

Free Will as an Open Scientific Problem

Mark Balaguer

**A Bradford Book
The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England**

© 2010 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

MIT Press books may be purchased at special quantity discounts for business or sales promotional use. For information, please email special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu or write to Special Sales Department, The MIT Press, 55 Hayward Street, Cambridge, MA 02142.

This book was set in Stone Sans and Stone Serif by the MIT Press. Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Balaguer, Mark.

Free will as an open scientific problem / Mark Balaguer.

p. cm.

“A Bradford book.”

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-01354-3 (hardcover : alk. paper)

1. Free will and determinism. I. Title.

BJ1461.B25 2010

123'.5—dc22

2009012426

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Index

- Abbott, L. F., 153
- Ability to do otherwise, 47–48
- Abstract objects, 184n17
- Active control. *See* Conscious control
- Agent causation, 16, 21, 67, 87, 177n16
- event-causal accounts of, 87, 177n16
- Agent involvedness. *See* Appropriate nonrandomness
- Albert, D., 182n8
- Ambiguity. *See* Analyses of free will, and ambiguity
- Analyses of free will, 26–45, 50–51, 55–63, 177n18. *See also* Conceptual analysis
- and ambiguity, 55, 59
- and carving nature at the joints, 23, 37 (*see also* Conceptual analysis, and human-being freedom)
- and coherence, 23, 30, 36, 38–39, 41
- and contextualism, 55, 59
- and human-being freedom, 30, 36–38, 48–49
- and imprecision, 55–62
- and incoherence, 59
- and moral responsibility, 30, 36, 39–45
- and ordinary language, 23, 28–35, 41, 45
- and the issue of what's worth wanting, 36, 39–44
- and the which-kinds-of-freedom-do-we-have question, 36–38, 45
- Antecedent determining control, 99–100
- Antimetaphysicalism, 22–24, 167–169
- Appropriate nonrandomness, 7–13, 83, 84–120
- A priori argument for determinism, 135–137
- A priori argument for libertarianism, 137–141
- Attacks on metaphysics. *See* Antimetaphysicalism
- Aune, B., 171n1, 173n10
- Austin, J. L., 50, 173n10
- Authorship, 7–10, 84–106. *See also* Plural authorship
- Autonomy, 36, 44, 61
- Ayers, M. R., 173n10
- Bell, J. S., 182n7, 182n8
- Bernstein, M., 92
- Berofsky, B., 92, 171n1, 173n10, 173n11
- Blips. *See* Neural blips
- Blumenfeld, D., 173n14
- Bohm, D., 145–146, 182n8
- Bok, H., 5, 46, 171n1, 173n11
- Bramhall, J., 171n3
- Brasil-Neto, J. P., 163–165
- Broad, C. D., 171n5
- Buridan's ass decisions. *See* Decisions, Buridan's ass

- Campbell, C. A., 67, 171n3
- Campbell, J. K., 173–174n14
- Cartesian dualism. *See* Mind–brain dualism
- Carving nature at the joints. *See* Analyses of free will, and carving nature at the joints
- Causation. *See* Agent causation; Libertarianism, event-causal; Probabilistic causation
- Chance objection to libertarianism. *See* Luck objection to libertarianism
- Character, 93, 120, 124
- Chisholm, R., 67, 171n3, 173n10, 174n5, 177n16
- Clarke, R., 67, 92, 107, 171n3, 173–174n14, 174n5
- Coherence. *See* Analyses of free will, and coherence
- Coherence question, the. *See* Question, coherence, the
- Collapse of the wave function, 144–146, 148, 155–157
- Compatibilism, 3, 4–6, 17–20, 25–63, 171n1, 171n2. *See also* Consequence argument, the
- Compatibilism question, the. *See* Question, compatibilism, the
- Compatibilistic libertarianism. *See* Libertarianism, compatibilistic
- Compatibilist intuitions about free will, 57–58
- Conceptual analysis, 25–30, 35–37, 41–42, 44, 50–51, 55–63, 88–89, 172n4, 177n18. *See also* Analyses of free will
- and concept articulation, 35
- and correctness conditions, 28–30, 35–37, 41–42
- and experimental philosophy, 29, 172n4
- and intuitions, 29
- and metaphysics (*see* Metaphysics, and conceptual analysis)
- Confabulation, 54, 143, 163–164
- Conscious control, 101–104
- Consciousness, slowness of. *See* Slowness of consciousness
- Consequence argument, the, 50–53, 173n12
- Contextualism. *See* Analyses of free will, and contextualism
- Contrastive explanations, 117–118
- Control, 7–10, 84–106
- active (*see* Conscious control)
- antecedent determining (*see* Antecedent determining control)
- conscious (*see* Conscious control)
- lack of, 100, 179n23
- plural (*see* Plural control)
- spontaneous (*see* Spontaneous control)
- Copenhagen interpretation of quantum mechanics, 182n7
- Copp, D., 173–174n14
- Crisp, T., 173n12
- Dayan, P., 153–154
- de Broglie, L., 182n8
- Decisions
- Buridan's ass, 72–73, 79, 120–122
- as conscious, intentional, and purposeful, 85–89
- non-torn, 120–130
- torn, 21–22, 68–70, 71–75, 76–120, 131–135, 141–143, 155–167
- Decoherence, 156, 183n11
- Deecke, L., 159
- Degrees of indeterminacy and L-freedom, 76–83
- Deliberation, 113–114, 118–119
- Dennett, D., 67, 107, 113–114, 118–119, 171n1, 171n3
- Determination by reasons, 95–96, 121–129
- Determined-or-Randomism (D-or-Rism), 8–10

- Determinism, 2–3, 6–7, 131–169
 a priori argument for, 135–137
 degrees of, 76–83
 as depressing, 105, 112, 125–126, 179n26
 empirical arguments for, 141–165
 FE-, 12–15, 18–20, 26–27
 for-all-practical-purposes (*see* Determinism, virtual)
 hard, 3
 macro-level, 142, 147–151
 neural, 142, 151–154
 soft, 3–4, 6, 25
 success-of-science argument for, 149–150
 torn-decision, 142, 155–165
 universal, 142–147
 virtual, 11, 142, 149, 151–165
 Deterministic interpretations of
 quantum mechanics, 145–147, 182n7
 DeWitt, B., 182n8
 Dignity, 36, 44, 61
 Direct referentiality, 49, 173n9
 Donagan, A., 67, 171n3
 Double, R., 5, 46, 92, 114, 171n1, 171n5, 173n11
 Do-we-have-free-will question, the. *See* Question, do-we-have-free-will, the
 Dualism. *See* Mind–brain dualism
 Dworkin, G., 5, 46, 171n1, 173n11
 Earman, J., 182n7
 Efforts of will, 70, 74, 179n23
 Ekstrom, L.W., 67, 171n3, 173n12, 174n5, 177n16
 Eliminativist views of decisions, 71, 175n7, 175n8
 Empirical arguments for determinism, 141–165
 Event-causal libertarianism. *See* Libertarianism, event-causal
 Everett, H., III, 182n8
 Experimental philosophy, 29, 172n4
 Facts of the matter. *See* Factual emptiness
 Factual emptiness, 23–24, 43, 56, 61–63, 111, 159, 167, 169, 171n4, 179n25, 184n17
 Fairness. *See* Moral responsibility, and fairness
 Falk, A., 173n10
 FE-determinism. *See* Determinism, FE-
 FE-determinism question, the. *See* Question, FE-determinism, the
 Festinger, L., 163–164
 Firing, neural, 153–154, 157
 Fischer, J. M., 5, 6, 46, 54, 92, 171n1, 173n11, 173n12, 173n13, 173–174n14, 174n1, 184n16
 Foley, R., 173n12
 Folk meaning, 19, 23, 27–36, 41–42, 45, 55–57, 59–61, 168, 172n4
 For-all-practical-purposes determinism. *See* Determinism, virtual
 Frankfurt, H., 5–6, 19, 22, 27, 46, 50, 53, 54, 65, 171n1, 172n3, 173n11, 173–174n14
 Frankfurt-case argument, the, 50–51, 173n14
 Frankfurtian freedom. *See* Freedom, Frankfurtian
 Freedom
 Frankfurtian, 5–6, 19, 22, 27, 46, 53–54, 65
 human-being, 48–49 (*see also* Analyses of free will, and human-being freedom)
 Humean, 4–6, 16, 19, 22, 27, 34, 45–46, 50, 53–55, 65, 174n15
 libertarian (*see* L-freedom)
 moral responsibility, 42
 ordinary-language, 116–117, 180n29
 varieties worth wanting (*see* Worth wanting, the issue of)
 Freedom-enhancing indeterminism. *See* Indeterminism, freedom-enhancing

- Free will. *See also* Freedom
 and intuitions (*see* Intuitions about free will)
 and the metaphysical component of the problem, 28, 53–54, 168
 and the moral component of the problem, 28, 53
 problem of, 1–15
 and the semantic component of the problem, 28, 53
 varieties worth wanting (*see* Worth wanting, the issue of)
- Gallois, A., 173n12
 Ginet, C., 12, 67, 68, 171n3, 173n12, 173–174n14, 178n22
 Glannon, W., 173–174n14
 Goetz, S., 67, 171n3
 Greenspan, P. S., 173n12
 Grotzinger, B., 159
- Habits, 102
 Hagan, S., 183n11
 Haggard, P., 161, 183n12, 183n13
 Haji, I., 92, 171n2, 173n11, 173–174n14
 Hameroff, S. R., 135, 143, 155–159, 181n3, 183n11
 Hard determinism. *See* Determinism, hard
 Hausman, D., 176n13
 Hidden variables, 145–146, 148, 151, 154
 Hiley, B. J., 146
 Hobart, R. E., 6, 9–10, 12, 66, 171n1, 174n2
 Hobbes, T., 4, 6, 9–10, 12, 66, 171n1, 174n2
 Hobbes-Hume-Hobart argument against libertarianism, 9–10
 Hodgson, D., 156
 Honderich, T., 143, 147–154, 183n9
 Horgan, T., 173n12
- Human-being freedom. *See* Freedom, human being; Analyses of free will, and human-being freedom
 Hume, D., 4–6, 9–12, 16, 19, 22, 27, 33–34, 41–42, 45–46, 50, 52–55, 65–66, 137, 171n1, 172n3, 173n10, 174n15, 174n2
 Humean freedom. *See* Freedom, Humean
 Humean responsibility. *See* Moral responsibility, Humean
 Hunt, D., 173–174n14
- Identity theory. *See* Token–token identity theory; Type–type identity theory
 Imprecision. *See* Analyses of free will, and imprecision
 Incoherence. *See* Analyses of free will, and incoherence
 Incompatibilism, 2, 9, 10–11, 13–14, 51–53, 55–62
 Incompatibilist intuitions about free will, 57–58
 Indeterminacy, 75–83, 171n4. *See also* Indeterminism
 degrees of (*see* Degrees of indeterminacy and L-freedom)
 freedom-enhancing, 96–106 (*see also* Libertarianism)
 macro-level, 182n5 (*see also* Determinism, macro-level)
 moment-of-choice, 16, 21, 67, 75–76, 107–110, 132, 158–159 (*see also* Libertarianism, non-Valerian)
 prior-to-choice, 16, 67, 75–76, 107–110, 132, 158–159 (*see also* Libertarianism, Valerian)
 Indeterminism, 6–7, 131–169. *See also* Indeterminacy
 freedom-enhancing, 96–106 (*see also* Libertarianism)

- kind needed for libertarianism (*see* Indeterminism, TDW-)
 no-freedom-enhancing (*see* FE-determinism)
 TDW-, 75–83, 131–169
- Indeterministic interpretations of quantum mechanics, 68, 145–147
- Interpretations of quantum mechanics, 68, 145–147, 182n7
- Intuitions, use of, 29, 50–51, 89
- Intuitions about free will, 56–60
- Ion channels, opening and closing of, 153–154
- Isen, A., 163–164
- James, W., 25
- Johnson, D., 173n12
- Kane, R., 7, 15, 20, 67–70, 73–74, 83, 92, 99–100, 114, 123–124, 171n3, 173n12, 173–174n14, 176n14, 177n16, 178n22, 179n23
- Kanean self-forming actions, 73–74
- Kant, I., 22, 25, 42–43, 137–141
- Kantian argument for libertarianism. *See* Moral-responsibility argument for libertarianism
- Kapitan, T., 171n1, 173n12
- Kind-term analysis of ‘free will’, 37, 48–50, 172n6
- Kind-term analysis of ‘moral responsibility’, 140–141
- Kochen, S., 144
- Kornhuber, H., 159
- Lamb, J., 173n12, 173–174n14
- Lateralized readiness potential, 183n12
- Lehrer, K., 171n1, 173n10
- Levin, P., 163–164
- Lewis, D., 171n1, 173n12
- L-freedom, 7–8, 10–11, 15–18, 65–130
 as applied to decisions, 121–122
 degrees of (*see* Degrees of indeterminacy and L-freedom)
 derivative, 123–124
 partial, 78–83
 as applied to persons, 121
 and the issue of what’s worth wanting, 106–113
- Libertarian freedom. *See* L-freedom
- Libertarianism, 10, 15–18, 65–130
 agent-causal. *See* Agent causation
 compatibilistic, 17–18, 55
 event-causal, 16, 21, 67, 176n13
 incompatibilistic, 18
 metaphysical, 17–18, 55
 moral responsibility argument for (*see* Moral responsibility argument for libertarianism)
 noncausal, 16, 67, 176n13
 non-Valerian, 16, 21, 67, 75–76, 107–110, 113–114, 132, 174n5
 semantic, 17–18
 Valerian, 16, 67, 107–110, 113–114, 132, 174n5
- Libertarian responsibility. *See* Moral responsibility, libertarian
- Libet, B., 143, 155, 159–162, 183n12, 183n13
- Lincoln, A., 181n1
- Locke, J., 171n1
- Luck objection to libertarianism, 13, 67, 92–95
- Macro-level determinism. *See* Determinism, macro-level
- Magnetic stimulation to the brain, 163–165
- Malcolm, N., 181n4
- Many-worlds interpretation of quantum mechanics, 145–146
- Materialism. *See* Mind–brain materialism
- McCall, S., 67, 171n3
- McCann, H., 67, 171n3
- McKay, T., 173n12
- McKenna, M., 173–174n14
- Meaning. *See* Folk meaning

- Measurement, problem of, 145
- Mele, A., 5, 46, 67, 92, 161, 171n1, 171n3, 173n11, 173–174n14
- Metaphysical component of the problem of free will. *See* Free will, and the metaphysical component of the problem
- Metaphysical interestingness, 30–31
- Metaphysical libertarianism. *See* Libertarianism, metaphysical
- Metaphysical problems, 23–24, 168–169
- Metaphysics
 attacks on (*see* Antimetaphysicalism)
 and conceptual analysis, 25, 30–45
- Microtubules, 155, 183n11
- Milgram, S., 163–164
- Mind–brain dualism, 16, 21, 67, 70, 109, 152
- Mind–brain materialism, 3, 67, 70–71, 85, 152, 183n9
- Moment-of-choice indeterminacy. *See* Libertarianism, non-Valerian
- Moral component of the problem of free will. *See* Free will, and the moral component of the problem
- Moral responsibility, 20, 22–23, 28, 36, 39–44, 53–55, 62–63, 107–111, 137–141, 168
 and analyses of free will (*see* Analyses of free will, and moral responsibility)
 and fairness, 41–42
 Humean, 41–42
 libertarian, 41–42
- Moral responsibility argument for libertarianism, 22, 42–43, 137–141
- Moral responsibility question, the. *See* Question, moral responsibility, the
- Nahmias, E., 29
- Narveson, J., 173n12
- Nathan, N., 173n12
- Natural-kind-term analysis of ‘free will’. *See* Kind-term analysis of ‘free will’
- Natural-kind-term analysis of ‘moral responsibility’. *See* Kind-term analysis of ‘moral responsibility’
- Nelkin, D., 163
- Neural blips, 106–110
- Neural determinism. *See* Determinism, neural
- Neural firing, 153–154, 157
- Neuroscience, 151–162
- Nichols, S., 29
- Noncausal libertarianism. *See* Libertarianism, noncausal
- Nonrandomness. *See* Appropriate nonrandomness
- Nonspecificist views of decisions, 71, 175n7, 175n8
- Non-torn decisions. *See* Decisions, non-torn
- Non-Valerian libertarianism. *See* Libertarianism, non-Valerian
- Nozick, R., 67, 171n3
- O’Connor, T., 67, 92, 171n3, 173n12, 178n21
- Ordinary language and analyses of free will. *See* Analyses of free will, and ordinary language
- Ordinary-language freedom. *See* Freedom, ordinary-language
- Ordinary-language meaning. *See* Folk meaning
- Otsuka, M., 173–174n14
- Paradigm-case-term analysis of ‘moral responsibility’. *See* Kind-term analysis of ‘moral responsibility’
- Parfit, D., 172n5
- Partial L-freedom. *See* L-freedom, partial
- Penrose, R., 135, 143, 155–159, 181n3
- Pereboom, D., 171n5, 173–174n14
- Personal identity, 172n5
- Phenomenology
 argument from, 89–91
 and torn decisions, 73, 75
- Plural authorship, 7, 83, 119

- Plural control, 7, 83, 119
- Plural rationality, 7, 83, 119
- Pretheoretic beliefs, 139–141
- Prigogine, I., 182n5
- Prior-to-choice indeterminacy. *See* Libertarianism, Valerian
- Probabilistic causation, 11, 16, 67, 80, 104, 129, 176n13
- Probabilistic laws, 68, 144–145, 150, 153, 182n6
- Problem of free will (defined), 1–15
- Problem of measurement. *See* Measurement, problem of
- Psychology, arguments from, 163–165
- Quantum-computer view of the brain, 135, 155–159
- Quantum gravity, 155–156
- Quantum mechanics, 1, 6, 68, 135, 143–147, 151, 154, 157
- Question
- coherence, the, 36–39
 - compatibilism, the, 18–19, 25–28, 45–62
 - do-we-have-free-will, the, 18–19, 23, 26–28, 30–45, 53
 - FE-determinism, the, 18–19, 26–27, 53
 - libertarian, the, 20–22, 24, 27, 49–50, 54, 65–130, 166–168
 - moral responsibility, the, 20, 22–23, 28, 36, 39–44, 53–55, 62–63, 137–141, 168
 - what-is-free-will, the, 18–19, 22–23, 26–61, 168
 - which-kinds-of-freedom-are-compatible-with-determinism, the, 45–50
 - which-kinds-of-freedom-do-we-have, the, 19, 22, 27–28, 34–44, 53–54, 65, 165–167
 - worth-wanting, the, 43–44
- Randomism. *See* Determined-or-Randomism
- Randomness, non-. *See* Appropriate nonrandomness
- Rationality, 7, 83, 113–119. *See also* Plural rationality
- strong, 114–115
 - teleological, 114–117
 - weak, 114–117
- Ravizza, M., 5, 6, 46, 54, 171n1, 173n11, 173–174n14, 174n1, 184n16
- Readiness potential, 159–162. *See also* Lateralized readiness potential
- Reasons, determination by. *See* Determination by reasons
- Reasons responsiveness, 6, 54, 65, 166–167
- Regress objection to libertarianism, 13, 67, 120
- Reid, T., 67, 171n3
- Responsibility. *See* Moral responsibility
- Rigidity, 49, 173n9
- Robb, D., 173–174n14
- Rowe, W., 67, 171n3
- Sameness, 56–57
- Sanford, D., 173n10
- Self-forming actions. *See* Kanean self-forming actions
- Semantic component of the problem of free will. *See* Free will, and the semantic component of the problem
- Semantic libertarianism. *See* Libertarianism, semantic
- Ship of Theseus, 56–57
- Situationism, 54, 143, 163–164
- Slote, M., 173n12
- Slowness of consciousness, 163
- Smilansky, S., 171n5
- Soft determinism. *See* Determinism, soft
- Sources, people as, 92, 102, 107, 111
- Specker, E. P., 144
- Spin, 144–146
- Spontaneous control, 98

- Stapp, H., 135, 181n3
- Statistical laws, 150, 153. *See also*
 Probabilistic laws
- Strawson, G., 92, 120, 171n5
- Strawson, P. F., 5, 46, 171n1, 173n11
- Strong rationality. *See* Rationality, strong
- Stump, E., 173–174n14
- Subconscious mental states and events, 71, 81, 86, 93, 101–104, 114–116
- Success-of-science argument for determinism, 149–150
- Superpositions, 144, 155–157
- Synaptic transmission, 153–154, 157
- Taylor, R., 67, 171n3
- TDW-indeterminism. *See* Indeterminism, TDW-
- Tegmark, M., 143–144, 151–152, 155–159, 183n11
- Teleological rationality. *See* Rationality, teleological
- Thorp, J., 67, 171n3
- Token–token identity theory, 70–71, 85–89, 109, 152
- Torn-decision determinism. *See* Determinism, torn-decision
- Torn decisions. *See* Decisions, torn
- Tuszyński, J. A., 183n11
- Twain, M., 131, 181n1
- Type–type identity theory, 70, 152
- Universal determinism. *See* Determinism, universal
- Valerian libertarianism. *See* Libertarianism, Valerian
- van Inwagen, P., 20, 50–53, 92, 137–141, 171n3, 173n7, 173n12, 173n14, 174n5, 178n21
- Velmans, M., 160, 163
- Vihvelin, K., 171n1, 173n12
- Virtual determinism. *See* Determinism, virtual
- Wallace, R. J., 5, 46, 171n1, 173n11
- Waller, B., 92
- Walter, H., 160
- Warfield, T., 173n12
- Watson, G., 5, 46, 171n1, 173n11
- Wave-function collapse, 144–146, 148, 155–157
- Weak rationality. *See* Rationality, weak
- Wegner, D. M., 163
- What-is-free-will question, the. *See* Question, what-is-free-will, the
- Which-kinds-of-freedom-do-we-have question, the. *See* Question, which-kinds-of-freedom-do-we-have, the
- White, M., 173n10
- Widerker, D., 173n12, 173–174n14
- Wiggins, D., 67, 171n3
- Wolf, S., 5, 46, 171n1, 173n11
- Worth wanting, the issue of, 36, 39–44, 84, 105, 106–113, 119
 and analyses of free will (*see* Analyses of free will, and the issue of what's worth wanting)
- Worth-wanting question, the. *See* Question, worth-wanting, the
- Wyma, K., 173–174n14
- Zimmerman, D., 173–174n14