
Mental Reality

second edition

Galen Strawson

with a new appendix

A Bradford Book
The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England

© 1994, 2010 by The Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, and information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

This book was set in Sabon by SNP Best-set Typesetter Ltd., Hong Kong, and was printed and bound in the United States of America.

First printing, 1994.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Strawson, Galen.

Mental reality / Galen Strawson.—2nd ed., with a new appendix.

p. cm.—(Representation and mind series)

“A Bradford book.”

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-51310-4 (pbk. : alk. paper)

1. Consciousness. 2. Behaviorism (Psychology). 3. Mind and body.

4. Materialism. 5. Philosophy of mind. I. Title.

B808.9.S73 2010

128'.2—dc22

2009011301

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Index

This index does not cite every occurrence of every listed term or topic. Page numbers in italic type indicate the place where a term is introduced, defined, or redefined.

- Aboutness as opposed to
 intentionality, 327–329
 Nonexperiential, 327, 328–330,
 338, 349, 351–352, 356–358
 UNA, 329
 UNA^{NE}, 329
- Active-principle idealism, *112–114*,
 116, 122
- Adaptive function, 214, 292, 301 n.,
 304–305
- Affect, 280–284
- Agnostic materialism. *See* Agnostic
 monism
- Agnostic monism, 96–99. *See also*
 ?-ism (under “ism”)
- Aldebaranians, 281–282
- Anscombe, G. E. M., 277
- Anthropomorphism, 336, 338
- Armstrong, D. M., 259–260, 277
- Arnauld, A., 125, 128
- Artificial intelligence (AI), xiii, 318
- Asymmetry thesis, 56–57, 66–70,
 73–74, 76, 97 n.
- Ayers. M. R., 9 n.
- BCS (behavioral or control-system)
 dispositions, 192, 193, 202
- Beetle, 329–330
- Behavior, xi, xii, xiii, 27–31, 33–34,
 36, 39, 188, 204, 219–226,
 228–229, 231, 235–247, 251–289,
 291–316, 328–330, 334–339,
 347–348, 353–354, and *passim*
 behavior in the broad sense,
 301–302, 313–314
 doing-behavior, 302, 303, 306, 314
 dreaming considered as, 309,
 314–315
 mental arithmetic considered as,
 308–309, 312, 313, 315
 nonovert or unobservable, 259,
 308–316
 thinking considered as, 314–315
 unsatisfactory definition of, 292–293
- Behavioral or control-system (BCS)
 dispositions, 192, 193, 202
- Behavioral or mental or neural
 (BMN) dispositions, 179, 181, 184,
 185, 192, 198, 202
- Behaviorism, xi, 28–31, 55. *See also*
 Neobehaviorism
- Behavior question, *xii*, xiii, 2, 27–31,
 34
- Belief, 184–186, 255–256, 265–266
- Berkeley, G., xii, 17, 39, 110,
 112–114, 116, 120

- Betelgeuzians, 238–239
 Bickhard, M. H., 329
 Blindsight, 149, 150, 151, 157, 169 n.
 Block, N., 32 n.
 BMN (behavioral or mental or neural) dispositions, 179, 181, 184, 185, 192, 198, 202
 Bradley, F. H., 116, 127
 Brain, 17, 57, 74, 81, 82–83, 88, 160–161, 166–167, 169
 in a vat, 15, 46, 195, 214, 271 n. (*see also* Louis, vat)
 British empiricists, 53
 Broad, C. D., 354 n.
 Buddhism, 287
 Bundle theory of mind. *See* Idealism, pure process
 Burge, T., 16, 211
 Butler, J., 23
 Byzantine fact about dispositions to act, 268

 Carnap, R., 223 n.
 Cartesianism, naturalized, *xi*, 318–319, 321, 324
Cataglyphus ant, 151, 323
 Causation, 93, 172, 180–181, 223 n., 278, 285, 331–333, 344–346, 349–350
 inus causal condition, 332 n.
 CD-player analogy, 165–168, 186
 Central control system (CCS), 150, 292, 294, 299–300, 302, 305–306
 Churchland, P. M., 29, 32 n., 82 n., 101, 196
 Color experience, 50, 60, 62–65, 69, 249
 Computers. *See* Machines
 Consciousness. *See* Experience
 Content
 cognitive or conceptual, 5 n., 109, 163 (*see also* Experience, cognitive)
 nonconceptual, 5 n., 163, 193
 purely experiential, 16–18, 130–133, 194–198, 205–206
 sensory, 5 n., 109, 163 (*see also* Experience, sensory)
 Cottingham, J., 125 n.
 Craig, E., 234
 Crane, T., 55
 Cussins, A., 90 n.

 Darwin, C., 83
 Davidson, D., 103, 195, 225 n., 309, 313
 Davies, P., 329
 Dennett, D., 5 n., 8, 9 n., 18, 21 n., 25, 51–52, 61, 65, 83, 92, 100, 170 n., 189 n., 248, 250, 299, 319, 323, 328, 337–339, 348, 356, 358
 Descartes, R., *xii*, *xiii*–*xiv*, 17 n., 51, 66, 76 n., 111, 112, 114, 120, 124–127, 139 n.
 Desires, 13 n., 255, 264–289
 conscious or occurrent, 280, 283–288
 mad, 276 n.
 phenomenology of, 280, 284–288
 Determinism, 331, 337
 Dislikes, 232 n., 279
 Dispositional thesis, 252, 264
 Dispositions, 136–137, 144, 326, 344–345, 355–357
 mental, 13 n., 14, 136–144, 160, 164–168, 184–186, 258, 267–280 (*see also* Belief; Desire; Propositional attitudes)
 microbehavioral, 204, 205, 213–214
 Dretske, F., 192, 193, 202, 291 n., 294 n., 302, 334 n.
 Dualism, 3, 47, 73 n., 89, 109, 114–143

 E/A intentionality (intentionality with respect to existent abstract objects), 178, 189–192, 198, 205–206, 214
 E/C intentionality (intentionality with respect to existent concrete objects), 178, 179–189, 196–198, 206, 210, 211
 Edelman, G., 82 n., 83, 100

- Eliminativism, 100–104
 Epictetus, 274, 287
 EQ content, 339, 340–344, 349–355.
 See also Experience, cognitive
 Equal-status monism, 57, 72–75, 77.
 See also Monism, M&P; Monism, neutral
 Evans, G., 179 n., 256 n., 349 n.
 Evidentialism, 256, 265. *See also*
 Positivism, public-domain
 Evolution, 1, 2 n., 39, 152, 201–202,
 285, 310, 313, 334, 336, 355
 Experience (or consciousness), xi,
 2–3, 4–13, 14–21, 44, 45–46,
 51–53, 57, 58–59, 62–65, 66–105,
 129–134, 153–155, 158–159,
 162–165, 179–184, 193–198,
 203–207, 208–214, 215–250,
 283–288, 317–318, 325–327,
 339–358
 cognitive, 4–13, 18–21, 143–144,
 339–344, 346–355
 color, 50, 60, 62–65, 69, 249
 equated with consciousness, 2–3
 as for someone, 129–136
 indescribable, 3
 of mice, 130–133
 sensory, 4, 13, 40–41, 143–144,
 215–250
 stream of, 3, 134, 195
 subject of, 129–134
 Experiential modality, 354–355
 Explanation, 84–92

 Flanagan, O., 9 n.
 Fodor, J., 32 n., 172, 179 n., 193,
 202, 212 n., 355–358
 Foster, J., 33
 Fragility, 356
 Frege, G., 129–136, 144
 Frege's thesis, 129–136, 144
 Freudian unconscious, 170
 Functionalism, 29, 30 n., 32 n., 216,
 217, 225, 229, 242, 257–260, 268,
 312 n., 334–336

Gammarus shrimp, 298–299
 Gardner, S., 250 n.
 Ghost in the machine, 318
 Gleitman, H., 314
 God, 50, 55, 69, 127 n., 298 n.,
 334–335, 353
 Gosling, J., 281 n.
 Gould, S. J., 298 n.
 Great Behavior Line, 309
 Greenberg, M., 211
 Gregory, R., 308 n.

 Hacker, P. M. S., 29
 Hall, R., 97 n.
 Hegel, G. W. F., 97, 116, 323
 Heil, J., 49 n., 281 n.
 Hornsby, J., 270 n., 291 n., 314
 Hume, D., 85, 111, 112, 121 n., 131,
 134, 172, 223 n.
 Humphrey, N., 313
 Hypnosis, 168–169

 Ichneumon larva, 298, 302
 Idealism, 35–36, 38, 39, 53–54, 101,
 107–144, 243 n., 317. *See also*
 Immaterialism; Mentalism
 active-principle, 112–114, 116, 122
 pure process (or strict), (PPI),
 111–112, 116, 119, 122, 134–144
 stuff, 114–115, 116–117, 119, 122
 transcendental, 117
 vat, 117
 Ignorance of the physical, xii, 50,
 74–75, 78, 81–82, 86–87, 89
 Immaterialism, 101–102, 117–119,
 120
 Insomnia, 12, 196
 Instrumentalism, 25, 104, 154
 Intention, 252–253
 Intentionality, xii, 38, 177–214
 behavioral or “as if,” 208, 210
 causal conditions of, 179–181,
 184–186, 196–198, 199, 208, 210,
 213–214
 conceptual, 189–194, 195–207

- Intentionality (cont.)
 “derived,” 95–96, 187, 192, 328, 330–331, 357–358
 E/A (intentionality with respect to existent abstract objects), 178, 189–192, 198, 205–206, 214
 E/C (intentionality with respect to existent concrete objects), 178, 179–189, 196–198, 206, 210, 211, 325, 350–351
 and the experienceless, 186–188, 190–193, 202–206, 208–210, 211–214. *See also* Aboutness, UNA^{NE}
 N/A (intentionality with respect to nonexistent abstract objects), 178, 189–190
 N/C (intentionality with respect to nonexistent concrete objects), 178, 190–192, 196–200, 206, 214
 no-problem thesis regarding, 177, 187, 192–193, 202, 207, 208, 209–210
 Intentional realism, 319, 324, 355–358
 Irreducibility thesis (irreducibility of experiential physical properties to nonexperiential physical properties), 56, 68–71. *See also* Reductionism
 ?-ism, 99, 105
- Jackendoff, R., 9 n., 149, 170 n., 171, 264
 Jackson, F., 63, 89, 150 n.
 James, W., 3, 7, 8, 9 n., 21, 97, 134, 341 n., 352 n.
- Kant, I., 50, 83, 97, 98, 117, 256, 262, 340
 Kim, J., 63, 291 n.
- Language, 35 n., 219–225, 227 n., 229–234, 237, 240, 241, 243–247, 263–264
 Lashley, K., 149, 170, 171
 Leiber, J., 147 n.
- Leibniz’s Law, 147, 148, 156
 Lewis, D., 32 n., 226 n., 276 n.
 Libet, B., 172
 Locke, J., 102, 115, 120
 Lockwood, M., 82 n., 83 n., 94 n., 170 n.
- Looking-glassing, 326
 Louis (a representative human being), 14, 15, 136–140, 158–159, 164–168
 Berkeleyan, 15–16
 instant, 16, 195–200, 214
 twin, 15–16
 vat, 15–16
 L-reality (Louis reality), 136, 137–138, 158–159, 164. *See also* Louis
- Mach’s principle, 329
 Machines, 93–96, 146–151, 156, 188, 190–193, 202–203, 207 n., 208, 234, 323, 330–331
 Mackie, J. L., 332 n.
- M&P (mental and physical) monism, 46–47, 48–49, 55–57, 72–74
 Marr, D., 95
 Martin, C. B., 264, 270 n.
- Materialism, xii, 1, 2, 32, 37–38, 43, 44, 46–105, 119, 120 n., 124, 128–129, 144, 199–200, 228
 Maxwell, J. C., 105
 McDowell, J., 8, 16, 340 n., 342 n.
- McGinn, C., 39, 69, 89, 90 n., 225 n., 313
- Meaning-experience. *See* Understanding-experience
 Mellor, D. H., 55
 Memory, 136, 137, 138–139, 144
- Mental
 action, 252, 308–310, 313–314
 being, 153–154
 concept of the, 32, 108–109, 141–142, 145–175, 317–324
 content, 37–39, 107–108, 127, 163, 169–174, 320–322 (*see also* Content)

- Mental and physical (M&P) monism, 46–47, 48–49, 55–57, 72–74
- Mental phenomena, *passim*
 dispositional, 13 n., 14, 136–144, 160, 164–168, 184–186, 258, 267–280 (*see also* Belief; Desire; Propositional attitudes)
 experiential. *See* Experience
 nonexperiential (or subexperiential), 3, 13, 14, 157–158, 159–162, 321–323
- Mentalism (strict), 108–109, 113–114, 117–120
- Mental or mental-ability-involving (MOMAI) abilities, 146 n., 149–151, 155
- Metaphysics, 48–49, 55, 76, 78–79, 124
- Microbehavioral dispositions, 204, 205, 213–214
- Millikan, R., 40, 193, 202, 292, 304 n., 314
- Milne, A. A., 280 n.
- Mind–body problem, 43–105
- MOMAI (mental or mental-ability-involving) abilities, 146 n., 149–151, 155
- Monism, 1, 43–44, 46–47, 109
 agnostic, 96–99 (*see also* ?-ism [under “ism”])
 equal-status, 57, 72–75, 77 (*see also* Monism, M&P; Monism, neutral)
 idealist (*see* Idealism)
 M&P (mental and physical), 46–47, 48–49, 55–57, 72–74
 materialist (*see* Materialism)
 neutral, 46, 49–50, 53, 57, 69, 73, 96–99, 117–118, 120 n.
 nonreductive, 56, 60–62, 69–70, 73
- Montague, M., 349 n.
- Morality, 101, 154
- Motivation. *See* M states
- M states (affectless motivational states), 281, 282–283
- Murdoch, I., 9 n., 19
- Nagarjuna, 331 n.
- Nagel, T., 3, 47, 62 n., 77, 82 n., 97 n., 105, 250, 333
- N/A intentionality (intentionality with respect to nonexistent abstract objects), 178, 189–190
- Nathan, N., 304 n.
- Naturalism, 2, 32, 33–34, 41, 177, 191–192, 201–202, 206, 213–214, 325–327, 335, 355
 logical or conceptual, 242, 285
 real, 326–327
- Natural-kind terms, 1, 48–50, 55, 223
- Naturalized Cartesianism, *xi*, 318–319, 321, 324
- Nausea, 216, 227–228
- N/C intentionality (intentionality with respect to nonexistent concrete objects), 178, 190–192, 196–200, 206, 214
- Nelkin, N., 169 n., 195
- Neobehaviorism, *xi*, 29, 30–31, 33–34, 213, 222, 225, 228, 229, 235, 239, 241–242, 251, 259–261, 264–265, 268, 276, 288, 291, 292–293, 297, 315–316. *See also* Behaviorism
- Neo-neobehaviorism, 315–316
- N.N.’s novel, 229–231, 239–240, 245
- Nonmentality question, *xi*, *xii*, 2, 23–25, 26, 31–32, 35–42, 107, 140
- No-problem thesis (regarding intentionality), 177, 187, 192–193, 202, 207, 208, 209–210
- Only In an Experiential Being thesis, 339
- Ontogenesis, 334
- Other minds, 234
- Occurrent nonexperiential mental processes, 168–172, 209
- Other-observability. *See* Publicly observable
- Oxygen examples, 260 n., 277, 278, 286

- Pain, 40, 51, 53, 132, 215–250, 279, 288 n.
- Panpsychism, 75–77
- Papineau, D., 40, 334 n.
- Paralysis example, 264
- Parfit, D., 132, 133, 240 n., 281 n.
- Pattison, M., 92
- Peacocke, C., 5 n., 163, 193
- Pears, D., 221 n.
- Peirce, C. S., 9 n.
- Persson, Ingmar, 240 n.
- Pettit, P., 16, 55, 342 n.
- Pff!* thesis, 352–354
- Phenomenalism, 38
- Phenomenology, cognitive. *See*
Experience, cognitive
- Philosophy, 12, 215–218, 223, 247, 324
- Phone-booth example, 281
- Physical, xii, 2, 43–105, and *passim*
concept of the, 32–33, 43–44, 55,
57–58, 110
ignorance of the, xii, 50, 74–75, 78,
81–82, 86–87, 89
- Physicalism. *See* Materialism
- Physics, 2 n., 50, 58, 61, 81–84,
86–92, 93–96, 100, 104–105
- Physicalism, 327
- Pitt, D., 341 n.
- Planck's constant, 84, 87
- Plato, 199
- Pool-of-water example, 181, 189,
212. *See also* Puddle example
- Positivism, 36, 38, 47, 48, 55, 78–79
public-domain, 256, 259, 285, 309,
315, 324 (*see also* Evidentialism)
- PPI (pure process [or strict] idealism),
111–112, 116, 119, 122, 134–144
- Private, 224, 243–247, 249
- Propositional attitudes, 14, 25, 45,
61, 100–101, 103, 184–186, 193.
See also Belief; Desire
- Puddle example, 329, 332–333
- Publicly observable, xii, 2, 25–27,
28–29, 215–217, 219–226,
229–233, 238–247, 256–257,
292–293, 295–297, 301, 308–316,
and *passim*
- Public-observability question, xii, 2,
25–27, 34–35
- Pure Observers, 265, 266, 335–336
- Pure process, 134–135. *See also* Pure
process idealism
- Pure process idealism (PPI), 111–112,
116, 119, 122, 134–144
- Putnam, H., 15 n., 55 n., 186 n.
- Q** antecedents (preconditions of
intentional behavior), 270,
271–275
- Quantum mechanics, 87–88, 91, 95
- Quine, W. V., 79, 86, 91, 95
- Raine, C., 10–11
- Ramsey, F., 32 n., 265
- Reductionism, 30–33, 47 n., 57,
59–62, 68–71, 97 n., 315
- Representationalism, 342, 354
- Rey, G., 51
- Rimbaud, A., 263 n.
- Robinson Crusoe, 263 n.
- Robots. *See* Machines
- Rooting story of the Weather
Watchers, 254, 263
- Rorty, R., 102 n.
- Rosenthal, D., 149 n., 170 n.
- Rule following, 231
- Russell, B., 94 n., 97, 138, 342–343
- Ryle, G., 7, 10, 291 n., 293, 314,
323
- San Vitale, 329, 339
- Schiffer, S., 210, 350 n.
- Schelling, F. W. J., 97
- Schopenhauer, A., 1, 7 n., 169
- Searle, J., 9 n., 14 n., 139, 167 n.,
168, 170, 172, 186, 212 n., 288 n.,
322, 331 n., 357 n., 358
- Sellars, W., 83 n., 340
- Sensation. *See* Sensory experience
- Sensory experience, 4, 13, 40–41,
143–144, 215–250

- Sherrington, C., 302, 306
 Shoemaker, S., 32 n., 131 n.
 Silliness, C. D. Broad's notion of
 Sirians, 226–232, 235, 237–239
 Smolin, L., 336 n.
 Space, concept of, 261–262
 Spelke, E., 358
 Spinoza, B., 97
 S sensations (Sirian pain sensations),
 226, 227–231
 Strawson, G., 52, 122 n.
 Strawson, P. F., 178
 Stream of consciousness. *See* Stream
 of experience
 Stream of experience, 3, 134, 195
 Strict idealism. *See* Idealism, pure
 process
 Stroud, B., 14 n., 142 n., 172, 174
 Stuff idealism, 114–115, 116–117,
 119, 122
 Subject of experience, 129–134
 Subexperiential (or nonexperiential)
 mental phenomena, 3, 13, 14,
 157–158, 159–162, 321–323
 Subpersonal states. *See*
 Subexperiential mental phenomena
 Swampman, 40–41, 191. *See also*
 Louis, instant
 Symmetry breaking, 84, 87
 Taking, cognitive-experiential
 346–350, 352, 353, 357. *See also*
 Experience, cognitive
 Telepathy, 26–27, 243 n.
 Terminology, 338, 343 n., 355
 Theory of evolution, 1, 2 n., 39, 152,
 201–202, 285, 310, 313
 Thought, 36, 40–42, 139–140,
 143–144, 171–172, 253, 272,
 296 n., 303–304. *See also*
 Experience, cognitive
 conscious, 12, 18–21, 169–170,
 171–172, 181–182, 194–196,
 203–204, 213
 determinacy property of, 182–183,
 195
 insubstantiality property of, 12,
 182–183, 194–195
 Tigger (*The House at Pooh Corner*),
 280 n.
 Trying, 270–275
 Turing, A., 147 n.
 Turing machine, 172
 Twins, 334, 342–345. *See also* Louis,
 twin
 Understanding-experience (or
 meaning-experience), 4–13,
 182–183, 208–209, 213. *See also*
 Thought; Experience, cognitive
 Unicorns, 178, 189, 190
 Velociraptors, 31
 Verificationism, 78, 218
 Watson, G., 281 n.
 Weather Watcher philosopher,
 255–256, 266, 277, 278, 319
 Weather Watchers, 251, 252–289,
 335
 Weiskrantz, L., 149 n.
 Wishing, 255, 280, 286–287
 Wittgenstein, L., 7, 10, 13, 29, 35 n.,
 195, 218, 221 n., 224 n., 226 n.,
 234, 243, 309, 353 n., 354
 Wittgensteinians, xiii, 26, 103, 216,
 217, 219 n., 234, 245, 285, 313
 W (quasi-Wittgensteinian) theorists,
 217, 218–223, 225, 229, 231, 234,
 245–246. *See also* Wittgensteinians
 Zombies, 317 n., 351