**Time and Identity** 

edited by Joseph Keim Campbell, Michael O'Rourke, and Harry S. Silverstein

A Bradford Book The MIT Press Cambridge, Massachusetts London, England © 2010 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

MIT Press books may be purchased at special quantity discounts for business or sales promotional use. For information, please email special\_sales@mitpress.mit .edu or write to Special Sales Department, The MIT Press, 55 Hayward Street, Cambridge, MA 02142.

This book was set in Stone and Stone Sans by Westchester Book Group. Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Time and identity / edited by Joseph Keim Campbell, Michael O'Rourke, and Harry S. Silverstein.

p. cm.—(Topics in contemporary philosophy)
"A Bradford book."
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-0-262-01409-0 (hardcover : alk. paper)—ISBN 978-0-262-51397-5 (pbk. : alk. paper)
1. Time. 2. Identity (Philosophical concept). 3. Self (Philosophy). 4. Death.
I. Campbell, Joseph Keim, 1958–. II. O'Rourke, Michael, 1963–. III. Silverstein, Harry, 1942–.
BD638.T5437 2010
115—dc22

2009041935

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

## Index

Abelard, Peter, 20 Action(s), 5, 15, 90, 149-150, 152-157, 161, 232, 236-237, 239, 241-242, 244-246, 303, 313 executable, 232, 237, 239, 244 normally self-effecting, 232, 236, 239 responsibility for, 5, 15, 90, 149-150, 152-157, 313 Actualism, 13, 97-102, 105-107, 108 predicate, 98, 108 property, 13, 97-102, 107, 108 world, 99-102, 105-107 Agency, 17-18, 151-152, 160, 221, 245-246, 303 centers of, 17-18, 245-246 Alston, William, 204 Ambiguity, 86, 116-125, 225 Anscombe, G. E. M., 17, 209-210, 212, 220, 224, 225 Apresjan, Juri, 116 Aquinas, Thomas, 173, 180 Aristotle, 19, 20, 50-51, 54, 56-57, 59-60, 62-64, 67, 72, 74, 312 Armstrong, David, 146 Arnauld, Antoine, 165-166, 172-173, 176 A-series, 2-3, 11, 27-34, 41-44 Auden, W. H., 27 Augustine of Hippo, 1

Awareness, judgmental, 32-33, 44 Ayers, Michael, 195 Bach, Kent, 126 Bacon, John, 146 Baker, Lynne Rudder, 44, 188 Barresi, John, 19 Bayle, Pierre, 179 Bennett, Jonathan, 16, 170, 179, 204 Bergmann, Michael, 97 Bigelow, John, 95, 280 Black, Max, 19 Blanchette, Patricia, 45 Bodies, 5, 165-166, 168-169, 172, 175, 176, 178, 180, ch. 9 passim, 222, 237 Bonnen, Clarence, 179 Borges, Jorge, 238 Boundary, 79-81, 91, 202, 206, 212, 220-225, 226, 285-286 Bradley, Ben, 279, 280, 284, 287, 288-291, 292, 293-294, 295 Brandt, Richard, 266 Broad, C. D., 43 Broome, John, 258, 266 B-series, 2-3, 11, 27-34, 41-44 Burman, Frans, 173-174 Butler, Joseph, 5, 21 Bykvist, Kryster, 265, 266 Campbell, John, 280

Carter, William, 66–68, 74, 75, 195

Castañeda, Hector-Neri, 230-233 Chalmers, David, 189 Change, 2-3, 7-9, 10, 13-14, 16, 28, 39-40, 42, 45, ch. 2 passim, 105, 106, ch. 5 passim, 136, 165-166, 169-170, 171, 178, 188-189, 197, 200, 204, 258, 263, 313-314, 318 Cambridge/relational, 73, 258, 263 Chesterfield, Lord/4th Earl of (Philip Stanhope), 249, 254-255 Chierchia, Gennaro, 91 Chisholm, Roderick, 20, 82, 95, 197 Clapp, Lenny, 119 Clarke, Randolph, 161 Class, 58-66, 69, 74, 98-99, 101 master, 58-66, 74 membership, 58-66, 69, 74, 98-99, 101 Cogito argument, ch. 10 passim Common ground, 13, 79-83, 85-90, 91, 92 Conditionals, subjunctive, 82-83, 91 Consciousness, 5, 155-157, 190. See also Self-consciousness Contextualism, 12-13, ch. 3 passim, 120-122, 127, 215 Continuants, 14, 15, 92, 150-151, 156, 210, 216, 218, 220 Coreference, 6, 13, 113, 118, 120, 213, 215 Craig, William Lane, 43, 162 Crimmins, Mark, 241 Crisp, Oliver, 179 Crisp, Thomas, 19, 43, 97 David, Marian, 45 Davidson, Matthew, 97 Death, evil/badness of, 18-19, 192-193, 254, 264, chs. 13-15 passim Epicurean view (EV), 18-19, 254, 264, 271, 274, 279, 283-284 time of, chs. 13-14 passim Demonstratives, 119, 211-212

Dennett, Daniel, 22, 223 Descartes, René, 8, 10, 15-16, 17, ch. 8 passim, 209-210, 216, 220, 222, 224, 225 Desgabets, Robert, 180 Designation, 98-99, 101, 108 Desires, 18, 193-194, 239, 241-242, 243, 244, 245-246, ch. 12 passim Desire theory. See Welfare, desire satisfaction account/theory of Determinism/indeterminism, 43, 90, 162 Domain, the, 35-39 Draper, Kai, 279, 280 Duplication, 10, 20, 100-102, 105, 106, 107, 141, 192, 314, 316-317. See also Fission Earman, John, 21 Edwards, Johnathan, 176-177, 179 Ehring, Douglas, 146 Einstein, Albert, 12 Endurantism, 9, 14, 126, 150, 162, 179. See also Three-dimensionalism Epicurean view. See Death, evil/badness of, Epicurean view Epicurus, 18, 19, 254, 264, 271, 274, 279, 283-284 Essence, individual, 16, 95, 170-175, 180, 181 Eternalism, 3-4, 9, 11-12, 18, 21, 27, 29, 34-35, 39-41, 43, 44, 45, ch. 2 passim, ch. 13 passim. See also Four-dimensionalism Evans, Gareth, 212, 217, 219, 225, 226 Events, 2-3, 11, 28, 31, 32, 41, 44, 45, 52, 73, 92, 130, 135, 136, 143, 146, 221, 262-263, 272-275, 300-301, 303, 304 Every Harm Is a Living State principle (EHILS), 303, 304-306 Every Harm Needs a Condition principle (EHNAC), 305-306

Evils/harms, 18-19, 249-250, 257, 259, 264, 265, chs. 13-15 passim deprivation, of, 274-275 posthumous, 18-19, 257, 259, 264, 265, chs. 13-15 passim prenatal, 290-291 recipients of ("evil/bad for"), 18-19, chs. 13-15 passim time of, chs. 13-14 passim timeless/atemporal, 273-274, 277, ch. 14 passim Existence, 7-8, 11-12, 20, 28, 34-42, 44, 45, ch. 2 passim, 95-98, 102, 106, 107, 108, 130, 133, 142-143, 167, 173-175, 177, 178, 180, 181, 186, 192-197, 202, 205, 209-210, 218, 220-222, 224-225, 274-275, 285-286 -at-t, 34-42, 45, ch. 2 passim, 205 eminent, 174-175, 181 formal, 173-175, 180, 181 objective, 173-175 simpliciter, 34-42, 45, 66-69, 75 Fatalism, 12, 43, 79, 84-86 Feelings, causes of vs. objects of, 271-273, 284, 292-293 Feinberg, Joel, 259-260, 265, 301, 302, 307 Feit, Neil, 279 Feldman, Fred, 279, 280, 287-288, 294 Fine, Kit, 97, 99-100, 101 First-person memory. See Memory, first-person Fission, or fission problem, 10, 14, 21, 141, 143, 147, 192-194, 203-204, 223, 260, 317 Flage, Daniel, 179 Fodor, Jerry, 118 Forbes, Graham, 97, 108 Four-dimensional (4D) framework, 277, 284-287, 289, 290, 292-293, 294, 295

vs. three-dimensional (3D) framework, 285-287, 290 vs. zero-dimensional (0D) framework, 285-287, 290 Four-dimensionalism, or the 4D view, 9, 14, 20, 55, 104, 129, 130-131, 141, 142-143, 144, 145, 147, 152, 179, 201, 271, 277, 279, 284-287, 289, 290, 292-293, 294, 295. See also Eternalism: Perdurantism Four-dimensional objects, 150, 152 - 158Fowler, Gregory, 161 Freedom, 11, 12, 79, 86-89, 90 paradox, 79, 86-89 time-traveler, 79, 86-89 Frege, Gottlob, 20, 124, 198, 210, 212, 224, 225, 239 Fusion, 21, 194, 203, 260 Gale, Richard, 43 Gassendi, Pierre, 167, 177, 180 Geach, Peter, 198 Gibbard, Allan, 199 Ginet, Carl, 79, 90 Glannon, Walter, 151-152, 161 Gödel, Kurt, 12, 21 Goldman, Alvin, 299 Goodman, Nelson, 82 Goods/benefits, 18, 19, 194, ch. 12 passim, 272, 274, 275, 283, 290, 292, 294, 300-301, 303-304 posthumous, 257-264, 283, 290, 292, 294, 303-304 recipients of ("good for"), 19, ch. 12 passim, 272, 274, 275, 283, 290, 292, 294, 300-301, 303-304 time of, 257-264 Grandfather paradox, 12-13, 80-81, 83, 86-87, 88-89 Grey, William, 279 Grover, Dorothy, 303 Grünbaum, Adolf, 32, 33, 43, 44

Haksar, Vinit, 153, 158, 159, 161 Hanley, Richard, 298 Harman, Gilbert, 280 Haslanger, Sally, 161 Hawley, Katherine, 20, 161 Hawthorne, John, 1, 19 Heller, Mark, 161 Helm, Paul, 177, 179 Heraclitus, 7, 12, 49–50, 52, 73 Hestevold, H. Scott, 66–68, 74, 75 Hinchliff, Mark, 21, 97, 108, 109 Hobbes, Thomas, 20 Hudson, Hud, 97 Hume, David, 10, 170, 179, 200, 221, 229, 242

'I', 16-17, 171-173, 175, 180, 197-203, 204, 205-206, 210-213, 216-219, 220-221, 223-224, 236-237 -elimination, 236-237 -introduction/addition, 236-237 -thoughts, 16-17, 197-198, 210, 216, 220-221, 224 Ideas, 173, 174, 177, 196, 204, 214, 216-218, 220, 239, 241-242 Identity, ch. 1 passim, 98-99, 101, 102-105, chs. 5-10 passim, 229, 238-239, 246, 260, 305, ch. 16 passim. See also Personal identity numerical, 7-8, 15-16, 105, 113-114, 125, 126, 152-155, 161, 169-171, 191, 213, 222, 313-314 public, 17, 238-239 qualitative, 7-8, 16, 113, 313-314 sortal, 14, 131-133, 137-138, 143, 144, 145, 186, 204, 211, 226 Immortality, 15–16, ch. 8 passim Indeterminism. See Determinism/ indeterminism Indexicals, 3, 16, 17, 30-31, 44, 197, 204-205, 210-213, 215-217, 219, 224

Indifference (as "middle" or "zero" value between good and bad), 275-276, 279, 289-290, 294-295 Individuals, past, 95, 97, 104-105, 106, 107 Jackendoff, Ray, 127 Jackson, Frank, 189 James, William, 212-213, 222, 224, 225, 226 Janernig, Anja, 44 Johansson, Jens, 279 Johnson, Samuel, 249, 254-255 Kant, Immanuel, 212, 217, 229, 299 Kaplan, David, 30, 211 Katz, Jerrold, 126 Keller, Simon, 21, 108, 265 Kim, Jaegwon, 45, 136, 146, 298 Knowledge, 17, 172, 174, 181, 189, 195-196, 198, 199, 200, 209-210, 212, 214-216, 217, 223, 221, 224-225, 226, 230-232, 233-239, 240, 242 from the inside, 216, 221, 233-234 from a perspective, 234-239, 240 self-, 17, 172, 198, 199, 200, 209-210, 212, 217, 223, 224-225, 230-232, 234, 236-239, 242 normally self-informative ways of acquiring, 17, 231-232, 234, 236-239, 242 unarticulated constituents of, 214-216, 224-225, 226, 234-235 Kripke, Saul, 21, 98, 108, 109, 126 Lange, Marc, 91 Lennon, Thomas, 180 Le Poidevin, Robin, 19 Lepore, Ernie, 118 Levenbook, Barbara, 19, 284, 302

Lewis, David, 1–2, 5, 12, 20, 21, 71, 79–82, 88, 91, 161, 162

Lewis, Delmas, 155, 161, 162 Lichtenberg, Georg, 210 Locke, John, 5, 186, 192, 195, 196-197, 204, 222, 233, 241, 246 Lombard, Lawrence, 9, 19, 20, 65, 73 Luper, Steven, 265 Markie, Peter, 166, 176 Markosian, Ned, 43, 63, 95, 97, 147, 272 Marquis, Don, 302 Martin, Raymond, 19 Matthews, G. B., 45 McConnell-Ginet, Sally, 91 McDowell, John, 188 McKinsey, Michael, 74, 75 McTaggart, J. M. E., 2-3, 19, 27, 28, 43 Mellor, D. Hugh, 44, 154-155, 161 Memory, first-person, 4-5, 223, 233 - 234Menzel, Christopher, 108 Mereology, 58-61, 64, 146, 168 Merricks, Trenton, 12, 51-53, 65, 160 Mersenne, Marin, 165, 166, 176 Moore, G. E., 200 Moral responsibility, 4, 15, 90, 146, ch. 7 passim, 221, 313-314 Moran, Richard. 226 Moravcsik, Julius, 116 Moyer, Mark, 121 Nadler, Steven, 181 Nagel, Thomas, 209, 219, 224, 225, 226, 279, 284, 293 Nelson, Michael, 21 No Backward Causation principle (NBC), 298-299, 306, 307 No Backward Evaluation principle (NoBE), 300-301 For Good (NoBEG), 300-301 No Free-Floating Interests principle (NFFI), 301-303

No Free-Floating Losses principle (NFFL), 302-303 Nolan, Christopher, 247 No Moral Relatedness principle (NMR), 304 Nonexistents, 50, 64, 69-70, 74, ch. 4 passim, 272-273, 274, 292 Nonidentity of Discernibles, 6-10, 20 Noonan, Harold, 20, 21, 192, 193, 198, 200, 204, 206 Notions, 234, 236, 239-244, 245 self-, 234, 236, 240-242, 245 Nozick, Robert, 19, 204, 249 Nunberg, Geoffrey, 117, 121 Oaklander, Nathan, 43 Objects, 7, 8-9, 14, 15, 35-38, 40, 42, 45, ch. 2 passim, 115, 118-119, 121-125, 126, 127, 133-134, 146, ch. 7 passim, 170, 201–203, 206, 217, 272, 279 enduring/three-dimensional, 51-52, 150-151, 170 nontemporal, 35-38, 40, 42, 146 over time, 14, 118-119, 121-125, 126, 127 perduring/four-dimensional, 8-9, 15, ch. 7 passim, 170, 272, 279 temporal/at a time, 14, 35-38, 40, 42, 45, ch. 2 passim, 118-119, 121-125, 126, 127 Olson, Eric, 11, 16, ch. 6 passim, ch. 9 passim Ontological novelty, 38-39, 42 Opacity, 6, 13-14, 115, 118, 120, 124 Parfit, Derek, 10, 18, 19, 21, 188, 189, 191-194, 222, 265, 266, 315 Pargetter, Robert, 280 Parmenides, 7, 12, 49-50, 73, 200 Partridge, Ernest, 301 Pattern goods, 258, 264, 266

Peirce, Charles Sanders, 19 Perdurantism, 8-9, 14, 15, ch. 7 passim, 166, 170-171, 179, 203. See also Four-dimensionalism Perry, John, 19, 20, 22, 44, 145, 213-214, 220, 224 Persistence, 2, 4, 7-9, 15-16, 20, 72, 129-130, 133-134, 139, 144, chs. 7-8 passim, 185-188, 204, 205 Person, personhood, 5, 14-15, 16, 17, 20, chs. 6-7 passim, ch. 9 passim, 221, 224, 229, 260, 305, 313, 318-319 Personal identity, 8, 10-11, 14-15, 16, 19, 20, 21, ch. 6 passim, ch. 9 passim, 222, 241, 246, 260, 305, 311, 313-315 biological approach, 138, 143, 146, ch. 9 passim episodic characterization of the problem of, 137-144 Olson's characterization of the problem of, 132-133 psychological approach, 10-11, 16, 21, 132-133, 138, 142-143, 146, ch. 9 passim, 313-315 standard 3D characterization of the problem of, 131-132 standard 4D characterization of the problem of, 130-131, 145, 147 Pitcher, George, 265, 302, 305–306 Plantinga, Alvin, 97 Plato, 20, 50, 61, 63, 67, 72, 174, 180 Plutarch. 20 Pollock, John, 97 Polysemy, 14, ch. 5 passim Posthumous evils/harms (see Evils/harms, posthumous) goods/benefits (see Goods/benefits, posthumous) reference (see Reference, posthumous) Powers, Larry, 73 Predication, 60, 64, 95, 97-98, 102, 107 Preferences, 18, ch. 12 passim

Prendergast, Thomas, 176 Presentism, 3-4, 9, 11, 12, 13, 18, 21, 27, 34-35, 39, 43, ch. 2 passim, 95-98, 102, 104-105, 106, 107, 108, 272. See also Three-dimensionalism predicate, 108 (see also Actualism, predicate) property, 13, 95-98, 102, 104-105, 107 (see also Actualism, property) time. 106 world, 106 (see also Actualism, world) Presuppositions vs. suppositions, ch. 3 passim Prior, Arthur, 102-103, 136, 146 Property, 2-3, 4, 6, 13, 14, 19, 28-29, 33-34, 35, 42, 43, 45, ch. 2 passim, ch. 4 passim, 123, ch. 6 passim, 156-157, 239, 262-263, 277-279 accidental. 50 essential, 50 exemplification/instantiation of, 14, 45, ch. 2 passim, 97, 123, ch. 6 passim, 156-157, 262-263, 277-279 at a time, 45, ch. 2 passim, 97, 123, 135-137, 156-157, 262-263, 277-279 Propositions, 6, 31, 61, 62-64, 65, 69, 79-80, 81, 94, 99, 101-102, 121, 198, 234-235, 239, 275 singular, 61, 64, 65, 69, 94, 99 Pustejovsky, James, 116, 117

Quantification, 28, 34–40, 42, 43, 45, 59–60, 65, 69–70, 74, 96, 97–98, 150, 156, 204 Quine, W. V. O., 6, 7, 8, 20

Rea, Michael, 43, 45, 95, 97 Realism, 70–71, 76 modal, 70–71, 76 Recanati, François, 226 Reference, posthumous, 272, 283, 291–292

Régis, Sylvain, 180 Relativity, 22, 27, 32, 43 special theory of, 27, 32, 43 Rescher, Nicholas, 20 Retroactivity problem, ch. 15 passim Rigidity, 13, 101–102, 109, 126, 242 Rosenbaum, Stephen, 272, 292 Ruben, David-Hillel, 277 Russell, Bertrand, 21, 62, 200, 210 Ryle, Gilbert, 84-86, 92 Salmon, Nathan, 20, 97, 108, 110 Saul, Jennifer, 115, 124 Scanlon, Thomas, 303 Schmaltz, Tad, 178, 180 Self, 2, 5, 8, 9-11, 16-18, 21, 141-142, 145, 172, 179, 193-194, 196-197, chs. 10-11 passim impulsive/bundle of cognitive complexes picture of, 244-246 rational agent picture of, 244-246 Self-concept, ch. 11 passim as a motivating complex, 238, 241 - 242primitive, 236-238, 239-240 Self-consciousness, 11, 27, 31-34, 41.42 Self-knowledge. See Knowledge, self-Ship of Theseus, 9-10, 26, 261 Shoemaker, Sydney, 194, 195, 196, 204, 212, 231, 233-234, 241, 246 Sider, Ted, 12, 20, 21, 27, 40, 41, 43, 44, 55, 57, 60-61, 65, 70-71, 72, 73, 79, 86-89, 92, 95, 108, 119, 141-142, 144, 145, 147, 150, 161, 162, 166, 176, 179, 279, 313-315, 317, 318-319 Silverstein, Harry, 18, ch. 13 passim, 283-284, 292-293, 294, 303 Simultaneity, 28-29, 31, 32, 41, 43, 44, 177, 203, 262 Slors, Marc, 161 Smart, J. J. C., 4, 43 Snowdon, Paul, 185, 191, 195

Soames, Scott, 63 Solon, 307 Sophocles, Oedipus the King, 307 Soul, 8, 10, 15-16, 20, ch. 8 passim, 229, 305, 314, 318-319 Space-time worms, 9, 20, 142, 160, 162, 303 Spinoza, Baruch, 175, 181 Stage theory, 150-152, 161 Stalnaker, Robert, 79-80, 86, 108 Stanley, Jason, 226 Strawson, Galen, 161 Strawson, Peter, 121, 200, 212 Substance concept/sortal, 133-134, 142-143, 186, 204 Substances, 10-11, 16, 17, 70, ch. 8 passim, 196-197, 204, 209, 212, 221 corporeal, 10-11, ch. 8 passim simple, 16, 169, 171, 178, 221 thinking, mental, nonmaterial, 10-11, 16, 17, 70, ch. 8 passim, 196-197, 204, 209, 212, 221 Substitutivity, 6, 13-14, ch. 5 passim, ch. 10 passim Succession, 28, 31, 41, 170 Sumner, L. W., 249, 250, 251-252 Supervenience, 99-100, 101-102 Supposition. See Presuppositions vs. suppositions Survival, 8, 10, 16, 21, 139, 149, 166, 186-187, 190, 191-194, 197, 202, 203-204, 261 Taylor, James, 307 Temporal parts, 8-9, 14, 15-16, 21, 41, 50, 51-52, 55, 65, 70, 73, 92, 123, 129-130, 137, 141, 142, 143, 144, chs. 7-8 passim, 199, 201, 219, 222, 279 Temporary intrinsics, problem of, 20, 52,73 Tense, 3, 4, 9, 11, 12, 28-31, 32, 35, 36,

43–44, ch. 2 *passim*, 95–96, 98, 102, 106–107, 156–157, 162, 273, 286, 294

Thinking animal problem. See Too many minds objection Thomas, Stephen, 84 Three-dimensional framework. See Four-dimensional framework, vs. three-dimensional framework Three-dimensionalism, or 3D view, 9, 14-15, ch. 6 passim, 151, 158. See also Endurantism; Presentism Time, introduction passim, chs. 1-4 passim, chs. 5–8 passim, ch. 9 passim, 209, 211, 213, 219, 222, 224, 225, 228, 235-236, 241, 242, ch. 12 passim, chs. 13-15 passim, ch. 16 passim A-theory of, 2-3, 11-12, 27, 28-34, 41, 42, 43, 44 B-theory of, 2-3, 11-12, 27, 28-34, 41, 42, 43, 44 BA-theory of, 11-12, 27, 28-34, 41, 42 flow/passage of, 1-4, 9, 11, 34, 41, 42, 167 mixed view of, 35-38, 39-42 Time travel, 12-13, 14, 21, ch. 3 passim, 141-142, 143, 145, 298 Tooley, Michael, 43 Too many minds objection, 16, 195-203 Transience, 29, 31, 34, 42 Transitivity, 6, 9, 10, 141, 194, 314-315 Triangle argument, 97-98, 107 Truth, 6, 43-44, 63, 80-82, 85-89, 91, 92, ch. 4 passim, 116, 122, 126, 199, 200, 205, 214, 234-235, 275 Vagueness, 135, 201-203, 206, 223, 225-226 ontological/de re, 135, 201-203, 206 Values Connect with Feelings requirement/thesis (VCF), 271-273, 279, 284, 292-293 van Inwagen, Peter, 5, 20, 44, 45, 79,

90, 146, 153, 160, 161, 162, 185

Velleman, David, 222, 224, 226, 258, 266 Vihvelin, Kadri, 12, 78, 86, 87-89, 92 Vihvelin's principle, 87-89, 92 Vinci, Thomas, 180 von Fintel, Kai, 82, 91 Vorobej, Mark, 266 Warmbrod, Ken, 82 Welfare, 4, ch. 12 passim, 275-276, 277, 279, 297-298, 303-304, 312 assumption, 297-298, 303-304 desire satisfaction account/theory of, ch. 12 passim Wiggins, David, 20, 133, 188, 204 Williams, Bernard, 19, 204 Worse-Off assumption, 297, 299, 300, 303, 304

Yablo, Stephen, 91 Yourgrau, Palle, 21

Zero-dimensional framework. *See* Four-dimensional framework, vs. zero-dimensional framework Zimmerman, Dean, 12, 54–55, 58