

# Computation, Cognition, and Pylyshyn

edited by Don Dedrick and Lana Trick

A Bradford Book  
The MIT Press  
Cambridge, Massachusetts  
London, England

© 2009 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information about special quantity discounts, please email [special\\_sales@mitpress.mit.edu](mailto:special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu)

This book was set in Stone Sans and Stone Serif by SNP Best-set Typesetter Ltd., Hong Kong.

Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Computation, cognition, and Pylyshyn / edited by Don Dedrick and Lana Trick.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-01284-3 (hardcover : alk. paper)—ISBN 978-0-262-51242-8 (pbk. : alk. paper)

1. Cognition. 2. Cognitive science. 3. Pylyshyn, Zenon W., 1937–. I. Dedrick, Don. II. Trick, Lana, 1957–.

BF311.C593 2009

153—dc22

2008042147

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

# Index

- Action(s). *See also* Grasping; Pointing  
vs. flicking movements  
effects of brain damage, 104–111  
metrics and frames of reference, 111  
mouth movements, 125, 127  
potential, 139–156  
and right and left hemisphere,  
122–128  
skilled vs. unskilled, 128  
vision-for-action vs. vision-for-  
perception, 104–128  
visual illusions and visually guided,  
111–128  
visually guided manual, 101–137
- Addition and subtraction. *See also*  
Number  
in animals, 228–229  
in babies, 225–226
- Age differences. *See* Development
- Aglioti, S., 113
- Agnosia  
simultagnosia (Balint's syndrome), 20  
visual form agnosia, 105–106
- Aiming (visually guided), 122, 126,  
128
- Algorithmic level of explanation,  
175–176  
connectionism and, 179–193
- Allen, C., 235
- Anderson, J., 259
- Anderson, R. A., 287–288
- Apraxia, 125
- Architecture  
classical, vii–xi, 259  
cognitive or functional, 139, 141, 149,  
249, 251, 255, 259–280  
connectionist, 251, 259–261
- Artificial neural networks. *See*  
Connectionism
- Associationism, vii–viii, 178
- Attention, 4–40, 49–72, 79–95, 103,  
110, 139–154, 157–168, 224, 228,  
237, 284, 288–291  
attentional resolution vs. sensory  
resolution, 15  
attentional tracking (*see* Multiple-  
object tracking task)  
awareness, 51  
capacity limitations, 79  
central executive, 55, 70, 71  
change blindness, 26  
cueing studies, 16, 51, 62, 81,  
156–168  
focal (*see* Attention)  
location-based, 63–65, 161, 284,  
288–291  
multifocal (*see* Multiple-object  
tracking task)  
multiple-spotlight view, 61  
object-based, 19–26, 57–65, 95,  
160–164, 237  
preattentive processing, 16, 54

- Attention (cont.)  
 selective (*see* Attention)  
 spotlight of (*see* Attention)  
 visual search task, 17–18, 33, 59–60, 70–71, 157–158, 161–163  
 zoom lens (*see* Attention)
- Balint's syndrome (simultagnosia), 20, 34, 104
- Behaviorism, 177–178, 245–247
- Bever, T. G., 178
- Binding problem, 9, 20–21, 32, 40, 311–312, 323–330
- Bonini's paradox, 179–180
- Brain damage  
 apraxia, 125  
 Balint's syndrome (simultagnosia), 20, 34, 104  
 neglect (unilateral neglect, hemispatial neglect), 20, 34  
 optic ataxia, 104–105, 125–126  
 right vs. left hemisphere damage and grasping, 125  
 visual form agnosia, 105–110
- Bregman, A., 213–214
- Burge, T., 272
- Burkell, J., 16
- Campbell, J., 6, 21
- Carey, S., 34, 228–229
- Cavanagh, P., 15
- Change blindness, 26, 40–41, 72
- Chiang, W.-C., 35
- Chomsky, N., 201–202, 209, 211, 247–248
- Churchland, P. M., 191
- Clark, A., 9–10, 21, 303–329
- Cognitive development. *See* Development
- Cognitive penetrability, 157, 248–251, 259, 263–265  
 and inhibition of return, 157–168  
 and vision-for-action, 103–104
- Cohen, Y., 157, 161, 287–288
- Cook, E. P., 146
- Comparative cognitive science, 175, 219–220
- Computational level of explanation, 175, 249–253  
 and connectionism, 178–179, 251
- Computational theory of the mind (CTM), vii–x, 259–280
- Computer–mind analogy, vii, 219
- Concepts, x–xiv  
 concept argument, 266, 272, 276, 298–299, 306–314  
 falling under a conceptual description, 5, 7, 11, 33, 299  
 number, 221, 223–224  
 object, 35, 223  
 preconceptual (nonconceptual)  
 individuation, 4–7, 13, 33, 298–299, 305–308  
 preconceptual object representation, 314–315
- Connectionism, 175–195  
 and algorithmic level of explanation, 179–193  
 Bonini's paradox, 179  
 classical architectures vs.  
 connectionist, vii, 176–178, 215, 251, 259–261, 264  
 computational power, 178–179, 185, 194  
 Fodor and Pylyshyn critique, vii–viii, 176, 178–179, 194  
 hidden units, 179, 261  
 implementation level of explanation, 193–194, 251  
 learning in, 177  
 McCullough–Pitts network, 179  
 rule–symbol distinction, 177, 265  
 subsymbolic representation, 177, 261
- Consciousness, 21, 247, 249, 251, 260, 273–276
- Cueing paradigm. *See also* Attention  
 costs and benefits, 158

- cue validity, 158, 162–163  
inhibition of return, 22–23, 95,  
157–168  
spatial cueing, 51, 62, 157  
Cummins, D., 235
- Darwin, C., 219, 220, 222  
Davidson, D., 271–272, 277  
de Grave, D. D., 117  
Dennett, D. C., 267, 270, 273–274  
Descartes, R., 252  
DeSouza, J. F. X., 113  
Development  
multiple-object tracking across the  
lifespan, 79–96  
number processing, 224–227  
object concept, 34–35, 63, 80,  
223  
Domains of specialization, 220. *See also*  
Modules  
Dorsal pathway, 71, 102–105, 107,  
111–112, 117–119, 122–129  
Dretske, F., 267, 272–277  
Driver, J., 24  
Dyde, R. T., 118
- Egly, R., 24  
Embodied cognition (situated  
cognition), 6  
Enumeration, 16, 80, 96. *See also*  
Number  
auditory, 222, 226–227  
estimation, 238  
subitizing, 16  
Evans, G., 321  
Evolution, 219–238  
Eye movements, 4, 18–19, 65, 158
- Feature(s), 17–22, 25, 51, 63, 71–72,  
141–143, 290  
feature hierarchy theory, 314  
feature integration theory, 21, 327  
feature map, 284–286, 291–296  
feature placing hypothesis, 294–296,  
304–306  
Figure-ground, 30  
Fingers of instantiation (FINSTs), 3–41,  
53–69, 94–95, 158–160, 169, 307  
causal connections with the world,  
xiii, 4–6, 8, 22, 32–33, 37  
demonstrative reference, xiii, 5–8, 12,  
19, 26, 35, 37, 41, 55–56, 59,  
320–322, 329  
focal attention differences from, 5,  
50–52  
incremental representation, 4, 9, 13,  
24, 35  
indexing, 11–12, 14, 19, 26, 29,  
30–33, 53–60, 69, 158, 160, 168, 307  
individuation, 10–16, 26, 28, 31, 33,  
35, 37, 71  
multifocal attention vs. preattentive  
tokens, 38–40, 53–60  
and multiple-location inhibition of  
return, 161  
multiple-object tracking task (*see*  
Multiple-object tracking task)  
object files and, 4, 22, 32, 94  
proto-objects and, 8–9, 28, 37, 229  
subitizing, 16  
subset selection task, 16–17  
Fodor, J. A., 54, 178–179, 251–252,  
259–260, 262, 267–270, 272, 276  
Foraging, 221, 229–232  
Frame of reference, 102, 287–288  
egocentric, 112  
multiple-object tracking and, 52  
object-centered, 20  
scene-based, 113  
Fusiform gyri, 107–110
- Gallistel, C. R., 220  
Ganel, T., 123–124  
Garrett, M., 178  
Geach, P. T., 299  
Gelman, R., 227

- Gestalt  
 figure-ground segmentation, 30  
 proximity constraint, 326, 328
- Gilbert, C. D., 149, 150, 152
- Glover, S., 116–118
- Gonzalez, C. L., 123–126, 128
- Grasping, 106, 111–112, 117, 122–125, 128  
 absolute metrics vs. relational, 111–113, 128–129  
 awkward grasping movements, 123, 128  
 brain damage as it affects, 104–111, 125–126  
 grip aperture, 105, 113–118, 122  
 handedness (left- vs. right-handed), 122–128  
 illusions as they affect  
 Ebbinghaus illusion, 114–119, 122, 124  
 Ponzo illusion, 116–117, 123–124, 128  
 rod and frame illusion, 116, 118  
 simultaneous tilt illusion, 116, 118  
 size contrast illusions, 114–115, 118, 122  
 precision grip, 112, 123, 125–126  
 visually guided vs. memory-guided, 118
- Greeno, J. G., 193
- Gutheil, G., 34
- Haffenden, A. M., 114, 117
- Halle, M., 208
- Haptic reaching/searching paradigm, 225
- Hartung, B., 121
- Hasegawa, T., 227
- Hauser, L., 229
- Hauser, M., 228–229
- Hebb, D. O., 245–246
- Hiraki, K., 227
- Homogeny vs. homoplasy, 220
- Homunculus, 249, 253–254
- Hooker, C. A., 191
- Identification of objects, 71, 238, 306, 318–321, 330
- Idsardi, W., 208
- Illusions, 11, 214, 264. *See also*  
 Grasping, illusions as they affect
- Illusory conjunctions, 326
- Illusory contour figures (Kanizsa figures), 164
- Implementation level of explanation, 175–176, 250–254, 262–263, 273, 278  
 and connectionism, 193–194, 251
- Indexing, 11–12, 14, 19, 26, 29, 30–33, 53–60, 69, 158, 160, 168, 297, 307
- Individuation, 10–16, 26, 28, 31, 33, 35, 37, 71, 260, 311, 291  
 individutive constraints, 310–313, 318–319  
 object individuation vs. object identification, 117, 295–300  
 preconceptual object individuation, 295–299, 307 (*see also* Fingers of instantiation)
- Inferotemporal cortex, 102, 107, 118
- Inhibition of return, 22–24, 157–168  
 location-based vs. object-based, 24  
 multiple-location, 161
- Inhibitory tagging, 162
- Intertheoretic reduction, 150, 186, 192
- Intriligator, J., 15
- Jackendoff, R., x
- James, T. W., 107–108, 111
- James, William, 260
- Kahneman, D., 4, 22
- Kaplan, D., 320
- Kaplan, R., 212
- Klein, R., 162
- Kobayashi, T., 227

- Koch, C., 33  
Kosslyn, S. M., 282–284, 292–293  
Króliczak, G., 119, 121
- Lateral occipital complex, 107, 108  
Lewandowsky, S., 179  
Linguistics, 201–217  
  edge marking rule, 208–209  
  obligatory contour principle, 205  
  optimality theory, 211–212  
  unprocessable language, 207–210  
Lipton, J. S., 226  
Looking time paradigm, 34, 224, 227–228
- Many properties problem. *See* Binding problem  
Marking, 10, 95, 161–162, 168  
Marr, D., 32  
Martinez-Trujillo, J. C., 145  
Maunsell, J. H. S., 141–142, 144–146, 148, 152–153  
McAdams, C. J., 142, 146, 148  
McCarthy, J. J., 211–212  
McClosky, M., 179  
Messiaen, O., 185  
Milner, A. D., 103, 111–119, 128  
Mishkin, M., 102–103  
Molecular and/or cellular cognition, 139–155  
Moore, J. L., 193  
Morgan, C. L., 220  
Morgan's Canon, 220  
Memory, 260, 273  
  scene memory, 70–71  
  semantic memory representation of number, 225  
  short-term, 83, 86, 88, 225, 226, 237  
  working, 52, 60, 152  
Modules, 9, 12, 34, 201–217, 221, 250–251  
Mouth movements, 125–127
- Multifocal attention. *See* Multiple-object tracking task; Cueing paradigm  
Multiple-object tracking task, 22–41, 49–72, 79–96, 159, 166  
  age differences across the lifespan in, 79–96  
  attentional amplification, 65  
  attentional concentration, 65  
  attentional vs. preattentive basis, 38–40, 53–60  
  central executive working memory and, 55, 70, 71  
  change blindness, 26, 40–41, 72  
  contrast sensitivity and, 91–94  
  distinguishing between targets based on names, 29, 39–40, 57–59  
  error recovery, 55  
  expertise and videogames, 53  
  full vs. partial report, 82  
  immediate vs. delayed report of static objects and, 83, 89–91  
  objects and, 8–9, 28, 61, 37, 297  
  occlusion, 27–28, 31, 36, 52, 164, 166  
  probe detection and, 65–69  
  scene memory and, 70–71  
  set tracking, 38–40, 56–59  
  sources of extraneous variance in, 93–96  
  visual search and, 59
- Nakajima, Y., 214  
Nativism, 205  
Neglect (visual, hemispatial, unilateral), 20, 34  
Newsome, W. T., 152  
Nissen, M. J., 21  
Number  
  abstract representation of, 227, 263, 265  
  addition and subtraction, 225–226, 228–229, 245

- Number (cont.)
- analog magnitude representation vs. object files, 238
  - animal sensitivity to
    - crabs (*Carcinus maenas*), 235–237
    - nonhuman primates, 227–230
    - piglets (*Sus scrofa*), 230–232
    - salamanders (*Plethodon cinereus*), 232–235
  - concept, 221, 223–224
  - cross-modal matching, 227–228
  - discrimination, 225–226, 229, 230–237
  - enumeration, 16, 80, 96
  - evolution of, 219–238
  - infants and, 224–227
  - ordinality, 226, 228, 230
  - small number system, 237
  - subitizing, 16
- Object(s)
- attention, object-based, 19–26, 57–65, 95, 160–164, 237
  - cohesion, 63–65, 223
  - concept, 35, 63, 223
  - identification, 71, 117, 295–300, 306–307
  - individuation, 10–16, 26, 28, 31, 33, 35, 37, 71, 223, 295–300, 306–307
  - vs. proto-objects, 8–9, 28, 37
  - spatiotemporal stability and, 68–69
  - Object files, 237, 299
    - fingers of instantiation and, 4
    - number and, 237–238
  - Occlusion, xiii, 27–28, 31, 36, 52, 164, 166
  - Odden, D., 212
  - Ohala, J. J., 211
  - Optic ataxia, 104–105, 125–126
  - O'Rourke, P. J., 285, 290–292, 297, 300
- Parahippocampal gyri, 108–110
- Parallel distributed processing networks (PDP). *See* Connectionism
- Parietal cortex, 102–104, 111–112, 125
- Pashler, H. E., 21
- Pattern classification, 179, 190
- Perenin, M. T., 125
- Perry, J., 8
- Pointing vs. flicking movements, 119–122
- Pomerleau, D. A., 193
- Posner, M. I., 157–158, 161
- Practice effects
  - in grasping, 123
  - inhibition of return, 164
  - visual search, 163–164
- Praxis network, 125–126
- Preattentive. *See* Attention
- Prince, A., 211–212
- Probe detection task, 65
- Production system, 187–188, 192, 193
- Pullum, G., 205
- Putnam, H., 272, 276
- Quine, W. V. O., 6, 299
- Rafal, R. D., 24
- Ramachandran, V. S., 296
- Recanzone, G. H., 145
- Reductionism, 139, 149–150, 152–153, 191–192
- Reference
  - bare demonstratives, xii–xiv, 6
  - causal theories of direct reference, xiii, 320
  - demonstrative, 5, 7, 12, 26, 35, 55–56
  - discrete reference principle, 59
  - linguistic, xi, 253, 272, 274, 276, 320–321
  - nonconceptual or preconceptual reference, xii–xiii, 7–9, 33, 290, 295, 298, 307–308, 314–315 (*see also* Fingers of instantiation)
  - perceptual demonstratives, 320
  - sensory reference, 320
- Reflexive processing, and inhibition of return, 162–168

- Relational properties, 13, 14, 24, 31, 38  
 Representation, 3, 141, 213–214, 260–261, 264  
     conceptual, xi–xiii, 6, 314  
     connectionism and, 177, 180, 261, 264  
     externalist theory of, 272–277  
     incremental, 4, 9, 13, 24, 35  
     linguistic, ix, 204–207  
     mental, vii–xiv, 212, 266–270  
     nonconceptual, xii–xiii, 4, 6–9, 281–302, 305  
     propositional, 266, 281, 329  
     sensory, 286–287, 303  
     subsymbolic, 180  
 Representational theory of mind, 175, 177, 178, 219  
 Richard, C. M., 164
- Saccades, 4, 18–19, 65, 158  
 Scene memory, 70  
 Schiff, K. C., 117  
 Scholl, B. J., 28, 31, 38–39  
 Scholz, B., 205  
 Schopflocher, D. P., 189  
 Search/reach paradigm, 228–229  
 Searle, J. R., 253–255  
 Seidenberg, M., 179  
 Selection. *See* Attention  
 Sentience, 21, 303–322  
 Shepard, R. N., 250, 283  
 Simon, H. A., 192–193  
 Simultagnosia. *See* Balint's syndrome  
 Situated action theories, 6, 38, 192  
 Skinner, B. F., 245–247, 250  
 Smolensky, P., 211–212  
 Spelke, E., 34–35, 226–227  
 Sperling, G., 24  
 Starkey, P., 227  
 Storm, R. W., 27–28, 54, 79, 82, 159, 161  
 Strawson, P. F., 295, 322–324  
     attributive ties, 323  
     individuation and identity, 10, 295–296  
     predicates, 322–323  
     subjects, 10, 322  
 Strong equivalence vs. weak equivalence, 176  
 Subitizing, 16. *See also* Number  
 Symbol(s), xii, xiv, 139–140, 177, 213–214, 246, 251–255, 260, 265, 272–273, 276. *See also* Connectionism  
 Symbol grounding, 251–255  
 Symbol–rule distinction, 177, 265. *See also* Connectionism
- Tagging, 10  
 Tipper, S. P., 22, 24, 160  
 Touretzky, D. S., 193  
 Transducer, 207–208, 213–215, 289  
 Treisman, A., 21, 314  
 Treue, S., 145  
 Trick, L. M., 16  
 Tri-level hypothesis, 139–141, 153, 175  
 Turing, A. M., vii, xii, 253, 255  
 Turing machine, 175, 178, 179  
 Turing test, 253–255
- Ullman, S., 10, 14, 33  
 Ungerleider, L. G., 102–103  
 Universal Grammar (UG), 201–217, 247–248  
     competence theories, 202–203, 213, 247–248, 253
- Van de Walle, G., 34  
 Ventral pathway, 71, 102–125  
 Vera, A. H., 192–193  
 Vighetto, A., 125  
 Vision-for-perception vs. vision-for-action, 104, 113–114, 118, 123, 128  
 Visual indexing theory. *See* Fingers of instantiation  
 Visual routines, 10, 40

- Visual search task, 17, 33, 59–60, 70–71, 158, 161–163
  - conjunction search, 17
  - feature search, 17
- Visuomotor control, 105. *See also*
  - Action(s)
- Von Eckardt, B., 192
  
- Weichselgarter, E., 24
- Westwood, D. A., 113, 117
- What vs. where pathway, 102–103
- Wiggins, D., 299
- Winner-take-all network, 33
- Wittgenstein, L., 248, 271–272, 277
- Wright, R. D., 164
- Wurtz, R. K., 145
- Wynn, K., 35
  
- Xu, F., 34
  
- Yantis, S., 31, 39, 160
- Yi, D. J., 166