

# Language and Equilibrium

**Prashant Parikh**

The MIT Press  
Cambridge, Massachusetts  
London, England

© 2010 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information about special quantity discounts, please e-mail  
special\_sales@mitpress.mit.edu

This book was set in Times New Roman and Syntax on 3B2 by Asco Typesetters,  
Hong Kong.

Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Parikh, Prashant.

Language and equilibrium / Prashant Parikh.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-01345-1 (hardcover : alk. paper)

1. Pragmatics. 2. Grammar, Comparative and general—Syntax. 3. Game—  
theoretical semantics. 4. Semantics (Philosophy) I. Title.

P99.4.P72P365 2010

401'.43—dc22

2009015862

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

## Index

- Action, 71, 309  
Agent, 13  
Akman, Varol, 151n  
Allen, Woody, 71  
Ambiguity, 22, 23, 84, 88, 129, 149,  
152, 166, 184–186, 212–216, 235,  
244–246, 249, 260, 265, 266, 283  
Anaphora, 203, 267–268, 298  
Anchor, 44, 68  
Archimedes, 214n  
Arrow, Kenneth, 295  
Artificial intelligence, 309  
Assignment, 46–48  
Aumann, Robert, 115n  
Auster, Paul, 37  
Austin, J. L., 2–4, 4n, 5n, 6n, 16n, 24,  
172, 196, 209, 215, 323  
  
Bach, Kent, 232  
Barthes, Roland, 12n  
Barwise, Jon, 4, 11, 16, 41, 43, 47, 48,  
50, 58, 70n, 126, 151n, 153n, 185,  
211, 236, 271, 292, 304  
Battle of the Sexes, 74n  
Beaver, David, 89n  
Benefits, 100–102, 321  
Benz, Anton, 20, 33  
Bernheim, Douglas, 114n  
Bezuidenhout, Anne, 8n, 232  
Blutner, Reinhard, 20n  
Bonaparte, Napoleon, 249  
Borges, Jorge Luis, 213  
Burge, Tyler, 85n  
  
Camerer, Colin, 80n  
Cappelen, Herman, 151n, 209  
Carroll, Lewis, 195  
Carston, Robyn, 5, 151n, 209  
Category theory, 41, 186, 189  
Cauchy, Augustin Louis, 210  
Causality, 11, 11n  
Character, 3  
Chierchia, Gennaro, 163n  
Cho, In-Koo, 114n  
Choice, 26, 27, 30, 35, 72–83, 130  
Clark, Herbert, 220  
Clark, Robin, 22, 89, 96n, 97, 101n,  
125n, 198, 203, 298  
Cohen, Ariel, 24n  
Common knowledge, 105–110, 262,  
296  
Communication, 23, 35, 279, 288, 291  
    animal, 221  
    definition of, 218–229  
Compositionality  
    fixed point, 17, 149, 287  
    Fregean, 15, 17, 148–149, 287  
Computational linguistics, 13, 24n, 301  
Constraint, 11, 30–31, 39, 45, 125, 144  
Context. *See* Meaning  
Context set, 4, 4n  
Contextual coordinates, 3  
Cooper, Robin, 271  
Copernicus, Nicolaus, 231  
Costs, 100–102, 312, 321  
Cournot, Augustin, 25  
Crawford, V. P., 322

- Davis, Steven, 232
- Deacon, Terrence, 9, 11, 221, 293, 295
- Debreu, Gerard, 295
- Decision problem, 72, 92, 93n, 160, 305, 307
- Derrida, Jacques, 12n, 13, 215, 283
- de Saussure, F., 12n, 26–28, 295
- Descriptions
- attributive use of, 232, 245–267, 299
  - definite, 8, 35, 233–268
  - generic use of, 245–267
  - incomplete, 242
  - indefinite, 232, 268–269
  - predicative use of, 245–267
  - referential use of, 231–267, 299
- Devlin, Keith, 38n, 41
- Discourse, 297–298
- Discourse representation theory, 5n, 15
- Discourse state, 66, 298
- Donnellan, Keith, 18, 232, 236, 242, 243, 259, 260, 262, 263
- Dostoevsky, Fyodor, 24
- Dretske, Fred, 7, 11, 11n, 58, 110
- Dynamic logic, 5n
- Eco, Umberto, 12n
- Efficiency, 22, 23
- Einstein, Albert, 123
- Environment, 66
- Epigenetics, 304
- Equilibrium, 1, 8, 13, 25–32, 91, 145, 189, 229, 231, 283, 285, 288, 297, 301
- by backward induction, 112
  - divinity, 113
  - by forward induction, 112
  - global, 133, 134, 138, 140, 143, 148, 249, 257, 259, 285, 325
  - intuitive criterion, 113
  - iterated dominance, 113
  - metaphysical, 302
  - mixed strategy, 198–203, 307
  - Nash, 78n, 79, 79n, 91, 95, 111–114, 165, 220, 305, 325
  - Pareto Nash, 91, 95, 110–120, 132, 143, 157, 175, 199, 201n, 202, 202n, 220, 305
  - payoff dominant, 116, 116n
  - perfect, 113
  - perfect Bayesian, 110–113, 325
  - proper, 113
  - risk dominant, 116–120, 201n, 305, 325
  - separating, 307
  - sequential, 113
  - stable, 114
  - subgame perfect, 111
  - universal divinity, 113
- Equilibrium semantics, 1, 5, 18, 32, 33, 127, 145, 157–160, 169, 229, 232, 236, 258, 265, 283, 325
- Equilibrium syntax, 285, 287
- Etchemendy, John, 304
- Fehling, Michael, 20
- Feynman, Richard, 1
- File change semantics, 5n
- Finnegans Wake*, 229–230
- Fixed point principle, 17, 30
- Formal pragmatics, 33
- Formal semantics, 2, 5n, 15, 16, 16n, 65n
- Free enrichment, 125, 151–162, 166
- Frege, Gottlob, 2, 3n, 14, 15, 17, 29, 85n, 148, 149, 231, 236, 242, 271, 286, 287, 298
- Game, 73–83
- complete information, 83
  - cooperative, 115n
  - coordination, 28n, 90, 115n
  - evolutionary, 106, 120
  - extensive form, 28n, 80, 82, 87, 90, 92, 313
  - glocal, 120–121
  - illocutionary, 124
  - imperfect information, 83, 313
  - incomplete information, 28n, 83n, 87n, 111, 313, 314, 315, 322, 323, 324
  - lexical, 123, 130–138, 249, 310, 325
  - locutionary, 123
  - mixed-motive, 115n
  - noncooperative, 115n

- partial information, 14, 28, 87, 110, 115n, 130, 138, 163, 284, 303–325  
 perfect information, 83, 313  
 phrasal, 123, 138–145, 255  
 sentential, 123, 138–145, 255  
 signaling, 313, 323–324  
 strategic form, 28n, 77, 80, 82, 90, 92, 313  
 subjective, 105–110, 150, 157, 164, 204, 296  
 zero-sum, 116  
 Game theory, 1, 17, 20, 21, 30, 33–35, 80, 191, 284, 305, 306, 309  
   behavioral, 80, 296, 306  
   evolutionary, 105, 106, 295, 306  
 Garden path sentence, 102, 176–184, 203, 283, 287  
 Gawron, Jean Mark, 44n  
 Generalized quantifiers, 232, 271–277  
 Generativity, 13, 229, 285, 288  
 Genetics, 304  
 Gintis, Herbert, 105n  
 Glimcher, Paul, 29n, 299  
 Grammar, 63, 98–100, 129, 284, 288, 290  
 Grice, Paul, 2, 3, 5n, 20, 23–24, 27, 30–34, 49n, 59, 94, 110, 116, 123–126, 165, 166–170, 196, 198, 218, 222–224, 232, 235, 243–245, 263, 266, 283, 292  
 Gricean maxims, 33, 166  
 Gronendijk, J., 5n  
 Grothendieck, Alexander, 270  
  
 Halpern, Joseph, 296  
 Harsanyi, John, 116, 116n, 313, 315, 322  
 Hegel, G. W. F., 5  
 Heim, Irene, 5n  
 Heuristics, 299  
 Hirsch, E. D., 215  
 Horn, Larry, 123n, 167  
 Hume, David, 28n  
  
 Idiom, 124n  
 Illocutionary act, 5n  
 Illocutionary force, 3, 7, 25, 125, 165, 204–206  
 Implicature, 3, 25, 30–33, 125, 151, 162–165, 283  
 Indeterminacy, 8, 13, 23–25, 34, 110, 145, 150–151, 153, 229, 231, 263, 267, 279, 280, 281, 283, 292, 298, 307  
   radical, 302  
 Index semantics, 3  
 Infon, 38, 42–43, 46–61  
 Information, 10–14, 15, 37–41, 304  
 Information flow, 2, 10, 11, 13, 23, 218, 225, 226, 227, 228  
 Information set, 81, 314  
 Information theory, 58–60  
 Intention, 20, 24, 64, 90, 196–198, 215, 221  
 Ionesco, Eugene, 207  
  
 Jäger, Gerhard, 33  
 Jakobson, Roman, 12n  
 Joint act, 220, 220n  
 Joshi, Aravind, 290  
 Joyce, James, 68, 197  
  
 Kahneman, Daniel, 20  
 Kamp, Hans, 5n  
 Kant, Immanuel, 184  
 Kaplan, David, 3, 5  
 Kaufmann, Stefan, 24n  
 Keller, Helen, 9n  
 Klir, George, 272  
 Kneale, W. C., 85n  
 Kohlberg, Elon, 114n, 115n  
 Kreps, David, 28n, 114n, 115n, 313, 323  
 Kripke, Saul, 3, 17, 35, 85n, 232, 235, 242, 243, 259–269  
 Kuhn, Harold, 28n, 313, 324n  
  
 Lawvere, F. William, 41n  
 Lepore, Ernest, 151n, 209  
 Levinson, Stephen, 167  
 Lewis, David, 3, 5, 13, 28, 28n, 92, 105, 313  
 Linsky, Leonard, 263

- Locutionary act, 5n  
 Logicism, 19n, 29  
 Lyons, Christopher, 232
- Mac Lane, Saunders, 41n  
 Macrosemantics, 32, 293, 310  
 Manning, Christopher, 225n  
 Martinich, A. P., 232  
 Maslow, Abraham, 302n  
 Mass media, 226n  
 Meaning, 10–14, 34–35, 39–41, 57, 68, 69, 216–218  
   addressee, 203–208, 222  
   conventional, 18, 49n, 64, 123, 124, 125, 129, 149, 291–295  
   illocutionary, 7n, 124, 150, 165, 168–172, 196, 283, 311  
   literal, 123, 151, 283  
   locutionary, 7n, 69n, 123–124, 145, 150, 151, 165, 168–172, 196, 283, 310  
   natural and nonnatural, 23, 28, 221, 228  
   pipeline view of, 5n, 123, 232, 288  
   referential, 18, 64, 67, 129, 149, 292  
   speaker, 203–208, 222  
 Merin, Arthur, 33, 93n  
 Mertens, Jean-François, 114n, 115n  
 Metaphysics, 302  
 Microsemantics, 32  
 Miscommunication, 204  
 Modal realism, 16n  
 Model theory, 4, 16n, 41, 70, 145, 190, 285  
 Mondrian, Piet, 301  
 Montague, Richard, 3, 5, 29  
 Moore, G. E., 246  
 Morandi, Giorgio, 327  
 Morgenstern, Oskar, 28n  
 Morphology, 294  
 Morris, Charles, 5n, 6  
 Moss, Larry, 41  
 Myerson, Roger, 72, 94n, 114n
- Names, 85, 232, 269–271  
 Neale, Stephen, 232, 233, 243  
 Neanderthals, 9n
- Neuroscience, 299  
 Newton, Isaac, 25
- Ontological map, 61–62, 129, 246, 248, 251, 284, 295  
 Ontology, 9, 16, 231, 302  
 Optimality theory, 20n  
 Osborne, Martin, 201  
 Ostertag, Gary, 232
- Paradigm, 1, 33  
 Paraphrase, 98, 120  
 Partee, Barbara, 16n  
 Partiality, 35, 39, 43, 70n  
 Particle physics, 304  
 Payoffs, 64, 75, 92, 285, 318  
 Pearl, Judea, 121n  
 Peirce, C. S., 12, 221, 295  
 Perlocutionary act, 5n  
 Perlocutionary effect, 5n  
 Perry, John, 4, 11, 16, 19n, 126, 185, 236, 292  
 Peters, Stanley, 44n, 271  
 Philosophy, 309  
   ideal language, 2  
   ordinary language, 2–3, 20  
 Phonology, 31, 216, 259, 291, 302n  
 Pietarinen, Ahti-Veikko, 20  
 Poincaré, Henri, 283  
 Possible worlds, 4, 70n  
 Pragmatics, 3–8, 30–34, 70, 123, 124, 283  
 Predicate logic, 15  
 Preference, 73–78, 94  
 Presupposition, 60, 240, 241n, 269  
 Primary utterance, 88, 120  
 Prince, Alan, 98n  
 Prisoner's Dilemma, 114  
 Proposition, 44, 150, 172–173, 211  
 Proust, Marcel, 68  
 Psycholinguistics, 177–183, 283, 300  
 Putnam, Hilary, 18, 291
- Quantum mechanics, 11n, 50, 210
- Radical pragmatics, 5, 33–34, 151, 209  
 Radical semantics, 5

- Ramey, Gary, 115n  
 Rationality, 22, 75, 115  
 Recanati, François, 5, 19n, 123n, 151n, 152, 153n, 154, 209, 243n  
 Reference, 2–8, 12, 14–18, 86n, 91, 145, 229, 231, 283, 298  
 Rego, Leandro, 296  
 Reimer, Marga, 8n, 232  
 Relevance, 92, 160  
 Relevance Theory, 5, 214, 232–233  
 Representation, 6, 12  
   gestural, 6  
   mental, 6  
   visual, 6  
 Robotics, 309  
 Rorty, Richard, 2  
 Ross, Ian, 163n  
 Rubinstein, Ariel, 201  
 Russell, Bertrand, 2, 2n, 8, 14, 29, 35, 231, 233, 240–245, 263, 283
- Salience, 278  
 Saturation, 124, 152, 166  
 Sauerland, Uli, 163n  
 Schanuel, Stephen H., 41n  
 Schelling, Thomas, 28, 28n, 92, 114n, 313  
 Schiffer, Stephen, 23, 105, 198, 223, 224  
 Schütze, Hinrich, 300n  
 Searle, John, 85n, 259, 261  
 Seligman, Jerry, 41, 50, 211  
 Selten, Reinhard, 114n, 116, 116n  
 Semantics, 3–8, 18, 30–34, 70, 123, 124, 283, 286  
 Setting, 71–72, 81, 83, 87, 93  
 Shakespeare, William, 303  
 Shannon, Claude, 11, 58  
 Sign, 11, 221  
 Situation, 4, 11  
   described, 66, 278, 279  
   discourse, 64–66  
   possible, 16n, 312, 314  
   resource, 66, 127, 128, 247, 272, 273, 277–281  
   utterance, 21, 64–66, 247, 278, 279  
 Situation semantics, 4, 16, 16n  
 Situation theory, 1, 4, 11, 16, 20, 21, 35, 41–48, 284, 303, 304, 309  
 Smith, Adam, 25  
 Smolensky, Paul, 98n  
 Sobel, J., 322  
 Social science, 14, 25  
 Social system, 296  
 Speaker meaning, 218  
 Spence, Michael, 116n, 322  
 Sperber, Dan, 5  
 St. Clair, Ute, 272  
 Stalnaker, Robert, 3, 4n, 5n, 65, 232, 236  
 Stewart, James, 72  
 Stokhof, M., 5n  
 Strategic inference, 190–193, 284, 299, 304  
 Strategic interaction, 28, 30, 110, 202, 227, 296, 304  
 Strategy, 82  
   mixed, 91  
   pure, 91  
 Strawson, P. F., 2, 23, 27, 196n, 220, 223, 224, 232, 236, 240, 245, 249, 262  
 String theory, 304  
 Suggestion, 204, 225–227  
 Symbol, 6, 8–12, 221, 295  
 Symbol system, 11, 302  
 Symbolic consciousness, 8  
 Syntax, 5n, 6, 7, 31, 284–291, 302, 326
- Tannen, Deborah, 204, 206  
 Tarski, Alfred, 14  
 Tattersall, Ian, 9n  
 Travis, Charles, 209  
 Truth, 196, 209–212, 240, 280, 283  
 Tversky, Amos, 20
- Universality, 35, 186–190, 284, 289, 305, 326  
 Use, 2–8, 12, 16n, 18–23, 91, 145, 229, 231, 232  
 Utility function, 75, 90, 92, 94, 100–101. *See also* Payoffs; Preference  
 Utterance, 21, 24, 88, 120

- Vagueness, 13, 152  
van Orman Quine, Willard, 28n, 40,  
302  
van Rooij, Robert, 33, 93n, 324n  
Vervet monkeys, 221, 295  
Vocabulary, 63, 186  
von Fintel, Kai, 241n  
von Neumann, John, 28n
- Ward, Gregory, 123n  
Watson, Joel, 72  
Westerståhl, Dag, 271  
White, Morton, 28n  
Whitehead, Alfred North, 2  
Wilson, Deirdre, 5  
Wilson, Robert, 28n, 314, 323  
Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 2, 24, 195, 207,  
295
- Yeltsin, Boris, 151n  
Yuan, Bo, 272
- Zeevat, Henk, 20n  
Zermelo, Ernst, 35n