The Development and Testing of Heckscher-Ohlin Trade Models: A Review

Robert E. Baldwin

The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England

© 2008 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

MIT Press books may be purchased at special quantity discounts for business or sales promotional use. For information, please e-mail special _sales@mitpress.mit.edu or write to Special Sales Department, The MIT Press, 55 Hayward Street, Cambridge, MA 02142.

This book was set in Palatino on 3B2 by Asco Typesetters, Hong Kong and was printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Baldwin, Robert E.
The development and testing of Heckscher-Ohlin trade models : a review / Robert E. Baldwin.
p. cm. — (Ohlin lectures)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-0-262-02656-7 (hc : alk. paper) 1. International trade—Econometric models. I. Title.
HF1379.B355 2008
382.01′5195—dc22 2008016995

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Index

American Economic Review, and Stolper-Samuelson theorem, 25
Autarky conditions, 1, 2, 3, 35, 37, 40

Baldwin and Cain, on Stolper-Samuelson effects, 136–40
Balance of trade
 and HOV theorem, 65
 and Leontief paradox (BLS), 74–76, 77, 78, 79–80
 and Leontief paradox (Leamer), 68, 69, 72, 73, 86
Beaulieu, E., on Stolper-Samuelson effects, 129–30
Beaulieu and C. Magee, on Stolper-Samuelson effects, 130–31
Bernard, Robertson, and Schott, on the lens condition, 163
Bernard, Redding, and Schott, on factor price equalization, 164–66
Bhagwati, J., 25, 29, 64
Bowen, Leamer, and Sveikauskas (BLS)
 and definition of factor abundance, 173
 HOV model tested by, 90–94, 95, 96, 104, 118, 174
  and demand side of trade, 185
 and Leontief paradox, 74–81
Bowen and Sveikauskas, 86
Bowley-Edgeworth box diagram, 17
Brecher and Choudhri, on Leontief paradox(es), 81–82, 173
Brecher-Chourdhri version of country-pair test, 49–50
Bureau of Census, US *See* Census Bureau, US
Bureau of Economic Analysis, US
 data from, 145
 input-output tables prepared by, 137
Bureau of Labor Statistics, data from, 137

Canada–US Free Trade Agreement, 130
Capital, and Rybczynski effects, 149, 150
Capital immobility, in HOS model, 178
Capital/labor ratios
 and absolute increase of capital and labor, 32
 and capital flow between countries, 178
 in Davis-Weinstein tests, 100
 and diversification cone, 157

Capital/labor ratios (cont.)
and factor price equalization, 41–42
and Helpman non–factor price equalization model, 54–55
intermediates in convergence of (US and ROW), 102
in Leontief paradox, 62–67
BLS on, 74–81, 84
Brecher and Choudhri on, 81–82
and lack of independent measures, 68, 82–84
Leamer on, 68–74, 77, 79, 80, 81, 86–87
and product varieties, 113
and sign matches (Debaere), 111
in Stolper-Samuelson theorem, 22, 23–24
Census Bureau, US, wage and employment data from, 137–38, 145
Chamberlin, Edward, 185
Chipman, J., 26
Choi and Krishna, 7, 10, 12, 116–17
Community indifference curve, 35, 36–37
Comparative advantage, 2, 52, 115
Comparative statics approach to trade theory, 10–11
Composition of output, and relative factor supplies, 121 (*see also* Rybczynski effects)
Cones of diversification, 4, 156
and Davis-Weinstein model, x, 100, 118–19
in developed vs. developing countries, 163
and factor-proportions specialization, 185
and globalization, 157
and "Heckscher-Ohlin aggregates," 158
and Heckscher-Ohlin proposition, 175
Helpman on, 53
and HOV model, 9
and returns to skilled and unskilled workers, 179
testing for, 10
Consumer preferences
and HO proposition, 2–3
and intra-industry trade, 51
Consumption levels, and HOV model, 44–45
Continuum of goods model, 198–99n.17
Cost minimization, 164–65
Countries' endowment lens, 160
Countries' factor-endowment lens, 161
Country effective factor endowment, 167
Country-pair tests, 48–50, 104–11
and Helpman test, 115–17
and increasing returns, 113–15
and intra-industry trade, 112–13
and technology differences (country and industry), 111–12

Davis-Weinstein tests, of HOV model, 98–103, 184
and demand side of trade, 185
and factor price equalization, 118–19
Debaere, P., 108–11
Debaere and Demiroglu, on the lens condition, 162–63
Deardorff, A., 6, 25–26, 52, 158–61. *See also* Staiger, Deardorff, and Stern
Demand differences, research needed on, 184–85
Developing countries, and country-pairs tests, 117. *See also* Poor countries

Differentiated products. *See also* Intra-industry trade
and firm heterogeneity, 180–81
and modified HO models, 185
and "new" trade theory, 50–52
Diversification cones. *See* Cones of diversification
Dynamic feedback effects of trade, and HOV model, 10–11
Dynamic models, and Ohlin, 10, 59

Economies of scale (increasing returns), 3, 10
and country-pair tests, 113–15
firm-level, 180
and Leontief results, 67
Ohlin on, 3, 57, 184
in regression analysis of factor content, 85
research needed on, 184
Education
and endogenous technological progress, 176–77
increase in, 152–53
and output (Harrigan), 150
regional differences in, 152
and wage inequality, 139–41, 153, 155
"Effect of Foreign Trade on the Distribution of Income, The" (Heckscher), 15
Effective factor endowment, country, 167
Effective total factor productivity (ETFP), 142
Endogenous growth theory or models, 176, 177
Endogenous technical change, 175–77
Endowment lens, 160
ETFP (effective total factor productivity), 142
Ethier, W., 26, 32, 42

Factor abundance
in Davis-Weinstein tests, 100
definitions of, 81
of poor countries, 95
and regression analysis, 86
Factor abundance, relative. *See* Relative factor abundance
Factor content
of consumption, 50
of country trade vs. individual good, 43
in Helpman non–factor price equalization model, 52, 55, 56
and HOV model, 6
of production (Davis-Weinstein tests), 98
and relative factor endowments, 9
Factor-content tests, 7, 62–68, 198n.15
of BLS, 92
of Choi and Krishna, 116–17
of Davis-Weinstein, 98–103, 118–19
of Hakura, 108
methodological criticisms of, 68–84, 87
and regression analysis, 84–86, 87
of Staiger, 104
of Trefler, 95, 110
Factor-content trade model, 7
and HO model, 2, 6 (*see also* Heckscher-Ohlin models)
Factor-content version of HO proposition, 121
Factor endowments
effective, 167
and factor prices, 156, 157, 169
lack of independent measures of, 68, 82–84
relative, x, 2, 9, 56–57, 87, 172 (*see also* Relative factor endowments)
in Stolper-Samuelson diagram, 18

Factor endowment of world
and country's factor endowment
as consumption vs. income, 81
and exports, 4, 45–48, 91
in HOV model, 6, 12, 45–48, 49, 167
for poor countries, 95
and trade, 43–44
and factor content of trade, 104
and relative factor abundance, 76–77
Factor-intensity lens, 160
Factor-intensity reversals, 66
Factor price equalization. *See also* Relative factor price equalization
absence of, 6, 54 (*see also* Non–factor price equalization model)
in modification of HOV model, 174.
Factor price equalization models, 7
Factor price equalization theorem, 4, 38–42, 121, 156–68, 169
in Davis-Weinstein tests, x, 100, 101, 118–19
and early investigation of HO proposition, 61
in Hanson-Slaughter model, 154
and HOV model, 48
Factor prices. S*ee also at* Relative factor price
and product prices, 17, 121, 122, 171 (*see also* Stolper-Samuelson effects)
and trade barriers, 186
Factor productivity
effective total (ETFP), 142
and Stolper-Samuelson effects, 169
Factor-proportions approach, of Heckscher and Ohlin, 171
Factor-proportions specialization, 185
Factor proportions trade theory, 7. *See also* Relative factor proportions
Factor trade
increased understanding of, 7
and production techniques (Hakura), 107–108
Feedback effects, of changes in trade, 5, 10
Feenstra and Hanson, on Stolper-Samuelson effects, 141–45
Firm heterogeneity, 180–84, 185
Foreign direct investment, 177–80
"proximity-concentration" trade-off in, 183
Foreign outsourcing. *See* Outsourcing
Foreign price pressures, and Stolper-Samuelson effects, 123–25
Free trade vs. protectionism. *See* Protectionism

GATT Uruguay Round Agreements, 130–31
Globalization
and factor prices (Leamer), 132, 134
and integrated world economy, 158
and separate cones of diversification, 157
and wage inequality, 135, 136
Goods' factor-intensity lens, 159, 161
Gravity equation or model, in Davis-Weinstein tests, 102–103, 115
Grubel and Lloyd, 51
Gross domestic product (GDP), Harrigan and Balaban on, 125–26

Gross domestic product function, estimating of, 145–47
Grossman and Helpman model, 176–77
Growth theory or models, endogenous, 176, 177

Haberler, G., 16
Hakura, D., 107–108
Hanson-Slaughter model, 151–55
Harrigan, James, 111–12
Harrigan-Balaban model, 125–28, 145–47, 148, 149–50
Heckscher, Eli, 1
 on free trade and factor prices, 38
"Heckscher-Ohlin aggregates," 158
Heckscher-Ohlin (HO) models
 empirical tests of, 7
 factor-proportions approach of, 171
 Heckscher on formalization of, 56–59
 modified, 118, 169
 and perfect factor mobility, 169
 and regression analysis, 85–86
 and relative factor endowments, 2, 87
Heckscher-Ohlin (HO) proposition, 2, 5, 12, 43
 bilateral, 117
 early empirical investigations of (Leontief paradox), 61, 62–68, 87, 172, 173–74, 194n.1
  methodological criticisms of, 68–84, 87
 extension of, 11–12
 factor-content version of, 121
 and factor price equalization, 54
 and HOV model modification, 9
 and income transfers, 73
 modification of, 95–97, 185
  by Ohlin, 57
 multi-country/multi-factor testing of, 7–8, 89–90, 103–104, 117–18
 BLS test, 90–94, 95, 96, 104, 118, 174, 185
 country-pair tests, 48–50, 104–11 (*see also* Country-pair tests)
 Davis-Weinstein test, 98–103, 118–19, 184, 185
 Staiger's test, 104
 Tefler's tests, 94–97, 110, 118, 174, 184, 185, 190n.7
 "strict" vs. "modified" (Hakura), 107
 two-factor, two-good, two-country version of, 33, 190n.4
 and Vanek relationship, 46
Heckscher-Ohlin theorems, 33–38
 and trade barriers, 186
Heckscher-Ohlin-Samuelson (HOS) model, 6, 16–17
 and factor price equalization theorem, 38–42, 156
 and Heckscher-Ohlin theorem, 33–38
 limitation of, 42–43
 mobility of factors assumed in, 129
 and Mundell study, 178
 and Rybczynski theorem, 26–33
 and Stolper-Samuelson theorem, 17–26
 as two-good, two-factor, 17, 31, 43
 variable-proportions, 172
Heckscher-Ohlin-Vanek (HOV) equation, 104–105, 167, 174, 195n.10
Heckscher-Ohlin-Vanek (HOV) model, ix, 6, 42–50, 172–73, 177
 alternative to, 185
 assumptions of, 50–52
 basic relationship in, 12
 BLS testing of, 90–94, 95, 96, 104, 118, 174

Heckscher-Ohlin-Vanek (cont.)
country-pair tests of, 48–50, 104–11 (*see also* Country-pair tests)
Davis-Weinstein tests of, 98–103
and dynamic feedback effects of trade, 10–11
and factor price equalization, 156, 158
and HOV theorem, 65
modifications of, 8–9, 173–75, 190n.7, 202n.1
on scale economies, 184
and separation of theory from empirical investigation, 187
Staiger's test of, 104
Trefler's tests of, 94–97, 110, 118, 174, 184, 190n.7
and modifications, 95–97
on trade in services of productive factors, 177–78
Heckscher-Ohlin-Vanek (HOV) relationship, basic, 167
Helpman non–factor price equalization model, 6–7, 52–56, 115–16, 157
Choi and Krishna on, 116–17
Helpman's relationship, 101
Helpman, E.
on foreign direct investment, 178–80,
on Melitz model, 181–84
Heterogeneous firms, 180–84, 185
Hicks, Ursula, 25
"Home market effect," 114
Homeownership, and support for trade barriers, 130
House Ways and Means committee, testimony to, 128–29
Hufbauer, G., 84, 85, 89
Human capital
and commodity composition of US trade, 85
and Leontief paradox, 65–66
"Idiosyncratic derived demand," 115
Income inequality. *See* Wage inequality
Income transfers, and HO proposition, 73
Increasing returns to scale. *See* Economies of scale
Inter-industry trade, 52
Intermediate goods
and country-pair tests, 116
in Davis-Weinstein tests, 101
double counting of, 195n.9
research needed on, 185
International trade theory, 1–2. *See also at* Heckscher-Ohlin; Rybczynski; Stolper-Samuelson
empirical investigations of, 175
evolution of, 56–57
and factor price equalization, 52, 156–68
in 1930s, 15–16
Ohlin on, 1–2, 57–59
real-side, 171–72
Ricardo on, 2
static terms in, 10
and wage inequality, 132
Interregional and International Trade (Ohlin), 5
Intra-industry trade, 51, 52
and country-pair tests, 112–13
in Davis-Weinstein tests, 103
Ohlin on, 185
Irwin, D., 129

Jones, R., 6, 11, 23, 26, 30, 33
Jorgenson, Dale, 145

Keesing, D., 65, 67, 89
Kravis, I., 65
Kreinin, M., 94n .2
Krugman, Paul, 51–52, 171

Labor, skilled vs. unskilled (Stolper-Samuelson), 123
Labor/capital ratios. See Capital/labor ratios
Labor immobility, and relative factor prices, 170
Lawrence and Slaughter, on Stolper-Samuelson effects
Leamer, E. E., on Leontief test, 68–74, 77, 79, 80, 81, 86–87, 172, 173
Leamer, E. E., on Stolper-Samuelson effects, 132–36
Lens condition, 160–64, 168
Leontief, Wassily, 12, 61–65
"Leontief commonplace," 73
Leontief paradox, 12, 63–68, 86
 BLS on, 74–81, 84
 Brecher and Choudhri on, 81–82
 disappearance of, 195n.9
 and lack of independent measure of factor endowments, 68, 82–84
 Leamer's criticism of, 68–74, 77, 79, 80, 81, 86–87, 172, 173
Location theory, Ohlin on, 58

Magee, S., on Stolper-Samuelson effects, 128–29
"Magnification effect," 23, 30
Markusen, J., on foreign direct investment, 180
Maskus, K., 12, 73, 82, 173
Melitz model, 180–84
Melvin, J., 11, 43
"Missing trade," 8, 10, 95–97, 174
Mundell, Robert, 178
Multinational firms, foreign direct investment by, 178–80

National Bureau of Economic Research Productivity Database, 144
National Election Studies survey (1993), 130
Neoclassical framework, 171
New economic geography, 114
"New" trade theory
 and differentiated products, 50–52
 and intra-industry trade, 112
Non–factor price equalization model, 9–10
 and Davis-Weinstein tests, 101, 103
 of Helpman, 6–7, 52–56, 115–16, 157
  Choi and Krishna on, 116–17
North American Free Trade Agreement, 130–31

Ohlin, Bertil, ix, 1, 189n.1. *See also at* Heckscher-Ohlin
 and consumer preferences, 2–3
 on differentiated goods, 185
 and factor proportion framework, 4, 6–7
 and feedback effects of changes in trade, 5, 11
 on free trade and factor prices, 38–39
 on modern Heckscher-Ohlin trade models, 56–59
 on scale economies, 3, 57, 184
 on trade in services of productive factors, 177–78
 on trade theory, 1–2, 57–59
"Opportunity cost" approach, 15–16, 190n.2
Outsourcing
 and product prices, 144
 and wage inequality, 144, 148

Pass-through assumption, and wage inequality from globalization, 135–36
Penn World Tables, data from, 162
Political economy approach, and Stolper-Samuelson effects, 128–31

Poor countries
capital stock per worker in, 83
and factor trade, 95
Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society, Leontief paper in, 62
Production functions
constant returns-to-scale (Ohlin), 57
and factor content of trade (Hakura), 108
and factor price equalization, 156
and Leontief's findings, 66, 67
non-identical (Ohlin), 58
and wages (Hanson and Slaughter), 155
Production possibilities curve or frontier, 16
Production techniques, and relative factor supplies (Hanson and Slaughter), 151–55
Productivity
and factor prices, 167–68
and international wage ratios, 168
and "missing trade," 95–97
variations in levels of, 181–84
Productivity-adjusted factor price equalization, in Hanson-Slaughter model, 154, 155
Productivity-equivalent factor price equalization, in Hanson-Slaughter model, 155
Product prices, and factor prices, 17, 121, 122, 171 (*see also* Stolper-Samuelson effects)
Product-price studies, and Stolper-Samuelson effects, 132–45, 147–48
Protectionism
and Leontief paradox, 67–68
research needed on, 186
and Stolper-Samuelson effects, 24, 25, 122–23, 128–31, 170
"Public goods" aspect of firm-level scale economies, 180

R&D. *See* Research and development
"Real cost" approach, 15, 190n.2
abandonment of, 12, 171
Real-side international economists, 171–72
Real world conditions, Ohlin's concern with, 3
Regression analysis
in BLS study of HOV model, 92, 93
and factor content, 84–86, 87
in Trefler's test of HOV proposition, 97
Relative factor abundance
and adjusted net exports, 91
and cost of productive factors, 54
definition(s) of, 91, 197n.4
and Leontief findings, 71–72
measures of, 76, 81
Relative factor endowments, x, 9, 56–57, 87, 172. *See also* Capital/labor ratios
and classical economists, 189n.2
and differences in direct foreign investment, 180
in endogenous growth models, 176
and factor content of trade, 9, 118
and HO trade models, 2, 87
and inter-industry trade, 52
and intra-industry trade, 51
and modification of HOV model, 175
in multi-country, multi-factor framework, 90
and non–factor price equalization model, 9
and opening of trade, 58
and trading patterns, 119
Ohlin on, 3

Relative factor price equalization, 166
Relative factor prices, and labor immobility, 170
Relative factor proportions, in trade theory, 15
Relative factor supplies, 101
 and composition of output, 121 (*see also* Rybczynski effects)
Relative outputs, and Rybczynski effects, 148–55
Relative product prices, and Stolper-Samuelson theorem, 17, 122
Research (needed), 184, 186–87
 on demand differences, 184–85
 on factor-proportion specialization, 185
 on forces influencing factor content of trade, 9
 on intermediates, 185
 on nontraded goods and services, 185
 in performance capabilities of different firms, 184
 on scale economies, 184
 on trade barriers, 186
 on trade changes, 186
Research and development (R&D)
 and labor supply, 177
 and Leontief paradox, 66–67
 in regression analysis of factor content, 85
Review of Economic Studies, Stolper-Samuelson theorem in, 25
Ricardo, David, 2
Ricardo-Viner model, 42
Rybczynski effects, 121, 148–55, 175
Rybczynski line, 31
Rybczynsk relationship, 29–30, 157
Rybczynski theorem, 26–33, 168, 169
Samuelson, Paul, 6, 11, 16, 33, 39. *See also* Heckscher-Ohlin-Samuelson model; Stolper-Samuelson theorem; and factor-price equalization theorem
Scale economies. *See* Economies of scale
Scheve and Slaughter, on Stolper-Samuelson effects, 130
Schott, Peter, on factor price equalization, 157–58
Sign-matching test, 106–11, 118
 of BLS, 91
 of Trefler, 94–95
Social or community indifference curve, 35, 36–37
Specific-factors model, 123
Staiger's test, 104
Staiger, Deardorff, and Stern, on country-pair test, 48–49, 104–106
Stolper-Samuelson effects, 121, 128, 147–48, 175
 empirical findings on
  and GDP function estimation, 145–47
  political economy approach in, 128–31
  and product-price studies, 132–45, 147–48
 general methodological approaches to, 122–28
Stolper-Samuelson elasticities, 128, 146
Stolper-Samuelson theorem, 5–6, 15, 17–26, 122, 168, 169, 190n.4
 "correlation" version of, 123
 "essential" version of, 25, 124, 138
 fiftieth anniversary (golden jubilee) of, 172, 191n.7
 generalization of, 26
 "general" vs. "restrictive" version of, 25

Stolper-Samuelson theorem (cont.)
lack of empirical support for, 169–70
and Rybczynski theorem, 27, 32–33

Technological differences, Hicks-neutral
and cost minimization, 165
and industry share of GDP, 112
and output shares (Harrigan), 149–50
and predicted vs. measured trade, x, 96–97, 99, 100, 100–101, 118
Technological progress, and factor prices (Leamer), 132–33, 133–34
Technological progress, Hicks-neutral, in Stolper-Samuelson effects, 126
Technological/technical change
endogenous, 175–77
and total factor-productivity, 132–33 (*see also* Total factor productivity)
and wage inequality, 135, 136
Technology(ies)
and country-pair tests, 111–12
and factor-intensity reversals, 66
and factor price equalization, 166
and factor trade (Hakura), 107
importance of, 169
and Leontief paradox, 66–67
in modification of HOV model, 174
Technology differences
and factor price equalization assumption, 101
and modification of HOV model, 174–75
Theoretical trade models, and empirical study, 172, 187
Theory of Trade, The (Ohlin), 15
Total factor productivity (TFP), 132–33, 136–37, 141–42
Trade, international. *See* International trade theory
Trade, intra-industry. *See* Intra-industry trade
Trade Act (1974), testimony on, 128–29, 131
Trade barriers. *See* Protectionism
Trade liberalization vs. protectionism. *See* Protectionism
Trade policies, and Stolper-Samuelson theorem, 24–26
Trade theory. *See* International trade theory
Transfers of income, and HO proposition, 73
Travis, W., 11, 43, 67–68
Trefler, D., ix–x, 8, 94–97, 110, 118, 166, 174, 184, 185, 190n.7

United Nations Development Organization (UNIDO), data from, 162

Vanek, J., 4, 11, 43, 64–65. *See also at* Heckscher-Ohlin-Vanek
Vanek equation, 193n.19
Vanek relationship, 45, 69
Vanek theorem, 5
Viner, J., 189n. 2, 190n. 1

Wage inequality
and education, 139–41, 153, 155
globalization vs. technical change in, 135, 136
and international trade, 132
and outsourcing, 144, 148
and relative price changes, 146
and Stolper-Samuelson theorem, 123–24, 175
and technology, 135, 136, 186

and trade changes, 186
trends in, 134–35, 139, 144
Welfare economics, and normative international economics, 171
World factor endowment. *See* Factor endowment of world
World War II, and US capital abundance, 83