Environmental Justice and Sustainability in the Former Soviet Union

edited by Julian Agyeman and Yelena Ogneva-Himmelberger

The MIT Press Cambridge, Massachusetts London, England

© 2009 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All Rights Reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

This book was set in Sabon on 3B2 by Asco Typesetters, Hong Kong. Printed on recycled paper and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Environmental justice and sustainability in the former Soviet Union / edited by Julian Agyeman and Yelena Ogneva-Himmelberger.

p. cm. — (Urban and industrial environments) Includes bibliographical references and index.

raphy and a second seco

ISBN 978-0-262-01266-9 (hardcover : alk. paper) — ISBN 978-0-262-51233-6 (pbk. : alk. paper) 1. Environmental degradation—Former Soviet republics.

2. Environmental justice—Former Soviet republics. 3. Environmental policy—Former Soviet republics. 4. Former Soviet republics—Environmental conditions. I. Agyeman, Julian. II. Ogneva-Himmelberger, Yelena.

GE160.F6E576 2009

363.700947—dc22 2008042144

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Index

Note: The letter f following a page number indicates a figure, m a map, n a note, and t a table.

Aarhus Convention, 12, 59, 150, 184n7, 263, 278. See also Information access participatory democracy and, 158-159, 232, 234 Accountability, 15, 161-165, 176-179, 182, 277 Afghanistan, 248 opium trade, 247 Agenda 21 commitment, 49, 53, 54, 55, 59 Agriculture arable land, 250-251, 251f, 256-257, 257t, 260m cotton farming, 246, 258-262 crop rotation, 261 crop yields, 250, 251t sectoral reform, 104–105, 263 Aguls, 100m Ainu people, 92n2 Air pollution, 218, 220, 225 monitoring of, 170–175t All-Russia Congress on Environmental Protection 2nd Congress, 57, 59 ALROSA mining company, 192, 193, 196–197, 208n5 Altai Republic, 35–36, 53 Angarsk-Daqing pipeline, 119

178–179, 182, 185n17 Arable land, 250-251, 251f, 256-257, 257t, 260m Aral Sea, 2 Arctic. See Northwest Territories (NWT), Canada; Subarctic Russia Armed conflict, 241-242, 248 Armenia, 2, 13 Arshan, 124 Authoritarianism, 58 Avars, 101 Azerbaijan, 2, 153, 277 agricultural sector, 104-105 Baku-Tbilisi-Ceyhan (BTC) Pipeline, 155, 183n3 ethnic factors, 100-101, 100m imbalance between oil wealth and the general economy, 97, 103–107 inequalities in standard of living, 105, 106t oil extraction and the environment in, 14, 97–99 Azerbaijan Popular Front Party, 114

Anosova, Svetlana, 160, 162, 165,

Baikal Environmental Wave (BEW), 125. *See also* Lake Baikal Baker Hughes Co., 179 Baku, 101 Baku-Tbilisi-Ceyhan Pipeline, 155, Panel on Environmental Assessment, 183n3 Balance, 263 Caspian Pipeline Consortium (CPC) project, 154-155 sustainability as, 85-87, 223 Baltic countries, 2, 142. See also Caspian Sea, 101, 153, 182 Estonia; Latvia; Lithuania Caucasus states, 2. See also Armenia; Bashkir people, 7 Azerbaijan; Georgia Bear Festival, KMAO, 37 Center for Russian Environmental Belarus, 2 Policy, 53 Beluga sturgeon, 154 Centralization of power, 4, 14, 276, Berezovka, Kazakhstan, 153, 157in Kazakhstan, 153 in Tajikistan, 237, 242, 256, 262sanitary protection zone, 159–160, 178, 180 Chemical emissions. See Toxic Berezovka Initiative Group, 158–161, 181–182. See also Local/grassroots emissions Chernobyl disaster, 1 organizing engagement with international Chevron, 154-155 community, 177-179 Child labor, 237, 245-246 environmental and health Circumpolar extraction, 200-201 monitoring, 161–166 Civil society, 14, 23, 119, 122, 125, Kazakhstan governing bodies and, 265–266, 279 160, 179–180 language and citizenship, 144, media use, 177, 180-181 151nn3-5 relocation campaign, 160, 176-177 public participation and, 223-224 role of NGOs in building, 199, Berezovka River, 157 Bering Sea region, 53 Civil Society International (CSI), 9-Bii Khem River, 34 Bilateral partnerships, 11 10 Biodiversity funds, 66n15 Cleanup campaigns, 279 Biomass production, 33 Coal extraction and transport, 34 Birthrate, 215 Coalition for a Clean Baltic, 226 British Petroleum-Rosneft, 75 Cold War, 3 Broken Hill Propriety (BHP), 201–202 Collective ownership, 219 "Brown" agenda, 3 Commonwealth of Independent States and "green" agenda, 5, 275, 280 (CIS), 2, 280. See also Belarus; Bucket Brigade air monitoring, 164-Moldova; Ukraine Communist legacy, 2–3, 6 Communist Party (post-Soviet), 50 Buddhist lamas, Tunka Valley, 119, 125, 127t, 128, 131–132 Conceptual content cognitive mapping Buriats, 121 (3CM) method, 80 Byelorussia. See Belarus Conflict, 241-242, 248 Conservation, 126 Canada Contamination impact of mining on indigenous contaminated areas, 1-3, 6, 102 peoples, 203-204 "contaminating culture," 3

Convention on Access to Information,
Public Participation, etc. See Aarhus
Convention
Corporatism, 227
Corruption, 56
Cotton farming, 246, 258–262
Court rulings, 158–160
Crime, 5, 102
Crop rotation, 261
Crop yields, 250, 251t
Crude Accountability, 161–165, 176–
179, 182, 277
Cultural heritage, 10, 277
Cultural symbolism, 145. See also Folk
songs

Daghestani peoples, 101 "Daina" (Latvian folk songs), 145–146 Dams, 194, 195 Darvoz Raion, 268n12 Daugavpils Dam proposal, 142–143, Deforestation, 21, 32–33, 34, 100m, 220–221, 260. See also Forests Death rates. See Mortality rates DeBeers Snap Lake, 201, 203-204 Decentralized legal systems, 8 Declaration of Sovereignty of the Republic of Sakha, 208–209n11 "Declaration of the Russian Green Movement for the Rio+10 Summit," 62 Deforestation, 56. See also Forests Democratic processes, 58, 59, 125 De-modernization period, 49–50 Déné people, 206, 210n14 Department of Institutional Integrity (INT), World Bank, 179 Development discourse, 265 Dia Met Mineral Ltd., 201, 202 Diamond mining, 193-194, 193f as a nonsustainable resource, 204 requiring international collaboration, 2.05 - 2.06in Viliui Sakha and Canada compared, 201-205

Diavak diamond mine, Canada, 201
"Dictatorship of the law" (diktatura zakona), 21, 24, 38
"Direct democracy," 125
Disease, 102
Dragon Oil, 155
Drought, 242
Drug abuse, 247
Drug trade, 237, 247–248

Earth Charter, 265
Earth Summit, Rio de Janeiro, 48–49
East Siberia-Pacific oil pipeline, 30, 39
Eco-Accord, 62
Ecologia (U.S.-Russian joint organization), 53
Ecological balance, 85–87, 223
Ecological footprint, 2, 243n3. See also Environmental degradation in post-Soviet era Estonia, 217–219, 220, 221
Ecological justice. See Environmental justice

Economic policy environmental values subsumed by, 5–6, 47–48, 98–99, 112t natural resources extraction model, 59–60 Eco-political movements, 88

Eco-villages, 52

Education and training, 81, 83 Endangered species, 154 Environment, 92n1 Environmental agendas. *See* "Brown" agenda; "Green" agenda; "Middle way" agendas

Environmental assessment, 202, 221t Canadian Panel, 202
Environmental degradation. *See also*Contamination; Deforestation;
Pollution; Toxic emissions
ethnicity and, 100–101, 100m
as a legacy of the Soviet era, 2–3, 6–
7, 16, 88, 98, 141

Environmental hazards, 8, 242, 267nn4 and 5

Environmental injustice, 86–87, 98–	Environmental security, 102
99, 110	Equal distribution of profits, 85–86
during post-Soviet transition, 149–	Equity, 97
150	Estonia, 2, 216–217, 224–232, 277
poverty and, 255–258	environmental assessment, 221t, 222t
racism and, 121	environmental-human rights linkages
regionally based, 249	in, 276
Environmental justice, 4, 9, 12–14, 89t, 198–199, 223–224	grassroots and protest movements, 227–228
defined and criterion of, 18n3, 215, 237	language and citizenship in, 144, 151nn3–5, 223–224
industrial development and, 277-278	national strategy on sustainable
justice-informed environmental	development, 232–235
discourse, 10	nature protection organizations,
as lack of access to natural capital,	228–232
237, 239–241, 245, 248–249, 252,	oil shale production in, 217–218
256, 263–264	post-Soviet transition, 16, 215–217,
merged with social movements, 122-	234
123	public participation, 222–223
multiple fronts and expressions of,	tradition of nature protection, 217–
149, 266, 276–277	219, 224
personal responsibility and, 149–150	Estonia National Strategy on
poverty and, 262	Sustainable Development (SE 21),
Environmental laws. See Legal	232–235
environment	Estonian Constitution, 233
Environmental monitoring	Estonian Fund for Nature, 232
of Karachaganaak Field toxic	Estonian Green Movement (EGM),
emissions, 164–165, 166–169t,	226–227, 232
170–175t, 176	Estonian Greens, 226, 229, 230
Environmental movements, 47, 276.	Estonian National Strategy on Sus-
See also Local/grassroots activism;	tainable Development (SE21), 277
professional environmentalists	Estonian Popular Front, 226
during late Soviet era (mid 1990s),	Estonian Society for Nature
47–48, 51, 276	Conservation, 228–229
opposing radioactive waste storage, 60–61	Ethnicity, 64, 121, 207–208n3, 219, 249, 262, 278
in post-Soviet Russia, 10–12, 51–54, 62	spatial patterns of, 100 European Bank for Reconstruction
stymied by economic policies, 5–7,	and Development (EBRD), 77–78,
13, 47–48, 64–65	90, 154, 181n1
Environmental Performance Index, 50,	European Court of Human Rights
65n6	(ECHR), 35
Environmental protection movement,	European Union (EU), 2
147–149	Technical Aid to the Commonwealth
Environmental Psychology Research	of Independent States (TACIS)
Unit, 220	program, 52–53
, · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	1 0 , ,

Exports of natural resources, 57–60, Gini index, 216, 234n2 97, 103, 104t, 105 Glasnost, 64, 141, 225 Extraction industries, 197-201. See Globalization, 90 also Oil extraction industries; Global Response, Tunka Valley, 121, Mining 277 Extremism, 6 Global South. See Southern ExxonMobil, 154–155 hemisphere countries ExxonNeftegas, 75 Gorbachev regime, 1, 64 Gorno-Badakhshan, 248–258, 250f, Federal Law on Ecological Expertise, 251f, 253t, 254t, 255t, 257t, 258t, 268n11 Ferghana Valley, 248 Grassroots. See Local/grassroots Fertility rates, 242–243 activism "Green" agenda, 3, 14, 226 Fisheries, 195, 203 Folk songs, 145-146. See also whether divided from the "brown" Cultural symbolism agenda, 5, 275, 280 Folksongs ("Daina"), Latvian, 145-Green economic policy, 51 146 Greenhouse gas emissions, 49 Food resources Green Liberty, 150 caribou habitat, 203-204 Green Maardu Association, 227, fisheries, 195, 203 228 salmon populations, 76, 78, 82t, 85, Green parties Union of Greens, 63 Foreign Corrupt Practices Act, U.S., Greenpeace, 12 Greenpeace Russia, 56, 61, 62 Forest certification program, 62 Green Republic of Estonia Forest Code, 32–34, 55, 65n14 (envisioned), 226 Green Salvation, 158-159, 161, 178, Forests, 218. See also Deforestation Forest Stewardship Council, 62 180, 183 Former Soviet Union (FSU) republics, Grey Whale, 76, 78 1–2. See also by country Guidelines on Access to Environmental Framework laws on indigenous rights, Information and Public Participation 24-28, 32-33, 38-39 in Decision Making, UNECE, 12 evisceration of, 29, 41n24, 276 Freedom House, 58 Habitat degradation, 154 Freedom House democracy rankings, Halliburton, 154–155 58 HDI index. See Human Development Freedom of Conscience law, 36 Index, UN (UNDP-HDI) Friends of the Earth, 88, 226 Health impacts monitoring. See also Public health issues of Karachaganaak Field, 161-164, 163t G-8 Presidency, Russian, 61 Garbage pollution, 220, 221 Health-related issues. See Public health Gazprom, 76, 77, 90, 91 issues Gender, inequalities, 237, 243–244, Helsinki Accord, 64 246, 254–255 Human Development Index, UN Georgia, 2 (UNDP-HDI), 2, 4, 12, 63, 215

Human rights, linked to the environment, 10, 276
Human security, 3, 99, 101–102, 278–279
environmental justice and, 240–241 and state security, 102–103
threats to, 102, 113–114
Human trafficking, 237, 247
Hunger, 13, 102. *See also* Poverty
Hydrocarbon development. *See* Oil extraction industries

Ida-Virumaa, 217, 228, 234

Identity, 142

Identity perceptions, 82t Impact assessment, 30–31 Indigenous peoples, 21, 33, 37, 40nn4 and 6, 207n1. See also by name resistance movements, 34-38 right to participate in development plans, 78-79 sacred lands law, 36-37 on Sakhalin Island, 84-85 in subarctic regions, 197–200, 203– "traditional" (subsistence) lifestyles recognized, 25, 38, 40n6 UN covenant on self-determination, 28, 39 Indigenous rights evisceration of laws protecting, 276 framework laws addressing, 24-28 implementation problems, 25-28 Russian opposition to international covenants, 28 Industrial development, 277. See also Resource extraction Inequality. See also Poverty income, 2, 7, 50, 63-64, 105, 106t, 113, 215, 219–220, 278 between oil wealth and general economy, 97, 103-107, 106t, 113 regional inequalities, 216, 249, 255-

Information access, 12, 278. See also

Aarhus Convention

Institute for Sustainable Communities (ISC), 53 International collaboration, 205–206 International environmental NGOs/ ENGOs, 9-12, 182, 199. See also Greenpeace; World Wildlife Fund (WWF); and by name role of, 92, 277, 278 in Tajikistan, 264-265 International Finance Corporation (IFC), 156-157 Office of the Compliance Advisor Ombudsman (CAO), 177-179. International finance organizations. See also European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD); World Bank funding oil development in FSU Republics, 77–78, 154, 156–157 International law, Russian in relation to, 27-28 International norms and standards, 65n1 "Interpol" confrontation, 146 Irkut River, 123 Irkutsk Oblast, natural gas reserves at, 119, 124, 128, 130, 133–134 Irrigation, 257

Johannesburg Summit. See World Summit on Sustainable Development, Johannesburg Just sustainability, 3

Kalamaja Society, 227–228 Kamchatka, 35 Karachaganak oil and gas condensate field, 155–157, 156–157, 161–164. *See also* Berezovka, Kazakhstan chemical emissions, 157–158, 159– 160 sanitary protection zone, 159–160, 178, 180 Karachaganak Petroleum Operating consortium, 156, 159–160, 178, 179 Kashagan Field, 153 Language and citizenship, 144, Kazakhstan, 2, 12, 14, 153, 156m. 151nn3-5, 223-224 See also Berezovka, Kazakhstan; Latvia, 2, 15–16, 141, 149–150, 216 Berezovka Initiative Group civil society and language in, 144 centralization of power in, 153 critique of Communist ideology in, community affects of extraction 143, 147 industry, 155-157, 161-164 culture and nationalism linked with court rulings, 158–160 ecological justice, 141–142 environmental-human rights linkages environmental-human rights linkages in, 276, 277 in, 141–142, 276, 277, 279 government inaction re: Berezovka environmental issues framed by community, 160, 179-180 nationalism, 142-144, 147 Law on the Environment, 184n6 folksongs ("Daina") used in protests, Ministry of Health, 180 145 - 146"Interpol" confrontation, 146 multinational joint ventures in oil development, 154-155 lack of access to natural capital, 237, 239, 242, 245, 248–249, 252, 256, sanitary protection zone law, 159-160 263 - 264Khanty-Mansi Autonomous Okrug nongovernmental organizations (KMAO), 37 (NGOs/ENGOs), 148, 150 Khatlon, Tajikistan, 249, 250f, 258-"politics of pollution" in, 147–148, Khodorkovsky, Mikhail, 119–120 post-Soviet transition period, 149– Khorugh, 268n12 150 KMAO law, 37–38 Latvian Constitution, 144 Latvian folk songs, 145–146 Knowledge structures, 79–80 Kolkhoz system, 218–219 "Lawfare," 38 Koryak Autonomous Okrug, 199– Legal environment, 4–5, 8, 275–276. 200 See also Indigenous rights Kovykta Field, 119, 133, 136n2 Agenda 21 commitment, 49, 53, 54, Kraton-3 nuclear explosion, 194 55, 59 Kristall nuclear explosion, 194 evisceration of environmental laws, Kuznets curve, 98–99, 105, 115n1 41n24, 276 failure in implementing laws, 56-59, Kyoto Protocol, 61, 62 189, 263-264, 276 Kyren pipeline project, 125 Kyrgyzstan, 2 historical background, 22–24 instability in, 22, 29-32 procedural and participatory rights DeBeers Snap Lake, 201, 203–204 neglected, 22, 31, 38 Lake Baikal, 2, 61, 120, 121, 132progressive environmental legislation, 21–22, 54–57, 64, 275–276 Land, lack of access to, 249-250, Lenkeran, 101 250f, 256, 257t Lezghins, 100m Land Code, 26, 29, 32–33, 41n14 Life expectancy, 50, 216 Landlocked developing countries Lifestyle behaviors, 8 (LLDCs), 13 Lithuania, 2, 216

Livestock production Millennium Development Goals for decline of in rural Tajikistan, 251the Central Asia and Pacific region 252, 253t, 254t, 258–259, 259t, states, UN, 13 261–262, 262f Mining, 34, 189. See also Diamond Living standards. See Standard of mining ALROSA mining company, 192, 193, 196-197, 208n5 Local-global environmentalism, 71, 72, 89t, 92, 150, 265–266 nonsustainability of, 204 Local/grassroots activism, 62, 91, 160, Minister for Nature Protection, Sakha 279. See also Public environmental Republic, 196 Minister of Ecology, Sakha Republic, concerns cultural tools, 145–146 196, 208n5 opposition to diamond mines, 196– Minority power, 7 Mirnyi, Sakha Republic, diamond mine, 193-194, 193f "popular epidemiology," 162, 176 protests and mass movements, 225, Moldova, 2 227–228, 231 Mongolia, indigenous peoples of, 33 religious ritual as protest, 119-120, Morbidity rates, 7 122, 125, 128, 131–132 Mortality rates, 7, 106t, 244 whether affecting policy, 90-91, 275, Moscow, 63 278 - 280Motor-vehicle deaths, 8 Logging, 21, 32, 33, 34 Multilateral partnerships, 11 Multinational joint ventures in oil Mackenzie Valley Pipeline, Canada, development. See also Sakhalin-2; 201 - 202Sakhalin Energy in Kazakhstan, 15, 154-155 Maldevelopment concept, 87 Malnutrition, 13 on Sakhalin Island, 71–72, 77–78, Marine resources, 154 87 - 88, 91salmon populations, 76, 78, 82t, 85, Muslumovo village, 11 88, 89t Market transition, , 1-2, 49-50, 83, Nagorno-Karabakh region, 101, 107 219-221. See also Post-Soviet era Nationalism, 90, 277 Markha River, 194 cultural nationalism, 88, 89t Martinev, Pyotr, 196 environmental issues framed by, Mayak nuclear facility, 7 142–144, 147 Medvedev period. See Putin-Medvedev Nationalization, 76 National parks, 35–36 regime Mercy Corps, 277 National security, focus on issues of, 6 "Middle way" agendas, 3, 9, 278-NATO, 215 279. See also Human security; Just Natural capital sustainability defined, 267n1 Militant Islamic fundamentalism, 248 lack of access to, 237, 239-242, 245, Military pollution, 219 248–249, 252, 256, 263–264 Millennium Development Goals, 56-Natural gas reserves, 49 57 Natural resources, 208–209n11

exports based in, 57-60, 97, 103, multinational joint ventures, 15, 71-72, 77-78, 87-88, 91, 154-104t, 105 nonsustainable resources, 204 pricing or valuation of, 51, 62 offshore development, 71, 74m, 75– resource extraction, 10, 280 76, 79, 85–86 Nature appreciation and protection oil exports, 97, 103, 104t, 105 Baltic states tradition, 142, 147– oil pipelines, 30, 39, 61, 119, 121 oil reserves, 49 Estonian tradition, 217–219, 224, oil shale production, 217–218 228 - 232regional degradation and, 154-157 Oil wealth, 153 organizations, 147–148, 228–232 Soviet-era movement (1950s), 10–11 Okhotsk Sea. See Sea of Okhotsk Oki Tedi mine, Australia, 202 Nazi-Soviet Nonaggression Pact, 144 Nenets Autonomous Area, 27, 40– Omnibus bills, 29–32, 276 41n11 "On Guarantees of the Rights of the Indigenous Small-Numbered Peoples Neoliberalism, 24 Nizhny Novgorod, 53 of the Russian Federation" law, 24, Nongovernmental organizations 26-27, 29, 30, 32, 40n6 (NGOs/ENGOs), 5, 148, 149–150, "On Objects of Cultural Heritage ..." 150, 226-232, 266. See also law, 36–37 International environmental NGOs/ "On Sacred Lands of the Indigenous ENGOs; and by name Peoples of the Russian Federation" role in building civil society, 199, 206 law, 36–37 Northwest Territories (NWT), "On Specially Protected Nature Canada, 189 Territories" law, 35–36, 41n18 "On Territories of Traditional Nature Novgorod, 53 Nuclear contamination, 194–195 Use" law, 25, 26. See also Nuclear explosions, 194 Indigenous rights Nuclear facilities, 7. See also "On the Environmental Impact Chernobyl disaster; Mayak nuclear Assessment" law, 30-31 "On the Insertion of Changes into the facility Town-Planning Code ... " law, 30 continued use of deteriorating, 8–9 radioactive fallout, 194-195 Organization for Economic underground nuclear tests, 194 Development and Cooperation waste import and storage, 60–61 (OECD), 12-13Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE), Occupational hazards, 8 Offshore drilling, 153 263 - 264Oil as "death," 85 Outmigration, 237, 238–239, 246– Oil extraction industries, 9, 72, 97– 247 "Outsiders" as targets, 149 Overgrazing, 100m environmental injustice and, 14, 97–

financial institutions funding, 60, 66n15, 154, 156–157, 183n1

OVOS (otsenka vozdeistviia na okruzhaiushchuiu sredu), 30–31

Oxfam, 277

prevalence of, 63, 123, 244, 249, Pacific Environment, 88, 277 Participatory democracy. See also 255t in rural Tajakistan, 16, 249, 252, Public participation Aarhus Convention and, 158–159, 253t, 262 232, 234 Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper, Perestroika, 216 Tajikistan, 263 Persecution or threats to "Priorities for Russia's National environmentalists, 10, 77, 143, 181, Environmental Policy" paper, 53 182, 186n29, 197, 295 Privatization, 32–34, 191, 218, 259 Professional environmentalists, 51-52, Personal responsibility, 149–150 Petroleum. See Oil extraction 62, 88, 91, 150, 193, 195 industries Psychosocial stresses, 6–7 Policymaking access, 59-60 Public Ecological Center, Yakutsk, Political climate, 280 195 - 196Political elite, 48 Public environmental concerns, 107-Political factors. See also Environ-113, 108t, 109t, 111t, 112t, 275, mental movements; Nationalism 278. See also Local/grassroots authoritarianism, 58 activism democratic processes, 58, 59 survey of in Azerbaijan, 107–113, eco-political movements, 88 108t, 109t, 111t, 112t in Kazakhstan, 184n12 Public health issues, 2, 50, 110–111, 162-164, 208n5, 234n1, 244. See pollution abatement politics, 148-149, 150 also Air pollution; Radioactive Political underrepresentation, 221fallout; Water pollution or contamination "Politics of pollution," 147-148, 150 environmental problems and, 5, 6–9, "Politics of signification," 72 12 - 14Pollution, 279. See also Air pollution; Public participation Contamination; Environmental the Aarhus Convention and, 158degradation; Water pollution 159, 232, 234 Pollution abatement politics, 56, 148– civil society and, 223-224 149, 150 extent in Estonia, 221-224 "Popular epidemiology," 162 failure to include, 158, 159 Population crisis, 216 in subarctic regions, 189, 201–203, Post-Soviet era. See also former Soviet 204 Union (FSU) republics Punitive action. See Persecution or critique of Communist ideology, 143, threats to environmentalists Putin-Medvedev regime, 61, 276 Putin regime, 21, 23, 50, 276 environmental problems, 189, 217– "dictatorship of the law" (diktatura zakona), 21, 24, 38 period of industrial collapse, 49–50 Post-Soviet Handbook, 9 dissolution of environmental state Poultry diseases, 268n13 organs, 58 Poverty. See also Inequality environmental policies, 38-39, 61 focus on issues of, 2, 6 focus in resource extraction, 57–60 hunger, 13, 102 Putin's Plan, 39

Quality of life. See Ecological footprint; Human Development Index, UN (UNDP-HDI); Standard of living

Radical environmentalism, 88, 89t Radioactive fallout, 194–195. *See also* Nuclear facilities Rahmon, Imomali regime, Tajikistan,

242, 245 Railroad(s), 33, 34

RAIPON, 31, 199, 209–210n12, 280

Recycling, 279

Religious ritual as protest, 119–120, 122, 125, 128, 131–132

Relocation, 267n1

Berezovka Initiative Group relocation campaign, 160, 176–177

Relocation campaign, 160, 176–177 "Resource curse," 155

Resource extraction, 9, 280. See also Exports; Mining; Natural resources; Oil extraction industries

Rio Declaration, Principle 10, 13 Rio Declaration on the Environment and Development, 49

Rivers, 34, 123, 157, 194, 195

"Rodnik" Legal Center, 35

Ruralization, 87

263-264

Rural subsistence communities, 63, 268n8, 296n16. See also Unsustainable livelihoods

increase of population in, 242–243 lack of access to natural capital, 237, 239–242, 245, 248–249, 252, 256,

Poverty in, 244, 249, 252, 253t in Tajikistan, 237, 238f, 241–242, 244f "Russia and Rio+5: What Has Been Done?," 62

Russian Academy of Sciences, 194–

Institute of Sociology, 177 Russian Association of Indigenous Peoples of the North (RAIPON), 31, 199, 209–210n12, 280 Russian Constitution (1993), 24
Russian Federation, 2. See also Tunka
National Park
as a "contaminating culture," 3
demographic crisis, 63
early endorsement of sustainable
development, 48–49
environmental movements in, 10–12,
51–54, 62
Russification policies, 142, 143, 144

Sacred lands, 36–37

Saint Petersburg, 53
Sakhalin-1, 75–76
Sakhalin-2, 75–77, 90, 91
Sakhalin Energy, 75, 77, 78, 89t, 90f, 91

Sakhalin Island. See also Sustainability discourses

as a resource periphery, 75, 83–84, 86

identity perceptions on, 82t multinational joint ventures in oil development, 71–72, 77–78, 87–88, 91

multiple sustainability movements, 14–15, 79, 276, 277 period of Japanese control, 73–75,

92 post-Soviet period, 73, 75–79, 78m

Soviet period, 75, 78
Solcha Republic, 190m, 208, 209p.11

Sakha Republic, 190m, 208–209n11. *See also* Subarctic region; Viliui Sakha region

diamond mines, 191–192 environmental policies, 191

Salinization, 260–261

Salmon populations, 76, 78, 82t, 85, 88, 89t

Sanitary protection zone, Kazakhstan, 159–160, 178, 180

Sanitation, 244

Science and technology, 51-52

Sea of Okhotsk, 71, 73, 74m, 75, 76, 78, 85. *See also* Karachaganak oil and gas condensate field

State Ecological Expertise committee, Self-determination, 28, 39 Shamans, Tunka Valley, 119–120, Russia, 61 State Forestry Service, Russian 122, 131–132, 136 Siberia Federation, 58 boreal forests, 33–34 State security, 102 deforestation, 32-33 Student nature protection organiza-East Siberia-Pacific oil pipeline, 30, tions (1950s), 10–11 39 Subarctic Russia, 16-17, 189 indigenous peoples of, 26, 28, 33-34, Suda Society, 227 Sugd, 259 radioactive waste storage in opposed, Subsistence needs, 103 Sustainability discourses, 63, 80–81, "Singing Revolution" (Latvia), 145– 82t, 276 sustainability as a healthy environ-Single heads of households, 237, 254ment, 85 255 sustainability as balance, 85–87, 223 Slavs, ethnic, 84, 101 sustainability as diversity, 81–83 Social actors, 71-73, 77, 79-81, 84sustainability as social change, 83-85, 91, 93n3 8.5 Social injustice, 219–221 as the task of industry, 87 Social movements, 72, 224 Sustainable city projects, 53 Social networks, 126, 129, 132–133 Sustainable development (ustoichivoie Social reforms, 216 razvitie), 12–15, 47 civil society embracing (early-mid Socio-Ecological Union (SEU), 10 Socioeconomic context, 215–217 1990s), 47–48, 51, 276 Soil contamination or erosion, 7, 34, conceptual definition(s), 48, 62–64, 100m, 101, 260–261 79 - 80Soil fertility, 250 early Russian Federation laws Southern hemisphere countries, 3 supporting, 54–57 Soviet era enforceable environmentalism, 88, collectivization and subsistence farming in, 192 multifaceted approaches, 50–53, 71– industrial policies, 192–195 land use practices, 218-219 recent decline in focus on, 55-59, 62, toxic legacy of, 2-3, 6-7, 88, 98, 141, 142, 193, 219 Western corporate model, 88, 89t, 92 Sustainable forest certification Soviet Union. See also Former Soviet Union (FSU) republics program, 62 collapse of, 48, 49, 142 Sustainable livelihoods, 237–238 economic growth approach, 87, 143 Sustainable Livelihoods Framework analysis, 239-241, 239t, 279 land use, 218–219 Stakeholder participation, 89t, 92 "Sustainable Sakhalin" movements, Standard of living, 7-8, 63, 105, 71, 73, 79, 80–81, 83–86, 87, 92 State Committee on Ecology, Russian Tajikistan, 2, 13, 237, 240m, 244f, Federation, 58 246f, 267n2, 277, 279. See also

Agriculture; Gorno-Badakhshan; Tozhu people, 25, 34 Unsustainable livelihoods Tozhu Raion, 25, 34 centralization of power in, 237, 242, Transneft oil pipeline route, 61 256, 262, 262–264 TTNUs. See Territories of traditional civil war, 241-242 nature use (TTNUs) educational system, 243, 243f, 245 Tungush, Kazakhstan, 159, 183environmental justice movement, 184n5 264-267 Tunka National Park human security issues, 240–241 pipeline plans through, 119, 120–124 international environmental NGOs/ proposal to subdivide, 123–124 ENGOs, 264-265 protests against the Yukos pipeline, lack of access to natural capital, 237, 120, 125–126, 277, 280 239–242, 245, 248–249, 252, 256, religious ritual as protest over, 119– 263-264 120, 122, 125, 128, 131–132 market transition, 241 Tunka oil pipelines debate, 119, 121 Turkmenistan, 2, 153 population increase, 242–243 Tyva (Tuva) Republic, 25, 34, 63 poverty in, 244, 245f rural subsistence communities, 16, 237, 238f, 241–242, 244f Ukraine, 2 unsustainable livelihoods in, 238, Unemployment, 2, 123, 215, 216, 219 245–255, 250f, 251f, 253t, 254t Union of Greens, 63 Tajikistan State Environmental United Nations (UN) Committee for Sustainable Develop-Program, 263 Talechis, 101 ment, 12 Talinn University, 233 Conference on Environment and Tallinn, Estonia, 218 Development (UNCED), 12, 53 TAN, 161 Conference on the Human Tatar, 7 Environment, 48 Technology, 218 Convention on Biological Diversity, Territories of traditional nature use (TTNUs), 27, 35, 40n8, 41n14, 200. Convention to Combat Desertifica-See also Indigenous rights tion, 263 Terrorism, focus on, 6 Declaration on Indigenous People's Threats. See Persecution or threats to Rights, 206 environmentalists Development Program (UNDP), 12, 261 Timber extraction, 21, 32, 33, 34 Division for Sustainable Develop-Tkhsanom consortium, 34–35 ment, 59 Tkhsanom TTNU, 200 Economic and Social Commission for Towards a Sustainable Russia journal, Asia and Pacific, 12 53 Economic Commission for Europe, 12 Toxic emissions, 160, 161-164 Framework Convention on Climate monitoring of near Karachaganak Change, 263 Field, 164–165, 166–169t, 170– Human Development Index (UNDP-175t, 176 HDI), 2, 12 Toxic legacy, 2–3, 6–7, 88, 98, 141, World Health Organization (WHO), 142, 193, 219 13

United States (U.S.), 3
Foreign Corrupt Practices Act, 179
Unsustainable livelihoods, 238, 245–
255, 250f, 251f, 253t, 254t See also
Rural subsistence communities
Urals, 60
Uralsk Weekly, 180–181
U.S. Agency for International
Development, 53
Uzbekistan, 2, 13, 248

Veterinary services, 252, 258, 262f Viliui Committee, 195–196, 197 Viliui River, 195 Viliui Sakha, 16–17, 189, 197–200, 206, 277, 280 plight of Natives compared with Canadian Native peoples, 200–201, 204–206 traditional ecological processes destroyed, 190–195 Violence, 102 Virumaa Foundation, 227, 228 Vulnerability context, 237–238, 241–242

229, 231
Water, access to, 250–251, 251f, 256–257, 257t, 261, 269n17
Water pollution or contamination, 7, 100m, 193–194, 208n5, 220, 225, 244
Water sampling methods, 165
Waterways, 34, 123, 157, 194, 195

"War against Phosphorites," 226, 228,

Western Kazakhstan Department of Statistics, 159 Western Kazakhstan Oblast Ecology

Department, 181 Whale populations, threats to, 76, 78, 89t

Wild Salmon Center, 88 World Bank. *See also* International Finance Corporation (IFC) Department of Institutional Integrity (INT), 179 funding extraction industries, 60, 66n15, 154, 156–157, 183n1
World Health Organization (WHO), 13
World Summit on Sustainable
Development, Johannesburg, 12, 48, 61
Worldviews, 72, 73, 79–80
World Wildlife Fund (WWF), 277
WWF Russia, 53–54, 62, 77

Yakut ASSR. *See* Sakha Republic Yakutsk, Sakha Republic, 191, 193, 196, 198 Yeltsin regime, 38, 49–50 environmental decrees, 55 Yukos Oil proposal, 14, 119, 121, 124