

Predicative Minds

The Social Ontogeny of Propositional Thinking

Radu J. Bogdan

A Bradford Book

**The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England**

© 2009 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information about special quantity discounts, please email <special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu>.

This book was set in Stone Sans and Stone Serif by SNP Best-set Typesetter Ltd., Hong Kong.

Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Bogdan, Radu J.

Predicative minds: the social ontogeny of propositional thinking / Radu J. Bogdan.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-02636-9 (hardcover : alk. paper)

1. Thought and thinking—Social aspects. 2. Thought and thinking. 3. Philosophy of mind. I. Title.

BF441.B625 2009

153.4'3—dc22

2008032751

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Index

- Adamson, L., 58, 61, 72, 78, 80, 81, 87, 110, 117, 122, 125, 141
- Akhtar, N., 84, 141
- Alexander, R., 115
- Anderson, M. L., 35
- Animal predication, 22–27, 138
animal thoughts as coinstantiations, 23, 26, 27
imperative and egocentric, 26–27
- Arbib, M., 128
- Arms race, between child adaptation and adult initiation, 48–49, 55, 58
- Assembly
by adult redesign, 55–56, 117–119
evolutionary timing of, 126–128
of mental abilities, 74, 117–122, 124–125
neural plasticity for, 120–122
of predication, xviii (*see also* Predication)
- Autism, 38, 63, 91
- Baldwin, D., 37, 79, 81
- Baron-Cohen, S., 79, 85, 142
- Bartsch, K., 29
- Barwise, J., 30
- Bates, E., 36–38, 54, 58, 65, 78, 79, 80, 84, 86, 87, 89, 100, 101, 109, 110, 117, 118, 119
- Bermudez, J., 25–27, 35, 59, 116, 138
- Bickerton, D., 125, 127, 128
- Bjorklund, D., 47, 58, 86, 120
- Bloom, L., 87
- Bloom, P., 80, 84, 87, 117, 125, 128, 141
- Boyd, R., 122, 123, 124, 126, 127
- Bretherton, I., 72
- Bruner, J., 58, 59, 61, 78, 80, 81, 84, 101, 110, 117, 141
- Call, J., 68, 72, 122, 126
- Carruthers, P., 27
- Categories, 4–5, 12–13, 24–27
animal, 25
versus concepts, 5
- Changeux, J.-P., 121
- Chisholm, J. S., 120
- Churchland, P., 28
- Clark, E., 39, 107, 110
- Clark, H., 39, 107, 110
- Coinstantiation, xvi, 11–13, 21, 117.
See also Proposition, minimal
in Frege's conception, 19
functional unity of, 12, 97, 104
general characterization, 11–12
linguistic, 98–99, 127, 128, 133
logical, 30, 31
mental, 10, 12–13
as mere representation, 9
in natural language, 21–22, 127–128, 133

- Coinstantiation (cont.)
 in predicate calculus, 12
 in Quine's conception, 96–97
- Comment
 bilateral, 61
 expressing intent, 61
 linguistic, 100–101
 protopredicative, 95
- Communication
 coordinated and reciprocal, 61
 coregulative, 58–65
 exclusively bilateral, 63–64
 imperative, 56, 65–68
 intersubjective, 51, 60
 protodeclarative, 51, 66–68, 80
 protoimperative, 66–67
 symbolic and conventional, 52, 93
- Communicative intent, 63–64, 72–73
- Communicative meaning, 6. *See also*
 Grice, P.
 bilateral, 63
 definition, 64
- Cook Wilson, J., 39, 110
- Copula
 of coinstantiation, 19, 98–99
 of predication, 100–102
 as truth rule, 12
- Coreference, 49, 56. *See also* Intent
 descriptiveness and facticity, 92–93
 shared, 52
 virtual, 85–86, 100
- Coregulation, 51
 physiological, 58
 psychological, 59
- Cosmides, L., 47, 123
- Davidson, D., xvii, 16, 28, 30, 32–34, 137
- Deacon, T., 124, 126
- Dennett, D., 33, 121, 124
- Development
 as arms race, 48, 123
 as evolution, 46–49
 plasticity of, 123
- Dickinson, A., 27
- Donald, M., 126
- Dretske, F., 39, 71, 110
- Eliminativism, 28–30, 32
- Fodor, J., 20, 22
- Folk psychology, 28–30, 31–32. *See also*
 Thought, metarepresented
 metamorphosed into mental design, 33
 as mind designer, 32–34
 versus naive psychology, 34, 70, 138–139
- Frege, G., 16–19, 137
 antipsychologism, 17
 on the axioms of predication, 16–17
 on thoughts, 18–19
- Fregean predication, 15–19, 137. *See also*
Frege, G.
 as concept application, 16
 as coinstantiation, 17
- Gibson, M., 16, 39–40, 110, 137
- Gomez, J. C., 60, 62, 63
- Goodale, M., 35
- Gopnik, A., 62, 90
- Grice, P., 6, 32, 33, 39, 63–64, 140
- Harris, P., 85, 86
- Hobson, P., 33, 38, 58, 59, 61, 62, 63, 78, 82, 87, 91, 93, 101, 110, 125, 143
- Hume, D., xvii
- Hurford, J., 35
- Intellect
 abilities of, 127
 recent evolution of, 127
- Intended descriptiveness, 7–8, 91–93, 102
 lacking in coinstantiations, 21–22

- Intended directedness, 7–8, 72
- Intent, 51, 73
 communicative, 72
 coreferential, 51, 81, 82
- Intentionality, 70–72
 components of, 71
- Intent/ionality (as intent and aboutness), 73, 82, 93
- Intent/ionalization, 118
- Interpretative predication, 28–34
- Joint triangulation, 52, 68, 78–80
- Kant, I., xvii, 105
- Kanzi, 124
- Kaplan, B., 58, 118
- Language, 20
 descriptive versus imperative use, 20–21
 language of thought, 20
 and predication, 20
- Leavens, D., 79
- Lewin, R., 124
- Linguistic predication, 20–22
- Lock, A., 93, 118
- Loftus, E., 110
- Mead, G., 6, 63, 90, 139
- Meltzoff, A., 62, 90
- Meaning
 communicative, 6 (*see also* Grice)
 versus saying, 106–107
 as semantic content, 6
- Mental sharing, 60, 69
- Milner, D., 35
- Mirror neurons, 69
- Mithen, S., 122, 127
- Moses, L., 79, 81
- Naive psychology, 69–70
 versus bilateral sense of other minds, 63
 versus folk psychology, 34, 70, 138–139
- Nelson, K., 87
- Neural plasticity (for assembly), 120–122, 124
- Oates, T., 35
- Olson, D., 33–34, 86, 89, 101, 120
- Ontogenetic adaptations, 47
 interpersonal, 48–49
- Ontogenetic staircase, 50
- Ostensive protopredication, 87–89
- Parenting, revolution in, 122–126
- P-dimensions, xvi–xviii, 7–8, 104
- Pellegrini, A., 47, 120
- Perceptual predication, 34–38
 as coinstantiation, 35
 dorsal versus ventral, 35
 innate, 36, 55
 by way of attention, 36
- Perner, J., 29, 79, 86, 140
- Perry, J., 30
- Pinker, S., 128
- Povinelli, D., 72, 142
- Pragmatic predication, 39–40
- Predicate calculus, 12, 18
- Predication
 assembly of, xviii, 55, 116–122
 central hypothesis, 49–50
 and consciousness, 133–135
 descriptive, 102–103 (*see also* Intended descriptiveness)
 general characterization of, xv, 3–4, 8–9, 53, 100
 as incidental outcome of development, 116
 innateness, 36, 55, 121, 132 (*see also* Perceptual predication)
 mental redesign of, 55–56, 77, 82 (*see also* Assembly)
 puzzles of, xv–xvi, 45–46
 situated, 63

- Predication (cont.)
 unit of, 11
 unity of, xvii, 97, 103–105, 130
 unsituated, 53
- Predicative thinking, 106–111
- Prince, C., 142
- Proposition
 compared with number, 29
 as creation of folk psychology, 28
 logical versus psychological, 10
 maximal (as predicative), 10
 minimal (as semantic content), 5, 10, 18, 19
- Quine, W. V. O., 95–97
- Ramsey, F., 39, 110, 137
- Reddy, V., 117
- Referential altruism, 90–91 (*see also* Coreference)
- Rizzolatti, G., 69
- Rogoff, B., 78, 80, 117
- Role-reversal imitation, 52, 69, 90
- Russell, B., 45
- Sabagh, M. A., 37
- Savage-Rumbaugh, S., 124
- Scaffolding, 78, 93, 94, 117
- S-dimensions, xvi–xvii, 4–5, 8
- Sense of other minds, 68–74
 bilateral, 62–63, 69
 versus naive psychology, 63
- Sellars, W., 29, 33, 34
- Seyfarth, R., 27
- Shanks, D., 27
- Shared attention, 52, 81–83, 84
 versus joint attention, 142–143
- Shared naming, 52, 83–89
- Shared triangulation, 78, 81–83
- Silk, J. B., 122, 124, 126
- Sperber, D., 39, 107, 110, 140
- Stich, S., 30
- Synchronization, 59–60
- Thought
 as image, 23
 instrumental, 54
 metarepresented, 28–30, 107
 minimally propositional or
 coinstantiative, 10
 maximally propositional or
 predicative, 10
- Todd, B., 79
- Tomasello, M., 47, 58, 62, 68, 69, 72, 78, 79, 80, 81, 82, 84, 85, 86, 87, 90, 91, 93, 100, 101, 117, 122, 125, 126, 141
- Tooby, J., 47, 123
- Topic-comment-presupposition format, 7–8, 22, 37–38, 40, 61, 85, 95, 109–110, 130
 and perceptual attention, 36
- Trevarthen, C., 58, 59, 60, 61, 85
- Vieru, S., 16
- Vygotsky, L., 86, 117, 118
- Wall, C., 87
- Wellman, H., 29
- Werner, H., 58, 118
- Whiten, A., 72
- Wiggins, D., 12, 137
- Williams, G., 47, 123
- Wilson, D., 39, 107, 110, 140
- Word acquisition, 50, 80–91
 animal words, 50
 as conventional symbols, 93–94
 first words, 50, 84, 89, 128, 141–142
 reference, 89–91
- Wray, A., 127, 128