

---

# Design and Destiny

Jewish and Christian Perspectives on Human  
Germline Modification

edited by Ronald Cole-Turner

The MIT Press  
Cambridge, Massachusetts  
London, England

© 2008 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information about special quantity discounts, please email [special\\_sales@mitpress.mit.edu](mailto:special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu).

This book was set in Sabon by SNP Best-set Typesetter Ltd., Hong Kong.  
Printed on recycled paper and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Design and destiny : Jewish and Christian perspectives on human germline modification / edited by Ronald Cole-Turner.

p. ; cm. – (Basic bioethics)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-03373-2 (hardcover : alk. paper) – ISBN 978-0-262-53301-0 (pbk. : alk. paper) 1. Medical genetics–Religious aspects–Judaism. 2. Medical genetics–Religious aspects–Christianity. 3. Genetic engineering–Religious aspects–Judaism. 4. Genetic engineering–Religious aspects–Christianity. I. Cole-Turner, Ronald, 1948– II. Series.

[DNLM: 1. Genetic Engineering–ethics. 2. Bioethics. 3. Christianity. 4. Germ Cells. 5. Judaism. 6. Religion and Medicine. WB 60 D457 2008]

RB155.D42 2008

201'.666065–dc22

2007032376

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

---

# Index

- Access to technology, 157–162
- Agar, Nicholas, 139–13
- Agius, Emmanuel, 91–20
- Albert the Great, Saint, 182
- American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS), 21, 27–42
- Anderson, V. Elving, 226, 140–24
- Anderson, William French, 131, 138–4, 138–10, 139–13, 142–48, 142–49
- Angell, Marcia, 159–160, 162, 165–41, 165–42, 165–43, 165–44, 165–45, 165–46, 165–47, 166–53
- Aquinas. *See* Thomas Aquinas, Saint
- Aristotle, 187
- Athanasius, Saint, 90–8, 91–19
- Augustine of Hippo, Saint, 180–181, 194–195
- Autonomy, 212
- Babel, the Tower (of the biblical book of Genesis), 38–39, 106–107
- Bainbridge, William Sims, 116–3
- Barbour, Ian G., 139–16, 140–30, 141–34, 141–44, 142–54, 142–56
- Barnet, Robert J., 165–37
- Barritt, J. A., et al., 25–5, 26–36
- Bartholomew, Ecumenical Patriarch of Constantinople, 81, 90–11
- Baruch, Susanna, et al., 2, 4, 17, 24–2, 25–4, 26–34, 116–4
- Basil the Great, Saint, 83–85, 91–15, 91–16, 91–17
- Bayertz, Kurt, 163–2
- Begley, Sharon, 116–1
- Behavioral Research, 139–13, 139–14, 140–25
- Bernstein, Ellen, 50–29
- Bioethics, 4–6, 212–213
- arguments for germline modification, 101–103, 122, 146 187, 202
- arguments in opposition to germline modification, 121–122, 146, 156–157, 178, 187
- Blaese, R. Michael, 27–38, 27–39
- Bonaventure, Saint, 182
- Brock, Brian, 223–29
- Bryant, J., 200–62, 225
- Buchanan, Allen et al., 25–7, 164–21, 166–52
- Bunyan, John, 100
- Burack, Jeffrey H., 216, 223–27
- Busuttil, Salvino, 91–20
- Cahill, Lisa Sowle, 24, 162, 209, 225–226, 140–27, 166–55
- Cain and Abel (of the biblical book of Genesis), 106, 108
- Callahan, Daniel, 141–42
- Cameron, Nigel M. de S., 15, 23, 210, 225, 117–5
- Campbell, J. H., 227
- Carter Center, 166–54

- Catholic Health Association of the United States, 139–13, 166–54
- Catholic Bishops, United States Conference, 139–16
- Catholic Magisterium or official teaching, 30, 52–55, 208
- Catechism of the Catholic Church, 52, 55–57, 69–2, 69–3, 69–5, 69–10, 69–14, 69–15, 69–18, 69–19, 70–28
- Congregation of the Doctrine of the Faith, 14, 52, 54–56, 69, 122–123, 26–33, 69–1, 69–7, 69–12, 69–13, 69–16, 69–17, 70–27, 70–30 70–46
- International Theological Commission, 14, 64, 124, 26–31, 70–39, 139–22
- Pontifical Academy for Life, 52–53, 57–58, 69–4, 69–6, 69–20, 70–22, 70–23, 70–24, 70–25, 70–26, 70–29, 70–34, 70–35, 70–36, 70–42
- Pope Benedict XVI, 26–31
- Pope John Paul II, 14, 54, 57, 60, 66, 123, 26–31, 26–32, 69–8, 69–21, 70–43, 139–13, 139–19, 139–20, 139–21, 141–36, 142–51
- Holy See, 26–33, 69–11, 70–31, 70–33
- Vatican II, 77, 89–3
- Catholicism, 13–14, 22, 24–25, 52–69, 203, 206
- and cloning, 61–62
- and the common good, 124
- and embryonic stem cell research, 62–63, 206–209
- and germline modification, 57–58, 63–65, 124, 206–209
- and human subject research, 53–57, 60
- medical ethics, 51, 53–56, 123, 47–3
- and natural law, 123
- theology, 13
- and xenotransplantation, 58–60
- Center for Genetics and Society, 166–54
- Cessario, Romanus, 198–37, 199–53
- Chadwick, Derek, et al., 142–53
- Chan, A. W. S., et al., 25–3
- Chapman, Audrey, 210, 225, 27–42, 222–14
- Charlesworth, Max, 142–53
- Christian beliefs
- and biotechnology, 1, 84–87, 132–133, 136–137
- creation, 78–80, 96–98, 104, 125–129, 146–147, 150–151
- eschatology, 97, 115–116, 134–136
- fall into sin, 79, 86, 96–97, 129–131, 133–134, 168–172, 178, 213–217
- and germline modification, 84–87, 107–108, 136–137, 205–217
- grace, 174, 177
- Holy Spirit, 77–78, 83, 174, 177, 183
- human nature, 79–80, 85, 98–99, 103–105, 109, 127–129, 146–157, 167, 172
- humans as co-creators, 98, 109–110, 116, 125, 128–129, 132, 151–153, 192, 215
- incarnation of Jesus Christ, 79–80, 85, 96–97, 104, 113, 116, 125, 131–132, 207, 215
- and medicine, 83–84, 86, 96–99, 132, 134
- redemption, 132–134
- responsibility for children, 85, 113–114, 219–221
- responsibility for creation, 98–102, 114, 123, 125, 127–129, 135–136, 150–153
- and social justice, 115, 145–146, 149–150, 153, 155–162, 209–211, 219–221
- and technology, 83–84, 98–100, 106–108, 113–116, 132–134, 151–152

- Chromosomes, artificial, 18
- Clague, Julie, 153, 164–18, 197–25
- Clarke, W. Norris, S.J., 141–44
- Cloning, 61–62, 193, 195–196, 217
- Cole, A. P., et al., 139–18
- Competition, 220–221
- Conscience, 168, 172, 178–183, 189, 194–196  
and errors, 181–182, 186–187  
as *synderesis*, 179–180, 185  
and virtue, 182
- Cole-Turner, Ronald, 134, 156, 225, 227, 7–7, 26–24, 117–6, 138–12, 141–35, 142–60, 164–29, 196–4, 199–50, 199–58
- Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Dignity, Council of Europe, 87, 92–21
- Coutts, Mary Carrington, 138–11
- Cox, Harvey, 135, 142–61, 142–63, 143–63
- Cox, Paul M., 142–58
- Crick, Francis, 51
- Crouch, Andy, 215, 222–22
- Culver, Kenneth, 27–39, 200–71
- Curran, Charles E., 140–28
- Daniels, Norman, 155, 164–21, 164–22, 164–23, 164–24, 164–25, 164–26, 164–26
- Davies, Brian, 180–181, 198–31
- Davies, Michael, 89–3
- de Chardin, Pierre Teilhard, 133, 142–57
- de Wachter, Maurice A. M., 138–11
- Deane-Drummond, Celia, 24, 225, 198–36, 198–38, 198–45, 200–69, 223–28
- DeBaets, Amy Michelle, 15, 23, 210  
“Designer babies,” 1–2, 16, 202
- Disabilities, 219
- Doerflinger, Richard, 70–43
- Dolly, the cloned sheep, 217
- Donum vitae*. See Catholic, Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith
- Dorff, Elliot N., 22, 216, 225, 47–1, 47–2, 47–4, 47–5
- Drane, James, 47–3
- Dunston, G. R., 131, 142–50
- Eggs. See Oocytes
- Eisenstein, J. D., 49–22
- Ellul, Jacques, 132, 142–55
- Elmer-Dewitt, Philip, 140–33
- Embryo, human 17, 201–203  
dignity of, 66–68, 85  
individuality, 66–67  
and twinning, 66
- Embryo Research, 53–57, 60–62, 65–68, 85, 123–124, 193–194
- Engelhardt, H. Tristram, Jr., 22–23, 226, 89–3, 92–22, 92–23
- Enhancement, see Therapy vs. enhancement
- Ethical, Legal and Social Implications (ELSI). See Human Genome Project
- Eugenics, 100, 114, 191–192
- Evagrius the Solitary, 89–4
- Evans, John H., 226, 26–24
- Fletcher, Joseph F., 142–46
- Frankel, Mark, 161–162, 27–42, 165–50, 166–51
- Friedman, Theodore, 25–6, 139–13
- Fuchs, Josef, S.J., 140–32
- Fukuyama, Francis, 5–8, 82–83, 178, 226, 25–9, 25–10, 25–11, 25–12, 25–13, 25–17, 25–18, 91–12, 91–13, 196–2
- GATTACA, 2, 192
- Gelsinger, Jesse, 102
- Gene repair, 19, 27–38, 27–39
- Gene targeting (or homologous recombination), 20, 27–40, 27–41
- Gene therapy. See Somatic cell gene therapy
- Genetics and Public Policy Center, 2, 4, 17, 24–2, 25–4, 26–34, 116–4

- Germline modification  
 definition, 4, 16–17, 20–21, 145, 196–1  
 inadvertent or unintentional, 20–22, 27–42, 27–43  
 safety, 206  
 techniques, 2–4, 17–20, 192–195
- Global Fund to Fight AIDS, 159, 165–38
- Gregory Palamas, Saint, 89–4
- Gustafson, James M., 140–30, 141–39
- Habermas, Jürgen, 6–7, 9, 82–83, 203, 226, 25–19, 25–20, 25–23, 91–14, 221–3, 221–4
- Hall, Douglas John, 152, 163–12, 163–13
- Häring, Bernard, 140–31, 197–27
- Hauerwas, Stanley, 222–20
- Hayes, Zachary, 140–30
- Heap, Brian (Sir), 226
- Hefner, Philip, 109, 215, 226, 117–15, 117–16, 117–17, 141–40, 222–21
- Hegel, Georg W. F., 90–6
- Heim, Rudolf, 198–39
- Heschel, Abraham Joshua, 48–15
- Heyd, David, 163–3, 164–19
- Hilkert, Mary Catherine, O.P. 163–8
- Hodge, Charles, 105, 117–12
- Hogan, Linda, 180–182, 197–27, 197–29, 198–32
- Hui, Edwin C. [Xu Zhi-Wei], 204, 226, 222–6, 222–7
- Human as artifact, 107–108
- Human dignity, 80, 94–95, 171
- Human enhancement, 85–86, 94–96, 105, 110–113, 154–157, 210–221
- Human freedom, 101–102, 109–110, 167–180, 183, 194–195  
 and knowledge, 168–171, 174, 179  
 transcendental freedom, 174–177, 179, 183, 191, 194–196
- Human Genome Project, 51, 93, 119–120, 124, 189
- Human germline genetic modification.  
*See* Germline modification
- Human identity, 167, 177  
 and germline modification, 177
- Human nature, 7, 87–88, 96–99, 105, 110–112, 145–157, 212–213  
 embodied, 148–150, 167  
 and genetics, 146–147, 189–190
- Human power over nature, 100–102, 109–111
- Human subjects research, 52–57, 60
- Huxley, Aldous, 105, 111, 161
- Image of God. *See* Christian beliefs, human nature
- In vitro fertilization (IVF), 9, 15, 191
- Inheritable genetic modifications. *See* Germline modification
- Jacob (of the biblical book of Genesis), 40–41
- Jakobovits, Immanuel, 49–21
- Jans, Jan, 140–32
- John Chrysostom, 91–9
- Johnstone, Brian V., C.S.S.R., 138–8
- Jonas, Hans, 1, 24, 226, 24–1
- Jones, D. Gareth, 141–38
- Jones, David Albert, 222–11
- Jones, Kenneth C., 89–3
- Joy, Bill, 108, 117–14
- Judaism, 29–46, 207, 215–216. *See also* Rabbis  
 and biotechnology, 1  
 Conservative, 31–32  
 doctrines, 32–46, 47–5  
 and germline modification, 39–40, 44–46, 216  
 and medicine, 34–36  
 method, 30–31, 47–4  
 Mishah, 36, 40, 42–43  
 Orthodox, 31, 38  
 Reform, 32  
 Talmud, 32–36, 39–44  
*tikkun olam*, 36–38, 45, 215–216  
 Torah, 32, 35, 37–38, 41–44, 90–7

- Juengst, Eric, 4, 121–122, 25–5,  
26–37, 27–43, 139–17, 140–30,  
143–65, 165–31
- Junker-Kenny, M., 226
- Justice, 16, 24, 115, 149–150,  
155–162, 168, 184, 201,  
209–211, 219–221
- Kant, Immanuel, 89–2
- Kass, Leon, 5–6, 25–14, 25–15,  
25–16, 25–22
- Keeler, Cardinal William H., 70–32
- Keenan, James F., S.J., 153, 213–214,  
216, 140–26, 163–17, 222–16,  
222–17, 222–18, 222–19
- Kolata, Gina, 116–2
- Krinsky, Sheldon, 161, 165–48,  
165–49
- Kubota, H., et al., 27–41
- Lammers, Ann, 141–41
- Lappé, Marc, 138–9
- Lee, Thomas F., 138–3, 138–6
- Lewis, C. S., 99–101, 117–8, 117–9,  
117–10
- Little, Margaret Olivia, 165–32
- Locke, John, 29
- Love, 174
- MacIntyre, Alasdair, 88, 92–24
- Mackler, Aaron, 226, 47–3
- Magisterium. *See* Catholic  
Magisterium
- Mann, Thomas, 152, 163–15
- Mantzarides, Georgios I., 91–19
- Marcy, Marin E., 140–29
- Market forces, 157–162
- Mauron, Alen, 139–14, 139–14
- McClaren, Anne, 196–3
- McGleenan, Tony, 141–45
- McKibben, Bill, 226, 118–25,  
200–66
- Medicare, 160
- Messer, Neil, 199–5
- Metz, Johannes B., 142–61
- Mitchell, C. Ben, 226
- Montesquieu, Claude, 29
- Moraczewski, Albert, 203–204,  
221–5
- Murray, Thomas H., 165–40
- National Council of the Churches of  
Christ, USA, 12, 98, 26–27,  
117–6
- National Nanotechnology Initiative  
of the National Science  
Foundation, 94, 116–3
- Natural law, 179–180, 183  
Orthodox rejection, 79–80
- Nelson, J. Robert, 138–12, 140–30
- Nevins, Michael, 49–21
- Newman, Lewis E., 225, 47–4
- Noah and the Ark (of the biblical  
book of Genesis), 106–107
- Nolan, Hugh J., 139–16
- Nominalism, 172–174, 186
- Nowak, R., 200–70
- Oocytes, 17
- Ooplasm transfer, 4, 19, 25–5,  
26–36
- Orthodox Christianity, 15  
definition, 73–79  
differences with western  
Christianity, 78  
doctrines, 79–82  
experience of God, 80–82  
and germline modification, 84–87  
and medicine, 83–86  
and philosophy, 82–83, 87–88  
role of creeds, 77–78  
role of tradition, 75–78
- Page, Ruth, 163–16
- Palmer, Julie Gage, 101–102,  
202–203, 25–8, 117–11, 221–1
- Parens, Erik, 4, 226, 25–5, 26–37,  
27–43, 163–1, 164–30, 165–33,  
165–34
- Peters, Ted, 178, 215, 226, 141–40,  
141–41, 197–24, 199–50, 223–23,  
223–24, 223–25

- Peterson, James C., 226  
 Phan, Kinh Luan, et al., 138–1  
 Philosophy and public debate, 5  
   objections to germline modification, 5  
   and religion, 5–7, 29, 82–83, 87–88, 212–213  
 Pinckaers, Servais, 172–173, 196–10, 196–11, 196–12, 196–13  
 “Playing God,” 9, 23, 121, 124–125, 187, 195  
 Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis (PGD), 202–203, 208  
 Protestantism, 11–13, 30, 204–205, 208–209  
 Prudence, 182–185, 189, 195  
 Public debate and religion, 1–2, 4–6, 217  
 Rabbis  
   Akiba ben Joseph, 44  
   Eliezer, 43, 90–7  
   Hanina, 43, 90–7  
   Hillel, 111, 47–9  
   Karo, Joseph, 34–35, 49–24  
   Maimonides, 45–46, 47–9  
   Moses ben Nahman, 35  
   Oshaya, 43  
 Rae, Scott B., 142–58  
 Rahner, Karl, 171, 174–177, 179, 183, 188–189, 191–192, 194–195, 209–210, 196–9, 197–15, 197–16, 197–17, 197–18, 197–19, 197–20, 197–21, 197–22, 197–23, 197–26, 199–51, 199–52, 199–54, 199–55, 199–56, 200–63, 200–64, 200–65, 222–13  
 Ramsey, Paul, 9–10, 16, 124, 132, 136, 151, 187–188, 195, 226, 25–21, 26–25, 139–23, 142–52, 143–64, 163–9, 198–44, 199–46, 199–47, 199–48, 199–49, 199–50  
 Reich, Warren T., 139–13  
 Reichenbach, Bruce R., 226, 140–24  
 Religion  
   definition, 29  
   opposition to germline modification, 10  
   and public debate, 1–2, 5–8  
   support for germline modification, 8–16  
   value of religion, 8  
 Rifkin, Jeremy, 10, 25–28–24  
 Risk. *See* Safety  
 Roco, Mihail C., 116–3  
 Roth, Cecil, 49–21  
 Roth, Sol, 50–33  
 Safety, 59–60  
 Seward, John, 222–11  
 Scholasticism, 172  
 Scott, Peter, 225  
 Scully, Jackie Leach, 118–24  
 Searle, J., 200–62, 225  
 Sermon on the Mount, 174  
 Shannon, Thomas J., 13, 22, 151, 203, 206, 208, 226–227, 70–44, 70–45, 141–37, 141–43, 163–10, 163–11  
 Shinn, Roger Lincoln, 227  
 Siep, Ludwig, 148, 163–4, 163–5  
 Silouan the Athonite, Saint, 90–5  
 Silver, Lee, 115, 209, 227, 222–12  
 Smith, Cynthia, et al., 165–36  
 Somatic cell gene therapy, 17, 93–95, 119–120, 145  
 Song, Robert, 149, 227, 163–6, 163–7  
 Southern Baptist Convention, 13, 26–30  
 Sperm, 17  
 Sperm precursor cells, 17  
 Spielberg, Steven, 117–13  
 Stock, Gregory, 227  
 Supreme Court of the United States, 30, 48–1  
 Suzuki, Nobutaka, et al., 26–35  
 Swinton, John, 223–29



- Symeon the New Theologian, Saint, 89–4
- Szasz, Thomas, 157, 165–35
- Temptation, 169–170
- Therapy vs. enhancement, 15–16, 23, 85–86, 94, 95–96, 110–113, 120–121, 134, 154–155, 190, 195–196, 201–202, 204–205, 211–217
- Thévoz, Jean-Marie, 139–14, 139–15
- Thomas Aquinas, Saint, 172, 174, 179–187, 194–195, 196–14, 197–26, 197–28, 198–33, 198–34, 198–43
- Thomism, 172, 174
- Thomson, J. A., 27–40
- United Methodist Church, 12–13, 206, 26–28, 26–29, 222–10
- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), 94–95
- United Nations, 94–95, 159, 165–39
- Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 54–55
- U.S. President's Commission for the Study of Ethical Problems in Medicine and Biomedical and Behavioral Research, 139–13, 139–15, 140–25
- U.S. President's Council on Bioethics, 110–112, 117–18, 117–19, 117–20, 117–21, 138–5, 199–57
- Vardy, Peter, 185–186, 198–41
- Vaux, Kenneth, 140–29
- Vectors, viral and nonviral, 18
- Verhey, Allen, 140–27
- Vincent of Lerins, Saint, 89–5
- Virtue ethics, 24, 168, 172, 177–179, 182–185  
and germline modification, 184–187, 189, 192
- Vlachos, Hierotheos, 89–4
- von Rad, Gerhard, 169
- Walter, James J., 13, 23–24, 151, 202, 227, 140–28, 163–10, 163–11
- Walters, LeRoy, 101–102, 202–203, 25–8, 117–11, 221–1
- Waskow, Arthur, 50–29
- Waters, Brent, 212, 227, 196–4, 222–15
- Wathen, James F. 89–3
- Watson, James D., 51, 119
- Westberg, Daniel, 185, 198–35, 198–40
- Westerman, Claus, 152, 169, 163–14, 196–5, 196–6, 196–7, 196–8
- Wheeler, Sondra Ely, 104, 204–205, 117–23, 222–8, 222–9
- William of Ockham, 172, 186
- Williams, Esther, 89–4
- Wilmut, Ian, 200–68
- Wisdom, 183–185, 195–196
- Wolter, Allan B., OFM, 70–44
- World Council of Churches, 11–12, 26–26
- World Health Organization, 155, 164–20
- Xu Zhi-Wei. *See* Hui, Edwin C.
- Zimmerman, Burke K., 138–7
- Zoloth, Laurie, 44–45, 216, 50–45, 223–26
- Zwaka, T. P., 27–40

