Pension Strategies in Europe and the United States

Edited by Robert Fenge, Georges de Ménil, and Pierre Pestieau

**CESTO** Seminar Series

The MIT Press Cambridge, Massachusetts London, England © 2008 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information about special quantity discounts, please e-mail  $\langle special\_sales@mitpress.mit.edu \rangle.$ 

This book was set in Palatino on 3B2 by Asco Typesetters, Hong Kong. Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Pension strategies in Europe and the United States / Robert Fenge, Georges de Ménil, and Pierre Pestieau, editors.

p. cm.—(CESifo seminar series)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-0-262-06272-5 (hardcover : alk. paper)
1. Pensions—Europe. 2. Pensions—United States. 3. Pension trusts—Europe.
4. Pension trusts—United States. I. Fenge, Robert. II. De Ménil, Georges, 1940– III. Pestieau, Pierre, 1943– HD7105.45.E85P46 2008
331.25'22094—dc22 2007020847

 $10 \quad 9 \quad 8 \quad 7 \quad 6 \quad 5 \quad 4 \quad 3 \quad 2 \quad 1$ 

## Index

Actuarial reduction factor (ARF), 27 Aging, 132, 211. See also Demographic shock and funded pensions, 239-240, 254-257, 265 - 266and investment strategy, 274-275, 277-279, 282-283, 285, 288-290 and labor market, 240, 255-257, 264-266 and rate of return, 257-259 and taxation, 254-255 Altruism, 214, 222 Annuitization, 12–13, 211–233 and Approved Personal Pensions (APPs), 176 mandatory, 215, 219-221, 227-232 and mortality rate, 220-221 and Personal Savings Accounts (PSAs), 218-221, 227-231 and privatization, 213-215, 217 welfare effects of, 227-231 Approved Personal Pension (APP), 176-186, 204 Balladur, Edouard, 37 Belgium, 4 Benchmark economy, 91–96 funded pensions in, 245-247 government in, 91-94, 96-106 households in, 91, 93 and life expectancy, 105 market in, 92–93 nontaxable pensions and, 99-101 parameterization of, 93-96 Ramsey problem, 101-103 social security in, 217-218 taxation in, 92-94, 96-99, 106-108, 110 Beveridgean system, 141-143, 146, 155

Bismarckian system, 141–143, 146–148, 151, 155 Bush (George W.) administration, 211 Caisse Nationale d'Assurance Viellesse (CNAV), 40, 44-45, 63, 73 Canada, 38 Capital, return on, 257-261 "Capital crowding-out" effect, 214 Capital integration, 159 Cohort effects and benefits age, 129 of demographic shock, 88-90, 101, 109-110 Dutch funded pensions, 251–252 French pension reform of 1993, 42-43, 53 - 54Condorcet winner, 126 Constant relative risk aversion (CCRA), 282 Defined-benefit (DB) pension plans, 172, 174, 239 Defined-contribution (DC) pension plans, 173-175, 189 Delayed retirement credit (DRC), 27-36 labor disutility, 29-30 and longevity, 34-35 model, 28-29 self-selection, 27-28, 30-33 Demographic shock cohort effects of, 88-90, 101, 109-110 and dependency ratio, 2, 7-8, 87, 104-105, 119 predictability of, 87-88 strategies for absorbing, 89-90, 111-112 and taxation, 90, 102-104 transitory, 104–106

Dependency ratio, 2, 7-8, 87, 119 and pivotal voting age, 121 and transitory demographic shock, 104-105Difference-in-difference methodology, 47-69, 194-195 baseline estimates, 55-58 common-trend assumption, 202 disclosure effects, 59-60, 62-63, 78-80 elasticity, 55 quasi-difference-in-differences, 197-199 response coefficients, 55, 58 sources of bias, 58-60 Disability pensions, 60–62 Distortionary taxation, 90 Dynastic model, 214 Early retirement in Canada, 38 in France, 67-74 and PAYG systems, 6 Échantillon Interrégime de Retraités (EIR), 43-44, 63-67, 73 Europe demographic shock in, 8 mandatory contributions in, 141 PAYG in, 1-2 population aging in, 132 sustainability of social security, 122-123, 132, 136 European Union (EU), 141 Family Resource Survey (FRS), 191–192 Financial numeracy, 169-170 First pillar system, 141 France, 4. See also French pension reform of 1993 complementary schemes in, 77-78 PAYG reform in, 6-7 pension system in, 40-41, 74-78 population aging in, 132 and U.K. system, 151-152, 155-156 Free choice model, 144–147 intertemporal wealth, 145, 147 liquidity constraints, 145 proofs of propositions, 161-164 rate of return, 147, 152 stationary equilibrium, 149-150

Free choice systems, 141–164 and capital integration, 159 comparing, 148–152 efficiency in, 155–156, 160–161

equilibrium under, 143, 149-160 income and, 152-155 myopic expectations, 159-160 national, 147-148 redistribution in, 142-143, 148, 151, 155 French pension reform of 1993, 37-80 cohort effects, 42-43, 53-54 contribution length, 41-42, 47, 49-59, 69-70 disability pensions, 60-62 labor-supply elasticity, 37, 70-71 objections to, 37-38 and pension rate, 75-76 proportionality coefficient, 76 reference wage, 42, 69, 77 replacement rate, 43, 50, 69, 73 retirement age, 45-47, 50-51, 67-74 unemployment, 67-70, 74 unpopularity of postponing retirement, 71-73 Funded occupational pensions in Netherlands, 13-15, 239-270 and aging, 239-240, 254-257, 265-266 average-wage, 250-253 and Dutch economy, 240, 264-266 income groups, 251-252 premiums, 245-247, 260-261 and rates of return, 257-261 variable indexation, 248-250, 252-253, 260-261 and wages, 246-247 Funded pension systems, 10–15 GDP, 95-96, 108 General-equilibrium model, 213, 215-217 annuity payments, 220 household types, 215, 222, 230-231 parameters, 225-226 preference structure, 221-224 Germany PAYG in, 4 pension reform in, 16-18, 20-21 population aging in, 132 Health insurance, 245 Hedging demand, 285-286, 288 Identification strategy, 47 IMAGE model, 241–245 household optimization, 243, 267-269 parameters, 242

rate of return, 243 tradable-goods sector, 269-270 Income and free choice systems, 152–155 and funded pensions, 246-247 and individual pension plans, 281-283 and interest rates, 243 and replacement rate, 218 retirement pensions as, 97-99 Individual pension plans, 273-290 and consumer age, 274-275, 277-279, 282-283, 285, 288-290 fixed/flexible contributions, 279-281 and income, 281-283 and investment risk, 274-275, 278-283, 285, 288-289 and labor flexibility, 283-285, 290 optimal dynamic portfolios, 277-279 optimal static portfolios, 275-277 predictability of returns, 285-289 and stock market investing, 273-274, 285-286, 288-289 INGENUE model, 259 Initiative Fifty Plus, 18 Intergenerational redistribution, 1-2, 108, 245, 266-267 Intertemporal wealth, 145, 147 Intragenerational redistribution, 9, 142 Investing. See also Individual pension plans and aging, 274-275, 277-279, 282-283, 285, 288-290 and labor supply, 283-285, 290 in stocks, 273-274, 285-286, 288-289 Italy, 132 Labor disutility, 29-30 Labor-force participation, 38-39, 243, 246-247, 255-257, 266 Labor income. See Income Labor supply and aging, 240, 255-257, 264-266 and demographic shock, 89–90 elasticity of, 37, 70-71, 123-124, 243 and investment strategy, 283-285, 290 and mobility, 141, 161, 176 and rate of return, 261 and taxation, 108 Life expectancy and benchmark economy, 105 and early retirement, 73 Longevity, 34-35

Mandatory annuitization, 215, 219–221, 227-232 Marginal labor tax, 36 Means-reversion, 286–287 Median voting age, 8–9, 120–121, 132 Merkel, Angela, 18 Microsimulations, 39 Migration, 141, 144 Minimum income guarantee (MIG), 202-203 Mitterand, François, 6 Mobility, workers', 141, 161, 176 Moral-hazard condition, 31-32 Netherlands. See also Funded occupational pensions in Netherlands aging in, 239-240 labor-force participation in, 256-257 market sectors, 264-265 PAYG in, 4, 241 New Zealand, 39 Normal retirement age (NRA), 27 Occupational pension systems, 13-15. See

Occupational pension systems, 13–15. See also Funded occupational pensions in Netherlands Optimal portfolio management, 275–279 Optimal taxation approach, 96–99 Overlapping-generations model, 216– 217

Pareto improvement, 2, 90, 101 Partial-privatization plans, 12-13, 212, 219-221, 232 Pay-as-you-go (PAYG) pension systems, 1-8. See also Demographic shock; Free choice systems; French pension reform of 1993; Sustainability delayed retirement credit (DRC), 27-36 in Europe, 1-2 as insurance, 213, 232 and migration, 141, 144 and privatization, 213-214 and retirement age, 5-8 Pension Credit Guarantee (PCG), 203 Pension-fund management, 15. See also Individual pension plans Personal Pensions Scheme, 171, 173, 175-186, 204-205 age-earnings profile, 179–180 opting-out patterns, 181-182, 184-185 rebate structure, 182-184

Personal Savings Account (PSA), 212, 218-221, 227-232 Pivotal voting age, 120-121, 126-128, 132 Population growth. See also Demographic shock and aging, 132, 211, 239 and dependency ratio, 2, 7-8, 87 and equilibrium benefit level, 131 and social security, 130-131 Portfolio management. See Optimal portfolio management Poverty condition, 30, 33 Private pensions. See also Retirement savings incentives in U.K. and annuitization, 213-215 partial-privatization plans, 12-13, 212, 219-221, 232 and PAYG systems, 213-214 United Kingdom, 192-193, 201-202, 204 United States, 211 Quasi-difference-in-differences model, 197 - 199Rate of return on capital, 147, 152, 243, 257-261, 273, 286-287 Rational expectations hypothesis, 143 Redistribution, 141 and efficiency, 155-156 in free choice systems, 142-143, 148, 151, 155intergenerational, 1-2, 108, 245, 266-267 intragenerational, 9, 142 Reference wage, 42, 69, 77 Replacement rate, 17, 43, 50, 73 and contribution length, 49-50 and earnings, 218 and reference wage, 69 Retirement age. See also Delayed retirement credit (DRC) average, 45-47, 51 and benefits age, 126-130 and contribution length, 55-59, 69-70, 73-74 early, 6, 38, 67-74 and labor market, 38-40 normal retirement age (NRA), 27 and PAYG systems, 5-8 self-selection, 27-28, 30-33 statutory, 6-7, 17-19 of women, 6, 19, 71-73

Retirement savings incentives in U.K., 169 - 206age-earnings profile, 179-180 Approved Personal Pension (APP), 176-186,204 contracting out, 174-175, 177-179 and financial numeracy, 169-170 and household saving behavior, 170-172, 175 - 176opting-out patterns, 181-182, 184-185 Personal Pensions Scheme, 171, 173, 175-186, 204-205 rebate structure, 182-184 reform of, 182-186, 202-203 Stakeholders Pension Scheme, 10–11, 171-173, 186-193, 199-205 State Earnings-Related Pension Scheme (SERPS), 172-173, 176-183 tax relief, 173-174, 186-187, 190-191 Retirement savings model, 193–203 and earnings groups, 196-199 pension probabilities, 195-196 and spouse's earnings, 193-202 "Riester" accounts, 16-17 Self-selection, 27-28, 30-33 Social security system, U.S., 87, 117-118 and discount rates, 124 and excess tax burden, 123-124 political support for, 121-122, 125-126, 131, 134, 136 and population growth, 130–131 predicted benefits, 131 present value of benefits, 119-120 as social insurance, 135 Spain, 132 Stakeholders Pension Scheme, 10–11, 171– 173, 186-193, 204-205 contribution limits, 190-191 and earnings groups, 187-190, 197-199, 201-203 rationale for, 186-189 response to, 191-193 and spouse's earnings, 199 and tax relief, 186-187, 190-191 State Earnings-Related Pension Scheme (SERPS), 172-173, 176-183 State Second Pension (S2P), 202 Statutory retirement age, 7 in France, 6 in Germany, 17–18 in United Kingdom, 19

Steady-state equilibrium, 224-225 Stochastic volatility, 286, 288 Stock market investing, 273-274, 285-286, 288-289. See also Individual pension plans Sustainability, 8-10. See also Free choice systems; Social security system, U.S.; Voter preferences and benefits age, 126-130, 136 and concern for family, 134-135 of European social security, 122-123, 132, 136 median-voter model, 8-9, 130-131 and pivotal voting age, 120-121, 126-128, 132 "Sustainability factor," 17

Taxation age-differential, 106-108 and aging population, 254-255 in benchmark economy, 92-94, 96-99, 106-108, 110 and demographic shock, 90, 102-104 distortionary, 90 excess burden of, 123-124 in Netherlands, 241 optimal taxation approach, 96–99 Personal Savings Accounts (PSAs), 219 of retirement pensions, 97-99 U.K. tax relief, 173-174, 186-187, 190-191 variable, 7-8 Thatcher (Margaret) administration, 173 Thrift Savings Plan (TSP), 211 Transition probability matrix, 233

Unemployment, 67-70, 74 Unfitness pensions, 60-62 United Kingdom, 18, 20-21 Approved Personal Pension (APP), 176-186 defined-benefit (DB) pension plans, 172, 174defined-contribution (DC) pension plans, 173 - 174and French system, 151-152, 155-156 National Insurance (NI) contributions, 178 PAYG in, 3–4 Personal Pensions Scheme, 171, 173, 175-186, 204-205 private pensions in, 192-193, 201-202, 204

retirement age in, 19 Stakeholders Pension Scheme, 10–11, 171-173, 186-193, 199-205 State Earnings-Related Pension Scheme (SERPS), 172-173, 176-183 State Second Pension (S2P), 202 sustainability of social security, 132 tax relief in, 173-174, 186-187, 190-191 United States. See also Social security system, U.S. baby boomers, 89, 109, 117 and Europe, 8 investment returns in, 273, 286-287 normal retirement age in, 27-28 partial-privatization proposals in, 12-13, 211-212 population aging in, 132 replacement rate in, 218 voter participation in, 120-121 Voter preferences, 135–136. See also

Sustainability and access to information, 132–133 benefits age, 126–130, 136 median age, 8–9, 120–121, 132 pivotal age, 120–121, 126–128, 132 retirement age, 128 and voter confidence, 125–126, 133–134 Wages. *See* Income War pensions, 61–62

Women labor-force participation, 255–257 retirement age of, 6, 19, 71–73 and retirement incentives, 184