
Water, Place, and Equity

edited by John M. Whiteley, Helen Ingram,
and Richard Perry

The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England

© 2008 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information about special quantity discounts, please e-mail special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu

This book was set in Sabon by Graphic Composition, Inc., Bogart, Georgia.
Printed on recycled paper and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Water, place, and equity / edited by John M. Whiteley, Helen Ingram, and Richard Warren Perry.

p. cm. — (American and comparative environmental policy)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-23271-5 (hardcover : alk. paper) — ISBN 978-0-262-73191-1 (pbk.)

1. Water resources development. 2. Equity. I. Whiteley, John M., 1940–

II. Ingram, Helen M., 1937– III. Perry, Richard Warren.

HD1691.W325 2008

333.91—dc22

2008017001

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Index

- Acequia*, 13, 14, 40, 41, 42, 43, 58
Adaptive management, 294, 297
 ethical concept that embraces equity,
 294–295
Aguas del Tunari and Betchel,
 201–202
All-American Canal, 16, 26, 118,
 136–139, 142
American Water Development, Inc.
 (AWDI), 43, 46–54, 60
Aristotle, 9
Arkansas River Compact, 49
- Baca Ranch, 37, 41, 45, 46, 48, 49,
 51
Boldt Decisions, 155, 165, 183
Bolivia, 195–224
 New Economic Policy, 199
 policy design, 204–205
 privatization, 199–200
 water war, 195–204
Border Environment Cooperation
 Commission (BECC), 104, 105,
 133, 134, 135
Brazil, 12, 15, 24, 25, 249–270
 approach to water reform, 266–267
 challenges to policymakers in equity
 terms, 259
 efficiency, 253
 decentralization, 260–266
 limits to equitable participation,
 264–266
 main unit of water management, 256
 politics, 253
 political meddling, 254–256
 reform, 260–266
 river basin, 256
 use of knowledge, 260–266
 water reform, 256–259
- Categorical imperatives, 281–291
 application to natural resources man-
 agement, 288
Ceará
 access to and use of knowledge, 255
 broader implications, 267, 323–33
 reform its water management, 257
 jurisdiction for decision making,
 31–33, 266–267
 water reform, 257–259
Citizens for Monument to Park Con-
 version, 51
Citizens for San Luis Valley Water, 47
Climate change, 12
 aggravated problems, 271–276
 challenge to categorical imperatives,
 290
Coalition for practical regulation, 73
Cochabamba, 7, 191, 195–224
 water war, 200–204
COGERH, 252, 258–259, 261
 amalgamation of ideas and technolo-
 gies, 259
 included social scientists, 258

- COGERH (cont.)
 responsibilities, 258
 role of conflict in sustainability, 262–263
 role technical knowledge, 258–259
 Colorado Supreme Court, 47
 Columbia River, 20
 changing social, economic and political landscape, 147–180
 conflict over efficiency and equity, 148
 Common law riparian rights, with the Doctrine of Prior Appropriation, 163
 Complex equity, 14
 AWDI, 54
 decision-making process, 53
 disjointed utilitarianism, 57
 form of distributive justice, 53
 injustice, 53
 managing complex social goods, 53
 politics and ethics, 57
 sustainability, 56–57
 Concerned Citizens of South Central Los Angeles, 73
 Consequentialist standards, 10, 83–88
 utilitarianism, 15
 Covenants, 281–287
 predicated upon three principles, 281
 potential drawbacks, 286–287
 Distributional equity, 16
 husbanding of water resources, 27
 Distributional inequity, 15–19
 Distributive justice, natural resources policy, 280
 Dublin Principles of 1992, 249, 256, 268
 Due process, 54, 57
 AWDI, 54
 decision-making procedures, 54
 fair decisions, 54
 moral-economic evaluation, 54
 responsibility of the interests and communities affected, 54
 Stockman's Water, 54
 Economic efficiency, allocation of water resources, 3–4
 Economic equity, 95, 97, 101–102, 107, 110
 Economic incentives, 23
 Ecosystem sustainability, 10
 Efficiency
 framework, 3–8, 27
 short-term water management, 198, 249
 trade-offs, 267
 Efficiency principle, beneficiaries pay, 27
 Ejidarios, 17, 99, 101, 107, 108, 109, 110, 111, 113
 Energy resource abundance and little need for government intervention, 147
 Pacific Northwest, 147
 in United States history, 147
 Environmental degradation and spiritual decline, 292–293
 Environmental justice
 collaborative process, 82
 cost and benefits environmental protection, 80–81
 determination of the costs and benefits, 82
 institutional barriers, 81–82
 literature, 79, 83
 need for policy change, 78
 policy intent, 86–87
 pollution control, 78
 relationship between ethics and politics, 86–87
 research literature, 78–80
 storm water runoff, 81–82
 Equitable processes and the poor and disadvantaged, 27
 Equitable water policy, conception of individual and collective welfare, 280
 Equity, 1–30, 35, 36, 38, 52, 53–54, 56, 57, 70, 81, 89, 90, 95–116, 110, 117–122, 148, 155, 159, 162, 163, 165–169, 172, 177, 178–180,

- 191–192, 215, 217, 218, 225, 233, 242–244, 271, 280–287
- access and distribution, 117
- among sovereign nations, 117–118
- binational water management, 117–130
- broader community values, 27
- bulk water, 250
- capitalist economics, 179
- categorical imperatives, 287–291
- community equity, 13–14
- conflict between different kinds of uses, 259
- context of water management, 100–102
- covenants, 281–287
- creation of participatory, 250
- democratic politics, 179
- democratization of decision making, 263–266
- difficulty in implementation, 279–280
- elite capture, 252
- environmental stewardship, 291–293
- ethical principles, 27
- implication of knowledge, 253
- institutional design, 260, 119–122
- international legal prescription, 122–126
- intrabasin transfer, 259
- intergenerational, 267
- in the case of common pool resources, 162
- irrigation districts, 96
- just compensation, 27
- lack of spatial congruence between aquifers and political jurisdictions, 297
- learning from past mistakes, 295
- limits to equitable participation, 264–266
- management, 259–260
- market-oriented, 95
- negotiated allocation, 252, 263–266
- and perpetuated inequity, 179
- policy failures, 302
- pressures for reform, 126–130
- promises associated with decentralization, 103–104
- restructuring, 95
- river basin councils, 96, 111
- sacrifices, 27
- seldom factored in where water is at stake, 118–130
- shift toward watershed, 130–136
- solidarity, 27
- Sonora as critical laboratory, 96
- sustainable river management, 180
- sustainable use of shared waters, 130–136
- technical knowledge, 259–260
- trade-offs, 267
- tradition of common law, 8
- urban water management, 96
- utilitarian approaches, 278
- and utilitarianism, 280
- water as a common good, 250
- water ethics, 27
- water goals, 272
- water governance, 117
- water management, 249
- water resources, 28, 278–281, 282, 283
- water quality and environmental impacts, 260
- Equity across boundaries, 19–21
- Ethic of fallibility, 298–301
- European Declaration for a New Water Culture, 25, 27
- four broad categories for ethical action, 28
- economic growth, 28
- water citizenry, 28
- water crime, 28
- Formal institutional rules
 - outcome, 250
 - process, 250
- Fraser River, 20, 148
 - changing social, economic and political landscape, 147–180

- Front Range, 22, 25
 Colorado Springs, 46
 Denver, 46
 Pueblo, 46
 Further research, 301–302
- Global water crisis, 195
 Globalization, 27, 197
 Great Sand Dune National Park, 25,
 37, 45, 46, 47, 51–52
- Harmon Doctrine, 20, 120, 122, 123,
 124, 140
- Intergenerational equity, 12
 ethic of stewardship, 28
 International Pacific Salmon Fisheries
 Commission, 165
 Intrinsic value, 10, 23
 just compensation, 26
 Isaac Stevens, 157–158
 Treaty, 155–159
- J. B. Babcock, 167, 173
 dams and salmon, 167
- La Coordinadora (Coalition for the
 Defense of Water and Life), 202–
 203, 214, 219
 Los Angeles Regional Water Quality
 Control Board (LARWQCB)
 Best Management Practices (BMP),
 69, 87–88
 current list of BMPs, 87
- Mexico, 95–116, 117–146, 275–276
 new culture of water, 102
 reform package, 95
 water policy was reshaped, 96
 water reform program, 97–100
 water sector modernization, 95
 Moral economy of water, 14, 22–23,
 52–53, 55, 56, 58, 62, 63
 communal social good, 51
 community, 39
 complex equity, 51
 concept of sustainability, 38
 Crowley County, 48
 due process, 38
 equity, 38
 intrinsically communal social, 43
 and marketlike transfers, 38
 overcoming moral prosperity, 38
 Owens Valley California, 48
 political conflict, 38, 55–56
 and urban-oriented allocations of
 western water 38
 water planning principles, 55–56
 Mothers of East Los Angeles, 73
 Multiple values of water, 9–12
 Murray Darling Basin, 23
- Nature Conservancy, 37, 41, 53,
 284
 North American Water and Power
 Alliance, 7
 Northwest Power Planning Council,
 293
- Participatory equity, 24, 252, 256,
 260
 Place, sense of, 1, 11, 277, 288, 301
 Plato, 8
 Policy design, 204–205, 206–209,
 211, 212–217, 218
 for democracy, 196
 Political equity, 24, 95, 97, 101–102,
 110
 creation of river basin, 107
 and irritation districts, 107–110
 procedural utilitarianism, 10
 Polluter-pays principles, 4
 Principle of complex equality, 63
 Prior appropriations, conflict with ef-
 ficiency, 163–164
 Procedural equality, 23
- River basin councils, 249–269
 accessibility of knowledge,
 249–250

- River values
 minority rights for efficiency, 169
 sacrificing equity, 169
- San Luis Valley, 14, 22, 25, 34, 37–67
 Water Conservancy District, 59
- Sense of community generated
 through water, 13, 14
- Social capital, 14
- Social learning
 and adaptive management, 294
 making midcourse corrections,
 296–297
 monitoring and measuring change,
 295–296
 watershed based venues, 293
- Sohappy, David, 165
 vs. Smith, 165
- Sonora, 96, 102–110, 112, 113
 irrigation districts, 107–110
 River Basin Councils, 105–107
 urban water management, 103–105
- Spain, 225–248
 concept of national territory and sov-
 ereignty, 226
 economic transformation, 227–229
 national political culture of water
 and local consequences, 234–239
 natural resources, 226
 needs of rural population, 227
 physical appropriation of the water
 resources, 225
 process of intellectual reconstruction,
 225
 process of social transformation, 226
 role of water, 226
 territorialization, 227
 water a scarce commodity, 229
 water as local issue to a national pri-
 ority, 239–244
 water policies, 229–234
- Stakeholder's councils in Brazil,
 249–270
 access to, 251
 failures, 251
 knowledge, 251
 participation matters, 250
 positive outcomes, 251
 role of, 251–252
- Stewardship ethics, premise, 291–293
- Stockholm International Water Insti-
 tute, 274–275
- Stockman's Water, 43, 48–51, 52, 53,
 54
- Storm water policy, 69–94
 consequentialist evaluation, 83–87
 deleterious effects, 85
 and equity issues involving munic-
 ipalities, 70
 ethical issues, 70
 environmental injustice, 79
 environmental justice and equity is-
 sues, 70, 81–82
 ethical considerations, 83
 ethics in policy design, 83–89
 policy outcome, 83
 positive effects, 85
 problem, 71–73
 protection measures and their costs,
 73–74
 regional, economic race and ethnic
 divisions, 74–78
 utilitarianism, 83–87
- Sustainability and water decisions, 23
- Sustainable community, definition of,
 57, 63
- Technical decision making, 253–255
 Brazil's democracy, 254
 water management, 253
- Technocratic elites, 24
- Technoscientific considerations
 in water allocation, 252
 water negotiations, 252
- Técnicos, 253
 actors in the water management pro-
 cess, 25
- Tragedy of the commons, boom and
 bust pattern in the salmon industry,
 161

- Transboundary governance, 19, 23
- Transboundary water, 19–20
- U.S.–Mexican water relations, 170–206, 278
 - All-American Canal dispute, 16, 26, 118, 136–139, 142
 - binational water management, 117–130
 - strengthening equitable management, 139–140
- User-pays principles, 16
- Utilitarian values, 9
- Utilitarianism, 83–87, 91, 280
 - consideration of diverse equities, 10
- Valley Voice*, 47
- Value diversity and water, 27
- Value pluralism, 2
- W.A.C. Bennett
 - Fish vs. Power, 175
 - hydroelectric development, 175
- Water management
 - new paradigm, 249,
 - privatization of water supply, 250
 - reform, 249
 - water markets, 250
- Water management Brazil, 249–269
 - technocratic model, 255
 - vulnerable to the interference of politics, 255
- Water privatization, 196–197. *See also* World Bank.
 - Cochabamba, 195–224
 - United Nations Commission on Sustainable Development, 196
 - water management policy, 195
- Watershed
 - governance, 12
 - inclusive venues, 297–298
 - reconcile the roles of science and public values in decision making, 297
- Western water policy
 - achieving sustainability, 55
 - growing uncertainty and political conflict, 55
- World Bank, 2, 196, 197–199, 201, 203, 207–220, 257
 - architecture of governance, 95
 - criticisms, 217–218
 - implementation of policy, 209–212
 - social construction, 212–217
 - water policy, 197–198
 - water policy goals, 205–209
 - water privatization, 196, 197–199, 201, 203, 207–220