

Disjunctivism

Contemporary Readings

edited by Alex Byrne and Heather Logue

The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England

© 2009 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

MIT Press books may be purchased at special quantity discounts for business or sales promotional use. For information, please e-mail special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu or write to Special Sales Department, The MIT Press, 55 Hayward Street, Cambridge, MA 02142.

This book was set in Stone Serif and Stone Sans on 3B2 by Asco Typesetters, Hong Kong, and was printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Disjunctivism : contemporary readings / edited by Alex Byrne and Heather Logue.

p. cm.—(MIT readers in contemporary philosophy)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-02655-0 (hardcover : alk. paper)—ISBN 978-0-262-52490-2

(pbk. : alk. paper)

1. Perception (Philosophy). I. Byrne, Alex, 1960–. II. Logue, Heather, 1979–.

B828.45.D56 2009

121'.34—dc22

2008027497

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Index

- Action at a distance, 155, 194, 210, 286–287
- Act/object conception of perceptual experience, 118, 219–222, 244–245, 247–249, 257, 260
- Adverbialism. *See* Adverbial theory
- Adverbial theory, 117–118, 208, 221–222, 265n23
- Afterimages, 44–46, 179n19, 231–232, 260
- Albritton, Rogers, 86n5
- Alston, William, xvii, xxvn18, 265n20, 313n3
- Anscombe, G. E. M., 111n7, 233, 247–249, 312n1, 313n5, 314n15
- Anti-realism about perceptual experience, 159–161
- Argument from hallucination. *See* Hallucination, argument from
- Argument from illusion. *See* Illusion, argument from
- Argument from science, 28–30. *See also* Causal argument; “Same cause, same effect” principle
- Armstrong, David, 111n7, 202n13, 217, 266n27
- Austin, J. L., xxvin30, 26, 92, 102–104, 128, 202n10, 261n1
- Ayer, A. J., 128, 202n8, 202n13
- Backward causation, 198–199, 258
- Baker, Gordon, 85n1, 87n17
- Barnes, W. H. F., xxivn4, xxivn11, xxvin29
- Berkeley, George, 155
- Biro, John, 268n39
- Bogen, James, 85n3
- Bonjour, Laurence, 87n18
- Brain in a vat, 173, 253
- Broad, C. D., 163n1, 169–170, 313n8
- Burge, Tyler, 111n7, 113n30, 254
- Butchvarov, Panyot, 255
- Byrne, Alex, x–xi, xxiiin2, xxvin25, xxvin27, xxvin28, xxvin30, xxviin37
- Campbell, John, xxivn8, xxvin33
- Cartwright, Richard, 264n12
- Causal argument, xxi–xxiii, 153, 168–169, 176, 188–193, 209–210, 284–287, 300. *See also* Argument from science; “Same cause, same effect” principle
- Causal determinism, 287
- Causal pre-emption, 299–300
- Causal theory of perception, xiv–xv, 33, 97, 117–118, 141, 184. *See also* Causal theory of vision
- Causal theory of vision, 33–42, 46–47, 50–53, 56, 59–66. *See also* Causal theory of perception
- Child, William, 111n1, 139, 148n3, 148n5, 180n26, 202n10
- Chisholm, Roderick, xxvin29, 201n6, 202n7, 315n22

- Clarke, Thompson, 242
- Common element, ix, 22–25, 59–60, 92–93, 95–98, 118, 142, 157, 167, 257, 279. *See also* Common factor
- Common factor, xv, 80–85, 140, 167, 214, 278. *See also* Common element
- Conceptual analysis, 49–50, 60, 74n13, 178n8
- Conjunctive analysis of perceiving/seeing, 121, 130, 208–214, 228–230, 255–258, 278
- Conjunctivism. *See* Conjunctive analysis of perceiving/seeing
- Conscious character. *See* Phenomenal character
- Cook, John W., 86n7
- Crane, Tim, vii, xxiin3, 148n2
- Criteria, 75–79, 81, 84, 85n2, 86n4, 86n8, 87n14, 87n17
- Dancy, Jonathan, xiii, xiv, xx, xxivn12, xxvin27, 111n12, 112n14, 262n1, 278–279, 284, 301
- Davidson, Donald, 47n1, 159
- Davies, Martin, 70–72, 101–102, 268n39
- Demonstrative judgment. *See* Thought, demonstrative
- Demonstrative thought. *See* Thought, demonstrative
- Dennett, Daniel, 159
- De re* thought. *See* Thought, singular
- Descartes, René, 85, 107
- Deutscher, Max, 47n1, 74n11
- Direct realism, 171, 175, 177–178, 207–208, 261
- Disjunctivism
- about action, xiv, 130, 132–133
 - about belief, 96–97, 99, 124–125, 130, 133–134, 301–302
 - and the causal theory of perception, xv, xxvn23, 47, 56–57, 97
 - characterizations of, ix–xi, 41–43, 55–59, 87n13, 91, 95–96, 130–132, 137–139, 158, 167–168, 174–175, 186–188, 213–214, 257, 271–272, 277–278, 291, 302
 - epistemological, xiv–xvi, 58, 82–84, 141 and hallucinations, 112n21, 132, 216–219, 222, 255, 278–279, 300–302, 308–309
 - and illusions, xi–xii, 132, 160, 278–279, 309
 - and intentionality of perceptual experience, 173–174
 - about the objects of perceptual experience, xxvin30
- Dretske, Fred, 111n2, 111n7, 112n16, 149n14, 156, 202n13, 268n39
- Duck-rabbit, 259
- Dummett, Michael, 48n4, 87n17
- Erlenkamp, Christoph, 263n9
- Evans, Gareth, 62, 64, 86n10, 112n18, 315n20
- Externalism
- about justification, 125–126, 129
 - about mental states/content, 154, 169–171, 253–254, 287
- Firth, Roderick, 312n1
- Flanagan, Owen, 183
- Fodor, Jerry, 112n16
- Føllesdal, Dagfinn, 148n8
- Foster, John, xxviin38, 111n6, 287–288, 313n2, 314n12, 314n16
- Foundationalism, 85n6, 238
- Frege, Gottlob, 239
- Fregean senses, 237, 239
- Geach, P. T., 11
- Gendler, Tamar, vii, 314n18
- Goldman, Alvin, 47n1, 74n12, 87n16, 202n7
- Goodman, Nelson, 58, 106, 108
- Goodwin, William, 87n12
- Graff, Delia, 306

- Grice, H. P., xiv, xxvn23, 33, 35, 47n1, 47n2, 48n5, 48n7, 52, 65, 74n16, 148n1, 201n7
- Gunther, York, vii
- Hacker, P. M. S., 85n1, 85n2, 85n3
- Haddock, Adrian, vii, xxvin27
- Hallucination
 argument from, 142–143, 153, 155–156, 168, 171–178, 185–188, 201, 207–208, 219, 313n4 (*see also* Indiscriminability, arguments from)
 primary/secondary objects of, 223–225, 232–234, 244–246, 248, 250–255
 veridical, 37–38, 168, 215, 217, 227, 239, 258, 264n16
- Hardin, C. L., 183, 200–201
- Harding, Gregory, 183
- Harman, Gilbert, 111n7, 246, 267n32, 312n1, 313n5
- Hawthorne, John, vii, xxviin36, xxviin37
- Highest common factor. *See* Common factor
- Hinton, J. M., viii–ix, xii, xiv, xvi, xx, xxiii, xxiiin2, xxvn23, 41, 58, 74n8, 87n13, 110n1, 111n9, 137, 156–159, 161, 167, 169, 179n23, 202n10, 202n11, 263n8, 271–272, 277, 279
- Hirst, R. J., 171
- Homunculus fallacy, 103
- Hornsby, Jennifer, xxvn22
- Horwich, Paul, 268n39
- Hume, David, viii, 73n1, 110, 113n35, 241–242
- Hume world, 257–258
- Husserl, Edmund, xxivn7, 148n8, 176, 243
- Hyman, John, 171, 184–185, 202n10
- Illusion
 argument from, 77, 80, 92, 94, 117–134, 160, 172, 177–178, 202n8, 202n10 (*see also* Indiscriminability, arguments from)
- Müller-Lyer, 231
- waterfall, 233–234, 264n13
- Imagery, xvii, 61, 153, 155, 162, 171–172, 174, 207, 313n3. *See also* Afterimages
- Imagination, 7, 59–61, 176, 273, 282
- Impossible staircase, 308
- Indiscernibility. *See* Indiscriminability
- Indiscriminability
 arguments from, xix–xxi, 10, 30, 80, 82, 91–93, 98–105, 108–110, 117–125, 134–135, 138–139, 155–156, 161, 185–190, 207, 215–216 (*see also* Illusion, argument from; Hallucination, argument from)
 and the concept of experience, xxi, 32, 96–97, 272, 280–284, 295, 298, 303–305, 310–311
 explications of, xx–xxi, 32, 133, 186, 283
 and the nature of nonveridical experience, xiii, 98, 112n21, 132, 284, 297–301, 309
 non-transitivity of, 92, 253, 305–307
- Indistinguishability. *See* Indiscriminability
- Infallibilism about the mental, 104–105, 141, 283, 312
- Inner experience, xxvn16, xxvn23, 23–24, 51–52, 54–57, 105, 131, 179n23, 289, 302. *See also* Inner states
- Inner states, 75–77, 81, 83–84, 86n4, 86n9, 168. *See also* Inner experience
- Intensional contexts, 245–247
- Intensional identity, 232–233, 252, 255
- Intentionalism. *See* Intentional theory
- Intentional theory, x, 94–95, 172–173, 208, 262n2, 273, 276
- Internalism, 83, 88n19, 88n20, 125–127, 129
- Internal relations, 197–198

- Jackson, Frank, 92, 111n2, 111n6, 112n22, 118, 183–184, 200–201, 201n5, 222, 235, 313n2, 315n22
- James, William, 242
- Johnston, Mark, vii, x–xi, xix–xxiii, xxivn12, xxvn19, xxvin30, 308
- Kenny, Anthony, 85n1, 85n3
- Kim, Jaegwon, 48n4, 268n39
- Kovakovich, Karson, xxviin36, xxviin37
- Kripke, Saul, 58, 65, 172, 268n38
- Laertius, Diogenes, 179n18
- Langsam, Harold, xii–xiii, xvii, xx, xxii–xxiii, xxvin31, 263n6, 313n4
- Lewis, David, 197, 202n15, 255, 262n3, 266n27
- Loar, Brian, 183
- Locke, Don, 155–156
- Logical space of reasons, 84
- Logue, Heather, x–xi, xxiiin2, xxvin25, xxvin27, xxvin28, xxvin30, xxviin37
- Lycan, W. G., 255
- Mackie, J. L., 109
- Macpherson, Fiona, vii, xxvin27
- Malebranche, Nicolas, 163n1, 212
- Manifest image, 181
- Martin, C. B., 47n1, 74n11
- Martin, M. G. F., ix–x, xii–xiii, xvi–xxi, xxiii, xxviin36, 113n29, 313n6, 313n7
- McCulloch, Gregory, 149n13, 179n21
- McDowell, John, xiv–xvi, 57–58, 95, 111n1, 111n7, 112n18, 112n25, 113n35, 124–125, 130, 134, 135n9, 138–144, 149n13, 164n6, 167, 169, 173–175, 180n24, 202n10, 202n11, 261n1, 263n8, 267n29, 271–272, 277, 301, 315n20
- McGinn, Colin, 67, 101–102, 148n1, 182, 201n5
- Meinong, Alexis, 246, 248
- Memory, 59–61, 69–70
- Mentalism, 235, 242, 260–261. *See also* Phenomenalism
- Merleau-Ponty, Maurice, 276
- Mill, J. S., 314n18
- Millar, Alan, x, xix–xx, xxiii, xxvin27, 111n9, 148n1, 148n2, 148n9, 149n11, 149n14, 263n9
- Moore, G. E., 201n6, 202n8, 242, 263n12, 313n2, 313n8
- Moya, Carlos J., 120, 135n2
- Nagel, Thomas, 182, 266n25
- Naive realism
arguments against, 94–95, 98, 177, 284–289
arguments for, 108, 199–200, 276, 281–283, 295–296, 211–312
characterizations of, xvii–xviii, 93–94, 97–98, 161–163, 199, 272–273, 295
and disjunctivism, xviii–xix, 91, 95, 273–276
and knowledge of experience, 107–110
- Nathan, Nicholas, 314n14
- Necker cube, 259
- Neta, Ram, xxvin27
- Nominalism about properties, 235, 266n27
- Non-conceptual content, 238, 262n2
- Nozick, Robert, 88n19, 88n20
- Objects
intentional, 5, 233, 244–249, 260, 275
non-existent, 244–255, 260
non-normal, xxii, 168–169, 171, 174–178 (*see also* Sense-datum theory)
- O’Faolain, Sean, 15
- O’Shaughnessy, Brian, 119–121, 124, 171–172, 313n2, 314n12
- Pain, 145–147, 235
- Parsons, Terence, 246, 248–249

- Peacocke, Christopher, 33, 112n16, 113n29, 148n1, 148n2, 149n12, 267n29, 268n40, 294, 312n1, 313n2
- Pears, David, 33, 53, 56, 148n1
- Penfield, Wilder, 163n2
- Perception
 direct vs. indirect, 142, 208–214, 228–229, 242–243, 256
 -illusion disjunctions, xii, xvi, xxivn16, 20–24, 27, 31–32, 111n9, 271, 277
- Perkins, Moreland, 111n6
- Phenomenal character, 93–94, 97–103, 174, 182–184, 236, 266n25, 290, 309–311
- Phenomenal consciousness. *See*
 Phenomenal character
- Phenomenal continua, 306
- Phenomenalism, 164n13, 164n14, 216.
See also Mentalism
- Phenomenal properties. *See* Phenomenal character
- Phenomenological argument, 82, 92. *See also* Indiscriminability, arguments from
- Phenomenology of experience. *See*
 Phenomenal character
- Phosphenes, 3, 9–10, 22, 173, 190
- Pitcher, George, 156–157, 159, 202n8, 202n13
- “Plainly” seeing, xxivn14, 19, 22, 32n3, 58
- Plato, viii
- Price, H. H., 92, 103, 184, 201n7, 202n8, 202n10, 203n14, 234, 313n8
- Pritchard, Duncan, xxvin27
- Projectivism about sensory qualities, 260–261
- Putnam, Hilary, 65, 172, 235, 254, 261n1
- Qualia, 106, 171, 201n2, 235–236, 261, 262n2. *See also* Phenomenal character
- Qualitative character of experience. *See*
 Phenomenal character
- Quine, W. V. O., 34
- Recognitional capacities, 100, 307–308
- Reid, Thomas, viii
- Relational properties, 236–237
- Reliabilism, 109, 125–126, 238
- Representationalism. *See* Intentional theory
- Representative realism, 117–118, 155.
See also Sense-datum theory
- Richardson, John T. E., 85n1
- Robinson, Howard, viii, x, xiii, xix, xxiii, 57, 111n6, 143–145, 178n6, 183, 189, 202n11, 262n3, 263n6, 285, 287–288, 313n2
- Rorty, Richard, 87n11
- Russell, Bertrand, 168, 313n2, 313n8
- Ryle, Gilbert, 18, 103
- “Same cause, same effect” principle, xxii–xxiii, 29, 156–158, 168–171, 173, 176, 190–194, 228–229, 263n6, 274, 287–288. *See also* Causal argument; Argument from science
- Scenario content, 149n12
- Scientific image, 181
- Searle, John, 111n7, 148n1, 261n1, 267n30, 267n32, 312n1
- “Seeing as” phenomena, 227–228, 243–244, 259–260
- Seeming, epistemic vs. phenomenal, 92, 111n2, 296
- Selective theory, xxvin30, 103, 234, 261
- Sellars, Wilfrid, 84, 181
- Sensational properties, 149n12, 313n2.
See also Qualia
- Sense-datum fallacy, 103
- Sense-datum theory
 arguments against, viii–ix, 9–11, 276
 arguments for, xxiii, 142–143, 153, 155, 163

- Sense-datum theory (cont.)
 characterizations of, viii, 27, 94, 103, 183, 208, 216, 240, 275–276
 and the “same cause, same effect” principle, 157
 and the theory of appearing, 188
- Sensory character. *See* Phenomenal character
- Siegel, Susanna, xxviii28, xxviii37, 265n20, 315n27
- Skepticism
 about the external world, xv, 85, 87n11, 107, 109–110
 about other minds, xv, 77–79, 85
- Smith, A. D., xxii, xxivn7
- Smith, Peter, 146
- Snowdon, Paul, ix, xi–xii, xiv–xv, xxivn13, xxivn14, xxviii27, 87n13, 97, 110n1, 135n9, 138–139, 141–146, 149n10, 164n6, 169, 178n4, 178n8, 180n24, 184, 202n8, 202n10, 202n11, 263n8, 271–272, 277
- Stoics, 172
- Strawson, P. F., 33, 35, 47n2, 48n5, 48n7, 63–66, 69, 86n8, 88n21, 112n18, 148n1, 169, 183
- Stroud, Barry, 109
- Sturgeon, Scott, xxviii36, xxviii37, 314n17
- Subjective character. *See* Phenomenal character
- Subjectivism, 94–95, 99, 103, 108, 273.
See also Sense-datum theory
- Suchting, W. A., 202n13
- Supersaturated red, 222, 227, 232, 235–236, 308
- Swampman, 72
- Taine, Hippolyte Aldophe, 178n5
- Taylor, Charles, 88n25
- Teichmann, Jenny, 48n4
- Thau, Michael, xxviii27, xxviii30, 263n6
- Theory of appearing, xvii, 184–201, 313n3
- Thought
 demonstrative, 43–46, 67–70, 100, 144, 212–213, 219–220, 227, 229, 294
de re (*See* Thought, singular)
 knowledge of, 106–108
 phenomenal character of, 182–183, 231
 singular, 221–222, 287, 294
- Time-gap argument, 194–198, 201
- Transparency of experience, 7, 62, 273
- Travis, Charles, 148n3
- Tye, Michael, 111n7, 202n7, 312n1
- Valberg, J. J., viii, 143–145, 276, 314n12
- van Inwagen, Peter, 268n38
- Veil of ideas. *See* Veil of perception
- Veil of perception, 87n11, 109–110, 276
- White, A. R., 48n4
- Wiggins, David, 47n2, 48n7, 135n8
- Williams, Bernard, 135n5, 135n8
- Williamson, Timothy, xxivn5, xxviii35, 96–98, 106, 108, 112n15, 294, 301–302, 306, 314n11, 315n24
- Wittgenstein, Ludwig, xv, 75–79, 81, 85n2, 86n6, 86n7, 86n8, 88n21
- Wright, Crispin, xxviii27, 85n3, 86n4, 87n14, 87n17
- Yablo, Stephen, 314n19
- Zalta, Edward, 246, 248–249