
The Ethics of Protocells

Moral and Social Implications of Creating Life in the
Laboratory

edited by Mark A. Bedau and Emily C. Parke

The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England

© 2009 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

MIT Press books may be purchased at special quantity discounts for business or sales promotional use. For information, please email special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu or write to Special Sales Department, The MIT Press, 55 Hayward Street, Cambridge, MA 02142.

This book was set in Sabon by SNP Best-set Typesetter Ltd., Hong Kong and was printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

The ethics of protocells : moral and social implications of creating life in the laboratory / edited by Mark A. Bedau and Emily C. Parke.

p. ; cm.—(Basic bioethics)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-01262-1 (hardcover : alk. paper)—ISBN 978-0-262-51269-5 (pbk. : alk. paper) 1. Artificial cells—Research—Moral and ethical aspects. I. Bedau, Mark. II. Parke, Emily C. III. Series.

[DNLM: 1. Biotechnology—ethics. 2. Cell Proliferation—ethics. 3. Bioethical Issues. QU 375 E84 2009]

TP248.23.E862 2009

174'.957—dc22

2008041190

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Index

- Adorno, Theodor, 109, 311
Agriculture, 10
Ahrendt, Hannah, 200, 203, 214n5,
214n10, 214n13
Alchemy, 129–130, 133–135, 156
Allianz, 297
Allison, Henry A., 224
Ambrière, Madeleine, 140n11
Amyris Biotechnologies (company), 3, 272
Androids, 127
Angell, Marcia, 234
Animal husbandry, 25–26, 33, 158
Animal rights, 138, 299
Anthropology of the Contemporary
Research Collaboratory (ARC), 267, 286,
288n8
Antibiotics, 43–44, 195
Anticipatory governance, 276
Applegate, John S., 83n2
Appleton, Josie, 118
Aquinas, Thomas, 127, 139n1
Arcuri, Alessandra, 91, 94
Aristotle, 126–127, 129, 131, 154, 224,
253n1, 337, 338, 214n14
Artificial cells. *See* Protocells
Artificial life, 89, 136, 140n13, 150,
201, 223, 239–246, 247, 248, 249, 252,
323
hard, 239–240
soft, 136, 239–240, 242
wet, 239–240, 242–244 (*see also*
Protocells)
Asilomar (1975 conference on recombinant
DNA), 23, 42, 189, 192
Automata, 128, 149–150, 153, 156–157,
159, 160, 161
Bacon, Francis, 127, 155, 156
Bacteria, 1, 3, 8, 26, 191, 192, 194, 283,
316. *See also Escherichia coli*
comparison of protocells with, 49–50, 58,
64–65
Badiou, Alain, 288n6
Balzac, Honoré de, 134, 140n11
Barnes, Barry, 330
Barrett, Katherine, 70, 83n2, 83n6
Barry, Andrew, 268
Bartel, David P., 4
Beauchamp, Tom, 257n12
Beck, Ulrich, 109, 203, 214n12, 273
Bedau, Mark, 12, 46, 65, 76, 79, 82, 102,
143, 199, 212, 213, 239–240, 241, 245,
248, 258n17, 330, 346
Bender, Wolfgang, 310, 317
Benkler, Yochai, 168, 171, 172, 178
Bennett, Charles H., 241
Bennett, Gaymon, 11
Bensaude-Vincent, Bernadette, 134
Bentham, Jeremy, 138
Berg, Paul, 23, 42, 189
Bergler, R., 292
Berkeley (university), 264, 265, 267, 283
Berube, David M., 296
Best, Robert, 315

- Better Regulation Commission, 110
- Bewers, J. M., 74
- Biagioli, Mario, 168
- Bible, 126, 148, 346–347n1
- BioBricks, 151, 156, 159, 169, 171–172, 177, 179, 186–187, 194, 264
- Bioethics and bioethicists, 161, 200, 268–269, 279–280, 281, 298, 329
- Biofuels, 173, 264, 283
- Biological weapons, 183, 189–190, 208, 309, 317–318
- Biological and Toxic Weapons Convention (1982), 189
- synthetic biology applications to, 190
- Biomedical science, 10, 12, 168, 206
- Biosecurity, 158, 184, 208, 267, 286
- Biosensors, 7, 50, 186, 194. *See also* Protocells, products
- Biotechnology
- industry, 183, 187, 192
- patents (*see* Patents, biotechnology)
- Bioterrorism, 8, 13, 160, 167, 172, 264, 334–335
- Biological weapons, 183, 189–190, 208, 309, 317–318. *See also* Dual use
- Boas, Marie, 107
- Bocci, Velio, 43
- Bodansky, Daniel, 78
- Böhme, Gernot, 200, 205, 207
- Boltanski, Luc, 273, 282
- Boniono, Giovanni, 10, 335
- Böschén, Stefan, 211
- Bostanci, Adam, 319
- Bovine growth hormone, 72
- Boyle, Robert, 131, 137
- Brannigan, Michael C., 31
- Breyman, Steve, 98
- Brody, Baruch, 231, 234
- Brooks, Rodney, 7, 239
- Broothaerts, Wim, 196
- BSE (bovine spongiform encephalopathy), 112–114
- Burden of proof, 40–41, 61–62, 77–78, 343. *See also* Decision theory, burden of proof in
- Burgess, Adam, 114, 118
- Buss, Klaus-Peter, 205
- Callahan, Daniel, 153–154
- Camazine, Scott, 241
- CAMBIA-BIOS Project, 166, 168
- Canguilhem, Georges, 229, 234, 255n3
- Carr, Edward H., 108
- Carson, Rachel, 23
- Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety, 72, 90
- Castells, Manuel, 208, 216n29, 216n30
- Caution, 44–45, 95–102, 212
- thick descriptive content of, 97–98
- Cell-free extract, 4, 6
- Cello, Jeronimo, 137, 190
- Cell phones, 20, 40, 42, 102, 105, 112, 114, 293
- risks of (*see* Risk of cell phones)
- Cellular automata (CA), 240
- Center for Nanotechnology in Society at Arizona State University (CNS-ASU), 275–276
- Chabon, Michael, 148
- Chaitin, Gregory, 241
- Chan, Leon Y., 171
- Chapman, Graham, 20
- Chemicals
- ethical objection to basic research, 134–136, 139
- industry, 10, 12
- regulation of (*see* Regulation of chemicals)
- risks of (*see* Risk of chemicals)
- toxicity of (*see* Toxicity of chemicals)
- Cho, Mildred, 8
- Christianity, 131, 133, 137, 139
- Chyba, Christopher F., 190
- Clark, Julie, 190
- Cloning, 10, 27, 31, 32, 33, 148, 199, 200, 296, 299, 313
- Cobb, Michael D., 301
- Codon Devices (company), 3, 13n1, 272
- Coghlan, Andy, 23
- Coglianesse, Cary, 106
- Commons Science and Technology Committee (UK), 106
- Comstock, Gary L., 32, 46n1, 46n3, 76

- Conference of the Parties to the Convention on Biological Diversity, 82n1
- Consequentialism. *See* Ethics, consequentialist
- Cost-benefit analysis, 81, 82, 233. *See also* Decision theory; Risk, analysis of
- Courage, 32, 44–45, 97, 99, 212
- Couzin, Jennifer, 319
- Cox, Jonathan P. L., 185
- Cranor, Carl, 12, 51, 52, 61
- Crashtest.com, 24
- Creationism, 127, 131–133, 322, 324, 326, 327
- Crichton, Michael, 13n2, 31, 199, 200.
See also *Prey*
- Cross, Frank B., 83n7, 83n9
- Curtis, George T., 170
- Dabrock, Peter, 204, 205, 206
- D'Alembert, 128, 139n2
- Danish Board on Technology, 301
- DARPA (Defense Advanced Research Project Agency), 193
- Darwall, Stephen, 253n1
- Darwin, Charles, 108, 132–133, 140n10, 144
- DBCP (pesticide), 42
- DDT (pesticide), 23
- Deamer, David, 4, 7, 49, 89, 151, 242, 295, 308
- Decision making
about protocells (*see* Protocells, decision making about)
public participation in, 11, 105, 115–119, 284, 297, 300–302
scientific authority in, 105–119
stakeholders in, 118
standards of conduct in, 37
transparency of, 117
values in, 75–76, 79, 82, 116–119
- Decision theory, 12, 37–38, 39–45. *See also* Precautionary principle; Risk
burden of proof in, 40–41
decision trees and, 37–38
decisions in the dark, 38, 39–45
decisions under risk, 37
decisions under uncertainty, 38
distributive justice and, 36
expected value in, 37
freedom of inquiry and, 36
good judgment and, 38, 45
harms of inaction, 42–43, 45
innocence until proven guilty, 40
minimax, 38
utilitarianism and (*see* Ethics, utilitarian)
utility in, 36, 38
vagueness in, 40
- Deleuze, Gilles, 274
- Demos (UK think tank), 28
- Dennett, Daniel, 224
- Department of Agriculture (DOA), 188
- Department of Health and Human Services (DHHS), 61
- Descartes, Rene, 128, 139n2
- Deville, Adrian, 343
- Dewannieux, Marie, 190
- Dewey, John, 287
- Diderot, Denis, 159
- DNA, 185
recombinant, 23, 42, 136, 160, 168–169, 183, 189 (*see also* Genetic engineering; Moratorium letter)
synthesis, 3, 165, 169, 172, 176, 179, 183, 186, 190, 264
use in bottom-up protocell construction, 4
- Dobson, Andrew, 46n2
- Doll, Richard, 113
- Dolly (cloned sheep), 31
- Doomsday scenarios, 32, 39–40, 92
- Dorff, Elliot, 148
- Dorrell, Stephen, 113
- Drexler, Eric, 8, 300, 303n6
- Drug Enforcement Agency (DEA), 188–189
- Dual use, 201, 210, 214n6, 317, 318
- Dufresne, Guillaume, 174
- Dupré, John, 325, 330
- Durodié, Bill, 11, 12, 71, 73, 75, 76, 111, 115, 116, 119
- Dworkin, Ronald, 94
- Eco, Umberto, 157
- Eisenberg, Rebecca S., 166

- Eisenstein, Elizabeth, 228
- Ekland, Eric H., 5
- Ellul, Jacques, 228, 234, 256–257n10
- Emergence, 170, 176–179, 241–242, 248, 252, 280–282, 284, 286
 strong, 241, 252
- Emmeche, Claus, 140n13, 240, 241, 242
- Endy, Drew, 168, 169, 171, 185
- Engelhardt, H., 299
- Enright, Mark C., 43
- Environmental Defense Fund (EDF), 59
- Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), 59, 188
- Equipment (anthropological concept), 267, 268, 279, 281
- Erbschloe, Michael, 191
- Erickson, Kent L., 43
- Escherichia coli*, 160, 186
- ETC Group (Action Group on Erosion, Technology and Concentration), 46n7, 172, 175, 176, 297
- Ethical concerns about protocells, 8, 296.
See also Synthetic biology, ethical issues
 particular to
 commodification of life, 32, 33–34, 45, 159, 162n3, 318
 hubris and hype, 321
 playing God (*see* Playing God)
 reductionism, 32, 34, 45, 162n3
 religious doctrine and, 35
 slippery slope argument and, 342–343
 unnaturalness, 12, 33, 45, 159, 162n3
 violating the sanctity of nature, 32, 153
- Ethical, Legal, and Social Issues (ELSI), 11, 211, 266, 267, 298
- Ethicists, 11, 117
- Ethics
 consequentialist, 92, 138, 253n1
 different ways of understanding, 298–299
 downstream, 223, 233, 235–236, 247
 environmental, 298
 ethical codes, 27
 ethical norms, 1, 224–230, 234, 235–236, 247–248, 254–255n2, 255n3, 258n20
 ethical theory, 253, 254n1
 flourishing and, 224–225, 226, 229–230, 280
 free agency and, 224–225, 237–238
 Kantian, 52, 204, 224, 225, 228, 256n7
 post hoc (*see* Ethics, downstream)
 precautionary, 236
 public dialogue and, 296–298, 300–302
 radical ethical crises, 228–230
 science and, 230–235, 247–250, 309
 responsibility and, 225–226, 344–346
 upstream, 12, 28, 224, 236–238, 246, 252–253, 255n2, 257n15
 utilitarian, 32, 35–36, 45, 224–225, 299
- Eurochem, 102
- European Center for Living Technology (ECLT), 213, 295
- European Commission, 27, 72, 78, 81, 83n2, 114, 115, 169, 275, 297
- European Environment Agency, 112
- European Union, 27, 41, 82, 169, 216n28, 243, 278n3
- European Union Joint Research Centre, 20, 22
- Evolution, volitional, 237–238
- Farley, John, 126, 133, 140n8
- Feenberg, Andrew, 201
- Ferber, Dan, 189
- Fisher, Elizabeth, 91, 94
- Fisher, Erik, 276
- Fitzpatrick, Michael, 112, 115, 116
- Fleck, Ludwik, 326–327
- Fletcher, Joseph, 154
- Food and Drug Administration (FDA), 62, 71, 73, 81, 188–189, 195, 228, 231
- Foot, Philippa, 96, 97, 224
- Foster, Kenneth, 78, 83n2
- Foucault, Michel, 281
- Fox-Keller, Evelyn, 206, 263, 312, 329
- “Frankencells” (tag word attached to protocell research), 8, 33, 200
- Frankenstein (myth/novel), 148, 150, 200, 214n4, 293
- Frankfurt, Harry, 256n7
- Fraser, Claire M., 2
- French, Peter A., 96

- Freud, Sigmund, 150, 153
 Fukuyama, Francis, 236
 Furedi, Frank, 105, 117
- Geiser, Ken, 41
 Geison, Gerald L., 132, 133
 Genetic algorithms (GAs), 244–245, 252
 Genetic engineering, 3, 8, 10, 38, 42, 43, 45, 136, 158–159, 160 183, 189.
See also DNA, recombinant
 Genetic modification (GM), 22, 25–26, 28
 of crops, 20, 23, 57, 64, 63, 64, 69, 76, 77, 83n7, 105, 106, 115, 297
 of food, 19, 20, 22, 23, 25, 69, 76, 115, 297
 GM Science Review (UK), 28
 of organisms (GMOs), 20, 25–26, 27, 69, 229, 297, 298, 299, 303n4, 336
 Genetics, 191, 309, 318
 Genidicine (company), 191
 Genomics, 10, 12, 25, 173, 209, 236, 325, 329
 Gibbons, Michael, 254n1, 275
 Gibson, Daniel G., 3
 Giddens, Anthony, 200, 204, 214n12
 Gilland, Tony, 83n3, 115
 Gillette, Clayton P., 60
 Gillis, Justin, 2, 3, 8
 Gillott, John, 106
 Gjerris, Mickey, 11, 299
 Godin, Benoît, 234
 Goethe, Johann W. von, 139n4
 Goklany, Indur M., 79, 83n7, 84n9, 343
 Goldberg, Susanne M., 192
 Golem (animated being from Jewish folklore), 127–129, 148, 313
 Goodwin, William, 150
 Gottlieb, Scott, 188
 Gould, Stephen J., 238, 241, 242
 Graham, John D., 89
 Gray, John S., 74, 75
 Gray, Michael W., 26
 Green fluorescent protein (GFP), 6, 157, 186
 Grinbaum, Alexei, 296
 Guan, Y., 190
- Habermas, Jurgen, 313
 Hacein Bey-Abina, Salima, 322
 Haker, Hille, 207
 Hammit, James K., 79
 Hampson, Norman, 107
 Hanczyc, Martin M., 5, 145
 Hansen, Janus, 293
 Hansson, Sven O., 102
 Hantsche, Brigitte, 11
 Haraway, Donna, 209
 Hargreaves, Ian, 105
 Harms, William, 238, 254n1, 255n3
 Harremoës, Poul, 101, 343
 Harris, John, 93
 Hauchler, Ingomar, 208
 Hauser, Marc D., 253n1
 Hauskeller, Christine, 12, 313
 Havelock, Eric, 228
 Hede, Karyn, 189
 Hegel, Georg W. F., 239
 Heidegger, Martin, 26, 155, 156
 Heller, Arno, 204
 Heller, Michael A., 166, 167, 168, 187
 Henkel, Joachim, 171, 176
 Hero of Alexandria, 128
 Hessel, Andrew, 10, 188
 Hill, Austin B., 113
 Hill, Donald, 128
 HIV, 43, 188
 HM Government, UK, 297
 Hoban, Thomas, 20
 Hobbes, 128, 139n2
 Hobsbawm, Eric, 108
 Holland, John H., 244
 Holm, Søren, 83n8, 93
 Homunculi, 127, 129–130, 139n4, 156, 313
 Honnefelder, Ludger, 200, 207, 208, 215n25
 Hood, Christopher, 118
 Horkheimer, Max, 311
 House, Lisa, 20
 House of Commons (UK), 113
 House of Lords (UK), 105
 Howard Hughes Medical Institute (HHMI), 144, 145, 146, 162n1

- Huff, James, 59
 Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority (HFEA), 309
 Human Genome Project, 11, 194, 267, 279, 313, 329
 Humanoids, 127–130
 Hume, Mick, 110
 Hursthouse, Rosalind, 99
 Hutchison, Clyde A., 2
 Huxley, Aldous, 135
 Huxley, Thomas H., 214n1
- Idel, Moshe, 128, 129
 Independent Expert Group on Mobile Phones (IEGMP), 112, 114
 InnoCentive (company), 193
 Institute for Biological Energy Alternatives (IBEA), 173
 Intellectual property. *See* Patents
 Ishikawa, Keitaro, 6
 Islam, 131, 148
- Jackson, Ronald J., 190
 James, Simon P., 26
 Jan, Tracy, 194
 Jaquet-Droz, 149–150
 Jasanoff, Sheila, 278
 Jefferson, Richard, 166
 Jensen, Ole, 302n1
 Joerges, Bernward, 201
 Johnson, Brian, 11
 Jonas, Hans, 199, 201, 203, 204, 209, 210, 225, 228, 236
 Jones, Phillip B. C., 72, 78, 83n2
 Jonsen, Albert, 227, 269
 Jowell, Tessa, 114
 Joy, Bill, 8, 38, 211
 Judaism, 128, 148
- Kabbalah (Jewish), 128
 Kaiser, Jocelyn, 173, 175
 Kant, Immanuel, 52, 128, 139n2, 204, 224–225, 228, 256n7. *See also* Ethics, Kantian
 Kaplinsky, Joe, 114
 Karpenko, Vladimir, 130
- Kass, Leon R., 46n1, 46n2
 Kastner, Justin, 72
 Kennedy, Ian, 117
 Kevles, Daniel, 263
 Khushf, George, 11, 234, 256n16
 Kitcher, Philip, 255n3
 Kline, Morris, 106
 Knorr-Cetina, Karin, 169
 Koestler, Arthur, 257n13
 Koselleck, Reinhardt, 274
 Krebs, John R., 23
 Kuhn, Thomas, 157n11
 Kumar, Sapna, 169, 176
- Lakhani, Karim, 193
 Lamarck, Jean-Baptiste, 132, 140n8, 140n9
 Lander, Eric S., 194
 Langlois, Richard N., 170
 Lartigue, Carole, 3, 264
 Lassen, Jesper, 296
 Latour, Bruno, 157n14, 202, 230
 Laughlin, Robert B., 242
- Law
 patent, 165, 169–170, 179 (*see also* Patents)
 premarket and postmarket, 60–63
 science and, 64
 tort, 71
 Lawrence, Stephen, 117
 Lee, T. R., 292
 Legname, Giuseppe, 190
 Leibniz, Gottfried, 131
 Levinas, Emmanuel, 155
 Levskaya, Anselm, 186
 Lewis, C. S., 153
 Lieverman, Adam, 70, 73
- Life
 commodification of (*see* Ethical concerns about protocells, commodification of life)
 definition of, 137, 307, 310–311, 313, 325–328, 329
 intrinsic value of, 32–35
 origin of, 136, 143, 144–145, 161, 242–243, 246, 322, 324–327
 patenting of (*see* Patents of life forms)
 reverence for, 34

- sanctity of, 12
 spontaneous generation of, 126–127, 131–133
 synthesis of (*see* Synthesis of life)
 Lindemann, Gesa, 312, 324, 330
 Linneus, 131
 Linux (operating system). *See* Open source, Linux operating system as an example of
 Lippmann, Edmund O. v., 126, 131, 132, 140n8
 Living technology, 7–8
 Longino, Helen, 201, 214n8
 Los Alamos National Laboratories (LANL), 243, 258n17
 protocell (*see* Protocell, Los Alamos)
 LS9, Inc., 3
 Lucentini, Jack, 152
 Luhmann, Niklas, 271–272
 Luisi, Pier Luigi, 4, 242

 Macintyre, Alasdair, 100, 268
 McKibbin, Bill, 236
 McNeill, William H., 113
 Magnus, Albertus, 127
 Mai, Volker, 43
 Malaria, 264
 Manchester, William, 106
 Manson, Neil A., 92
 Marguet, Philippe, 169
 Margulies, Anne H., 194
 Marx, Karl, 109
 Maskus, Jerome H., 180n3
 Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT), 172, 186, 194, 264, 265, 283.
 See also BioBricks; Registry of Standard Biological Parts
 Maurer, Stephen M., 160, 192
 Meek, James, 106
 Mele, Alfred, 224
 Merchant, Carolyn, 312
 Merges, Robert, 177
 Merkle, Ralph, 8, 9, 39
 Metabolomics, 236
 Meyer, Gitte, 295
 Michaels, David, 64
 Mieth, Dietmar, 23

 Milgram, Elijah, 228
 Miller, Harold, 73, 79, 83n8
 Miller, Henry I., 89
 Miller, Karl E., 43
 Miller, Stanley L., 140n14
 Ministry of Agriculture Fisheries and Food (MAFF), 113
 Ministry of the Environment, 82n1
 Mirowski, Phillip, 168
 Mobile phones. *See* Cell phones
 Modularity (concept), 168–172, 179, 234
 Monnard, Pierre-Alain, 4
 Mooney, Chris, 8, 200
 Moratorium letter (on recombinant DNA, 1974), 42, 189
 Morris, Julian, 46, 71, 72, 77, 78, 112, 343
 Moss, Lenny, 324, 329
 Municipal Code Corporation, 82n1
 Murray, Fiona, 168
Mycoplasma genitalium, 2–3, 173, 174, 242
 Myhr, Anne I., 89

 Nagel, Thomas, 300
 Nanotechnology, 8, 10, 27, 38, 39, 45, 102, 109, 135, 136, 158, 167, 178, 208–209, 223, 236, 247, 275–276, 282, 292, 293, 294, 296, 297, 299–300, 318
 Nanotechnology, biotechnology, information technology and cognitive science (NBIC) convergence, 236
 NASA (National Aeronautics and Space Administration), 162n2
 National Academy of Sciences of the USA, 42
 National Commission for the Protection of Human Subjects, 234, 257n12, 269
 National Research Council (NRC), 59, 60, 61, 63, 64, 192
 National Science Foundation (NSF), 267
 Newman, William R., 128, 130, 139n3, 140n5
 Newton, Isaac, 131
 Nielsen, Annika P., 300
 Nielsen, Peter, 5
 Nilsson Jacobi, Martin, 311

- Nixdorff, Kathryn, 317
- Nongovernmental organizations (NGOs),
20, 21, 23, 111
- Noireaux, Vincent, 6, 152, 242, 308, 314,
315
- Norton, Bryan G., 247
- Nowotny, Helga, 199, 200, 203, 205, 207,
274–275
- Nussbaum, Martha, 224
- Oberholzer, Thomas, 4
- Obrist, Barbara, 130
- Office of Technology Assessment (OTA) of
the US Congress, 59
- O'Malley, Maureen, 174
- O'Neill, Brendan, 113
- O'Neill, Onora, 294, 295
- Ong, Walter, 228
- Open source, 10, 166, 168, 172, 175–176,
179, 184–196
Linux operating system as an example of,
10, 192–193
- O'Riordan, Timothy, 111, 343
- OSPAR Commission, 82n1
- Ovid, 127
- Oyama, Susan, 238, 254n1, 324
- Ozick, Cynthia, 148
- PACE (Programmable Artificial Cell
Evolution) project, 19, 27, 28, 243, 245,
247, 258n17, 296, 303n2
- Paracelsus, 129, 139n4, 156
- Parliamentary Office for Science and
Technology (POST), 105
- Parke, Emily, 12, 41, 46n4, 70, 83n2, 103,
213, 330, 346
- Pascal's Wager, 92–93
- Pasteur, Louis, 132, 133
- Patents, 10, 187–188, 196, 272, 320
biotechnology, 187–188
in biomedicine, 167
law and, 165
of life forms, 3, 25, 160, 165–180, 172–
176, 178, 188, 208, 272–273, 286, 320
(*see also* Patents, *Mycoplasma
laboratorium*)
- Mycoplasma laboratorium*, 3, 172–175,
177
public transparency and, 166
software, 188
- Patterson, George, 302
- Paul, Ellen F., 224
- Pauly, Philip, 263
- Pedagogy, 279
- Pejčić, Bobby, 191
- Pence, Gregory, 274
- Peng, Zhaohui, 191
- Peterson, Eugene, 347n1
- Peterson, Martin, 91, 99
- Pharmaceutical industry, research,
testing and regulation process, 231–233,
234
- Philo of Byzantium, 128
- Philosophy of science, 230, 329
- Pick, Daniel, 108
- Pindar, 128
- Playing God (criticism of protocell
research), 12, 32, 34–35, 45, 89, 126,
130, 133, 137 138–139, 154, 202, 313,
340–342, 345
- Plessner, Helmut, 312, 324
- Pliny, 127
- PNA (peptide nucleic acid), 5, 152, 243,
249–250, 258n18
- Pohorille, Andrew, 4, 7, 49, 242, 295,
308
- Poliovirus, 137, 190
- Pomper, Philip, 256n6
- Porritt, Jonathon, 111
- Postman, Neil, 228
- Pottage, Alain, 10, 175
- Pouchet, Felix, 132
- Precaution, 114, 109, 114, 138, 160
- Precautionary principle, the, 12, 27, 32,
41–44, 45–46, 69–82, 89–102, 112,
117, 343–344. *See also* Decision theory;
Risk
argument against protocells from,
343–344, 345
criticism of, 41–44, 71–81
definition of, 41, 111
different interpretations of, 90–95

- directive for action in, 70, 76, 77, 79, 80, 82
- emotions and, 75–76, 81
- as an epistemic rule, 91, 93–94, 98–99, 101
- forgone benefits and, 79–80, 82, 83n7
- harms of inaction and (*see* Precautionary principle, the, opportunity costs of)
- incoherence of (*see* Precautionary principle, the, self-contradiction of)
- misapplication of, 72, 111
- mistaken priorities and, 80, 82
- operationality of, 78
- opportunity costs of, 109
- paralysis and (*see* Precautionary principle, the, self-contradiction of)
- as procedure, 91, 94–95, 98–99, 101
- regulation and, 72–73, 81
- relevance to protocell research, 69, 82, 101–102, 247
- as a rule of choice, 91–93, 98–99, 101
- scope of, 70, 74, 76, 77, 80
- self-contradiction of, 40, 76–77, 78, 82, 92, 99, 111
- severity of, 70, 74, 76, 77, 79, 80, 82, 83n8
- specificity of, 70
- stifling innovations and, 79–80, 82, 83n8
- strength of, 70
- superfluousness of, 71–72, 81
- trade protectionism and, 72, 81, 96
- triggering factor of, 70, 76, 77, 80, 82
- uncertainty and, 70
- unknowability and, 77–78, 82
- unsound science and, 74, 82, 83n5, 83n6, 112
- vagueness of, 70–71, 78–79, 81, 82, 90
- variability of, 70–71, 78–79
- virtue approach to, 90, 95–102
- worst-case scenarios and, 73, 112
- Prey* (Michael Crichton novel), 13n2, 31, 199
- Price, Charles C., 135–136, 137
- Probiotics, 43–44
- Prometheus, 150
- Proteomics, 236
- Protocells, 1–2, 31, 49, 295–296, 308, 314.
See also Synthetic biology
- bottom-up approach, 3–6, 137, 176, 177, 239, 243–244, 245–246, 251, 252, 264, 307, 314, 318, 322, 333, 341
- by-analogy debate strategy applied to, 335–336, 345
- creating vs. using, 334–335
- decision making about, 39–45
- containment of, 9–10
- dual-use applications of (*see* Dual use)
- ethical guidelines for, 161
- ethical objections to (*see* Ethical concerns about protocells)
- health and environmental consequences of, 319
- language and self-representation issues with, 321
- Los Alamos, 5–6, 52, 152, 243
- medical applications of, 316
- motivations and goals for creating, 6–8, 13, 57, 245–246, 307, 308, 309, 314–318, 317, 321–328, 334
- ontological debate strategy applied to, 336–339, 345
- origin of life, relevance to (*see* Life, origin of)
- patenting (*see* Patenting of life forms)
- products, 1, 7–8, 49–50, 58, 63, 64, 173, 264, 283, 307, 314–315, 316–320, 334, 314–321
- regulation of (*see* Regulation of protocells)
- risks of (*see* Risk of protocells)
- top-down approach, 2–3, 6, 137, 177, 239, 242, 251, 252, 264, 307, 314, 318, 322, 333
- type-token debate strategy applied to, 339–340, 345
- uncertain consequences of, 160–161
- ProtoLife Srl, 13n1
- Public Library of Science, 194
- Purdy, Laura M., 312
- Putnam, Robert D., 110

- PVC (polyvinyl chloride), 73
Pygmalion, 128
- Quijano, Romy F., 83n5
- Rabinow, Paul, 11, 234, 254n2, 268
Raffensperger, Carolyn, 46n7, 83n2, 91
Rai, Arti, 168, 176, 188
Rasmussen, Steen, 2, 4, 5–6, 13n3, 50, 89, 137, 243, 248, 249, 264, 307, 310, 314
Raymond, Eric. S., 193
Real-time technology assessment (RTTA), 276
Red blood cells, artificial, 1, 7
Redon, Richard, 192
Registry of Standard Biological Parts, 172, 176, 186, 194. *See also* BioBricks; Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Regulation, 20–21, 24, 27–28, 58–65, 81, 99, 111, 159, 161, 188–189, 208, 228, 231, 233 234, 247–248
of automobiles, 24
of chemicals, 58–61, 63
of protocells, 25, 26–27, 28
of straw burning, 24
voluntary codes of practice in, 23–24
Regulatory institutions, 20–21, 27–28, 58–65, 71–73, 111–112, 188–189, 228, 231
Rehmann-Sutter, Cristoph, 324
Reiss, Michael J., 32, 46n3
Ribozymes, 5, 144
Rio Declaration, 72, 90, 91, 94
Risk, 291. *See also* Decision making;
Decision theory
acceptability of, 50–57
assessment of, 12, 20, 27, 28, 36–37, 39, 42, 44–45, 52, 60, 74–75, 82, 111, 209–213
of automobiles, 20–21, 23
aversion to, 21, 73–74, 81
balancing of rewards and, 191–192
of cell phones, 105, 114–115
of chemicals, 54
complexity of, 74
control of, 55, 56–57
decisions under (*see* Decision theory, decisions under risk)
definition of, 20, 52–53
of digital technology, 22–23
of electricity, 20, 23
familiarity of, 291–292
of genetic modification, 22
historical examples of reaction to, 21–24
hypothetical vs. actual, 37, 80, 83n9
knowledge of, 26, 54, 56–57, 60, 64, 65, 71, 100
perception of, 12, 20, 50–57, 58, 109–116, 291–292, 293
of pesticides, 23
of pharmaceuticals, 23
of protocells, 8–9, 12, 13, 25, 35, 38, 49–50, 57–58, 64–65, 100, 101–102, 138, 199, 210, 247, 250, 317–321, 334
of radioactive substances, 23
skepticism about, 292
source of, 53, 55
of synthetic biology, 189–191
uncertainty about, 32, 37–41, 65, 70–71, 74, 75, 77, 82, 83n7, 109, 112, 274, 280
of vaccines, 105, 112, 116
voluntary, 57
Risk-benefit analysis. *See* Cost-benefit analysis; Risk, assessment of
RNA, 2, 144–147, 174
use in protocell research, 4–5, 6, 145, 146, 314
Robert, Jason S., 257n13, 258n19
Robinson, William C., 180n1
Roco, Mihail C., 296, 300, 303n7
Ropeik, David, 40, 42
Royal Commission on Environmental Pollution (RCEP), 105
Royal Society, 110, 112, 115, 257n15, 297, 301
Rubin, Charles T., 73
Russell, Colin A., 134
Sainsbury, D., 117
Saks, Michael J., 60

- Salek, Sam, 234
 Sandin, Per, 12, 76, 83n2, 83n3, 90, 91, 93, 94, 95, 96
 Sandler, Ronald, 297
 Santillo, David, 78
 SARS virus, 190
 Satanism, 130
 Saunders, Peter, 70
 Scanlon, Thomas, 52
 Schoeman, Ferdinand, 225
 Scholem, Gershom, 128
 Schon, Donald A., 225, 230
 Schrödinger, Erwin, 147
 Schudt, Karl, 96
 Schummer, Joachim, 130, 132, 134, 135, 140n6
 Schweitzer, Albert, 138
 Science and technology
 ethics and (*see* Ethics, science and)
 problem-oriented assessment of, 309–310
 public perception of, 8, 11, 13, 19–27, 167, 201, 211, 292–295, 311–313, 330 (*see also* Risk, perception of)
 skepticism about, 295, 300–301
 social progress and, 106–109, 110
 values and, 109
 Science studies, 230
 Scientific American (magazine), 167
 Scottish Council on Human Bioethics, 309
 Self-assembly, 3, 238, 241, 242, 243–244, 245, 249–250, 252, 311, 324, 337
 bottom-up, 241, 251, 252, 258n19
 coupling with evolution, 244, 245
 Selin, Cynthia, 303n5
 Sen, Amartya, 225
 Shapin, Steven, 268
 Shelly, Mary, 125, 150
 Sheridan, Barrett, 173
 Sherwin, Susan, 312
 Shreeve, James, 173, 175
 Silver, Lee M., 31
 Singer, Maxine, 189
 Slovic, Paul, 50–51, 55–56, 57
 SmallTimes, 292
 Smith, Hamilton, 2–3, 8
 Smith, John, 140n12
 Soul, 130, 133, 138
 Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy, 155
 Stathern, Marilyn, 277
 Stem cells, 10, 19, 23, 27, 49, 69, 70, 308, 309, 313, 315, 316, 318, 320, 329
 Stephens, Trent D., 41
 Steward, Sir William, 114
 Stewart, C. Neal, 20
 Stich, Stephen, 37, 46n5, 92
 Stikeman, Alexandra, 9
 Stone, Marcia, 168
 Sunstein, Cass R., 91, 92, 94, 99
 Sustainability, 26
 Synthesis of life
 abhorrence of, 125, 137–139
 causal determination and, 131
 ethical assessment of, 125–130, 136
 evolution and, 132–133
 experimentation and, 131–132
 hubris objection, 130, 134, 137 (*see also* Ethical concerns about protocells, hubris and hype)
 motivation for, 136–139
 playing God objection (*see* Playing God)
 scientific fascination with, 125, 137–139
 uncertain consequences of, 138
 Synthetic biology, 3, 27–28 69, 136, 143–162, 150–152, 168–169, 171–172, 183–187, 209, 223, 263–266, 269, 285, 287. *See also* Protocells
 application to biological weapons (*see* Biological weapons, synthetic biology applications to)
 application to creation of designer pathogens, 190–191
 bottom-up vs. top-down, 151, 177 (*see also* Protocells, bottom-up; Protocells, top-down)
 ethical issues particular to, 160–161, 167 (*see also* Ethical concerns about protocells)
 patenting (*see* Patenting of life forms; Venter, J. Craig, *Mycoplasma laboratorium* patent)

- Synthetic Biology Engineering Research Center, the, (SYNBERC), 265–287
 devices, 265
 chassis, 265
 Human Practices, 265, 280, 283–287
 Mode One, 270–274, 275, 282, 283–284, 287
 Mode Two, 274–278, 282, 284–285, 287
 Mode Three, 278–282, 285–287
 parts, 265
 Synthetic Genomics, Inc., 3, 13n1
 Szostak, Jack, 4, 5, 144–147, 149, 150, 151, 153, 155, 157, 161, 161n1, 242
- Talmud, 126,
 Tauber, Alfred I., 256n8
 Taylor, Charles, 225
 Tertullian, 140n6
 Thalidomine, 23, 41
 Theis, Morgan, 244–245, 247, 248, 251, 258n19
 Thompson, Larry, 319
 Thoreau, Henry David, 294
 Tickner, Joel, 75, 83n5
 Tomlinson, Sir Bernard, 113
 Toulmin, Stephen, 298
 Toxicity, 59, 73
 of chemicals, 59
 of cosmetics, 59
 health hazard assessment, 59
 of pesticides, 59, 60
 of pharmaceuticals, 59, 60
 Transcendence argument. *See* Playing God
 Transgenic. *See* Genetic modification
 Trewavas, Anthony J., 23
 Triant, Mark, 12
 Tumpey, Terrence M., 190
 Turnbull, H. W., 106
- Umar, M., 148
 Ungar, Sheldon, 110
 United Nations, 41, 79, 82n1
 United States Department of Energy, 2
 United States Patent and Trademark Office (USPTO), 3, 165, 173, 174, 178
 Urea, 8
 Urey, Harold C., 140n14
 Utilitarianism. *See* Ethics, utilitarian
- Variant Creutzfeldt-Jakob disease (vCJD), 113–114
 Vaucanson, Jacques, 128
 Venter Institute, the, 172, 174, 177
 Venter, J. Craig, 2–3, 8, 33, 172–174, 175, 192, 209, 242, 325
 global ocean sampling project, 175, 325
Mycoplasma laboratorium patent (*see* Patents, *Mycoplasma laboratorium*)
 Venters, George A., 2001
 Vesicles, 4, 6, 145–146
 growth and division of, 5
 Villarreal, Luis P., 26
 Virgil, 127
 Virtanen, 159
 Viruses, 3, 9, 26, 149, 173, 190. *See also* Poliovirus
 Vitalism, 134
 Vogel, Gretchen, 320
 Volokh, Eugene, 342
- Waddington, Conrad T., 256n6
 Walde, Peter, 4
 Walden, Paul, 135
 Walsh, John P., 168
 Walton, Douglas, 342
 Watson, James, 42, 43
 Weber, Max, 270, 273, 278, 280
 Weiss, Paul, 257n13
 Wells, Herbert G., 125
 Wheeler, Michael, 149
 Wilsdon, James, 257n15
 Wilson, Edward O., 236–238, 249
 Wilson, James Q., 224
 Wilson, Richard, 41
 Wikipedia, 171, 194
 Wiladavsky, Aaron, 73, 79, 83n8
 Wilson, James M., 191
 Wingspread Conference, 46, 91
 Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 205, 208
 Wolbring, Gregor, 150
 Wolpe, Paul R., 148
 Wolverhampton Electricity Supply, 20

Wood, Gaby, 150, 156, 157, 159
World Health Organization (WHO), 24, 43
World Trade Organization (WTO), 72
Wren, Jonathan D., 188
Wynne, Brian, 112, 118

X-Prize Foundation, the, 193

Yandle, Bruce, 72
Yesley, Michael, 211
Yomo, Tetsuya, 6

Zeitler, Uli, 299
Zimmer, Carl, 2
Zizek, Slavoj, 111
Zoloth, Laurie, 148

