

Acting in an Uncertain World

An Essay on Technical Democracy

**Michel Callon
Pierre Lascoumes
Yannick Barthe**

translated by Graham Burchell

**The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England**

© 2001 Editions du Seuil.

This translation © 2009 Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

First published as *Agir dans un monde incertain: Essai sur la démocratie technique* by Editions du Seuil.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information on quantity discounts, email special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu.

Set in Stone Serif and Stone Sans on 3B2 by Asco Typesetters, Hong Kong. Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Callon, Michel.

[*Agir dans un monde incertain*. English]

Acting in an uncertain world : an essay on technical democracy / Michel Callon, Pierre Lascoumes, Yannick Barthe.

p. cm.

Originally published in French as: *Agir dans un monde incertain*.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-03382-4 (hardcover : alk. paper)

1. Democracy. 2. Political leadership. 3. Technology—Political aspects. 4. Science—Political aspects. I. Lascoumes, Pierre, 1948–. II. Barthe, Yannick. III. Title.

JC423.C245413 2009

321.8—dc22

2008021376

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Index

- Academy of Sciences, French, 8, 62, 101, 200
- Act-up*, 181–183
- Actions Traitements*, 181, 182
- Agence Française de Lutte contre le Sida (AFLS), 183
- Agence Nationale de Recherche sur le Sida (ANRS), 183
- Agence Nationale pour la Gestion des Déchets Radioactifs (ANDRA), 13–16, 112, 147, 150, 151
- Aides*, 181–183
- AIDS epidemic, 181–188, 196, 206
- AIDS forum, 18
- AIDS information campaign, 165
- AIDS movements, 74, 83–86, 89, 105, 181–185, 233, 236, 240, 244
- Alarm, 22, 211–214
- Arcat-Sida*, 181
- Arendt, Hannah, 199, 262, 263
- Asbestos, 9, 196, 213
- Association Française contre les Myopathies (AFM), 49, 71–75, 105, 145, 186, 187
- Automobile industry, 64, 68
- Bachelard, Gaston, 55, 56, 99–103
- Barbot, Janine, 181
- Beck, Ulrich, 226, 227
- Biotechnologies, 155, 156. *See also* Genetically modified organisms
- Blood, infected, 22, 181, 193, 196, 200, 202, 209, 220
- Boureau, Alain, 117
- Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy (BSE), 1, 9, 18, 24–27, 153, 194–200, 206, 208, 213–215, 220, 221, 231, 236, 237, 260
- Brown, Phil, 77, 78
- Bureau des audiences publiques pour l'environnement (BAPE), Québec, 167
- Cambrosio, Alberto, 55
- Canguilhem, Georges, 251
- Cassini, Jean-Dominique, 46, 48, 98
- Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique (CNRS), 62, 64
- CERN, 96
- Chateauraynaud, Francis, 212
- Chernobyl, 14, 89–92, 149
- Citizen conference. *See* Consensus conference
- Citizens' juries and panels, 176–179
- Clarke, Adele, 83
- Climate change, 19, 20, 176, 177, 194, 196, 200, 206, 217
- Cloning, 172
- Collaborative research, 126, 135, 137, 142, 143, 146, 147, 159, 162, 180, 182, 186, 187, 227, 229, 250, 257, 260, 265

- Collective, constitution of
 by aggregation, 116, 121, 130–135, 144, 156
 by composition, 68, 119, 121, 124, 128–139, 142–146, 151–156, 159–162, 168, 172, 173, 176, 178, 181, 186, 223, 225, 240–242, 252, 259, 260, 264
- Collège pour la prévention des risques technologiques, 16
- Commission de Génie Biomoléculaire (CGB), 172
- Commission de Recherche et d'Information sur la Radioactivité (Crii-Rad), 89
- Commission nationale du débat public (CNDP), 167
- Commissariat à l'Énergie Atomique (CEA), 13, 62, 107, 112, 150, 249
- Comité consultatif national d'éthique (CCNE), 162, 230
- Concern for collective, 132, 136, 159, 161, 168, 172, 173, 181
- Concerned emergent groups, 29, 82, 83, 87–90, 93–96, 114, 124, 125, 128–133, 139, 144, 145, 146, 150, 151, 154, 182, 189, 227, 232, 236, 247–253, 257, 260, 262
- Conseil d'État, 200, 201, 202, 203
- Conseil national du sida (CNS), 183–186
- Consensus conference, 2–10, 114, 115, 164, 169–172, 176, 178, 180, 188
- Coulomb, Charles de, 46, 48, 98
- Court of Justice of the European Community, 203, 214
- Decision, 178, 191, 192, 217, 223
- Delacampagne, Christian, 239
- Delegation, 116, 119–123, 127–131, 135, 136, 139, 144, 154, 157–159, 174, 178, 227–233, 238, 250
- Delegative democracy, 10, 119–123, 126, 134–140, 143–145, 148, 151–158, 161, 170, 176, 178, 188, 205, 225–234, 237, 238, 241, 243, 246, 252, 253, 256, 257, 260–264
- Dewey, John, 241, 252
- Dialogic democracy, 10, 134, 135, 139, 145, 146, 151, 154–159, 163, 167, 175, 183, 186–191, 205, 210, 216, 221, 225, 229, 233, 234, 237, 241, 248, 256–262, 265
- Dialogic procedures, 158, 177, 181, 187, 188, 216, 220, 221, 227, 229, 246–251, 254, 262, 263, 265
- Dialogism, 160, 164, 178, 247, 254
- Distilben, 21, 221
- Dodier, Nicolas, 181
- Électricité de France (EDF), 16–18
- Electromagnetic fields, 16–18, 30
- Energy policy, 150, 165, 259
- Epidemiological studies, 17, 22, 23, 30, 193, 195, 197, 212. *See also* Popular epidemiology
- Epstein, Steven, 74
- Established groups, 130, 132, 140, 144, 145, 151, 154, 159–162, 170, 172, 175, 176, 178
- European Commission, 27, 195, 206–209, 215
- European Community, 203, 216
- Evans-Pritchard, Edward, 77
- Experimentation, collective, 9, 18, 61, 70, 105, 141
- Experientia*, 44, 47, 48, 76, 77, 82
- Experimentum*, 44, 47, 48, 76
- Expertise, 15, 28, 86, 89, 169, 215–218, 225, 228–233, 249, 250, 252, 253
- Exploration, 27, 28, 32, 147, 185, 187, 188, 189
- double, 203, 205, 218, 222, 223
- collective, 181–183
- of collective, 129, 185
- of overflows, 214–217

- of possible worlds, 20, 28, 68, 119, 123–127, 136, 139–142, 145–147, 151, 159, 164, 178, 217, 218, 228, 232, 233, 237, 246, 259, 264
- Fair effect process, 243–248
- Favret-Saada, Jeanne, 77
- Focus groups, 7, 164–166
- Future generations, 13–15, 25, 28, 109, 173, 207, 235, 236, 245
- Gene therapy, 2–6, 9, 68
- Genetically modified organisms (GMOs), 2, 3, 8, 9, 18, 111–114, 156, 157, 169–174, 178, 180, 194, 200, 203, 216, 221, 234–237, 240, 252, 259, 260
- Genetic diagnosis, 9, 69, 103
- Genetic diseases, 67, 68
- Genetic mutations, 61, 80, 143, 200, 219
- Genetics, 60, 73, 156, 170, 178, 232
- Godard, Olivier, 207
- Greenpeace, 170, 175, 197, 198, 203
- Habermas, Jürgen, 262, 263
- Hepatitis, 192, 193, 209, 218
- Hermitte, Marie-Angèle, 219–222
- High-tension electricity lines, 167
- Highways, 167
- HIV, 84, 183, 184, 186, 206, 220. *See also* AIDS
- Horming, George, 176
- Horton, Robin, 76, 77
- Houdart, Sophie, 59, 60
- Hutchins, Edwin, 57
- Hybrid forums, 9, 10, 18–28, 35, 36, 79, 118–124, 127, 128, 131, 134–136, 139, 153–156, 167, 168, 178, 180, 183–191, 203, 205, 210, 216, 217, 222, 225–242, 245–257, 261, 262, 264, 265
- Identities, 106, 128, 129, 130, 131, 136, 137, 138, 139, 140, 141, 142, 143, 146, 149–152, 155–166, 172–176, 182–185, 189, 205, 223, 228
- Information technologies, 6
- Inscriptions, 51–56, 59, 89, 97, 104
- Institut national de la recherche agronomique (INRA), 62
- Institut national de la santé et de la recherche médicale (INSERM), 62
- Institut national de la statistique et des études économiques (INSEE), 49
- Institut Pasteur, 66, 67, 103
- International Agency for Research on Cancer (IARC), 23
- Interessement, 61–64, 103, 104
- Irreversibility, 15, 28, 70, 108–110, 150, 157, 189, 192, 199, 200, 207, 212, 219, 249
- Jasanoff, Sheila, 4, 5
- Jonas, Hans, 198, 199
- Kant, Emmanuel, 263
- Keating, Peter, 55
- Kepler, Johannes, 49
- Kiba, 2, 3
- Knorr Cetina, Karin, 97
- Kobayashi, 6–9
- Laboratorization of society, 65, 67, 87, 89, 91
- Latour, Bruno, 66, 68, 233
- Lavoisier, Antoine, 46, 101
- Learning, collective, 9, 10, 18, 27, 28, 32–35, 106, 181, 189
- Levidow, Les, 178
- Lévi-Strauss, Claude, 99
- Lévy-Bruhl, Lucien, 99
- Licoppe, Christian, 43, 44, 47, 50, 76, 83
- Lippman, Walter, 241
- Listeriosis, 211
- Mad cow disease. *See* Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy

- Markets externalities, 235, 237
- Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT), 80
- Media, 90, 112, 123, 171, 175, 181, 184–189, 258
- Memmi, Dominique, 162
- Minamata, 212, 213
- Mobile phones, 8, 9, 23, 30, 31
- Myopathy, 18, 67, 71, 81, 82, 139–154, 186, 187, 233, 236, 240, 245, 264
- Neuromuscular diseases. *See* Myopathy
- Nietzsche, Friedrich, 101–103
- Nosocomial diseases, 193, 206
- Novartis, 169, 175, 236
- Nuclear contamination, 87, 91, 92, 151, 231, 219
- Nuclear energy, 25, 108–113, 149, 150, 157, 177, 249
- Nuclear plants, 7, 10, 23, 90, 92, 195, 212
- Nuclear waste, 2, 9, 13–16, 20, 24, 25, 28, 32, 87–89, 107–110, 129, 147–154, 211
- Office parlementaire d'évaluation des choix scientifiques et technologiques, 7, 16, 169–171
- Obligatory passage point, 47, 62, 64
- Opinion polls, 25, 111, 155–158, 165, 179
- Orphan diseases, 71, 236, 237. *See also* Myopathy
- Pasteur, Louis, 66
- Pesticides, 180
- Pharmaceutical laboratories, 165, 182–185, 193, 236, 237
- Pharmaceutical products, 193
- Plato, 99, 100
- Popper, Karl, 100–103
- Popular epidemiology, 77, 79, 83, 212, 213
- Positifs*, 181
- Precaution, principle of, 8, 11, 23, 30, 189–223
- Problemization, 47, 81–83, 104, 136, 218
- Procedural justice, 243, 246, 251, 254
- Public health agencies, 30, 210, 216, 218, 230
- Public hearings, 7
- Public inquiries, 166–168
- Rawls, John, 262–265
- Referenda, 120, 155–158
- Rémy, Elisabeth, 16
- Representation, 11, 84, 115–119, 128, 227, 238–242, 250–254, 258–260
- Reproductive technologies, 83
- Research collective, 51, 54–61, 66, 67, 70, 76, 80, 83, 86–89, 95–99, 102–105, 124, 125, 136, 141, 150, 158, 160
- Research in the wild, 10, 70, 78, 79, 86, 89–95, 99, 104–106, 120, 124–127, 130, 131, 136–141, 151, 157–161, 166, 168, 172, 173, 176, 183, 187, 191, 196, 216, 228, 232, 233, 237, 238, 252, 264
- Responsibility, principle of, 199
- Rio convention, 207–209
- Rio World Conference, 177
- Risk(s), 11, 14–24, 87, 148–151, 173, 178, 180, 192–204, 207–222, 225–228, 238, 253, 257
prevention of, 192–198, 202, 206, 209
- Road accidents, 140, 195
- Roosevelt, Franklin D., 42, 229
- Rousseau, Jean-Jacques, 107, 113, 133
- Sandel, Michael, 265
- Secluded research, 10, 37, 40–43, 46–51, 54, 58–61, 70, 78, 83, 89–99, 104, 105, 120, 124–127, 130, 131, 134–139, 147, 150, 151, 157–161, 166, 168, 172, 173, 176, 177, 182, 183,

- 187, 192, 196, 215, 226, 232, 233,
237, 238, 252, 255, 264
- Société Nationale des Chemins de fer
Français (SNCF), 29, 31
- Socrates, 100
- Spinal muscular atrophy (SMA), 49, 71–
74, 129, 141–143
- Strathern, Marilyn, 25
- Taylor, Charles, 138
- Torny, Didier, 212
- Toxic products, 79, 98, 136, 137, 180,
197–200, 204, 208, 211–213, 219,
221, 240, 264
- Traceability
of actions, 215
of debates, 166, 175, 247
- Trains, 29–33
- Translation, 48, 69, 91, 95, 98, 99, 102–
106, 127, 131, 159, 162, 215, 232
- Translation 1, 48–51, 63–70, 76, 89, 94,
95, 97, 102–104
- Translation 2, 51–59, 66–70, 76, 89, 94,
102, 104
- Translation 3, 59–70, 76, 89, 93–97,
102–104, 124
- Transparency, 162, 163, 175, 247
- Truman, Harry, 42
- Vigilance, 88, 89, 104, 151, 202, 203,
210–214, 222, 252, 257
- Walzer, Michael, 138
- World Health Organization (WHO), 211
- World Trade Organization (WTO), 215
- Wynne, Brian, 90
- Yamamoto, 59–61

