

# Conceptual Analysis and Philosophical Naturalism

edited by David Braddon-Mitchell and Robert Nola

A Bradford Book  
The MIT Press  
Cambridge, Massachusetts  
London, England

© 2009 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

MIT Press books may be purchased at special quantity discounts for business or sales promotional use. For information, please email [special\\_sales@mitpress.mit.edu](mailto:special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu) or write to Special Sales Department, The MIT Press, 55 Hayward Street, Cambridge, MA 02142.

This book was set in Stone sans and Stone serif by SNP Best-set Typesetter Ltd., Hong Kong, and was printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Conceptual analysis and philosophical naturalism / edited by David Braddon-Mitchell and Robert Nola.

p. cm.

"A Bradford book."

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-01256-0 (hardcover : alk. paper)—ISBN 978-0-262-51228-2 (pbk. : alk. paper)

1. Analysis (Philosophy). 2. Naturalism. I. Braddon-Mitchell, David. II. Nola, Robert.

B808.5.C557 2009

146'.4—dc22

2008027190

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

## Index

- Abduction, 16, 232  
Adams, Robert M., 221  
A-intension, 37, 226, 240  
Aliens, 205–206, 212–213, 216, 221  
Analytic, 23–24, 28, 36, 38–40, 42, 219, 273–276, 278, 280, 282–283, 286–287, 319–320  
A posteriori, 11–13, 15, 18, 24–26, 29, 38–41, 107–108, 168–170, 188, 191–193, 195, 197, 199, 222, 287, 308, 321  
A priori, 9, 11–14, 17–18, 25, 28–29, 31, 33, 35, 37, 39, 41, 43, 99, 101–111, 140, 142–143, 145, 148, 161, 167–168, 170, 173, 188, 222, 243–248, 250–252, 256, 261–265, 319, 321, 330, 332, 335, 342  
Aquinas, St. Thomas, 126  
Armchair, 11, 14, 25, 39–42, 57, 159–163, 167–181, 267, 271, 282–284, 287, 298–200  
Armstrong, D. M., 99, 105, 111, 208, 220–221  
  
Bayesian, 290, 292, 300, 303, 308–309, 312  
Behaviorism, 1, 100, 134–135  
Belnap, Nuel D., 216  
Best deserver, 269  
Biconditionals, a priori, 12, 99, 101, 103, 105, 107, 109, 111  
  
Birds, animatronic, 36  
Black, Robert, 209, 218, 221, 240  
Block, Ned, 109, 161, 254  
Boghossian, Paul, 198  
Braddon-Mitchell, David, 11, 30, 40, 111, 143, 156, 238, 280, 345  
Burge, T., 274  
Byrne, Alex, 161  
  
Caloric, 273–274  
Canberra Plan, 1, 4–15, 17, 19, 25–30, 37–41, 43, 45, 111, 113–115, 124–125, 135–136, 183–185, 190, 193–194, 199, 267, 270–271, 278, 298, 308, 310, 315–316, 322  
Capacity, recognitional, 107  
Carnap, R., 3, 4, 19, 20, 186, 208, 280–281  
Carnap sentence, 186, 191, 208, 220, 280, 281  
Carruthers, P., 258  
Causal powers, 203  
Chalmers, David, 69, 74, 131, 133, 137, 141, 157–158, 161, 222, 244, 265  
Child, William, 181  
Chomsky, Noam, 53–54, 56, 66–67, 96, 175, 177  
C-intension, 222, 226, 232, 240  
Circles, recognition of, 60, 65, 68, 83, 89, 93

- Cognitivism, 318–319  
 Collins, J., 19  
 Colyvan, M., 18, 306, 312–313  
 Combinatorialism, 16, 208–209, 212–213, 220–221  
 Compatibilism, 99, 101, 103, 105, 110, 379  
 Competence, semantic, 14, 175–180, 182, 273, 321  
 Composition, 106–107, 110, 117  
 Conceivability, 133–136, 251  
 Concepts, 7, 11, 14, 19, 24–29, 35, 40, 54, 60, 71, 102, 164, 166, 172–179, 267–268, 273, 280, 282, 316, 318–331, 334–348  
   theory of, 35, 38, 340  
 Conceptual analysis, 14, 23, 47, 94, 160–182, 199, 267–271, 283–287, 295–298, 335  
 Conceptual change, 40–41  
 Consequences, 31, 33–34, 162, 194, 267, 287  
   logical, 206  
   long-term, 34  
   short-term, 34–35  
 Conservatism, epistemic, 290–295  
   theoretical, 290, 295  
 Constitution, 102, 270  
   “is” of, 102  
 Contextualism (about knowledge), 234–236, 240, 241  
 Convergence, 19, 34–35, 324–325, 333, 345  
 Coordinates, 17, 243–256, 261  
 Core-physical, 104  
 Cummins, R., 253  
  
 Davidson, Donald, 162  
 Davies, Martin, 131, 156, 180, 240  
 Decision theory, 18, 254, 266, 303, 306, 308, 310, 312  
 Deduction, 293, 337  
 Dennett, D., 257  
  
 Derivation, 17, 244–246, 248–250, 252, 256, 266, 304  
 Descriptions (definite), 4–6, 10, 20, 139–158, 176, 191, 211, 216, 224, 230–231, 233–234, 237–238, 267, 284, 286, 331  
 Descriptivism, 14, 139–158, 280–283, 319, 332, 342  
 Determinism, 101, 279  
 Devitt, Michael, 144, 150–151, 176  
 Disagreement, 26, 40–41, 47, 316–345  
   moral, 18–19, 322–326, 328, 345  
 Dispositions, 11–12, 38–40, 42, 177, 179, 255–256, 262, 396  
 Dretske, Fred, 220  
 Dummett, Michael, 337–339, 343–344  
  
 Electron, 3–6, 103–104, 255, 257, 268, 276, 282, 299  
 Eliminativism, 26, 63, 111, 196  
 Ellis, Brian, 220  
 Equivalence meaning, 157  
 Essence, 24, 115–123, 126–134, 270  
 Eucalyptus, 36  
 Experience, 7, 13, 28, 58, 62, 113–117, 147, 189, 217, 232, 245–252, 255, 258, 260–263, 268  
  
 Fine, Kit, 120, 221  
 Free will, 7, 37, 101–102, 105, 110, 113, 175, 265, 267  
 Frege, Gottlob, 154, 156–158  
 Functionalism, 12, 15, 18–19, 30–31, 88, 100, 105, 191, 276, 280, 315, 319–320, 323–324, 332–333, 340–341, 345, 347  
   moral, 15, 19, 191, 315, 319–320, 323–324, 332–333, 340–342, 345, 347  
  
 Genes, 25, 269, 287  
 Gettier, Edmund, 163, 165, 167, 235, 335

- God, 103–105, 112, 124, 168–169, 217, 218, 274, 283, 317
- Gödel, K., 312
- Goodman, N., 291–292
- Gopnik, A., 96
- Gore, Al, 226
- Grammar, generative, 54–55, 66
- Grice, Paul, 160, 163, 165, 170, 176
- Haecceitism, 209–212, 221, 227, 240
- Hájek, A., 312
- Harmony, 337, 343–344
- Haugeland, John, 181
- Hawthorne, Jonathan, 1, 114, 299
- Heat, 128–130, 133, 136, 222, 274, 276, 285
- Hempel, Carl, 2, 19–20
- Hintikka, J., 311
- Hume, D., 263, 303, 309
- Humeanism about laws, 103, 269
- Humility, Kantian, 203
- Ramseyan, 16, 203–222, 223–225, 240
- Hyperintensionality, 29, 37
- Idealization, 34–35, 65, 75, 77, 333
- Identity, transworld, 210–211
- Idlers, 16, 205–206, 212–216, 235, 239–240
- Information, 10, 17, 30, 33, 39, 46, 51–53, 58–61, 68, 77–78, 87, 91–92, 101, 107, 109, 145–148, 155–156, 174–175, 177–178, 216, 246–247, 252, 257, 262–264, 268, 270, 278, 281, 283, 288–289, 335
- Input, 30–31, 34–35, 162, 255, 324, 339
- Introspection, 14, 40, 52–53, 58–59, 62, 287
- Intuitions, 47, 50–51, 53, 55–57, 67, 143, 161, 167, 170, 175, 191, 210, 262, 265, 277, 319, 321, 323, 347
- Jackson, Frank, 1, 11–12, 14, 19, 25, 30, 39, 97, 100, 103, 107, 112, 116, 131, 141–142, 145, 148, 157–184, 190–191, 194–195, 198, 218, 222, 240, 244, 271, 275, 280, 283–284, 299, 303, 309, 315–316, 319, 323–327, 331–348
- Johnston, Mark, 114, 116, 321, 333
- Kahneman, D., 312
- Kinds
- functional, 41
  - natural, 104, 139, 172, 274, 281, 328
  - social, 329–330
- Kind-terms, 141, 145, 157, 280
- Knowing-that, 119, 133, 225, 232, 238–239, 248
- Knowing-what, 48, 118–119, 126, 215, 238
- Knowledge, tacit, 48, 118–119, 126, 215, 238
- Kolmogorov, A., 303, 312
- Kripke, Saul, 24, 27, 38, 112, 128–130, 132–133, 136, 139–142, 149, 156–157, 167, 222, 274
- Kroon, Frederick, 13, 14, 141, 156–158
- Lakatos, Imre, 175
- Langton, Rae, 203–204, 214, 223, 225, 228, 235
- Language, Lagadonian, 211–212
- Laurence, S., 36
- Laws (of nature), 6, 27, 103, 108, 162, 188, 203, 205, 208–209, 213, 218–221, 267, 269, 272
- Levine, J., 226
- Lewis, David K., 1–9, 13–18, 20, 25–28, 43, 49, 84, 88, 99, 102, 105, 110–112, 114–116, 118, 120–121, 125–130, 141, 164, 180, 183, 186–199, 208–211, 214, 217–218, 220–230, 233–240, 257, 268, 271–273, 276, 280, 299, 308–313, 341, 346–347

- Libertarianism, metaphysical, 33  
 Location problem(s), 9–10, 195, 267, 269–271, 279, 332  
 Locke, J., 286  
 Logic, classical, 303, 306, 308, 312  
 Logic, Kleene, 306  
 Lowe, E. J., 112  
 Lycan, William, 171–173
- Mapmaking, 34  
 Meno, 65, 143  
 Mental states, 8, 14, 18, 30–31, 33, 35, 40, 46, 84, 159, 166, 171–172, 174, 187–180, 268, 276, 281, 283  
 Menzies, Peter, 14, 15, 164, 183, 191, 192  
 Metaphysics, 10–12, 15–16, 26–30, 43, 47, 100, 102–105, 177, 183–185, 194–199, 214, 239, 270–271, 286, 288–289, 296–298  
   fundamental, 18, 100, 102–104, 110, 160, 176, 269, 283, 298  
 Method of cases, 180, 319–321, 346  
 Mill, John Stuart, 156, 220  
 Miller, K. L., 30  
 Millikan, Ruth, 175  
 Momentum, 192, 285–286  
 Morality, folk, 6, 15, 319, 323–324, 326–327, 331–334, 337–340, 347–348  
 Morality, mature folk, 19, 191, 323–324, 326, 331–332, 338, 342, 348  
 Müller-Lyer illusion, 258  
 Multiple realization, 4
- Nagel, T., 258  
 Names, 5–6, 13–14, 20, 139–158, 191, 206, 212, 214, 217, 230, 280, 329  
 Naturalism, 23–28, 174–175, 306–312  
 Nichols, Shaun, 84, 96  
 Nola, Robert, 302, 308  
 Nolan, Daniel, 7, 18–20, 26, 27, 280  
 Normativity, 11, 18, 32, 296, 303, 305–311
- Occam's razor, 205, 213, 239  
 O-language, 205–207, 217, 219, 224  
 Ontology, 9, 13, 18, 26–27, 47, 172, 174, 256, 270, 296, 340–341  
   moderate, 102  
 O-terms, 2–6, 11, 185–187, 194, 224, 230  
 Output clauses, 333, 339–341, 348
- Pain, 50, 88, 99, 101–102, 104–105, 109–112, 126, 128–133, 136, 233, 273  
 Papineau, David, 305  
 Patterns, 8, 12–13, 32, 61, 64, 67, 69–70, 72–73, 79, 81, 83, 85–86, 93–94, 96–97, 100–101, 108, 205, 259, 261–262, 270, 276–277  
 Personal level, 49, 50–53, 57–59, 62–64, 71  
 Pettit, Philip, 17, 182, 243, 244, 248, 256, 258, 262, 263, 264, 345  
 Phonemes, 67  
 Physicalism, 8–9, 12–15, 17, 26, 28, 43, 101–106, 109–115, 122–125, 134–136, 161, 189–190, 192–194, 199, 243–245, 252, 256, 264  
 Physics, quantum, 48  
 Plantinga, Alvin, 221  
 Platitudes, 7–8, 10, 14–15, 18, 20, 28, 46–47, 49, 84–85, 127, 187, 191, 267–300, 346  
 Pop-out, 17–18, 245–246, 248–249, 251–252, 255, 262–263, 265  
 Possibilia, 23, 25–26  
 Price, Huw, 1, 14, 114, 136, 299  
 Prior, Elizabeth, 216  
 Probability, 18, 187, 254, 290, 303, 312, 347  
 Properties  
   alien, 16, 221  
   fundamental, 15–16, 204–209, 211–220, 222–224, 234, 236–237, 239–240

- moral, 15, 183, 191, 319, 322–333, 331, 334, 339–341  
 perfectly natural, 218  
 physical, 43, 159, 183  
 semantic, 40, 151, 195, 198  
 Prototype theory of concepts, 35  
 Psychology, folk, 7, 11, 14, 20, 45–51, 57–59, 61–64, 75–76, 83–88, 114, 125–127, 135–136, 172–175, 180–181, 183, 187, 194, 196, 273, 275–276, 319, 337, 340, 246–347  
 Putnam, Hilary, 167, 231, 274  
  
 Qualia, 13, 114, 116, 126–127, 130, 161, 217, 222, 236–237, 347  
 Quasi-realism, 345  
 Quidditism, 16, 208–213, 221, 223  
 Quine, W. V. O., 24, 28, 219, 299, 306, 307, 336  
  
 Ramsey, F. P., 1–9, 18, 20, 183–188, 192–197, 207, 220, 230, 234, 308–311, 313, 316  
 Ramseyan Humility, 16, 19, 203–241  
 Ramsey-Carnap-Lewis, 183, 185, 187–188, 192–195  
 Ramsey sentence, 2–6, 10–11, 14, 19, 20, 26, 186, 190–191, 195, 207–208, 212, 219–220, 234, 268, 273, 281, 308, 319  
 Rational beings, 101  
 Rationality, 18, 100, 290, 303–312, 331, 334, 341–342, 344, 348  
 Rawls, J., 291, 292  
 Read, Stephen, 343  
 Realism, 3, 197–198, 211, 291, 334  
   direct, 236, 241  
 Realization, 4, 6, 9, 15–16, 186, 207–209, 212, 214–217, 220, 223–226, 228, 232–233, 235–237, 239  
 Recognition systems, 35–37  
 Recursively representational states, 252–253, 257–261  
  
 Reference, 15, 17, 24, 37, 128–129, 140, 143, 144–145, 147–152, 154–158, 174, 184–187, 191–192, 196, 198, 208, 216, 222, 281, 328–331, 334, 335, 347  
   causal theory of, 141–142, 145–147  
   description theory of, 154  
 Referential indeterminacy (ambiguity), 20, 196–197, 220–221  
 Relativism, quasi, 19, 315–316, 325, 334, 343, 346, 348  
 Replacement, 210, 213, 135, 239  
   argument, 212, 214, 239  
   conception, 13, 113–114, 124–125, 136, 275  
 Representational states, 17–18, 31, 71, 252–261, 265  
 Research School of Social Sciences, 1, 25  
 Revelation, doctrine of, 113–136, 115, 124, 129, 135  
 Rigidify (rigidification), 43, 139, 157, 216, 222, 231, 233–234, 238  
 Robinson, Denis, 182, 220, 346, 347  
 Roles, causal, 8, 14–15, 56–57, 67, 76, 183, 186, 188–191, 193, 199, 260, 268, 340  
 Roles, nomological, 204, 207–208, 220  
 Rules, generative, 54–55, 67  
 Russell, Bertrand, 154, 156–158, 222, 312  
  
 Salmon, Nathan, 158  
 Schaffer, Jonathan, 232, 235, 238, 239, 232, 234, 235, 241  
 Schiffer, Stephen, 163  
 Searle, John, 141  
 Segerberg, Krister, 161  
 Self-presentation, 116–117, 122  
 Semantics, 11, 14–16, 25, 33–34, 39–40, 43, 150, 155–156, 158, 179, 181, 196–197, 226, 231–232, 240, 304, 328, 340

- Sentences, grammatical, 5, 9, 60,  
     67–69, 73–74, 76–78, 80–81, 83, 89,  
     91, 93, 96  
 open, 60–61, 66, 69–70, 79, 88–89, 92,  
     224, 322  
 Shoemaker, Sydney, 220  
 Similarity between aggregations, 100,  
     106  
 Simulation, off-line, 30  
 Skepticism, 16–17, 115, 228–229, 232,  
     234, 236, 238, 241, 342, 346  
 Smart, J. J. C., 28, 99, 105, 111  
 Smith, Michael, 181, 262, 299  
 Soames, Scott, 24, 141–144, 147,  
     150–158, 240  
 Space, logical, 100–104  
 Stalnaker, Robert, 48, 52, 58, 102, 109,  
     131, 133, 161, 222  
 Stanley, Jason, 139  
 Sterelny, Kim, 144, 150–151, 173–175  
 Stich, Stephen, 11–12, 46, 84–85, 96,  
     166, 196, 198  
 Stoljar, Daniel, 13, 20, 49, 120, 135,  
     265  
 Strawson, G., 116  
 Subpersonal, 49–53, 57–59, 62–64, 71,  
     156, 257  
 Supervenience, 9, 106, 163, 276, 319,  
     333  
 Swoyer, Chris, 220  
  
 Tersman, Folke, 348  
 Theoretical terms, 4–5, 8, 15, 18, 23,  
     25–26, 139, 183, 185, 187, 192–193,  
     205–208, 220, 231, 273, 280, 282,  
     299, 308, 310, 312, 322  
 Theory, folk, 46, 48–49, 94, 127, 173,  
     176, 181, 191, 194, 273, 287, 289,  
     294, 298, 300, 319–322, 346  
 Theory, tacit or implicit, 12, 49–50, 53,  
     55–57, 61–64, 70, 72, 76, 84, 86–91,  
     94–95, 396  
 Thoughts, fine-grained, 30  
  
 Time-slice, 41–43  
 Tooley, Michael, 183, 191, 220  
 Triangle, 101–102  
 Truths, analytic, 39, 274, 278, 280,  
     282–283  
 T-terms, 2–7, 15, 20, 186–187, 190,  
     194, 197, 205–208, 219, 224,  
     230–232, 273, 341  
 Twin earth, 25, 39, 50, 58, 165  
 Two-dimensionalism, 16, 29, 32–34,  
     36, 38, 130–131, 133, 136, 157, 161,  
     180, 226, 240, 336, 347  
 Two-step, Canberra Plan, 7, 9, 14, 27,  
     269–270  
  
 Unger, Peter, 222  
 Universals, 56, 100, 205, 210, 219  
  
 van Fraassen, B. C., 300, 312  
 von Frisch, K., 107, 109  
  
 Wason, P. C., 312  
 Water and H<sub>2</sub>O, 24, 36, 39–43, 50, 100,  
     107–108, 131–132, 142, 146, 165,  
     177, 188, 328, 331, 335  
 Wettstein, Howard, 158  
 wffs, 72, 75–76, 80, 83, 85–86, 89, 91,  
     95  
 Whittle, Ann, 223, 225, 227, 240  
 Williamson, Timothy, 181  
 Wittgenstein, L., 81, 270, 329  
 Wright, Crispin, 299  
  
 Yablo, Stephen, 161  
  
 Zebras, 32–33