

Emergence: Contemporary Readings in Philosophy and Science

edited by Mark A. Bedau and Paul Humphreys

**A Bradford Book
The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England**

© 2008 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information about special quantity discounts, please email special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu

This book was set in Stone Serif and Stone Sans on 3B2 by Asco Typesetters, Hong Kong.
Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Emergence : contemporary readings in philosophy and science / edited by Mark A. Bedau and Paul Humphreys.

p. cm.

"A Bradford book."

Includes bibliographical references and (p.) index.

ISBN 978-0-262-02621-5 (hardcover : alk. paper) — ISBN 978-0-262-52475-9

(pbk. : alk. paper)

1. Emergence (Philosophy) 2. Science—Philosophy. I. Bedau, Mark. II. Humphreys, Paul.

Q175.32.E44E44 2007

501—dc22

2007000949

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Index

- Aggregativity, 15, 100–108, 151n10
- Alexander's Dictum, 341, 436, 438, 440, 442
- Alexander, Samuel, 12–13, 19, 21, 23–26, 31–32, 81, 84–85, 88–90, 127–129, 139, 141, 144, 149, 434–436. *See also* Alexander's Dictum
- Autonomy, 128, 155, 159, 185n4, 340
- epistemological, 182, 186n16
- explanatory, 6, 160, 179, 181–182
- metaphysical/ontological, 6, 120, 157, 161, 183
- nomological, 129
- of sciences, 348, 438
- and weak emergence, 157, 178–179, 181–184
- Bain, Alexander, 19, 21, 23, 25, 29–30, 33, 41, 54–55, 81, 84
- Bridge laws, 44–45, 133–136, 218, 339–340, 366–369, 373, 396–400, 404, 406. *See also* Reductionism
- British Emergentism, 14, 19–24, 26, 31, 33, 50–51, 52n7, 53n14, 57n47, 82
- Broad, C. D., 16, 19–21, 23–25, 33–34, 36–51, 52n2, 52n7, 53n7, 54n24, 54n27, 55n33–n35, 56n37–n38, 56n42, 66n6, 81, 85–93, 127, 149, 342
- Cartesian dualism. *See* Dualism, Cartesian
- Causal closure, 121. *See also* Epiphenomenalism; Materialism; Physicalism; Reductionism; Reductivism
- of mental realm, 427
- of physical domain, 14, 112, 341, 427, 428–429, 442
- Causal fundamentalism, 159–162, 165
- Causal novelty of emergent phenomena. *See* Novelty of emergent phenomena, causal
- Causal reductionism. *See* Reductionism, causal
- Causey, Robert, 25, 45–46, 56n44–n45
- Cellular automata, 157, 256–257, 301, 307, 312, 341. *See also* Chaos; Complexity; Dynamical systems; Evolution, non-biological (cellular automata); Game of life, the; Irreducibility, computational
- and complexity, 17, 249, 252, 256, 278, 325
- density problem in, 289, 294–295
- and generation of dynamical hierarchies, 326–327
- and weak emergence, 164–165, 167, 171, 174, 182–183, 184n1
- Chaos, 99, 231, 249, 252–257, 260–270, 301, 337, 342, 350, 375–376, 378, 380–381, 384–386. *See also* Cellular automata; Complexity; Dynamical systems; Quantum mechanics; Unpredictability of emergent phenomena
- in cellular automata, 174, 257, 270–271
- in quantum mechanics, 378
- Complexity, 13, 114, 120, 164, 179, 227, 249, 251–253, 279, 284, 305, 313–314, 325–327, 329–330, 390, 434. *See also* Cellular automata; Chaos; Computation theory; Dynamical systems; Irreducibility, computational; Systems theory

- Complexity (cont.)
 algorithmic, 164, 325
 computational, 16, 211–212, 299, 325, 342
 emergence of, 256, 278, 280, 283
 and evolution, 256–257, 283
 and failure of reductionism, 213, 216
 Kolmogorov, 275–276
 levels of, 20, 33, 41, 85, 139–140, 218, 222, 251
 object, 313, 322, 324–330
 organizational/organized, 5, 20, 22, 31–33, 41, 49, 85, 87, 128, 251, 339
 science of, 155–157, 161, 164, 183, 185n10, 186n15, 209, 211
 statistical, 278
 theory, 12, 17, 337–338, 341
- Complex systems. *See* Complexity
- Computational complexity. *See* Complexity, computational; *see also* Irreducibility, computational
- Computation theory, 276–278, 283, 387, 393n20. *See also* Complexity
- Conceptual novelty. *See* Novelty of emergent phenomena, conceptual
- Consciousness, 4, 12, 14–15, 95, 134, 139, 338, 411, 413, 427. *See also* Irreducibility of consciousness; Mental causation; Mental realism; Mind-body problem; Qualia
 as causally emergent, 57n48, 69–70, 72, 143, 153n37, 159, 161, 183
 creation of, 131–132, 136
 and logical supervenience, 416
 and token physicalism, 434
- Darwinian evolution. *See* Evolution, Darwinian
- Davidson, Donald, 95–96, 191, 401, 420n1, 437, 443n3, 443n6
- Downward causation, 6, 51n3, 52n5, 129, 139, 141–150, 155, 153n37, 159. *See also*
 Dynamical hierarchies; Epiphenomenalism;
 Mental causation; Mental realism;
 Supervenience
 and weak emergence, 143, 157, 161, 175–178
- of mental properties, 57n48, 112, 149, 159, 437
 emergent, 148, 176–178, 185n18
 reflexive, 145–148
 diachronic, 147–149
 synchronic, 149
 explanatory, 150
 in British emergentism, 21–23, 33, 38, 437
 in non-reductive physicalism, 112, 119–120, 438–440, 442
 difficulties, 23, 33, 38, 144–150, 152n5, 157n48, 176–177, 185n13, 437–438, 440, 442
 weak, 176–178, 186n16
 argument, 14, 112, 120, 340–341
 in dynamical hierarchies, 219, 323, 341
- Dualism, 72–73, 112, 128, 134, 397, 427. *See also* Mental causation; Mental realism; Mind-body problem; Supervenience
 Cartesian, 32, 52n7, 87, 128, 427, 430, 442
 property, 74, 430, 443
- Dynamical hierarchies, 307, 320, 326–327, 330. *See also* Cellular automata; Chaos; Complexity; Downward causation; Dynamical systems
 in biological systems, 305
 and downward causation, 323, 341
 emergent, 217–219, 309
 in molecular systems, 305–306, 311, 314
- Dynamical systems, 277, 297, 314, 323, 325–326, 330. *See also* Cellular automata; Chaos; Complexity; Dynamical hierarchies
 chaotic, 342, 379, 391
 non-linear, 270
- Dynamical systems theory. *See* Systems theory, dynamical
- Emergent evolution. *See* Evolution, emergent
- Emergent laws, 4, 19–20, 31, 42–43, 47, 88, 128, 163, 174. *See also* Trans-ordinal laws
- Emergent materialism. *See* Materialism, emergent
- Epiphenomenalism, 79, 111, 118, 129, 134, 141, 436. *See also* Mental causation; Mind-body problem; Supervenience

- Epistemological autonomy. *See* Autonomy, epistemological
- Evolution, 22, 162, 249, 278–279, 281–284, 307, 342. *See also* Cellular automata; Complexity; Dynamical hierarchies; Dynamical systems biological, 50, 184, 196, 231, 237, 264, 277, 279, 283, 305, 330, 386 and complexity, 32, 85, 252, 256–257, 283, 305 Darwinian, 32–33, 85, 280–281 of dynamical systems, 378, 383 emergent, 2, 33, 85, 95, 124n6, 143, 436 non-biological (cellular automata), 167, 233, 257, 295, 312, 314, 326, 387, 389–391 Exclusion argument, the, 111–112, 115, 120, 122, 123n1, 123n3, 124n4, 159. *See also* Causal closure; Epiphenomenalism; Mental causation Explanatory autonomy. *See* Autonomy, explanatory Explanatory reductionism. *See* Reductionism, explanatory
- Feyerabend, Paul, 369–372
- Fodor, Jerry A., 134, 182, 191, 201, 203n3, 203n5, 204n19, 218, 339–340, 429, 437, 443, 444n13
- Fundamental laws, 45–46, 54n27, 93–94 of chemistry, 29 of physics, 165, 197, 221–222, 225–226 in special sciences, 22, 83
- Game of Life, the, 184n1, 233, 256–257, 301, 312. *See also* Cellular automata; Complexity; Dynamical hierarchies; Evolution, non-biological (cellular automata) patterns in, 5, 166–175, 178, 180, 182–183, 196, 288, 292–293
- General systems theory. *See* Systems theory, general
- Gollub, Jerry P., 382–384
- Hare, R. M., 78–79, 95–96, 420n1, 422n10
- Hellman, G., 420n1, 430–431, 444n5
- Heteropathic effects, 26–31, 37–38, 82–85, 88. *See also* Emergent laws; Heteropathic laws; Homopathic effects; Homopathic laws
- Heteropathic laws, 11, 25–29, 31, 83–84, 88. *See also* Emergent laws; Heteropathic effects; Homopathic effects; Homopathic laws
- Holism, 4, 10–11, 209, 249, 251
- Homopathic effects, 26–27, 29, 54n19, 82, 84. *See also* Emergent laws; Heteropathic effects; Heteropathic laws; Homopathic laws
- Homopathic laws, 27–29, 82, 84, 127. *See also* Emergent laws; Heteropathic effects; Heteropathic laws; Homopathic effects
- Intra-ordinal laws, 42, 46, 87. *See also* Trans-ordinal laws
- Intrinsic emergence, 271–273, 278
- Irreducibility, 3–4, 10–11, 15, 25, 209, 337–338, 429, 434, 441 computational, 16, 341–342, 387–389 of consciousness, 72, 74–78, 430–431 and weak emergence, 160, 164, 182–182, 185n6
- Jackson, Frank, 73–74, 151n12, 420, 422n12, 423n14
- Kim, Jaegwon, 12, 14, 51n3, 56n43, 57n49, 79, 81, 111–112, 115–116, 118, 124n9–n11, 159, 175–177, 214, 216, 340–341, 420n1, 422n10, 423n16
- Kripke, Saul, 43, 56n44, 73, 90, 416–417
- LePore, E., 431–433, 437, 444n11
- Lewes, George Henry, 18n1, 19, 21, 23, 25–26, 30–32, 37, 51n2, 52n7, 54n23, 55n33, 56n41, 81, 84–85, 89–90, 130, 151
- Loewer, Barry, 52, 57, 431–433, 437, 444n11
- Materialism, 191, 397, 419–420, 423n17. *See also* Causal closure; Epiphenomenalism; Physicalism; Reductivism; Reductionism emergent, 52, 81, 89, 94

- Materialism (cont.)
 non-reductive, 81, 128 (*see also* Physicalism, non-reductive)
 reductive, 81, 88–90, 94 (*see also* Physicalism, reductionism)
- Mayr, Ernst, 348, 352, 354
- Mechanism (theory), 37, 39, 48, 50, 55n5, 56n37–n38, 57n46, 85–86, 88, 90, 140, 283. *See also* Physicalism; Reductionism
 comprehensive, 39–40, 46
 pure, 38–39, 56n38, 85–86
- Mental causation, 111, 430, 436–440. *See also* Consciousness; Downward causation; Epiphenomenalism; Mental realism; Mind-body problem; Reductionism
- Mental realism, 189–193, 201, 433, 436, 468
- Metaphysical autonomy. *See* Autonomy, metaphysical/ontological
- Mill, John Stuart, 11, 16, 19, 21, 23–30, 32–33, 37, 41, 51n1, 53n11, 53n14–n18, 54n19, 54n21, 54n26, 54n26–n27, 54n29, 55n31, 55n33, 81–85, 93, 127, 130
- Mind-body problem, 429, 437, 443n5, 70, 72, 420n1. *See also* Consciousness; Downward Causation; Mental causation; Mental realism; Reductionism; Supervenience
- Morgan, Lloyd, 12, 19, 21, 23–26, 31–33, 37–38, 41, 50, 55n33, 64, 81, 84–85, 95–96, 127–130, 139, 143–144, 146, 148–149, 151n11, 153n36, 434–437
- Multiple realization, 134, 138, 182, 338–339, 431–432, 443, 443n5
- Nagelian bridge laws. *See* Bridge laws
- Neovitalism. *See* Vitalism, neo-
- Nominal emergence, 158–160, 185n4
- Nomological autonomy. *See* Autonomy, nomological
- Non-obviousness of emergent phenomena, 301. *See also* Novelty of emergent phenomena; Underivability of emergent phenomena; Unexplainability of emergent phenomena; Unpredictability of emergent phenomena
- Non-reductive materialism. *See* Materialism, non-reductive
- Non-reductive physicalism. *See* Physicalism, non-reductive
- Non-reductivism, 428–431. *See also* Materialism, non-reductive; Physicalism, non-reductive
- Novelty of emergent phenomena, 4, 16, 66, 123, 124n10, 125n24, 130, 270–272, 282–283, 307, 330, 386. *See also* Non-obviousness of emergent phenomena; Underivability of emergent phenomena; Unexplainability of emergent phenomena; Unpredictability of emergent phenomena
 causal, 15
 conceptual, 3, 10–11, 209, 339
 ontological, 3, 11, 159
- Objective reductionism. *See* Reductionism, objective
- Ontological autonomy. *See* Autonomy, metaphysical/ontological
- Ontological novelty of emergent phenomena. *See* Novelty of emergent phenomena, ontological
- Ontological reduction. *See* Reductionism, ontological
- Ontological reductionism. *See* Reductionism, ontological
- Pattern formation, 270–273, 279–281
- Physicalism, 74, 113, 121, 337–340, 420. *See also* Materialism; Reductionism; Reductivism
 non-reductive, 119, 429–438, 440–441, 442n3, 444n8 (*see also* Materialism, non-reductive)
 token, 397–398, 401–403, 434
 type, 397–398, 402
- Physical reductionism. *See* Reductionism, physical
- Qualia, 14–15, 99, 111, 136, 139, 159. *See also* Consciousness, Epiphenomenalism, Mental causation, Mental realism

- Quantum mechanics, 23–24, 49–50, 52n5–n6, 55n32, 57n46, 88, 209, 223–224, 264, 283–284, 351–352, 360, 376, 378. *See also* Chaos
non-relativistic, 22–23, 55n32, 210, 259
- Reductionism, 70–71, 74, 107–108, 176, 221–223, 249, 252, 260, 264–265, 337, 395. *See also* Bridge laws; Materialism; Non-reductivism; Physicalism; Reductivism; Special sciences, reduction to physical sciences; Supervenience
causal, 71, 174–175, 444n11
compatibility with emergentism, 3, 99–101, 174–175, 184, 218, 251
explanatory, 349
and mental causation, 428, 430–431, 436, 438, 443
objective, 352–354
ontological, 70–75, 174
physical, 128, 134, 140, 152n25
theory, 348, 352
- Reductive materialism. *See* Materialism, reductive
- Reductivism, 395–403, 405–406. *See also* Bridge laws; Materialism; Non-reductivism; Physicalism; Reductionism; Special sciences, reduction to physical sciences; Supervenience
- Segregation, 235–241, 246–247
- Special sciences. *See also* Reductionism, theory in British emergentism, 19–22, 25, 27, 29, 38–39, 42–43, 51n2, 56n42, 83, 85–87, 333
reduction to physical sciences, 22, 27, 29, 35, 83, 85–87, 99, 128, 182, 184, 186n19, 218, 395–400, 403–408, 435
- Sperry, Roger, 19, 50–51, 57, 127, 143–146, 148–149, 153, 159, 435, 437
- Strong emergence, 15, 158–160, 176, 184n2, 185n6–n7
- Supervenience, 3, 10, 14, 69, 81, 112, 115, 125n15, 125n17, 125n19, 153n35, 214, 337, 411, 420, 420n1, 421n2–n4, 422n13, 429, 441, 443n4. *See also* Consciousness; Downward causation; Irreducibility; Reductionism
causal, 78–79
and downward causation, 115–118, 120–121, 159, 340–341
etiology of, 94–96
global, 412–413, 417, 419, 422n11, 431–432
local, 412–413, 417
logical/conceptual, 412–419, 422n9, 423n16–n17
mereological, 130, 186n19
natural, 412–413, 415–417, 422n10–n11
and physics, 121–123
strong, 93–94, 118, 432
van Cleve definition, 90–91
- Swinney, Harry L., 382–384
- Systems theory. *See also* Dynamical systems
dynamical, 155, 211, 278, 283, 342, 382
general, 211, 251–252, 258n5
- Theory of everything, the, 210–211, 213, 250–263, 265
- Theory reductionism. *See* Reductionism, theory
- Thompson, F., 420n1, 430–431, 444n5
- Token physicalism. *See* Physicalism, token
- Trans-ordinal laws, 42–47, 56n39, 87–88, 93–94. *See also* Intra-ordinal laws
emergent, 43, 45–46, 88
- Type physicalism. *See* Physicalism, type
- Underivability of emergent phenomena, 160–170, 172, 216. *See also* Non-obviousness of emergent phenomena; Novelty of emergent phenomena; Unexplainability of emergent phenomena; Unpredictability of emergent phenomena
- Unexplainability of emergent phenomena, 11, 64, 141, 209. *See also* Non-obviousness of emergent phenomena; Novelty of emergent phenomena; Underivability of emergent phenomena; Unpredictability of emergent phenomena

- Unpredictability of emergent phenomena, 3, 10–11, 15–16, 55, 65–66, 131–132, 141, 210, 342. *See also* Non-obviousness of emergent phenomena; Novelty of emergent phenomena; Underivability of emergent phenomena; Unexplainability of emergent phenomena
and chaos theory, 270, 376, 380
- van Cleve, James, 56n38, 81, 90–95, 422. *See also* Supervenience, van Cleve definition
- Vitalism, 32, 47, 52n9
biological, 88, 249, 352, 434, 436
emergent, 47
neo-, 65, 127–128
substantial, 47
- Weak emergence, 15–16, 155, 157, 159–164, 174–175, 177–184, 185n6–n7, 185n9, 186n16–n19, 250