
Conflicts of Conscience in Health Care

Basic Bioethics

Glenn McGee and Arthur Caplan, editors

Peter A. Ubel, *Pricing Life: Why It's Time for Health Care Rationing*

Mark G. Kuczewski and Ronald Polansky, eds., *Bioethics: Ancient Themes in Contemporary Issues*

Suzanne Holland, Karen Lebacqz, and Laurie Zoloth, eds., *The Human Embryonic Stem Cell Debate: Science, Ethics, and Public Policy*

Gita Sen, Asha George, and Pirooska Östlin, eds., *Engendering International Health: The Challenge of Equity*

Carolyn McLeod, *Self-Trust and Reproductive Autonomy*

Lenny Moss, *What Genes Can't Do*

Jonathan D. Moreno, ed., *In the Wake of Terror: Medicine and Morality in a Time of Crisis*

Glenn McGee, ed., *Pragmatic Bioethics*, 2d edition

Timothy F. Murphy, *Case Studies in Biomedical Research Ethics*

Mark A. Rothstein, ed., *Genetics and Life Insurance: Medical Underwriting and Social Policy*

Kenneth A. Richman, *Ethics and the Metaphysics of Medicine: Reflections on Health and Beneficence*

David Lazer, ed., *DNA and the Criminal Justice System: The Technology of Justice*

Harold W. Baillie and Timothy K. Casey, eds., *Is Human Nature Obsolete? Genetics, Bioengineering, and the Future of the Human Condition*

Robert H. Blank and Janna C. Merrick, eds., *End-of-Life Decision Making: A Cross-National Study*

Norman L. Cantor, *Making Medical Decisions for the Profoundly Mentally Disabled*

Margrit Shildrick and Roxanne Mykitiuk, eds., *Ethics of the Body: Post-Conventional Challenges*

Alfred I. Tauber, *Patient Autonomy and the Ethics of Responsibility*

David H. Brendel, *Healing Psychiatry: Bridging the Science/Humanism Divide*

Jonathan Baron, *Against Bioethics*

Michael L. Gross, *Bioethics and Armed Conflict: Moral Dilemmas of Medicine and War*

Karen F. Greif and Jon F. Merz, *Current Controversies in the Biological Sciences: Case Studies of Policy Challenges from New Technologies*

Deborah Blizzard, *Looking Within: A Sociocultural Examination of Fetoscopy*

Ronald Cole-Turner, ed., *Design and Destiny: Jewish and Christian Perspectives on Human Germline Modification*

Holly Fernandez Lynch, *Conflicts of Conscience in Health Care: An Institutional Compromise*

Conflicts of Conscience in Health Care

An Institutional Compromise

Holly Fernandez Lynch

The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England

© 2008 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information about special quantity discounts, please e-mail special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu

This book was set in Sabon on 3B2 by Asco Typesetters, Hong Kong.
Printed on recycled paper and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Lynch, Holly Fernandez.

Conflicts of conscience in health care : an institutional compromise / by Holly Fernandez Lynch.

p. ; cm. — (Basic bioethics)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-12305-1 (hardcover : alk. paper)

1. Refusal to treat—Moral and ethical aspects—United States. 2. Physician and patient—Moral and ethical aspects—United States. 3. Physicians—Professional ethics—United States. 4. Medical laws and legislation—United States.

5. Conscience—United States. 6. Medical ethics—United States. I. Title.

II. Series.

[DNLM: 1. Ethics, Medical—United States. 2. Refusal to Treat—ethics—United States. 3. Conscience—United States. 4. Health Facilities—United States.

5. Health Services Accessibility—United States. 6. Refusal to Treat—legislation & jurisprudence—United States. W 50 L987c 2008]

R727.36.L96 2008

174.2—dc22

2008005529

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Index

- Abandonment (by physician). *See* Doctor-patient relationship
- Abortion, 2, 7, 19–20, 23, 25, 29, 30, 36–38, 39, 40, 53–57, 59, 64, 66, 69, 79, 83–85, 91–92, 94, 96, 106, 107, 110, 119–120, 122, 123, 127–130, 132, 137–138, 142, 148–149, 151–153, 158, 165, 167, 169, 172–173, 179, 180, 187, 190, 198, 201, 204–206, 220, 226–227, 234, 244, 247–248, 270n66, 271n80, 289n29, 298n23, 300n50. *See also* Access to care
- Harris v. McRae*, 187, 287n5
- Roe v. Wade*, xi, 19–20, 22, 37
- role in conscience clause debate, 19–20, 37–38, 83, 128–130, 131–132, 172–173
- selective reduction, 37, 122
- sex selection, 119–120, 127–128
- Access to care (geographic). *See also* Affordability of care; Calibration of supply and demand; Last doctor in town; Referral
- access problems *not* associated with conscientious refusal, 70–72, 169, 174, 189–191, 243, 247
- difference from inconvenience, 99–100, 104, 201, 213, 242–243
- geographic boundaries, 141, 165–178, 191–192, 208–212, 226, 251–252 (*see also* Antitrust law, Certificate of need, Health professional shortage areas)
- market failures (*see* Calibration of supply and demand; Last doctor in town; Supply)
- reasonable access, 14, 99–100, 117, 165, 166–168, 172–174, 177, 191–192, 195, 200, 213, 217, 224, 233, 251–252, 300n46
- role in conscience clause debate, xiii–xiv, 2, 8, 10, 12, 24, 33, 62, 68–69, 71–72, 75, 79–80, 87, 89, 97, 99–101, 104, 119, 141, 155, 162, 165–166, 172, 193, 207, 213–214, 245, 247, 250
- rural areas, 8, 72, 74, 181, 189–190, 191, 300n52–53
- travel concerns, 117, 168, 173, 176–177, 186, 190, 199, 208, 224, 243, 299n42, 200n46, 306n37 (*see also* Emergency care, emotional factors)
- travel patterns, 166–168, 170–172, 175, 229n27, 299n27
- Access to Legal Pharmaceuticals Act, 103, 306n35. *See also* Pharmacists
- Adams, Karen E., 197–198
- Administrative law. *See also* Counter-majoritarian protection; Fair process
- arbitrary and capricious standard, 139, 212–213 (*see also* Licensing boards, judicial review)

- Administrative law (cont.)
 delegation of authority, 134, 136, 177–178, 212, 290n43–44
 involvement of stakeholders, 136–139, 168, 178, 184, 202, 228, 235
 notice-and-comment rulemaking, 138–141, 168, 178, 211–212, 228, 235, 250, 253, 254
- Affordability of care, 71–72, 133, 177, 243, 278n88. *See also* Access to care; Insurance
- Allied health professionals. *See* Pharmacists
- American Bar Association (ABA), 232
- American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists (ACOG), 55, 64, 96, 137, 232, 274n35, 280n21, 313n82
- American College of Surgeons, 186
- American Medical Association (AMA), 4, 26, 44, 50, 55, 108, 137, 154, 205, 216, 219, 223, 232, 262n8, 266–267n33, 294n25, 295n34, 311n56. *See also* Professional ethics
- American Society for Reproductive Medicine (ASRM), 157, 288n15
- Antitrust law, 169–175. *See also*
 Access to care, geographic boundaries; Access to care, travel patterns
 cellophane fallacy, 172–174
 critical loss test, 171
 direct competitor test, 170–171
 elasticity of demand, 169, 173
 Elzinga-Hogarty test, 171, 298n18
 geographic market, 169–174
 migration due to price, 171, 174
 patient origin data, 170
 product/service market, 169
U.S. v. E.I. DuPont De Nemours, 173
- Apolitical action. *See* Monopoly power, abuse of
- Apotemnophilia, 131, 133
- Aquinas, Thomas, 225. *See also* Double effect
- “Ashley” treatment (pubertal suppression), 120
- Assisted reproduction, 5–6, 37, 120–123, 156–157, 264n12, 287n7, 288n12, 288n15. *See also* Benitez, Lupita; Homosexual parents
- Autonomy. *See also* Doctor-patient relationship; Informed consent; Medical professionalism; Paternalism; Professionalism, generally; Vulnerability movement, 21–22, 45
 of patient, 5, 7, 8, 21–22, 45, 62, 67–68, 83, 87, 125–126, 127, 142, 196–198, 203, 219, 222, 223, 238–239
 of physician, xiv, 5, 7, 21–23, 44, 47–48, 50, 61, 62, 63, 67–68, 72, 101, 196–199, 216
- Avner, Dennis (“Catman”), 120–121. *See also* Cosmetic surgery
- Beauchamp, Thomas, 9
- Benitez, Lupita, 25, 157–159. *See also* Discrimination; Homosexual parents
- Bloodless surgery. *See* Jehovah’s Witnesses
- Blustein, Jeffrey, 63–64, 66
- “Brain drain,” 184–185, 189. *See also* Calibration of supply and demand; Supply
- Brophy v. New England Sinai Hospital, Inc.* *See* Conscientious refusal; End-of-life issues
- Calibration of supply and demand, 14, 89, 117, 141, 165, 178–181, 189–192, 195–196, 252. *See also* Access to care; Demand; Last doctor in town; Licensing boards, new responsibilities; Medical schools; Supply

- benchmarking, 191–192
- failure (*see* Last doctor in town; Licensing boards, accountability to patients)
- foreign medical graduates, 184–185 (*see also* “Brain drain”)
- funding, 246–247, 251 (*see also* Conscientious refusal, penalization of)
- incentives, 179, 181–184, 186, 187–188, 302n77–79 (*see also* Free exercise clause)
- telemedicine, 185–186
- traveling physicians, 186
- unacceptable methods, 182–184 (*see also* Conscientious refusal, exclusion of conscientious refusers from profession)
- California, 25, 36, 103, 146, 156, 157–159
- Canada, 127–128
- Canterbury v. Spence*. *See* Informed consent
- Catholic Charities of the Diocese of Albany v. Serio*. *See* Free exercise clause
- Certificate of need, 168, 174–176. *See also* Access to care, geographic boundaries
- Charo, R. Alta, 73, 108, 152–153
- Childress, James, 9, 200
- Church Amendment. *See* Conscience clauses
- Code of Medical Ethics. *See* American Medical Association; Professional ethics
- Complicity (moral), 66, 91–92, 107, 111, 222–223, 229, 231, 232–235, 312n64. *See also* Conscience
- Conflicts of conscience. *See also* Autonomy; Conscience; Conscience clauses; Conscientious refusal; Last doctor in town; Medical professionalism, primacy principle; Secularization
- compromise, importance of, xi, 7, 9–14, 24, 38, 42, 63, 75, 80, 100–101, 104, 107–108, 111–113, 119, 129, 152, 193, 205, 213–214, 219, 228, 240–241, 245, 247, 255 (*see also* Licensing boards)
- institutional solutions to, 10–12, 73–75, 79–80, 100–113, 208, 286n38, 286n40 (*see also* Licensing boards; Medical professionalism, group obligations versus individual obligations)
- relationship to medical technology, 22, 25–26, 28, 38, 46, 53
- Congress, 20, 134, 139, 187, 230, 268n45
- Conscience. *See also* Autonomy; Conflicts of conscience; Conscience clauses; Conscientious refusal
- definition of, xii, 34–37, 160, 270n64, 293n13, 297n57
- institutional conscience, xiii, 20, 31, 105, 106–107, 111, 175, 285n27–29
- professional conscience (*see* Professional ethics)
- protection of (*see* Conscience clauses)
- relation to personal integrity, xiv, 6, 9, 10, 13, 23, 35–36, 48, 51, 57, 61, 63, 65–67, 75, 80, 92, 147, 149, 161, 180, 196–198, 217, 224, 236–237, 239, 250, 266n22, 297n57
- religious versus secular, 33–34, 66–67, 148–149, 265n16, 266n24, 270n63 (*see also* Draft; Free exercise clause)
- right of (*see* Free exercise clause; Rights, of physicians)
- value in medicine (*see* Conscience clauses, value to society; Counsel of restraint; Moral diversity; Moral uncertainty)
- Conscience clauses. *See also* Autonomy; Conflicts of conscience; Conscience;

- Conscience clauses (cont.)
 Conscientious refusal; Medical professionalism
 Church Amendment, 20, 27, 106, 265n5
 constitutional permissibility, 27, 32–33, 271n80, 287n5 (*see also* Free exercise clause)
 definition of, 1, 7
 historical background, 13, 19–23, 65
 not constitutionally required, 32–33, 149, 269n57 (*see also* Free exercise clause; Licensing boards, power to require services as condition of licensure)
 opposition to, 7–8, 23, 57–65, 80, 241–245
 pharmacists, application to (*see* Pharmacists)
 scope of, 1–2, 7, 20, 27, 33–34, 94, 106–107, 162, 220, 247–249, 285n27–29
 state laws, 3, 20, 27, 42, 54, 69, 94, 101–103, 106–107, 146, 154, 158, 220, 223–224, 247–249
 support for, 7–8, 65–70, 80–87
 value to physicians, 10, 13, 27–33, 63, 66, 74, 80–81, 86–87, 250, 255–256 (*see also* Conscience, relation to personal integrity)
 value to society, xi, 10, 13, 57, 65, 80–82, 85–86, 180, 207, 250, 255–256 (*see also* Counsel of restraint; Moral diversity; Moral uncertainty)
- Conscientious refusal. *See also*
 Autonomy; Conflict of Conscience; Conscience; Conscience clauses; Medical professionalism, baseline duties
 abuse of (*see* Monopoly power, abuse of)
 empirical data, 2, 26, 104, 156–157, 172–173
 exclusion of conscientious refusers from profession, 11, 52, 57, 58, 63–64, 66, 75, 80, 87, 91, 95, 99, 101, 108, 110–111, 183, 216, 256 (*see also* Conscience clauses, value to society; Counsel of restraint; Moral diversity; Moral uncertainty; Supply)
 litigation, 25, 27–28, 267n38, 268n39, 282n48
Brophy v. New England Sinai Hospital, Inc., 135–136, 267n38
Davis v. U.S., 25 (*see also* Jehovah's Witnesses)
Grace Plaza of Great Neck, Inc. v. Elbaum, 40, 106
Gray v. Romeo, 105–106
Harbeson v. Parke-Davis, Inc., 25
Jobes, In re, 105, 219
North Coast Women's Care Medical Group (*see* Benitez, Lupita)
Requena, In re, 104–105, 167–168, 186, 242
Shelton v. University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey, 59
Stormans, Inc. v. Selecky, 30, 102–103, 269n49
Thomas v. Abdul-Malek, 25, 220
Vandersand v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc., 102
Walker v. Pierce, 25, 147
 penalization of, 2, 14, 57, 58, 60, 63, 95, 101, 108, 145, 159, 179–180, 195, 203–204, 206–207, 214, 215–216, 246, 253, 306n30 (*see also* Last doctor in town; Medical professionalism, baseline duties; Supply)
 permissible circumstances (limitations on), 6–7, 14, 202–203 (*see also* Last doctor in town; Medical professionalism, baseline duties)
 permissible and impermissible reasons
 judgment, 23–24, 151
 objection to patient, 149–151, 152, 153–159 (*see also* Discrimination)

- objection to service, 149–153
 sincerity, 159–162, 251, 296n51
 (see also Draft)
 validity, 147–159, 161, 163, 251
 by public servants, 59–60 (see also
 State action)
Endres v. Indiana State Police, 59–
 60
Rodriguez v. City of Chicago, 59
*Shelton v. University of Medicine &
 Dentistry of New Jersey*, 59
 reason-giving (explanation), 222,
 236–239, 296n51
 accuracy of reasons, 5, 237
 consistency, 6, 154, 156, 161, 237
 dialogue, 237–239
 proselytizing, 238
 self-evaluation, 236–237
*Conservatorship of Morrison v.
 Abramovice*. See Doctor-patient
 relationship
 Contraceptives, 2, 20, 23, 31, 40, 53,
 65, 96, 101–104, 107, 110, 125,
 132, 148, 152, 198, 243–244,
 248, 284n10. See also Morning-
 after pill; Natural family planning;
 Pharmacists
 Contract. See Doctor-patient
 relationship
 Cosmetic surgery, 35, 120–121, 131,
 132, 226. See also Avner, Dennis
 Council on Graduate Medical
 Education, 182–183, 185
 Counsel of restraint, xiv, 6, 8, 10, 80–
 87, 127, 134, 206, 255–256. See
 also Conscience clauses, value to
 society; Moral expertise; Moral
 uncertainty
 Counter-majoritarian protection, 66,
 133, 137, 139–140, 208. See also
 Administrative law, notice-and-
 comment rulemaking; Fair process
 Daar, Judith, 146
 Daniels, Norman, 48–51, 54, 72, 73,
 130–131, 137, 140
 Davis, John K., 8, 135
Davis v. U.S. See Conscientious
 refusal
 Death with Dignity Act, 3, 263n9. See
 also End-of-life issues; Oregon
 Delaware, 103
 Demand (for medical services), 110,
 141, 190, 250–251. See also
 Access to care; Calibration of
 supply and demand; Supply
 measurement of, 109, 118–119,
 141
 medical needs (versus preferences),
 130–133, 167–168, 290n37
 setting limits on satisfaction of
 demand, 119–134, 137–143, 250–
 251 (see also Administrative law;
 Fair process; Licensing boards;
 Mill, John Stuart; Monopoly
 power; Moral expertise; Moral
 uncertainty; Professional ethics;
 Standard of care)
 legal services, 123–124, 134, 137
 medical expertise, 5, 124–126, 137,
 142, 202–203, 288n15, 293n14,
 295n39
 moral limits, 120–123, 127–140,
 142
 Department of Health and Human
 Services (HHS), 176, 232. See
 also Health professional shortage
 area
 Dickens, Bernard M., 113, 123
 Dignitary harm (to patient), 148,
 151–152, 154, 167. See also
 Conscientious refusal;
 Discrimination
 Discrimination. See also Conscientious
 refusal, permissible and
 impermissible reasons; Doctor-
 patient relationship, matching;
 Medical professionalism, baseline
 duties
 discriminatory effect (incidental),
 129, 152–153
 disincentives, 159

- Discrimination (cont.)
 by doctors, 8, 14, 32, 50, 149–159, 163, 253, 254, 266–267n33, 294n23, 294n25, 295n34–35
 by employers (*see* Employment)
 invidious discrimination, 149–150, 153–159, 163, 215, 247, 275n49
 by patients, 92–93, 282n45, 294n22
- Doctor-patient relationship. *See also* Autonomy; Medical professionalism
 generally, 45–46, 71, 90, 155, 242–243
 legal issues (*e.g.*, abandonment, creation and termination of relationship), 25–28, 32, 41, 230–231, 235, 271n87, 310n39
Conservatorship of Morrison v. Abramovice, 232
Leach v. Drummond Medical Group, 200
Matthies v. Mastro Monaco, 25
Payton v. Weaver, 36–37
Walker v. Pierce, 25, 147
- matching (of doctor and patient, based on moral values), 13, 63, 87–93, 95–97, 151–152, 175, 217–218, 256, 281n30 (*see also* Discrimination)
 accommodation of physicians, 93–95 (*see also* Employment)
 contracting, negotiating, and promise-keeping, 10, 13, 46, 65, 88–90, 97, 241–242, 281n34
 ensuring matches (*see* Calibration of supply and demand; Licensing boards)
 examples of, 95–97
 gaps (matching not feasible), 97, 217
 patient preferences, 91–93, 168
 trust, 63, 90–92, 155
 vulnerable patient (*see* Vulnerability)
- Double effect (doctrine of), 224–226, 309n38. *See also* Emergency care
- Draft (military), 149, 154–155, 160–161, 197, 200. *See also* Conscientious refusal
U.S. v. Seeger, 160, 293n13
Welsh v. U.S., 160
- Dresser, Rebecca, 73
- Dudzinski, Denise, 47
- Duties, 42. *See also* Rights
 of patients, 216–217, 218, 229, 230
 of physicians (*see* Medical professionalism)
 of profession (*see* Medical professionalism)
- Emergency care, 7, 44, 59, 133, 167, 198, 217, 223–228. *See also* Access to care; Double effect; Last doctor in town; Medical professionalism, baseline duties; Vulnerability
 definition of emergency, 133, 224, 226–228 (*see also* Morning-after pill)
 duty to rescue, 41, 70–71, 226
 ethical obligations, 61, 69, 207, 215, 223–224, 226, 228, 235, 239, 254
 emotional factors, 167, 173, 294n17
 EMTALA, 40–41, 223, 226
 legal obligations, 40–41, 223–224, 226, 248, 271–272n87
 transfer, 224 (*see also* Referral)
- Employment. *See also* Conscientious refusal; Licensing boards; Medical schools; Pharmacists; Rights
 accommodation of employee
 conscience, 27, 93–95, 101–104, 107–108, 248, 253, 286n37
 case law, 27, 268n39, 282n48
Shelton v. University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey, 59
Stormans, Inc. v. Selecky, 30, 102–103, 269n49
 Title VII, 27, 28, 42, 94, 103, 268n39, 283n49
 unique position of physicians, xii–xiii, 27–28, 95, 107–108, 283n52

- Employment Division v. Smith*. See Free exercise clause
- End-of-life issues, 3–4, 27, 37–38, 40, 46, 83, 85, 88, 95, 104–106, 107, 124, 131, 146, 167, 219, 225, 263n8, 263n9, 267n38, 280n22. See also Futility
- Brophy v. New England Sinai Hospital, Inc.*, 135–136, 267n38
- Grace Plaza of Great Neck, Inc. v. Elbaum*, 40, 106
- Gray v. Romeo*, 105–106
- Jobes, In re*, 105, 219
- Requena, In re*, 104–105, 167–168, 186, 242
- Endres v. Indiana State Police*. See Conscientious refusal, by public servants
- Establishment clause (of First Amendment), 32–33
- Euthanasia. See End-of-life issues
- Execution, physician participation in, 38, 82
- Fair process, 137–140, 142–143, 212–213. See also Administrative law
- Female circumcision (genital mutilation), 83, 85, 124, 280n21. See also Mill, John Stuart, harm principle; Moral uncertainty
- Fenton, Elizabeth, 166, 198
- First Amendment. See Establishment clause; Free exercise clause
- Fleischman, Alan R., 63–64, 66
- Free exercise clause (of First Amendment), 29–32, 158–159, 187–188, 268–269n45, 269n57, 302n77. See also Benitez, Lupita; Conscience; Conscientious refusal; Employment; Licensing boards, power to require services as condition of licensure; Pharmacists; Rights
- case law
- Catholic Charities of the Diocese of Albany v. Serio*, 31
- Employment Division v. Smith*, 30, 302n77
- Johnson v. Robison*, 187–188 (see also Calibration of supply and demand, incentives)
- St. Agnes Hospital v. Riddick*, 32, 269n52
- Stormans, Inc. v. Selecky*, 30–31, 102–103, 269n49
- Summers, In re*, 32
- government interest, 30
- neutral law of general applicability, 30–32
- O’Callaghan, Nora, 29–32, 269n46
- voluntary choice, 31–32, 269n52 (see also Medical professionalism, consent model)
- Free-riding, 109–111, 179–180, 300n50
- Fried, Charles, 67
- Futility (medical), 38, 119, 126, 138, 146. See also End-of-life issues
- “Gag” clauses, 223. See also Informed consent; Insurers
- Germany, 152
- Goodin, Robert, 70–73, 112, 199, 278n89
- Grace Plaza of Great Neck, Inc. v. Elbaum*. See Conscientious refusal; End-of-life issues
- Gray v. Romeo*. See Conscientious refusal; End-of-life issues
- Greenawalt, Kent, 35, 148
- Griswold v. Connecticut*, 40. See also Contraceptives
- Harbeson v. Parke-Davis, Inc.* See Conscientious refusal; Informed consent
- Harm, to self and others. See Mill, John Stuart
- Harris v. McRae*. See Abortion
- Health Professional Shortage Area (HPSA), 176–177, 182. See also Access to care, geographic boundaries

- HIV/AIDS, 29, 50. *See also* Medical professionalism, epidemics
- Homosexual parents, 156–159, 295n38. *See also* Benitez, Lupita; Discrimination
- HPV vaccine, 4–5
- Hutchins, Kathleen, 227
- Hyde Amendment, 187. *See also* Abortion
- Illinois, 20, 27, 101–102, 249, 284n10
- Informed Consent, 26, 41, 82, 219–223, 239, 254, 308n25. *See also* Autonomy; Medical professionalism, baseline duties; Vulnerability
Canterbury v. Spence, 219
Harbeson v. Parke-Davis, Inc., 25
Thomas v. Abdul-Malek, 25, 220
- Insurance, 31, 45, 72, 90, 110, 154, 158, 223, 243, 286n34. *See also* Affordability of care; Insurers
- Insurers, 21, 24–25, 109–111, 118, 133, 138, 153, 243, 286n34
- Jackson v. Metro. Edison Co.* *See* State action
- Japan, 185–186
- Jehovah's Witnesses, 25, 38, 125, 142, 151. *See also* Autonomy; Moral expertise; Professional ethics
- Jobes, In re.* *See* Conscientious refusal; End-of-life care
- Johnson v. Robison.* *See* Free exercise clause
- Last Doctor in Town. *See also* Access to care; Calibration of supply and demand; Emergencies; Licensing boards; Medical professionalism, group obligations versus individual obligations; Supply; Vulnerability
actual versus artificial, 179, 200
disincentives, 101, 204–206, 214, 228, 269n47 (*see also* Conscientious refusal, penalization of)
duties, 68, 73–74, 79, 196–201, 203, 207, 214, 224–228, 254, 304n6
enforcement of duties, 14, 203–204, 207, 214, 228
grounds for refusal, 200–203, 304n19
lottery, 200 (*see also* Draft)
market failure, 178–179, 181, 184, 193
patient compensation (*see* Licensing boards, accountability to patients)
Leach v. Drummond Medical Group. *See* Doctor-patient relationship
Legal professionalism, 61–62, 63, 67–69, 81–82, 197, 238–239, 275–276n54, 276n55, 276n62
Lesnick, Howard, 81, 82, 238–239
Levinson, Sanford, 81
Licensing boards. *See also* Conflicts of conscience; Conscientious refusal; Medical professionalism, group obligations versus individual obligations; Pharmacists
accountability to patients, 14, 140, 196, 207–214, 218, 252 (*see also* Last doctor in town)
criticisms of (as institutional solution), 241–246
fines (monetary awards), 208, 210–212, 252, 306n37
flexibility of (as institutional solution), 245, 249
funding (*see* Calibration of supply and demand)
gaps in accountability, 209–210, 214, 306n34
as institutional solution, 11, 108, 111–113, 191, 192, 230, 250, 256–57, 314n8
judicial review, 212–213
models, 11, 101–104, 104–106

- new responsibilities, 11, 117–118, 141–143, 162–163, 165–166, 169, 178–179, 191–193, 196, 229, 246, 250–252 (*see also* Calibration of supply and demand)
- political feasibility, 11–13, 241, 247
- power to require services as condition of licensure, 28–33, 112, 204 (*see also* Conscience clauses, not constitutionally required; Free exercise clause)
- Lomasky, Loren, 166, 198
- Malpractice, 25, 27, 181–182, 204, 220, 309n28
- Matthies v. Mastromonaco*. *See* Doctor-patient relationship
- May, Thomas, 155
- Medicaid/Medicare, 40–41, 118, 133, 147, 182, 187, 230
- Medical professionalism
- baseline duties, 7, 9, 13–14, 29, 49, 51, 63–65, 163, 215, 217, 239–240, 246, 253–254 (*see also* Conscientious refusal, reason-giving; Discrimination; Emergencies; Informed consent; Last doctor in town; Notice; Referral)
 - consent model (voluntary commitment), 8, 48–57, 197–198
 - contracting (*see* Doctor-patient relationship, matching)
 - epidemics, 48, 50–51, 195–196, 216–217
 - gatekeeping power (*see* Monopoly power; Vulnerability)
 - group obligations versus individual obligations, 10, 13, 42, 59–60, 73–75, 79–80, 107, 111–112, 119–120, 199–200, 206, 224 (*see also* Last doctor in town; Licensing boards, as institutional solution)
 - patient-centric model, 57–65, 275n41 (*see also* Autonomy, of patient; Conscientious refusal, opposition to)
 - physician-centric model, 65–70 (*see also* Autonomy, of physician; Conscience; Conscientious refusal, support of)
 - primacy of patients (relationship to physician self-interest), 8, 43–48, 74–75, 236, 273n5 (*see also* Doctor-patient relationship)
 - specialization, 25, 53, 56, 57, 64–65, 72, 80, 87–88, 95, 97, 180, 188, 253, 276n66 (*see also* Autonomy, of physician; Doctor-patient relationship, matching; Moral diversity; Professionalism, generally)
- Medical schools. *See also* Calibration of supply and demand
- acceptance of conscientious refusal by students, 183–184, 205 (*see also* Conscientious refusal, exclusion of conscientious refusers from profession; Moral diversity)
 - admissions, 182–184, 301n61 (*see also* Doctor-patient relationship, matching; Moral diversity)
 - clinical programs, 184
- Meyers, Christopher, 179, 296n51
- Mill, John Stuart
- harm principle, 82–84, 127–130, 289n24, 289n26
 - moral debate, 84–87, 93, 139–140, 237–239 (*see also* Moral diversity; Moral uncertainty)
- Mississippi, 20, 154, 220, 249
- Monopoly power. *See also* Conscience clauses; Conscientious refusal; Duties; Last doctor in town; Medical professionalism; Pharmacists; Vulnerability
- abuse of, 12, 23–24, 68–70, 74, 86, 129, 132, 198–199, 201, 221, 224, 250, 266n22, 283–284n1
 - expanding to other professions, 79, 186–187, 190–191

- Monopoly power (cont.)
of physicians, 6, 10, 13, 70–75, 86, 111, 120, 132, 197, 199, 250
- Moose Lodge No. 107 v. Irvis*. *See* State action
- Moral diversity, 22, 80–82, 129, 163, 182, 206, 246. *See also* Conscientious refusal, value to society; Counsel of restraint; Doctor-patient relationship, matching; Mill, John Stuart; Moral uncertainty
- Moral expertise, 134–136, 202–203, 291n45, 291n50. *See also* Professional ethics
- Moral risk, 51–55, 61, 197, 216, 238. *See also* Conscience; Conscientious refusal; Medical professionalism
- Moral uncertainty, 84–86, 123, 129, 148, 151, 201–203, 256, 280n17, 280n21. *See also* Conscience clauses, value to society; Counsel of restraint; Mill, John Stuart; Moral diversity
- Morning-after pill (Plan B), 2, 31, 101, 131–133, 152, 227, 237, 313n74. *See also* Abortion; Contraceptives; Emergency care; Pharmacists
- Natural family planning, 96, 125. *See also* Contraceptives; Tepeyac Family Center; Pope Paul VI Institute
- Nazi doctors, 82
- Negligence, 29, 209. *See also* Malpractice
- New Jersey, 25, 29, 59, 104, 105
- New York, 31, 103, 175
- North Coast Women's Care Medical Group, Inc.* *See* Benitez, Lupita
- Notice (of conscientious refusal), 4–5, 90, 217–219, 254. *See also* Medical professionalism, baseline duties
- Notice-and-comment rulemaking. *See* Administrative law; Fair process
- Objection. *See* Conscientious refusal
- Oregon, 3, 54, 103, 263n9. *See also* Death with Dignity Act
- Orentlicher, David, 88, 218, 281n30
- Palliative care. *See* End-of-life issues
- Paternalism, 5, 19, 21, 61, 135, 219, 223. *See also* Autonomy; Doctor-patient relationship; Moral expertise
- Payment (for medical services). *See* Affordability of care; Insurers
- Payton v. Weaver*. *See* Doctor-patient relationship
- Pellegrino, Edmund, 66–69, 91–92, 106, 196, 216, 231, 237
- Pennsylvania, 25, 175, 220, 227
- Pharmacists (and pharmacies), xii–xiii, 2, 11, 20, 24–25, 28, 30–31, 219, 20, 100–104, 107–108, 146, 152–153, 166, 168, 176, 186–187, 198–199, 210, 219, 249, 278n88, 284n9–10, 286n38, 289n8–10
- Physician-assisted suicide. *See* End-of-life issues
- Planned Parenthood of Minnesota v. Rounds*, 84. *See also* Abortion; Mill, John Stuart, moral debate
- Pluralism, 21, 22, 87, 135, 151. *See also* Conflicts of conscience; Moral diversity; Secularization
- Pope John Paul II, 1, 14, 283n1
- Pope Paul VI Institute for the Study of Human Reproduction, 96. *See also* Doctor-patient relationship, matching
- President's Commission for the Study of Ethical Problems in Medicine and Biomedical and Behavioral Research, 219, 231–232. *See also* Informed consent

- Professionalism, generally, 43, 81, 109–110, 133. *See also* Legal professionalism; Medical professionalism
- altruism, 47–48, 71
- challenges to traditional models, 45–47 (*see also* Doctor-patient relationship)
- competence (as prerequisite to duty), 204–206, 228
- contract with society, 43, 47, 49, 52, 54, 57, 58, 71, 75, 88–89, 123, 124, 136, 156, 207 (*see also* Monopoly power; Vulnerability)
- freedom of association, 26, 32, 35, 54, 67–68, 72, 153–154, 200, 271–272n87 (*see also* Discrimination; Doctor-patient relationship)
- Professional ethics, 4, 34, 53, 54–55, 134–137, 138, 149, 202–203, 221, 230, 288n15, 305n21. *See also* American Medical Association; Demand, setting limits; Moral expertise
- Racism. *See* Discrimination
- Referral. *See also* Complicity; Medical professionalism, baseline duties
- ethical obligations, 229–236, 254
- legal obligations, 41, 230–231, 233
- professional standards, 232–233
- role of licensing boards, 229–230, 233
- self-referral, 229–230 (*see also* Duties, of patients)
- Refusal. *See* Conscientious refusal
- Refusal clauses. *See* Conscience clauses
- Religion. *See* Conscience, religious versus secular; Discrimination; Free exercise clause; Secularization
- Requena, In re*. *See* Conscientious refusal; End-of-life care
- Rhodes, Rosamond, 62–63, 68
- Rights. *See also* Access to care; Conscience; Conscientious refusal; Duties; Free exercise clause; Medical professionalism
- legal, of doctors, 42, 65, 269n57
- legal, of patients, 19–20, 21, 39–41, 120, 155–156, 271n80, 287n5
- moral, 1, 7–8, 9, 39, 65, 67, 120, 155
- relationship to duties, 42
- role in conscience clause debate, 39–42
- as trumps, 39
- Rodriguez v. City of Chicago*. *See* Conscientious refusal, by public servants
- Roe v. Wade*. *See* Abortion
- Rural areas. *See* Access to care; Last doctor in town; Supply
- SARS, 195–196. *See also* Medical professionalism, epidemics
- Savulescu, Julian, 58–63, 134, 153, 275n41
- Secularization, 22–23, 66. *See also* Conflicts of conscience; Pluralism
- Selective Service. *See* Draft (military)
- Self harm. *See* Mill, John Stuart
- Shelton v. University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey*. *See* Conscientious refusal; Employment
- Sokol, Daniel, 216–217
- South Carolina, 173
- South Dakota, 84
- Specialization. *See* Medical professionalism
- St. Agnes Hospital v. Riddick*. *See* Free exercise clause
- Standard of care, 41, 138, 221, 292n60. *See also* Demand, setting limits; Professional ethics
- State action, 32–33
- Jackson v. Metro. Edison Co.*, 32
- Moose Lodge No. 107 v. Ivis*, 32
- Stem cells, 26, 38, 130, 274n33
- Sterilization, 7, 20, 65, 96, 106, 220, 222, 248. *See also* Church Amendment

- Stormans, Inc. v. Selecky.* See Conscientious refusal; Employment; Free exercise clause; Pharmacists
- Summers, In re.* See Free exercise clause
- Supply (of physicians), 251. See also Access to care, geographic boundaries; Calibration of supply and demand; Conscientious refusal; Demand; Last doctor in town; Licensing boards, new responsibilities; Medical schools maldistribution, 189, 196, 303n2 market failure, 178–182, 184, 189–193, 211 registry of willing physicians, 145–147, 162, 217, 218, 229–230, 251, 254 shortage, 172, 189–191, 196, 206, 208, 303–304n2–3
- Swartz, Martha, 20, 34–35, 38, 136–137
- Taylor v. St. Vincent's Hospital, 2.* See also Church Amendment; Sterilization
- Texas, 146, 181
- Tepeyac Family Center, 96. See also Doctor-patient relationship, matching
- Thomas v. Abdul-Malek.* See Conscientious refusal; Informed consent
- Torture, physician participation in, 38, 82
- Tuskegee syphilis study, 82
- U.S. v. E.I. DuPont De Nemours.* See Antitrust law
- U.S. v. Seeger.* See Draft (military)
- Vandersand v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.* See Conscientious refusal; Pharmacists
- Veatch, Robert, 13, 88–90, 97, 123, 136, 216, 233
- Vulnerability (of patients), 10, 68, 70, 73–74, 112, 120, 196–199, 217, 220–221, 223, 224, 226, 229, 233, 243–245, 278n89, 304n13. See also Monopoly power, abuse of
- Waldron, Jeremy, 39
- Walker v. Pierce.* See Conscientious refusal; Doctor-patient relationship
- Wardle, Lynn, 106
- Washington, 20, 25, 30, 102, 249, 278n88
- Washington, D.C., 189
- Welsh v. U.S.* See Draft (military)
- Willowbrook hepatitis study, 82
- Withholding/withdrawing medical care. See End-of-life issues; Futility
- Woods, Robert D., 179, 296n51
- World Health Organization (WHO), 192, 280n21, 303n84