
Conflicts of Conscience in Health Care

Basic Bioethics

Glenn McGee and Arthur Caplan, editors

Peter A. Ubel, *Pricing Life: Why It's Time for Health Care Rationing*

Mark G. Kuczewski and Ronald Polansky, eds., *Bioethics: Ancient Themes in Contemporary Issues*

Suzanne Holland, Karen Lebacqz, and Laurie Zoloth, eds., *The Human Embryonic Stem Cell Debate: Science, Ethics, and Public Policy*

Gita Sen, Asha George, and Pirooska Östlin, eds., *Engendering International Health: The Challenge of Equity*

Carolyn McLeod, *Self-Trust and Reproductive Autonomy*

Lenny Moss, *What Genes Can't Do*

Jonathan D. Moreno, ed., *In the Wake of Terror: Medicine and Morality in a Time of Crisis*

Glenn McGee, ed., *Pragmatic Bioethics*, 2d edition

Timothy F. Murphy, *Case Studies in Biomedical Research Ethics*

Mark A. Rothstein, ed., *Genetics and Life Insurance: Medical Underwriting and Social Policy*

Kenneth A. Richman, *Ethics and the Metaphysics of Medicine: Reflections on Health and Beneficence*

David Lazer, ed., *DNA and the Criminal Justice System: The Technology of Justice*

Harold W. Baillie and Timothy K. Casey, eds., *Is Human Nature Obsolete? Genetics, Bioengineering, and the Future of the Human Condition*

Robert H. Blank and Janna C. Merrick, eds., *End-of-Life Decision Making: A Cross-National Study*

Norman L. Cantor, *Making Medical Decisions for the Profoundly Mentally Disabled*

Margrit Shildrick and Roxanne Mykitiuk, eds., *Ethics of the Body: Post-Conventional Challenges*

Alfred I. Tauber, *Patient Autonomy and the Ethics of Responsibility*

David H. Brendel, *Healing Psychiatry: Bridging the Science/Humanism Divide*

Jonathan Baron, *Against Bioethics*

Michael L. Gross, *Bioethics and Armed Conflict: Moral Dilemmas of Medicine and War*

Karen F. Greif and Jon F. Merz, *Current Controversies in the Biological Sciences: Case Studies of Policy Challenges from New Technologies*

Deborah Blizzard, *Looking Within: A Sociocultural Examination of Fetoscopy*

Ronald Cole-Turner, ed., *Design and Destiny: Jewish and Christian Perspectives on Human Germline Modification*

Holly Fernandez Lynch, *Conflicts of Conscience in Health Care: An Institutional Compromise*

Conflicts of Conscience in Health Care

An Institutional Compromise

Holly Fernandez Lynch

The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England

© 2008 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information about special quantity discounts, please e-mail special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu

This book was set in Sabon on 3B2 by Asco Typesetters, Hong Kong.
Printed on recycled paper and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Lynch, Holly Fernandez.

Conflicts of conscience in health care : an institutional compromise / by Holly Fernandez Lynch.

p. ; cm. — (Basic bioethics)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-12305-1 (hardcover : alk. paper)

1. Refusal to treat—Moral and ethical aspects—United States. 2. Physician and patient—Moral and ethical aspects—United States. 3. Physicians—Professional ethics—United States. 4. Medical laws and legislation—United States.

5. Conscience—United States. 6. Medical ethics—United States. I. Title.

II. Series.

[DNLM: 1. Ethics, Medical—United States. 2. Refusal to Treat—ethics—United States. 3. Conscience—United States. 4. Health Facilities—United States.

5. Health Services Accessibility—United States. 6. Refusal to Treat—legislation & jurisprudence—United States. W 50 L987c 2008]

R727.36.L96 2008

174.2—dc22

2008005529

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Acknowledgments

This project was undertaken while I was a member of the inaugural cohort of academic fellows at the Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology, and Bioethics at Harvard Law School. The Center aims to promote and support interdisciplinary scholarly research into important issues at the intersection of law and health policy and is committed to the neutral exploration of new ideas.

First, I must thank the Center's faculty director, Einer Elhauge, who encouraged me to pursue this idea and give it book-length treatment, offered insightful commentary on my arguments along the way, and patiently advised me throughout the publication process.

I am also hugely indebted to Glenn Cohen, my "fellow fellow," who offered incredibly helpful advice on this project since day one. Glenn is the epitome of what a scholar should be: intellectually curious, dedicated to getting things right, and extraordinarily generous with both his time and encouragement. This book would have suffered tremendously without him.

The arguments in this book were also shaped and improved by the keen and discerning comments of anonymous peer reviewers, as well as through conversations with Norman Daniels, Michelle Mello, Ben Roin, and Talha Syed. Additionally, I am thankful to participants in the Center's opening workshop, particularly Dan Brock and Frances Kamm, whose comments at that early stage stayed with me throughout the writing process, as well as to those who were willing to discuss my ideas over the dinners that followed the fall 2006 Health Law Policy and Bioethics workshops.

I am especially thankful to Hermes Fernandez, “a fine father and a fine lawyer,” for his assistance in reviewing and offering suggestions on the entire manuscript—all on an extremely tight deadline. He also did his absolute best to help me with writers’ angst, for which I am grateful beyond words. Thank you also to my incredible mother, husband, sister, brother, and friends for their unconditional support, encouragement, and attempts to keep me sane—even my loyal writing assistants/distractions, Bubba and Isis, did their part. I truly could not have done this without all of your help and I hope you know how deeply my appreciation runs.

Finally, thanks are owed to Kathy Paras, the Petrie-Flom Center’s tireless Program Administrator, for her words of encouragement and assistance with a wide variety of logistical matters, and to the fine editors at MIT Press.

The views expressed are solely those of the author and should not be attributed to Hogan & Hartson, LLP or its clients.