

Offshoring of American Jobs

What Response from
U.S. Economic Policy?

Jagdish Bhagwati and
Alan S. Blinder

The Alvin Hansen
Symposium on Public
Policy
Harvard University

*edited and with an
introduction by
Benjamin M. Friedman*

The MIT Press
Cambridge, Massachusetts
London, England

© 2009 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

For information about special quantity discounts, please email special_sales@mitpress.mit.edu

This book was set in Palatino by SNP Best-set Typesetter Ltd., Hong Kong. Printed and bound in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Alvin Hansen Symposium on Public Policy (2007 : Harvard University) Offshoring of American jobs : what response from U.S. economic policy? / Jagdish Bhagwati and Alan S. Blinder ; the Alvin Hansen Symposium on Public Policy, Harvard University ; edited and with an introduction by Benjamin M. Friedman.

p. cm. — (Alvin Hansen Symposium on Public Policy at Harvard University)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-262-01332-1 (hbk. : alk. paper) 1. Offshore outsourcing—United States. 2. Labor market—United States. 3. Manpower policy—United States. 4. Free trade—United States. I. Bhagwati, Jagdish N., 1934– II. Blinder, Alan S. III. Friedman, Benjamin M. IV. Title.

HD2368.U6A48 2009

331.12'042—dc22

2009005943

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Index

- Accountants, 30, 42
Adjustment Assistance program.
 See Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA)
Advertising, 62, 64
AFL-CIO, 12, 14, 78
Against the Tide: An Intellectual History of Free Trade (Irwin), 72
Agriculture, 50, 80, 94, 104–105
Al-Ahram (Cairo newspaper), 1
Allocation, 5–6, 27. *See also*
 Reallocation
Alterman, Eric, 3
Alvin Hansen Symposium on
 Public Policy, xiii–xiv
American Economic Association, 81
American Prospect, The (journal), 4
Amiti, Mary, 74
Arab security companies, x
Arbitrage, 95
Artificial intelligence (AI), 33
Associated Press-IPSOS survey, 63
Atkinson, Robert D., 33
Automation, 4–5, 80
Automobile industry, xi, 98

Bananas, 25
Bankruptcy, 42

Banks, 20, 32, 67
Baumol, William, 110
 Bhagwati on, 2, 13–14, 17n6
 comparative advantage and, 83
 reallocation and, 77
 technology transfer and, 66
Baumol’s disease, 31, 34
Bernhard Harms Prize, 9
Bernstein, Aaron, 8
Bhagwati, Jagdish, xii, 22, 34
 Blinder and, 109–113, 115, 117–118
 China and, 8–10
 comparative advantage and, 26, 38
 Freeman and, 66–67, 103, 105–106
 free trade and, 1–17, 19
 imperfect competition and, 3–7, 13
 India and, 8–10
 Invisible Hand and, 5–7
 Irwin and, 71–72
 Kletzer and, 82–90
 Krugman and, 3, 8, 14, 16n1, 66, 103–105
 Lawrence and, 12, 15, 103, 105
 media and, 1–15, 105–107
 offshoring and, 10–15
 “polluter pay” principle and, 6–7

- Bhagwati, Jagdish (cont.)
 protectionism and, 1–10, 101, 107
 response of, 101–109
 rise of Japan and, 3–7
 slow growth and, 14–15
 unskilled labor and, 14–15
- Blanchard, Oliver Jean, 79
- Blinder, Alan S., xii, 2, 102–103
- Bhagwati and, 109–113, 115,
 117–118
 evidence for theories of, 73–74
- Freeman and, 30, 64–69, 109, 112,
 115, 119–120, 121n4, 121n6
- Irwin and, 71–81, 109–110,
 114–119
- Kletzer and, 82–90, 109, 111–112,
 119–120
- Krugman and, 110
- Lawrence and, 56n14, 91–99, 109–
 110, 114–119
 offshoring and, 10–12, 19–59 (*see*
also Offshoring)
- Paul Revere role of, 54, 91–92, 113
- Perot approach of, 72, 77, 110, 118
- policy recommendations of, 43–
 50, 77–81, 117–119
 protectionism and, 21, 25–27, 53,
 110–111
 shift in view of, 11–12
 teaching methods of, 111–112
- “Blue Collar Blues: Is Trade to
 Blame for Rising U.S. Income
 Inequality?” (Lawrence), 105
- Blue-collar workers, 42, 105
- Borjas, George, 103
- Boskin, Michael, 4
- Brainard, Lael, 12, 84, 95
- Brazil, 25
- Brookings Institution, 12
- Brown, Clair, 77
- Buffett, Warren, 68
- Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS),
 35, 62, 89
- Bush, George W., 19
- Bush, Jeb, 9
- Business cycles, 112
- Businessweek*, 4, 8
- Call centers, 10, 31
- Cambridge University, 7–8, 13
- Canada, 95
- Capital-labor ratio, 63
- Carpenters, 46, 48
- Chace, James, 106–107
- Chaplin, Charlie, 53
- Charlie Rose* (TV show), 10
- Charter schools, 45
- China, ix, 17n6, 21, 53, 71, 73
 communist politics and, 102
 education and, 34, 63–64, 115–116
 emergence of, x, 8–10, 22, 51–52
 English language and, 51, 57n34
 forecast fragility and, 101–103,
 118
 high growth rate of, 101–103
 impersonal jobs and, 24, 34
 increased employment in, 39
 increased labor supply and, 22–
 23, 63
 lack of useful capital from, 63
 new entrant effects and, 29–30
 poor policies of, 101–102
 purchasing power parity and, 69
 supply-and-demand curve and,
 76–77
 teachable moment for, 77
 training potential of, 115–116
- Citibank, 20
- Clinton, Hillary, 1, 66, 107
- Colleges, 45–47
- Columbia School of Journalism,
 107
- Columbia University, 9–10, 111
- Communications technology. *See*
 Information and communications
 technology (ICT)

- Communism, 102
- Comparative advantage, 21, 111
- climbing ladder of, 48–50, 77–81
- creation of advantage and, 26
- education and, 25–27
- English language and, 29–30, 32, 42–43, 51–52, 57n34, 115, 118
- evidence for theories of, 73–74
- future concerns and, 27
- India and, 26–31, 52–55
- kaleidoscopic movement of, 26, 38, 83
- loss of, 26
- new entrants and, 26, 29
- reallocation and, 27–32
- research and development (R&D) and, 50, 69
- resource-based, 25–26
- validity of, 83
- Computer programmers, 31, 42, 48, 116
- Consumption, 86, 105, 112–113
- Cooper, Richard, 17n7
- Crook, Clive, 106
- Currency market, 77, 95, 97
- Davis, Bob, 2–3, 10, 83
- Democrats, 1, 4, 14–15, 104, 119
- Department of Labor, 80
- Design, 62, 64
- Dictionary of Occupational Titles (DOT), 35, 85
- Digitalization, 64
- Dixit, Avinash, 7
- Doctors, 46, 65, 113
- Doha round, 119
- Downsizing, 75–76
- Earned Income Tax Credit, 44, 68
- Economic issues
- Baumol's disease, 31, 34
- comparative advantage, 21, 25–32
- forecast fragility of, 101–103, 117–118
- gains-from-trade theorem, 43
- Great Depression, 5–6, 112
- imperfect competition, 3–7
- Invisible Hand, 5–7
- natural resources and, 25–26
- new entrants, 26
- offshoring, 10–15 (*see also* Offshoring)
- pessimism and, 8–9, 73, 80–81, 92
- protectionism, 8–10 (*see also* Protectionism)
- recession, 42, 75
- Stolper-Samuelson theorem, 104
- supply-and-demand curve, 76–77
- Third Industrial Revolution, 52–54
- Washington Consensus and, 67
- Economic Policy Institute, 14
- Economist* journal, 106
- Editors, 42
- Education, 11–12, 97
- Baumol's disease and, 34
- charter schools and, 45
- China and, 34, 63–64, 115–116
- college, 45–47
- comparative advantage and, 25–27
- endowments and, 33–34
- federal job training and, 43–45
- future workforce and, 45–48
- government-sponsored retraining programs and, 79–80
- group learning and, 47
- India and, 63–64, 115–116
- interregional mobility and, 79
- K–12 system reform and, 115, 117–118
- literacy rates and, 102
- No Child Left Behind and, 45, 47
- Office of Automation and Manpower and, 80

- Education (cont.)
 O*Net data and, 89
 people skills and, 47
 personally / impersonally
 delivered services and, 23–24, 93
 preparing workforce of the
 future, 45–48
 problem-solving skills and, 47
 raising U.S. standards of, 46–47
 rote preparation and, 47
 science, 45
 skilled labor and, 23–24, 26, 33–
 34, 38, 45–48, 52, 79
 Trade Adjustment Assistance
 (TAA) and, 43–44
 unemployment and, 79
 vocational, 47–48, 68, 78
 wages and, 52
 white-collar workers and, 42
- Elasticity, 76
- “Elder Challenges Outsourcing’s
 Orthodoxy, An” (Lohr), 8
- Electricians, 46
- Employment Law Alliance survey,
 62–63
- Endowments, 33–34
- England, 25
- English language
 China and, 51, 57n34
 comparative advantage and, 29–
 30, 32, 42–43, 51–52, 57n34, 115,
 118
 India and, 29–30, 42–43, 52, 115,
 118
- Entertainment, 32, 49
- Environmental issues, 6–7, 68
- Equilibrium, 119
 better, 14
 comparative advantage and, 21,
 25–27
 imperfect competition and, 13
 increasing returns and, 13
 offshoring and, 22, 38
 policy and, 13–14
 reallocation and, 29
- Europe
 absolute price differences and, 95
 coping skills of, 51
 postwar, 10
 U.S. growth and, 8–9
- Exchange rates, 95, 97
- Exogenous factors, 8–9
- Exports, 9, 73–74
 comparative advantage and, 21,
 25–27, 48–50
 future, 48–50
 offshoring and, 10–15, 38 (*see also*
 Offshoring)
 U.S. trade imbalance and, ix–x, 49
- Farrell, Diana, 65
- Feenstra, Robert, 9–10
- Financial Times*, 14, 106–107
- Florida, 9
- Fogel, Robert, 80
- Foreign Affairs* journal, 10, 12, 23,
 72, 103, 106, 114
- Foreign direct investment (FDI)
 Arab security companies and, x
 offshoring as, 20–21
 returns to capital and, 30
 supply-and-demand curve and,
 76
 tax system and, 68
 trade deficit and, ix–xi, 49
- Francis E. Walker medal, xiii
- Freeman, Richard B.
 Bhagwati and, 66–67, 103,
 105–106
 Blinder and, 30, 64–69, 109, 112,
 115, 119–120, 121n4, 121n6
 views of, 61–70
- Free trade
 China and, 8–10 (*see also* China)
 cyclic episodes of, 71–72
 differentiated products and, 4–6

- equilibrium and, 13–14, 21–27, 38
 exchange rates and, 95, 97
 exogenous factors and, 8–9
 fundamentalism of, 111
 gains assumption of, 21
 Great Depression and, 5
 imperfect competition and, 3–7, 13
 increasing returns and, 13
 India and, 8–10 (*see also* India)
 Invisible Hand and, 5–7
 lack of consensus on, 1, 3, 105–107, 109–110
 liberalization and, 15
 loss of faith in, 1
 Marxism and, 5
 media interpretation on state of, 1–15, 105–107
 North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) and, 61, 72, 77–78
 offshoring and, 10–15 (*see also* Offshoring)
 perceived flight from, 2–3
 “polluter pay” principle and, 6–7
 protectionism and, 1, 4, 84, 92, 98 (*see also* Protectionism)
 rise of Japan and, 3–7
 second thoughts on, 2, 83, 111
 slow growth and, 14–15
 theoretical attacks against, 72
 traditional gains from, 83–84
 two-way effects of, 75–76
 unskilled labor and, 14–15
 “Free Trade Was Passé After All” (Krugman), 3–4
 Friedman, Benjamin M., ix–xiv
 Friedman, Thomas, 10, 95
 Frito-Lay, 5
 Gains-from-trade theorem, 43
 Gates, Bill, 46
 Geek Squad, 48
 General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS), 11, 16n4
 Georgia, 77
 German language, 43
 Germany, 106
 Globalization, 8, 10
 capital-labor ratio and, 63
 costs of, 83–84
 exchange rates and, 95, 97
 measurement of, 67
 North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) and, 61
 offshoring and, 10–15 (*see also* Offshoring)
 Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) and, 78–79
 wage stagnation and, 103–105
 Washington Consensus and, 67
 Goldberg, Arthur, 80
 Gomory, Ralph, 2, 13–14, 17n6, 66, 83, 110
 “Gospel of Free Trade Is Losing Its Apostles, The” (Pennar), 4
 Grapes, 25
 Gravity models, 95
 Great Depression, 5–6, 112
 Great Society, 44
 Greider, William, 13, 66
 Grieco, Paul L. E., 84
 Gross Domestic Product (GDP)
 growth, 69, 81, 94, 104
 Grossman, Gene, 6, 65
 Group learning, 47
 Haltiwanger, John, 77
 Hamilton, Alexander, 50
 Hansen, Alvin, xiii–xiv, 81
Hard Heads, Soft Hearts (Blinder), 77
 Harvard University, xiii, 14–15, 33, 46, 80
 Health insurance, 44, 68
 Health tourism, 65

- High school dropouts, 45
Hollywood, 32, 49
Hong Kong, 102
Hufbauer, Gary Clyde, 84
Hurricanes, 9
Hymans, Saul, 26
- Idaho, 77
Immigration, 14, 103
Imperfect competition
 differentiated products and, 4–6
 equilibrium and, 13
 Invisible Hand and, 5–7
 political economy and, 7
 rise of Japan and, 3–7
Imports, 5
 cheap capital goods and, 102
 employment effects and, 15, 94
 globalization and, 102, 104–105
 Keynesian unemployment and, 39
 real wages and, 15
 service sector and, 20, 48, 97–98
 U.S. trade imbalance and, ix, 39
 wage-loss insurance and, 57n28
Increasing returns, 13
In Defense of Globalization
 (Bhagwati), 17n8, 101
India, 17n6, 71, 110
 comparative advantage and, 26–31, 52–55
 emergence of, x, 8–10, 22, 51–52, 54, 91–92
 English language and, 29–30, 42–43, 52, 115, 118
 forecast fragility and, 101–102, 118
 higher education and, 63–64
 high growth rate of, 101–103
 impersonal jobs and, 24, 34
 increased employment in, 39
 increased labor supply and, 22–23, 63
 knee-jerk interventionism of, 102
 lack of useful capital from, 63
 new entrant effect of, 29–31
 reputation building and, 95–96
 rising supply prices and, 115
 rupee appreciation and, 77
 supply-and-demand curve and, 76–77
 teachable moment for, 77
 threat of, 54, 91–92
 training potential of, 115–116
 wages and, 77, 115
Industrial Revolution
 First, 46, 52, 54
 Second, 52, 80
 Third, 52–54
Industry
 automation and, 4–5, 80
 automobile, 98
 Benedict Arnold CEOs and, 61
 comparative advantage and, 21, 25–27
 corporate governance reform and, 69
 differentiated products and, 4–6
 downsizing and, 75–76
 externality issues and, 4–5, 8–9
 Markusen models and, 66
 oligopolistic, 6
 protectionism and, 1–10, 84, 92, 98–99
 reallocation and, 27–32 (*see also* Offshoring)
 steel, 98
 unions and, 12, 14, 65, 68, 96, 98, 104
 “*Inflation, Unemployment, and Monetary Policy*” symposium, xivn1
Information and communications technology (ICT), xi, 10, 22, 64
 forecast fragility and, 118

- future innovation and, 32–33
 location of work and, 20–21, 55n2, 85–86
 reallocation model and, 30–32
 transportation costs of, 85
 Insurance, 44, 57n28, 68, 78–79
 International Monetary Fund (IMF), 67
 Internet, 62, 64–65, 71, 85–86
 Interventionism, 102
 Invisible Hand, 5–7
 Irwin, Douglas A.
 Bhagwati and, 71–72
 Blinder and, 71–81, 109–110, 114–119
 media frenzy and, 71–72
 “Is Free Trade Passé?” (Krugman), 16n1

 Japan
 absolute price differences and, 95
 media frenzy over, 3–7
 postwar, 10
 protectionism and, 4
 rise of, 3–7, 10
 threat of, 71–72, 78
 Japanese language, 42–43
 Jefferson, Thomas, 25, 50
 Jensen, Brad, 65, 85, 87, 97, 120
 Job satisfaction, 23–24, 53
 Job security, 22
 Associated Press-IPSOS survey and, 63
 Employment Law Alliance survey and, 62–63
 extent of offshoring’s impact and, 34–37
 net vs. gross job loss and, 38
 O*NET and, 36, 86–89
 personal/impersonal jobs and, 23–24, 28–32, 35–37
 professional jobs and, 42, 86–89
 reallocation and, 27–32
 Job training, 93
 educational system and, 47 (*see also* Education)
 federal, 43–45, 79–80
 need for more, 115, 117
 vocational, 47–48, 68, 78
 Johnson, Harry, 8–9, 13
 Johnson, Lyndon, 44
 Journalism schools, 106–107. *See also* Media
 Journal of Economic Perspectives, 8
 Journal of International Economics, 103
 Journal of Political Economy, 6
 Julius Caesar (Shakespeare), 69

 Katz, Larry, 79, 103
 Kemp, Murray, 13
 Kennedy, John F., 80
 Kennedy Round, 12
 Kennedy School of Government, 15
 Kerry, John, 11–12, 61
 Keynes, John Maynard
 business cycles and, 112
 forecasting and, 19, 28
 free trade and, 5–6, 8
 on word choice, 73, 94
 Keynesian unemployment, 38–39, 41, 92
 Kirkegaard, Jacob, 74
 Kletzer, Lori G., 91
 Bhagwati and, 82–90
 Blinder and, 82–90, 109, 111–112, 119–120
 geographic employment distribution and, 65
 protectionism and, 84
 Know Nothings, 119
 Koster, Marvin, 17n7

- Krugman, Paul
 Bhagwati and, 3, 8, 14, 16n1, 66, 103–105
 Blinder and, 110
 imperfect competition and, 3–7, 13
 protectionism and, 3–7
 rise of Japan and, 3–7
 wage depression and, 15
 Kuttner, Robert, 4, 7
 Kuznets, Simon, 80–81
- Labor
 Associated Press-IPSOS survey and, 63
 automation and, 4–5, 80
 bargaining and, 96
 blue collar, 42, 105
 Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) and, 35, 62, 89
 corporate governance reform and, 69
 downsizing and, 75–76
 employee stock ownership and, 69
 Employment Law Alliance survey and, 62–63
 federal job training and, 43–45, 79–80
 future risk and, 32–34
 geographic distribution of, 65
 guaranteed income and, 68
 human contact and, 53
 increased supply of, x, 22–23, 29, 34–35, 53, 63–64, 101–103, 115–116
 insurance and, 44
 interregional mobility and, 79
 job satisfaction and, 53
 job security and, 22–23 (*see also* Job security)
 literacy rates and, 102
 location of work and, 20–21, 55n2, 85–86
 Markusen models and, 66
 net vs. gross job loss and, 38
 North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) and, 61, 72, 77–78, 119
 Office of Automation and Manpower and, 80
 offshoring and, xi, 10–15, 19–55 (*see also* Offshoring)
 O*NET and, 36, 85–89
 pensions and, 44, 68–69
 people skills and, 47
 personal/impersonal jobs and, 23–24, 28–32, 35–37
 “polluter pay” principle and, 6–7
 profit sharing and, 69
 protectionism and, 1–10, 21, 25–27, 41, 53, 84, 92, 98–99, 101, 107, 110–111
 skilled, 23–24, 26, 33–34, 38, 45–48, 52, 79
 Third Industrial Revolution and, 52–54
 Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) and, 12, 43–44, 57n28, 78–79
 turnover and, 23, 75, 94–96
 unions and, 12, 14, 65, 68, 96, 98, 104
 unskilled, 5, 14, 61, 96, 103, 105, 108n8
 weakened bargaining position of, 68
 white collar, 11, 20–21, 42, 55n2, 64–65, 71, 73, 79, 85–89, 102
 LaLonde, Robert J., 45
 Lane, Julia, 77
 Lawrence, Robert Z.
 Bhagwati and, 12, 15, 103, 105
 Blinder and, 56n14, 91–99, 109–110, 114–119
 media and, 92
 protectionism and, 92, 98–99

- Lawyers, 32, 42
 Lee, Thea, 14
 Lemann, Nicholas, 107
 Letterman, David, 19
 Liberalization, 15, 43, 98
 Litan, Robert, 12
 Literacy, 102
 Log wage equation, 40
 Lohr, Steve, 8
Los Angeles Times, 4
- Macroeconomics, 10, 12, 38–39, 112
 Malthus, Thomas, 116
 Mankiw, Greg, 19, 65
 Mann, Catherine, 65
 Manufacturing, 49, 56n19
 Baumol's disease and, 31
 downsizing and, 75
 employment share of, 94, 105, 115
 foreign competition and, 42
 Industrial Revolution and, 46, 52, 54
 North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) and, 61
 offshoring and, 62 (*see also* Offshoring)
 reallocation and, 27–32
 restoring base of, 28
 supply-and-demand curve and, 76–77
Marketplace (NPR show), 55n2
 Markets
 Arab security companies and, x
 Baumol's disease and, 31, 34
 China and, 8–10, 17n6, 51–53 (*see also* China)
 comparative advantage and, 27–32 (*see also* Comparative advantage)
 currency, 77, 95, 97
 English language and, 29–30, 32
 exchange rates and, 95, 97
 exogenous factors and, 8–9
 future U.S. exports and, 48–50
 gains-from-trade theorem and, 43
 Gross Domestic Product (GDP) growth and, 69, 81, 94, 104
 imperfect competition and, 3–7
 India and, 8–10, 17n6, 51–55 (*see also* India)
 Invisible Hand and, 5–7
 natural resources and, 25–26
 new entrants and, 26, 29, 75
 niche, 75–76
 political economy and, 7
 “polluter pay” principle and, 6–7
 protectionism and, 1–10, 21, 25–27, 41, 53, 84, 92, 98–99, 101, 107, 110–111
 regional specialization and, 106
 rigidities and, 51
 Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) and, 12, 43–44, 57n28, 68, 78–79, 117, 119
 U.S. trade imbalance and, ix
 wireless delivery and, 41, 51
 Markusen, James, 66
 Marshall, Alfred, 74, 76
 Marx, Groucho, 110, 112
 Marx, Karl, 5, 110, 112
 Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT), 4, 8, 106
 Mathematics, 2, 8, 45
 Matthews, R. C. O., 13
 McCartney, Paul, 1, 66
 McKinley, William, 33
 McKinsey Global Institute, 62
 Meade, James, 13
 Meany, George, 12, 78
 Media, 67
 China and, 9
 free trade interpretations and, 1–15, 105–107
 heretical arguments and, 3
 hype and, 1, 3, 77, 105–107
 India and, 9

- Media (cont.)
 Irwin response and, 71–72
 journalism schools and, 106–107
 Lawrence response and, 92
 mathematics and, 8
 rise of Japan and, 3–7
 Mexico, 61, 72
 Microsoft, 20–21
 Mining, 94
 Mishel, Lawrence, 14
 Mode 1, 10–12, 113
 Mode 2, 86
 Mode 3, 86
Modern Times (film), 53
 Monopolies, 66
 Monsoons, 9
 Movie stars, 32
 “Muddles over Outsourcing, The”
 (Bhagwati), 16n2
- Nanotechnology, 68
Nation, The (magazine), 3, 13
 National Academy of Public
 Administration, 20
 National Public Radio (NPR), 10,
 55n2
 Natural resources, 25–26
 “Nature makes no leap,” 74
 NBER Program, 9
 Networking, 33
 New Democrats, 1, 14–15
 New New Thing, 113
New Republic magazine, 5
New York Times, 2, 8, 15, 77, 104,
 106
 Nilekani, Nandan, 10
 No Child Left Behind program, 45,
 47
 Nongovernmental organizations
 (NGOs), 102
 North American Free Trade
 Agreement (NAFTA), 61, 72, 77–
 78, 119
- Office of Automation and
 Manpower, 80
 Offshoring
 absolute price differences and,
 95
 adjustment issues and, 37–41
 Associated Press-IPSOS survey
 and, 63
 Baumol’s disease and, 31, 34
 Benedict Arnold CEOs and, 61
 big deal hypothesis and, 22, 24,
 27, 32, 34, 54, 83, 91, 93, 97
 Blinder on, 10–12, 19–55
 Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS)
 data and, 62
 business-as-usual approach to, 22,
 24, 32, 84, 120
 call centers and, 10
 China and, 8–10, 17n6, 22, 51–53
 (*see also* China)
 comparative advantage and, 27–
 32 (*see also* Comparative
 advantage)
 compensating losers and, 43
 continuation of, 32–34
 debate components of, 21–25
 defining, 20–21
 disproportionate benefits of,
 65–66
 downsizing and, 75–76
 educational response to, 11–12
 (*see also* Education)
 elasticity and, 76
 Employment Law Alliance survey
 and, 62–63
 English language and, 29–30, 32,
 42–43, 51–52, 57n34, 115, 118
 equilibrium and, 22, 27, 38
 estimating potential job loss and,
 34–37, 86–89, 93–94, 97, 114–115
 flux issues and, 11–12
 as foreign direct investment
 (FDI), 20–21

- as fundamental trade phenomenon, 22
- future risk and, 32–34
- gains assumption and, 21
- gains-from-trade theorem and, 43
- General Agreement on trade in Services (GATS) and, 11
- as impending catastrophe, 72–74, 114
- impersonal jobs and, 23, 28–35, 39, 46–54, 64–65, 86, 97, 112, 115, 119
- increasing returns and, 13
- India and, 8–10, 17n6, 22, 51–55 (*see also* India)
- intellectual positions on, 19
- intra-firm trade and, 98
- job creation and, 21
- job satisfaction and, 23–24, 53
- large impact on U.S. structure, 22–24
- location of work and, 20–21, 55n2, 85–86
- lower U.S. wages and, *x* (*see also* Wages)
- mass unemployment and, 27
- measurement of, 21, 64–65, 86–89, 120
- of medical services, 65
- monopoly loss and, 66
- national data systems and, 52–54
- natural resources and, 25–26
- net vs. gross job loss and, 38
- new entrants and, 29
- North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) and, 61, 72, 77–78, 119
- O*NET and, 36, 85–89
- vs. outsourcing, 20
- personal jobs and, 23–24, 28–32, 34–37, 53, 93, 115
- physical proximity and, 10–12, 90
- policy recommendations for, 43–50
- politics of, 41–43
- positive impact of, 22, 65–67
- potential jobs affected by, 35–37
- preparing workforce of the future, 45–48
- as productivity advance, 65–66
- professional jobs and, 42 (*see also* White-collar workers)
- professions subject to, 86–89
- protectionism and, 1–10, 21, 25–27, 41, 53, 84, 92, 98–99, 101, 107, 110–111
- returns to capital and, 30
- scale effects and, 74–75, 84–89
- self-evident truths and, 25–27, 32–34
- service sector and, 20–24, 27–32, 41–42 (*see also* Service sector)
- slower productivity growth from, 51
- social welfare and, 22
- structural unemployment from, 38–39
- supply-and-demand curve and, 76–77
- technology and, 32–34 (*see also* Technology)
- as Third Industrial Revolution, 22, 52–54
- Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) and, 12, 43–44, 57n28, 68, 78–79, 90, 117, 119
- trade deficit and, 49
- transition issues and, 27–32, 35–41
- as two-way street, 49
- vulnerability issues and, 11
- wage depression and, *x–xii*, 14, 27, 30–31, 40–41, 52, 93, 96–97
- wireless delivery and, 41, 112–113
- Offshoring Institute, 62

- Oil, 25, 118
- Old Democrats, 1
- O*NET, 36, 85–89
- Onshoring, 32, 38
- “Outsourcing Works So Well,
India Is Sending Jobs Abroad”
(*New York Times*), 77
- Oversaving, 81
- Oxbridge, 106
- Panagariya, Arvind, 13, 22, 34, 115
- Pareto moves, 43, 111, 120
- Passell, Peter, 106
- PBS, 1
- Pennar, Karen, 4
- Pensions, 44, 68–69
- People skills, 47
- PepsiCo, 5
- Perot, Ross, 72, 77, 110, 118
- Peterson Institute for International
Economics, 105
- Philippines, 42, 115
- “Play It Again Sam: A New Look
at Trade and Wages”
(Bhagwati), 104
- Plumbers, 46
- Policy, xii
- Blinder’s recommendations for,
43–50, 77–81, 117–119
- building a better safety net, 43–45
- equilibrium and, 13–14
- estimating potential job loss and,
35–37
- federal job training and, 43–45
- future U.S. exports and, 48–50
- General Agreement on Trade in
Services (GATS) and, 11, 16n4
- government-sponsored training
programs and, 43–45, 79–80
- interest groups and, xii
- interventionist, 102
- liberalization, 15, 43, 98
- No Child Left Behind and, 45, 47
- North American Free Trade
Agreement (NAFTA) and, 61,
72, 77–78, 119
- preparing workforce of the
future, 45–48
- protectionist, 1–10, 21, 25–27, 41,
53, 84, 92, 98–99, 101, 107,
110–111
- radical, 68
- Trade Adjustment Assistance
(TAA) and, 12, 43–44, 57n28,
78–79
- Washington Consensus and, 67
- Political economy, 7
- Politics
- Arab security companies, x
- communist China and, 102
- Democrats and, 1, 4, 14–15, 104,
119
- federal job training and, 43–45,
79–80
- Know Nothings and, 119
- laissez-faire and, 24, 84, 120
- offshoring and, 41–43
- socialism and, 112
- Trade Adjustment Assistance
(TAA) and, 43–44
- white-collar workers and, 42
- “Polluter pay” principle, 6–7
- Portugal, 25
- Potato chips, 4–5
- Prices, 5–6
- absolute differences in, 95
- arbitrage and, 95
- Baumol’s disease and, 31, 34
- comparative advantage and, 30
- exchange rates and, 95, 97
- future technology and, 33
- international differences in, 92–93
- purchasing power parity and, 69
- supply-and-demand curve and,
76–77
- Princeton University, 6–7, 33

- Principles of Economics* (Marshall), 74
 Pringles, 5
 Problem-solving skills, 47
 Production
 Baumol's disease and, 31, 34
 disproportionate benefits and, 65–66
 foreign competition and, x–xi, 42
 (see also China; India)
 increased labor supply and, x, 22–23, 29, 34–35, 53, 63–64, 101–103, 115–116
 literacy rates and, 102
 natural resources and, 25–26
 North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) and, 61
 offshoring and, 10–15 (see also Offshoring)
 “polluter pay” principle and, 6–7
 slower average growth of, 51
 standard of living and, 32
 supply-and-demand curve and, 76–77
 Professional jobs. *See* White-collar workers
 Professors, 32–34
 Profit sharing, 69
 Protectionism
 Bhagwati on, 1–10, 101, 107
 Blinder on, 21, 25–27, 53, 110–111
 China and, 8–10
 comparative advantage and, 21, 25–27
 India and, 8–10
 industry externalities and, 4
 Invisible Hand and, 5–6
 Japan and, 4
 Kletzer on, 84
 Krugman on, 3–7
 Lawrence on, 92, 98–99
 Samuelson on, 8–10
 wireless delivery and, 41
 Purchasing power parity, 69
 Radiologists, 24, 30, 42, 55n3, 79
 Reallocation, 65. *See also* Offshoring
 Baumol's disease and, 31, 34
 digitalization and, 64
 disruption caused by, 27–28
 equilibrium and, 29
 estimating potential job loss and, 35–37
 future speculation and, 27–28
 as impending catastrophe, 72–74
 information and communications technology (ICT) and, 30–32
 Markusen models and, 66
 monopoly loss and, 66
 net vs. gross job loss and, 38
 new entrants and, 29
 personal/impersonal jobs and, 28–32
 slower productivity growth from, 51
 standard of living and, 32
 trade model for, 29–32
 unemployment factors and, 38–39
 wage effects and, 40–41
 Recession, 42, 75
 Regression analysis, 40, 57n23, 96–97, 116
 Research and development (R&D), 50, 69
 Returns to capital, 30
 Revere, Paul, 54, 91–92, 113
 Ricardo, David, 21, 25
 Roberts, Paul Craig, 13, 66
 Robinson, Joan, 7
 Rose, Charlie, 66
 Rossi-Hansber, Esteban, 65
 Rote preparation, 47
 Routinizability, 116
 Russia, 106
 Sampson, Gary P., 12
 Samuelson, Paul, 8–10, 16n2, 66, 83, 107, 110–111

- Saudi Arabia, 25
 School for International Affairs,
 Columbia, 106
 Schrage, Michael, 4–5
 Science, 32, 45
 Second Industrial Revolution, 52,
 80
 Secretary of Labor, 80
 Semiconductor chips, 4–5
 Service sector, 83, 94
 Baumol's disease and, 31, 34
 Benedict Arnold CEOs and, 61
 comparative advantage and,
 27–32
 division of labor and, 75–76
 education and, 46
 English language and, 29–30, 42–
 43, 52, 115, 118
 exchange rate and, 95, 97
 expansion of, 31–32
 future risk and, 32–34
 impersonal jobs and, 23, 28–35,
 39, 46–54, 64–65, 86, 97, 112, 115,
 119
 imports and, 97
 increased complexity of, 33
 information and communications
 technology (ICT) and, 30–32
 innovation in, 49–50
 job satisfaction and, 23–24
 job security and, 23
 location of work and, 20–21, 55n2,
 85–86
 O*NET and, 36, 85–89
 personal jobs and, 23–24, 28–32,
 34–37, 53, 93, 115
 preparing workforce of the
 future, 45–48
 qualitative changes in, 23
 reallocation measurement of,
 86–89
 skilled labor and, 26
 Third Industrial Revolution and,
 22, 53–54
 tourism and, 20
 trade deficit and, 49
 wireless delivery and, 41, 51, 53,
 112
 Shakespeare, William, 69
 “Shaking Up Trade Theory”
 (Bernstein), 8
 Shipbuilding, xi
 Shoe manufacturing, xi
 Silicon Valley, 25
 Singapore, 102, 105
 Smith, Adam, 5, 7, 25, 72
 Snape, Richard H., 12
 Socialism, 112
 Social welfare
 increase of global, 53
 Invisible Hand and, 5–7
 offshoring and, 22
 Solow, Robert, 4, 14
 South Korea, 102, 105
 Soviet bloc, former, 29–30, 53, 63
 Special interest groups, xii
 Srinivasan, T. N., 13, 22, 34, 104, 115
 Stafford, Frank, 26
 Stagnation, 81, 103–105
 Standard Occupational
 Classification (SOC), 35, 85
 Standard of living, 32, 49, 92,
 112–113
 Stanford University, 4
 Steel industry, xi, 98
 Steelworkers Union, 65
 Stolper-Samuelson theorem, 104
 Supply-and-demand curve, 76–77
 Swagel, Phillip, 65

 Taiwan, 102, 105
 Tarrif retaliation, 7
 Taxes, 44, 68
 Teachable moments, 77

- Technology, 112
 automation and, 4–5, 80
 call centers and, 10
 digitalization and, 64
 externality issues and, 4–5
 future innovations and, 32–34
 future prices of, 33
 government-sponsored retraining programs and, 79–80
 impersonal jobs and, 23, 28–35, 39, 46–54, 64–65, 86, 97, 112, 115, 119
 information and communications technology (ICT), xi, 10, 20–22, 30–33, 55n2, 64, 85–86, 118
 international competition and, x–xi
 Internet, 62, 64–65, 71, 85–86
 location of work and, 20–21, 55n2, 85–86
 monopoly loss and, 66
 nanotechnology and, 68
 Office of Automation and Manpower and, 80
 protectionism and, 4–5
 reallocation model and, 30–32
 Stolper-Samuelson theorem and, 104
 transportation costs of, 85
 wage depression and, 14, 104
 wireless delivery and, 41, 51, 112–113
 “Technology, not Globalisation, Is Driving Wages Down” (Bhagwati), 14
Terrified by Trade: The Paradox of Protectionism in the United States (Bhagwati), 101
 Theory of comparative advantage. *See* Comparative advantage
 Third Industrial Revolution, 22, 52–54
 Tobin, James, xiii–xiv
 Tourism, 20, 113
 Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA)
 AFL-CIO and, 12, 78
 as burial insurance, 78
 costs of, 78–79
 expansion of, 90
 Kennedy and, 12
 reform of, 43–44, 68, 78–79, 117, 119
 wage insurance and, 57n28, 78–79
 Trade deficit, ix–xi, 49
 Transition costs, 27, 37–41, 114–115
 Turnover, 23, 75, 94–96
 TV, 49
 Tyson, Laura, 3–7, 14, 110
 Uchitelle, Lou, 2
 U.K. Institute of Directors, 62
 Unemployment, 57n21. *See also*
 Offshoring
 cyclical, 39
 education and, 79
 frictional, 92
 government-sponsored retraining programs and, 79–80
 Keynesian, 38–39, 41, 92
 post-World War II era and, 81
 reallocation estimates and, 38–39
 structural, 92
 Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) and, 12, 43–44, 57n28, 78–79
 Unemployment insurance, 44
 Unions, 12, 14, 65, 68, 96, 98, 104
 United States
 absolute price differences and, 95
 Arab security companies and, x
 China and, 8–10 (*see also* China)
 coping skills of, 51
 English language and, 29–30, 32, 42–43, 51–52

- United States (cont.)
 European view of growth of, 8–9
 exchange rate and, 95, 97
 foreign-held assets and, ix–x
 future exports of, 48–50
 Great Depression and, 5–6, 112
 Gross Domestic Product (GDP)
 growth and, 69, 81, 94
 India and, 8–10 (*see also* India)
 innovation and, 49–50
 interest groups and, xii
 national data system of, 52–54
 as net exporter, 73–74
 North American Free Trade
 Agreement (NAFTA) and, 61,
 72, 77–78, 119
 post–World War II era and, 81
 protectionism and, 1–10, 21, 25–
 27, 41, 53, 84, 92, 98–99, 101, 107,
 110–111
 purchasing power parity and, 69
 rise of Japan and, 4
 standard of living and, 32, 49, 92,
 112–113
 tax system and, 68
 theory of comparative advantage
 and, 21, 25–27
 Third Industrial Revolution and,
 52–54
 Trade Adjustment Assistance
 (TAA) and, 12, 43–44
 trade imbalance of, ix–xi, 49
 turnover rates in, 94–95
 underdeveloped parts of, 77
 Universal health insurance, 44, 68
 Uruguay Round, 11
 U.S. Department of Labor, 43–44
 U.S. Patent Office, 33
- Video conferencing, 33
 Visible Hand, 7
 Vocational education, 47–48, 68, 78
 Voice recognition systems, 33
- Wage insurance, 44, 57n28, 68,
 78–79
- Wages
 capital-labor ratio and, 63
 depression of, x–xii, 14, 27, 30–31,
 40–41, 52, 93, 96–97
 education and, 52
 elasticity and, 76
 factor content approach and, 103
 foreign competition and, 42
 Great Depression and, 5–6
 Gross Domestic Product (GDP)
 growth in, 69
 immigration and, 103
 increased labor supply and, x,
 116
 India and, 77, 115
 international differences in, 92–93
 Invisible Hand and, 5–7
 log equation for, 40
 Markusen models and, 66
 profit sharing and, 69
 purchasing power parity and, 69
 reallocation effects and, 40–41
 regression analysis and, 40,
 57n23, 96–97, 116
 skilled labor and, 52, 79
 stagnation and, 81, 103–105
 Stolper-Samuelson theorem and,
 104
 supply-and-demand curve and,
 76–77
 technology and, 14
 Trade Adjustment Assistance
 (TAA) and, 12, 43–44, 57n28, 68,
 78–79, 117, 119
 unskilled labor and, 5, 14, 61, 96,
 103, 105, 108n8
 workforce of the future and,
 45–48
- Wall Street, 49
Wall Street Journal, 2, 10, 13
 Wal-Mart, 113

- Washington Consensus, 67
- Weather, 9
- Wei, Shang-Jin, 74
- Weinstein, David, 10
- Weinstein, Michael, 106
- Wessel, David, 2, 10, 83
- White-collar workers, 11, 102
 - digitalization of, 64
 - impersonal jobs and, 23, 28–35, 39, 46–54, 64–65, 86, 97, 112, 115, 119
 - location of work and, 20–21, 55n2, 85–86
 - media frenzy and, 71
 - as new trade victims, 42, 73, 79
 - O*Net and, 85–89
 - personal jobs and, 23–24, 28–32, 34–37, 53, 93, 115
 - Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA) and, 79
- Who's Bashing Whom?* (Tyson), 5
- Wikipedia, 61
- Wolf, Martin, 106
- Work Activities data, 86–89
- World Bank, 67
- World Trade Organization (WTO), 86
- World War II era, 81

- Yale University, 106